



City of Dublin

**LAND USE & LONG
RANGE PLANNING**

September 26, 2012

Minor Project Review

12-060ARB-MPR – BSC Public District

Dublin Community Church – Architectural Modifications

81 West Bridge Street

This is a request for architectural modifications to an existing building in Historic Dublin. The site is located at the southwest corner of the intersection of Bridge Street and Franklin Street. This is a request for review and approval of a Minor Project Review in accordance with Zoning Code Section 153.066(G) and under the review standards of Zoning Code Section 153.170 and the Historic Dublin Design Guidelines.

Date of Application Acceptance

Wednesday, September 5, 2012

Date of ART Recommendation

Thursday, September 13, 2012

Case Manager

Eugenia M. Martin, ASLA, Landscape Architect | (614) 410-4650 | emartin@dublin.oh.us



PART I: Application Overview

<i>Zoning District</i>	BSC Public District
<i>Review Type</i>	Minor Project Review
<i>Development Proposal</i>	Modifications to an Existing Structure
<i>Use</i>	Religious (Permitted Use in BSC Public District)
<i>Building Type</i>	Existing Structure; Civic Building (Permitted in BSC Public District)
<i>Administrative Departures</i>	None
<i>Waivers</i>	None
<i>Property Address</i>	81 West Bridge Street
<i>Property Owner</i>	Dublin Community Church
<i>Applicant</i>	Chuck David, Dublin Community Church
<i>Case Manager</i>	Eugenia M. Martin, ASLA, Landscape Architect (614) 410-4650 emartin@dublin.oh.us

Application Review Procedure: Minor Project Review

The purpose of the Minor Project Review is to provide an efficient review process for smaller projects that do not have significant community effects. The Minor Project Review is necessary to ensure that applications for development meet the requirements of Chapter 153 of the Dublin Zoning Code.

Following acceptance of a complete application for Minor Project Review, the Administrative Review Team shall make a recommendation to the Architectural Review Board to approve, deny, or approve with conditions the application based on the criteria of §153.066(F)(5) applicable to Site Plan Reviews and Site Plan Review Waivers, if necessary. A determination by the Administrative Review Team is required not more than 14 days from the date the request was submitted.

Zoning Code Analysis

§153.0062 – Building Types

Awnings and canopies may be used on buildings if they provide suitable protection from the elements and are designed to be consistent with the architecture of the building or other existing awnings on the building. Awnings are to be located above an entrance, windows or transoms and may be made of canvas or decorative metal.

A 9-foot 6-inches wide terra cotta colored canvas awning is proposed to be located above the main entrance into the church from the rear parking lot and will project four feet from the building façade. The lowest portion of the awning will be 7-foot 6-inches from grade which does not meet the Zoning Code requirement of eight feet minimum clearance. The method of attachment of the awning structure to the building has not been provided and may require the addition of stanchions to support the projection of the awning.



PART II: APPLICABLE REVIEW STANDARDS

The full text of the Minor Project Review standards and the Architectural Review Board standards is attached at the end of this Report.

Minor Project Review Criteria

The Administrative Review Team reviewed this application based on the review criteria for Minor Projects, and made the following findings:

- (a) **Similarity to Approved Basic Plan**
Not applicable
- (b) **Consistency with Approved Development Plan**
Not applicable
- (c) **Meets Applicable Zoning Regulations**
Met with condition. The proposed materials are consistent with the Zoning Code requirements for awnings in design and type of material. The location of the awning provides suitable protection from the elements as well as adds architectural character to the building. The applicant will be required to install the awning with a minimum of 8 feet clearance from grade.
- (d) **Safe and Efficient Pedestrian, Bicycle, & Vehicular Circulation**
Not applicable
- (e) **Coordination and Integration of Buildings and Structures**
Not applicable
- (f) **Open Space Suitability and Natural Features Preservation**
Not applicable
- (g) **Adequate Provision of Public Services**
Not applicable
- (h) **Appropriate Stormwater Management**
Not applicable
- (i) **Development Phasing**
Not applicable
- (j) **Consistency with Bridge Street Corridor Vision Report, Community Plan, and other Policy Documents**
Met. The proposed awning contributes to the character of the BSC Public District as well as the adjacent BSC Historic Core District.



