



Minor Project Review

**14-007MPR – BSC Sawmill Center
Neighborhood District**

Covelli Enterprises Sign

6693 Sawmill Road

This is a request for review of a sign for a business on the west side of Sawmill Road within the Rite Rug Center. This is a request for review and approval of a Minor Project Review application under the provisions of zoning code section 153.066(G).

Date of Application Acceptance

Thursday, January 23, 2014

Date of ART Determination

Thursday, February 6, 2014

Case Manager

Justin Goodwin, AICP, Planner II | (614) 410-4677 | jgoodwin@dublin.oh.us



PART I: APPLICATION OVERVIEW

<i>Zoning District</i>	BSC Sawmill Center Neighborhood District
<i>Development Proposal</i>	Tenant wall sign
<i>Building Type</i>	Existing Structure
<i>Waivers</i>	None
<i>Administrative Departures</i>	None
<i>Property Address</i>	6693 Sawmill Road
<i>Property Owner</i>	Covelli Enterprises
<i>Applicant</i>	Brad Petro, Cicogna Signs
<i>Case Manager</i>	Justin Goodwin, AICP, Planner II (614) 410-4677 jgoodwin@dublin.oh.us

Application Review Procedure: Minor Project Review

The purpose of the Minor Project Review is to provide an efficient review process for smaller projects that do not have significant community effects. The Minor Project Review is necessary to ensure that applications for development meet the requirements of Chapter 153 of the Dublin Zoning Code.

Following acceptance of a complete application for Minor Project Review, the Administrative Review Team shall approve, deny, or approve with conditions the application based on the criteria of §153.066(F)(5) applicable to Site Plan Reviews and Site Plan Review Waivers, if necessary. A determination by the Administrative Review Team is required not more than 14 days from the date the request was submitted.

Application History

The lessee of this tenant space (Covelli Enterprises) received approval from the Administrative Review Team for a Minor Project Review application for exterior modifications on October 3, 2013. The approved exterior modifications included replacement of a storefront window pane, addition of seven windows on the north façade, and minor façade repairs including refinishing the existing stucco sign band on the front elevation.

Zoning Code Analysis

§153.065(H) – Site Development Standards – Signs

This multiple-tenant building is permitted two different types of building-mounted signs for each tenant with a storefront. The applicant is proposing a ±30-square-foot internally illuminated wall sign on the east elevation over the main entrance to the tenant space. No other signs are proposed. This building currently has an existing wall sign above the main tenant entrance in the center of the front elevation with the text 'Rite Rug Center.' A ground sign with the same text is also located along Sawmill Road. Both of these signs were installed prior to adoption of the Bridge Street District zoning regulations.



Existing Structure/Tenant Space

Proposed Wall Sign			
	Permitted	Proposed	Requirement
<i>Size</i>	Max. 30.7 sq. ft. based on ½ sq. ft. per lineal foot of storefront width (61.4 ft. tenant space)	30.3 sq. ft.	Met
<i>Location</i>	On walls facing a public street; located within 6 ft. of the common public entrance; not extending more than 14 in. from the face of the structure	Above the main entrance to the storefront	Met
<i>Height</i>	Located within the first story as appropriate to building type; 15 ft. for Existing Structures; not extending above the roofline	Approx. 12 ft. 9 in. above grade	Met
<i>Colors</i>	Max. 3, except that registered trademarks less than 20% of total sign area may have unlimited colors, provided that sign copy and background use one of the colors within the trademark; or Max. 5 for the entire sign, where a registered corporate trademark exceeds 20% of the sign area.	4 total (black, white, green and apricot) Registered corporate trademark: ±15% of sign area (‘Panera Bread’ copy with logo and associated green band)	Not Met

PART II: ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM COMMENTS

Graphic Design Consultant

Signs in the Bridge Street District are required to be designed with the maximum of creativity and the highest quality of materials and fabrication. Signs are intended to be fully integrated with the building architecture and overall site design, as well as to add a sense of liveliness, activity, and enhanced pedestrian experience in this district.

One of the City’s graphic design consultants, Carrie Krebbeks, has reviewed the originally proposed sign with respect to the intent for signs in the Bridge Street District. A copy of Ms. Krebbek’s memo is attached to this report.

The original proposal included individual channel letters (‘Covelli Enterprises’) and a separate ‘shoe-box’ style internally illuminated sign cabinet with acrylic push-thru letters (‘Panera Bread’), acrylic push-thru logo, and acrylic-backed routed letters (‘Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio’).