Architectural Review Board

The Administrative Review Team reviewed this application based on the review criteria for proposals within the Architectural Review District Boundaries, and made the following findings:

General Review Standards

- 1) Character and Materials Compatible with Context
Criterion met: The proposed awning is compatible with the character of the existing building and complements the awnings on adjacent buildings.
- 2) Recognition and Respect of Historical or Acquired Significance
Not Applicable
- 3) Compatible with Relevant Design Characteristics
Not Applicable
- 4) Appropriate Massing and Building Form
Not Applicable
- 5) Appropriate Color Scheme
Criterion met: The color and style of the awning are appropriate to the architecture of the building.
- 6) Complementary Sign Design
Not Applicable
- 7) Appropriate Landscape Design
Not Applicable
- 8) Preservation of Archaeological Resources
Not Applicable

Alteration to Buildings, Structure, and Site Standards

- 1) Reasonable Effort to Minimize Alteration of Buildings and Site.
Criterion met with conditions. The proposed awning is located above the main entrance into the church from the rear parking lot and is designed to provide a minimal protection zone over the double doors. With the building permit application, additional information will need to be provided indicating the method of attachment to the building and how the awning meets the requirements for wind, lateral loads and live loads as required by Chapter 16 of the Ohio Building Code by. The lowest portion of the awning will be required to meet the minimum clearance of eight feet from grade.
- 2) Conformance to Original Distinguishing Character.
Not Applicable
- 3) Retention of Historic Building Features and Materials.
Not Applicable



- 4) Alteration Recognizes Historic Integrity and Appropriateness.
Not Applicable
- 5) Recognition and Respect of Historical or Acquired Significance.
Not Applicable
- 6) Sensitive Treatment of Distinctive Features.
Not Applicable
- 7) Appropriate Repair or Replacement of Significant Architectural Features.
Not Applicable
- 8) Sensitively Maintained Historic Building Materials.
Not Applicable

Additions to Existing Buildings, Structure, and Site

Not Applicable.

PART III: ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM RECOMMENDATION

This proposal complies with the Minor Project Review criteria and the applicable development standards of the Zoning Code. The Administrative Review Team recommends approval to the Architectural Review Board for this Minor Project Review application with two conditions:

1. The applicant provide details indicating how the awning meets the requirements for wind, lateral loads and live loads as required by Chapter 16 of the Ohio Building Code well as how the awning will be attached to the building to the satisfaction of the Chief Building Official prior to receiving a Building Permit; and
2. The awning be installed with a minimum of eight feet of clearance.



MINOR PROJECT REVIEW CRITERIA

The following outlines the full text of the review criteria (summarized above) for all Minor Project Review applications as outlined in Section 153.066(G) of the Dublin Zoning Code.

- (a) The Site Plan shall be substantially similar to the approved Basic Plan.
- (b) If a Development Plan has been approved that includes the property, the application is consistent with the Development Plan.
- (c) The application meets all applicable requirements of §153.059 and §§153.062 through 153.065 except as may be authorized by Administrative Departure(s) pursuant to §153.066(H).
- (d) The internal circulation system and driveways provide safe and efficient access for residents, occupants, visitors, emergency vehicles, bicycles, and pedestrians.
- (e) The relationship of buildings and structures to each other and to other facilities provides for the coordination and integration of the development within the surrounding area and the larger community and maintains the image of Dublin as a high quality community.
- (f) The application is consistent with the requirements for types, distribution, and suitability of open space in §153.064 and the site design incorporates natural features and site topography to the maximum extent practicable.
- (g) The scale and design of the proposed development allows the adequate provision of services currently furnished by or that may be required by the City or other public agency including, but not limited to, fire and police protection, public water and sanitary sewage services, recreational activities, traffic control, waste management, and administrative services.
- (h) Stormwater management systems and facilities will not cause alterations that could increase flooding or water pollution on or off the site, and removal of surface waters will not adversely affect neighboring properties.
- (i) If the development is to be implemented in phases, each phase is able to be considered independently, without the need for further phased improvements.
- (j) The application demonstrates consistency with the BSC Vision Report, Community Plan and other related policy documents adopted by the City.

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD CRITERIA

The following outlines the full text of the review criteria (summarized above) for all Architectural Review Board applications as outlined in Section 153.174(B) of the Dublin Zoning Code.

(3) *General Character*

- (a) The design of new structures and of additions to existing structures, including new site improvements, shall take into account the architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, materials and color of other structures and site within the District and immediate vicinity.
- (b) Where changes have taken place in the course of time as evidence of the history and development of adjacent or nearby buildings, structures or sites, if these changes are deemed to have acquired significance and would be compromised by the proposed new development, then this significance shall be recognized and respected in the design of the new development.



- (4) *Architectural Style.* There are a number of intermixes of architectural styles, as well as a larger number of buildings of such modest nature or so extensively remodeled to effectively lose all architectural importance. It is with reference to the basic architectural character of the key buildings noted above that the need for compatibility in the future construction in the District should be made. Compatibility does not infer imitation, but rather an appropriate design in terms of scale, building materials and detail. The architectural character of the various areas of the District consists mainly of four themes:
- (a) Simple rectangular commercial buildings with exterior construction of rubble or random Ashlar limestone, one, one and one-half, or two stories high with gable roof and ridgeline parallel to the street, mainly of the era of 1820 to 1890.
 - (b) Simple rectangular commercial buildings and outbuildings with exterior construction of frame with horizontal siding and corner trim, one, one and one-half, or two stories high with gable roof and ridgeline parallel to the street, mainly of the era of 1820 to 1890.
 - (c) Residential buildings with exterior construction of rubble or random Ashlar limestone, or red brick laid up in common bond, or frame with horizontal siding and corner trim, mainly of the era of 1820 to 1890.
 - (d) Residential buildings with stone on facades, one to one-half stories, mainly of the era 1950-1970.
- (5) *Massing and Building Form.* Massing of new buildings shall be generally similar to those in adjacent and nearby buildings. Building forms should generally reflect those of the architectural style of the building and the Historic District. Variations of gabled roof forms are preferred. Window to wall ratios should be appropriate to the type and use of building constructed.
- (6) *Color.* Traditional colors and combinations of those colors that are both identified with the origin or the era in which the structure or property was originally built and approved by the Architectural Review Board shall be used for exteriors for all new structures to be built, and reconstruction, remodeling and exterior maintenance of existing structures within the Architectural Review District. Fluorescent or luminescent colors are prohibited.
- (7) *Signs.* Signs should be designed to complement the nineteenth century Early American character of the district by incorporating design features common to signs from the 1800s. Materials should complement the architectural character of the District and colors should consistent with the era of the building. Sign types consistent with the character of the Historic District include wall, projecting, window, awning, and sandwich boards.
- (8) *Landscaping.* The landscape design of the site should be consistent with the overall architectural and historic character of the structures on the site. Plant material and methods for installation shall be selected respecting the nature of the urban environment and the survivability and diversity of the plan species. Non-plant material shall be of a type associated with the origin or era in which the structure was originally built. Significant features of the original landscape, e.g., stone walls, shall be preserved.
- (9) *Archaeological.* Every reasonable effort shall be made to record, protect and preserve archaeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.
- (C) *Alterations to Buildings, Structure and Site.* In addition to the General Review Standards, the following shall be met by applications for alterations to existing buildings, outbuildings, structures, and sites prior to approval of a Board Order.
- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to ensure that the use of the property will involve minimal



alteration of an existing building, structure or site and its environment.

- (2) The alteration shall conform to the distinguishing, original exterior qualities or character of the structure, its site, and its environment.
 - (3) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a period building, structure, site and/or its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural or environmental features should be avoided when possible.
 - (4) All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance inconsistent or inappropriate to the original integrity of the building shall be discouraged.
 - (5) Whereas changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure or site and its environment, if these changes are deemed to have acquired significance, then this significance shall be recognized and respected.
 - (6) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure or site shall be treated with sensitivity.
 - (7) Significant architectural features which have deteriorated should be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities whenever possible. Repair or replacement of architectural features should be based on accurate duplication of the feature, and if possible, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
 - (8) The surface cleaning of structures, if provided as part of the application, shall be undertaken with methods designed to minimize damage to historic building materials. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials should be avoided.
- (D) *Additions to Existing Buildings, Structures, and Site.* In addition to the General Review Standards, the following shall be met by applications for additions to existing buildings, outbuildings, structures, and site prior to approval of a Board Order.
- (1) Materials for additions should be traditional to the District, but need not match those of the original structure to which the addition is attached.
 - (2) Contemporary design for additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when they do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural materials, and the design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment. Roofline additions are discouraged or should be placed and designed to have the least amount of visual impact.
 - (2) Additions should be clearly distinguishable from the original structure by keeping additions at a smaller scale where appropriate or other similar measures. The intent of an addition should be that if the additions or alterations were removed the essential form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired. Additions should generally be located to the rear of the original building so that the most significant and visible faces of historic properties are given priority. Additions to the front should be clearly separated from the original building and simplified in design to not detract from the historic



aspects of the structure.

- (3) All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Additions with no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance inconsistent or inappropriate to the original integrity of the building shall be discouraged.