Ms. Krebbeks recommended the following:

- Consider using the same font for ‘Covelli Enterprises’ as used for the word ‘Bread’ in the registered trademark, unless the proposed font is necessary for brand consistency.
- Design the Panera Bread trademark (letters, logo and green bar) in a manner more consistent with other examples of Panera Bread signs used at the company’s restaurant locations. Examples include using individual channel letters affixed to a separate aluminum panel (the green bar), with the text and logo extending beyond the edges of the green bar. Many Panera signs use a trapezoidal-shaped green bar instead of a simple rectangle as proposed. Another

option would be to omit the green bar altogether and affix the letters and logo directly to the wall.

- Use the green bar within the registered trademark as a visual separator of information in the sign by separating the 'Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio' text and placing this line beneath the logo as dimensional, non-illuminated letters affixed directly to the wall.
- Consider using back-lit halo lighting to ensure the black 'Covelli Enterprises' letters are visible during day and night.

The applicant has provided additional information clarifying some elements of the sign design and has proposed a revised design incorporating some of the design recommendations. The revised proposal includes:

- Internally-illuminated channel letters ('Covelli Enterprises'), affixed directly to the wall as originally proposed. These letters are black and will use a day/night film that will appear as white when illuminated (similar to the Verizon Wireless office signs along I-270). The applicant has confirmed that the proposed font is consistent with the company's branding specifications.
- The shoe-box cabinet has been replaced with an aluminum backer panel (green bar). The 'Panera Bread' text is proposed as individual, internally illuminated LED channel letters with a separate logo mounted to the backer panel. The text and logo extend slightly above the top edge of the green bar. The applicant has stated that Panera Bread is transitioning away from the use of the trapezoidal bar; the proposed backer panel is rectangular.
- The aluminum backer panel includes routed text ('Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio') beneath the 'Panera Bread' text and logo. This text is proposed as white internally-illuminated acrylic-backed letters.

Planning

The proposed sign meets the applicable zoning regulations for total sign size, number, location, and height. However, additional adjustments are necessary to meet requirements for sign color as it relates to the size of registered corporate trademarks.

The number of permitted sign colors for signs in the Bridge Street District is based on the size of a registered corporate trademark or symbol. Where a registered trademark is 20% or less of the total sign area, the trademark may use unlimited colors, provided that the sign copy and background use one of the colors also used in the trademark. Where a registered trademark exceeds 20% of the sign area, the entire sign is limited to a maximum of five colors, including the trademark, sign copy and background. The intent of the 20% size threshold for registered trademarks is to balance the aesthetic character of the community while also allowing businesses to use their branding specifications.

In this case, the 'Panera Bread' text, logo and green backer bar together constitute a registered corporate trademark. This element of the sign comprises approximately 15% of the total sign area. At this size, the four proposed colors are permitted (white, black, green and apricot) within the trademark. However, the green backer bar is expanded in size to also include the 'Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio' text, which is not part of the registered trademark. The combined size of the 'Panera

Bread' text and logo, the 'Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio' text and the green backer panel constitutes approximately 25% of the total sign area.



While the entire sign does not exceed the maximum five colors permitted where trademarks exceed 20% of the sign area, this sign does not meet this threshold because the actual trademark area is less than 20% of the sign area. In this case, the green backer panel that is normally part of the Panera Bread logo is being expanded as a means to illuminate additional secondary text that is not part of the registered trademark. This does not meet the sign color and trademark size requirements.

Planning recognizes the effort made by the applicant to revise the sign design and add visual interest by using the separate aluminum panel and individual channel letters for the 'Panera Bread' trademark. However, additional modifications to this sign element are necessary to meet the sign color and trademark size requirements. This could be accomplished by decreasing the size of the aluminum panel to serve only as a backer bar for the trademark element. The 'Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio' text should be separated from the aluminum panel and affixed directly to the wall as dimensional, non-illuminated letters (black to coordinate with the 'Covelli Enterprises' text), as recommended by the City's graphic design consultant. With this modification, a consistent margin should be used above and beneath the 'Panera Bread' text when the height of the green bar is reduced.

Building Standards, Parks & Open Space, Fire, Engineering, Police, Economic Development

No comments.

PART III: APPLICABLE REVIEW STANDARDS

Applicable Minor Project Review Criteria

The Administrative Review Team has reviewed this application based on the review criteria for Minor Projects, which include the following:

(c) Meets Applicable Zoning Regulations

Criterion met with condition. The proposed sign is consistent with the Zoning Code requirements for signs with regard to location, number, height, and total size. The size of the aluminum backer panel must be reduced to conform to the size and color requirements for registered corporate trademarks.

(e) Building Relationships and Quality Development

Criterion met with condition. The use of individual channel letters/logo and separate backer panel for the Panera Bread trademark adds visual interest and aesthetic quality to the sign. To accommodate the recommended reduction in size of the green backer panel, the 'Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio' text should be separated from the panel and affixed directly to the wall as dimensional, non-illuminated black letters. This approach will add an additional level of aesthetic quality in addition to meeting the size and color requirements for registered trademarks.

(j) Consistency with Bridge Street Corridor Vision Report, Community Plan, and other Policy Documents

Criterion met with conditions. The Community Plan notes that "Dublin's built environment contributes positively to the community's character. This image is characterized by high quality office buildings, well-landscaped areas and streetscapes, *tasteful signs and graphics*, appropriate lighting standards and quality architecture." The proposed sign, with additional adjustments as described in this report, will positively contribute to the aesthetic character of the community.

PART IV: PROPOSED ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM DETERMINATION

Approval of this Minor Project Review Application with two conditions:

- 1) That the green aluminum backer panel be reduced in size (vertical width) to meet the 20% sign area threshold for corporate trademarks with unlimited colors; and
- 2) That the 'Market Headquarters for Southern Ohio' text be separated from the green backer panel and affixed directly to the wall as dimensional, non-illuminated black letters.

Carrie Krebbeks

DESIGNER. BLOGGER. CRAFT NERD. GO-GETTER.

3055 Sunset Drive, Columbus, OH 43202
ckrebbeks@gmail.com // 614.208.2528

FOR: Rachel Ray, AICP
Planner II, City of Dublin

DATE: January 31, 2014

RE: Covelli Enterprises Sign
Bridge Street Corridor

Per your request, I have reviewed the proposed Covelli Enterprises sign application prepared by Cicogna Electric & Sign Company dated January 23, 2014. My comments are as follows:

1. In regard to the Bridge Street Sign Code Regulations document, the proposed Covelli sign is effective for the purpose of navigation, information and identification for pedestrians and vehicles. It also meets the BSC size requirements.
2. I would ask if the font used for “Covelli Enterprises” is brand-specific to either Covelli or to the Panera Bread brands. I can see that it matches the font of the line under the Panera logo (MARKET HEADQUARTERS, etc.). If it is not a brand-specific font, then I would recommend exploring a different option. Perhaps one that better compliments the “BREAD” in the Panera logo. I would suggest something a bit more clean and streamlined for both “Covelli Enterprises” and “MARKET HEADQUARTERS” if they are not currently dictated by brand standards.
3. The Panera Bread logo and subsequent line appear to be too close to the edges of the green bar containing them. Due to the code requirement related to the size of a registered trademark, it is not possible to increase the margin of the green bar around the logo and line. Perhaps explore some other options incorporating the green bar as a logo backer or omitting it altogether. Please refer to the Panera sign photos below and note how an angle-edged bar is used behind their logo, sometimes even allowing the logo to extend beyond it. The bar would serve as a nice visual separator to provide information hierarchy for the Covelli sign. It would also highlight the Panera logo, a nationally-known brand. If the bar were to go more in this design direction, consider pulling out the “MARKET HEADQUARTERS” line on its own beneath the Panera logo in dimensional, non-illuminated lettering.



NO BAR



BAR EXAMPLES: NOTE ANGLES PROVIDE VISUAL INTEREST



4. The proposed sign plan specifies individual internal illuminated channel letters in black for Covelli Enterprises. I am not completely up to snuff on the technical specifications on this sign proposal; however, I have concern over the black color and its illumination. I would want to ensure that the sign is as noticeable in the evening as it is in the daytime. If the proposed sign intends to illuminate similar to the examples below, then it would be effective. If not, then I would recommend using white lettering to ensure visibility at all hours of the day.



ADDITIONAL INSIGHTS:

While the current proposed sign for Covelli Enterprises is in accordance with regulations, I feel there is potential to make it more aesthetically pleasing and push the envelope for Dublin's new Bridge Street Corridor. It will be a revitalized area with the promise of energy brought to it from people walking/riding/driving through it. It should feel new, refreshing and break-through.

Panera Bread is known for artisan food. Live consciously. Eat deliciously. From the Panera website:

We are bakers of bread. We are fresh from the oven. We are a symbol of warmth and welcome. We are a simple pleasure, honest and genuine. We are a life story told over dinner. We are a long lunch with an old friend. We are your weekday morning ritual. We are the kindest gesture of neighbors. We are home. We are family. We are friends.

Realizing that Covelli Enterprises is more on the business side of things, I still think there could be a tighter tie to the Panera brand using more aesthetically pleasing materials for this sign. Materials that feel natural, warm and closely related to the message around which Panera rallies.

What about using wood or brushed metal? Illuminating the sign using wall-mounted display lights? Making the sign feel slightly more crafted yet professional? Here are some examples of signs that push the envelope with this approach:



Thank you and please let me know if you have any questions regarding my comments.