



City of Dublin Planning and Zoning Commission

Planning Report

Thursday, May 15, 2014

Tuttle Crossing/I-270 PCD, Subarea 5A - 5515 Parkcenter Circle

Case Summary

Agenda Item	3
Case Number	14-033FDP
Site Location	5515 Parkcenter Circle West side of Paul Blazer Parkway, between Rings Road and Parkcenter Circle.
Proposal	Modifications to the parking, landscaping and signs for an existing office building at the northwest corner of the intersection of Parkcenter Circle and Paul Blazer Parkway.
Applicant	Carey BP Dublin LLC; represented by Linda Menerey.
Planning Contact	Jennifer M. Rauch, AICP, Senior Planner (614) 410-4690, jrauch@dublin.oh.us
Requests	Review and approval <u>final development plan</u> under the Planned District provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.050.
Planning Recommendation	Approval of the final development plan with conditions. Based on Planning's analysis, this proposal complies with the final development plan criteria and the existing development standards within the area. Approval is recommended with two conditions. <u>Conditions</u> 1) Sign 7 be moved to the west to meet the required 8-foot setback from the right-of-way along Paul Blazer Parkway. 2) Phase two improvements will not occur until the City is provided written documentation of need by the Owner, as outlined within the development text.

Facts	
Site Area	10.5 acres
Zoning	PCD, Planned Commerce District (Tuttle Crossing/I-270, Subarea 5A plan)
Surrounding Zoning and Uses	The site is surrounded by office uses within the Tuttle Crossing/I-270 Planned Commerce District. The Washington Township Fire Department Station #95 is northeast, across Paul Blazer Parkway.
Site Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two vacant buildings connected by an atrium, totaling 116,500 square feet located in the south portion of the property. • Frontage on three rights-of-way: Rings Road - north, Paul Blazer Parkway - east, and Parkcenter Circle - south. • Atrium Parkway, a private drive to the west. • Parking on the north, south and west of the building. • Access from Atrium and Paul Blazer Parkways. • Irregular western property line along Atrium Parkway/Rings Road with parking restrictions through existing access easements. • Floodplain in the northeastern portion of the site. • Off-site, regional stormwater pond in the northwest corner of site. • Significant mounding along Rings Road and Paul Blazer Parkway. • Mature trees along north and east property lines. Large tree stand adjacent to the pond within the north parking area.
City Council	<p>2013 Approval of a rezoning/preliminary development plan to modify the development text and preliminary development plan regarding parking and sign requirements for the existing site.</p> <p>2003 Approval of a rezoning to create Subarea 5A within the Tuttle Crossing/I-270 PCD and approval of a revised development plan to permit two multi-tenant ground signs.</p>
Planning and Zoning Commission	<p>2013 Recommendation of approval to City Council of a rezoning/preliminary development plan to modify the development text and preliminary development plan regarding parking and sign requirements for the existing site.</p> <p>2000 Approval of a revised development plan to permit a 58,880-square-foot expansion to construct the second building with associated site improvements.</p>

Facts

	<p>1997 Approval of a revised development plan for a parking lot expansion to accommodate the original 63,070-square-foot office building.</p> <p>1995 Approval of a development plan to construct the first building at 63,070 square feet with associated site improvements.</p>
--	--

Details **Final Development Plan**

Proposal	The application includes the reconfiguration of the parking lot, a sign plan, and additional landscaping. The approval is for the final development details for the site, developed in two phases.																															
Phase One	Phase One will include a sign plan and minor landscape modifications.																															
Sign Provisions	<p>The approved development text addresses the need for building and individual tenant identification. The sign provisions outline three different types of signs: monument, canopy, and directional.</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="3">Sign Detail</th> <th colspan="4">Sign Type</th> </tr> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Monument</th> <th rowspan="2">Canopy</th> <th colspan="2">Directional</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Internal</th> <th>External</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Number</td> <td>2</td> <td>2</td> <td>3</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Area (sq. ft.)</td> <td>50</td> <td>24" each</td> <td>6</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Height (ft.)</td> <td>10</td> <td>15</td> <td>6</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Content</td> <td>Tenant names permitted</td> <td>Address only</td> <td>Tenant names permitted</td> <td>Address only</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sign Detail	Sign Type				Monument	Canopy	Directional		Internal	External	Number	2	2	3	1	Area (sq. ft.)	50	24" each	6	4	Height (ft.)	10	15	6	3	Content	Tenant names permitted	Address only	Tenant names permitted	Address only
Sign Detail	Sign Type																															
	Monument		Canopy	Directional																												
		Internal		External																												
Number	2	2	3	1																												
Area (sq. ft.)	50	24" each	6	4																												
Height (ft.)	10	15	6	3																												
Content	Tenant names permitted	Address only	Tenant names permitted	Address only																												
Monument Signs	<p>The applicant is proposing two monument signs; one on the north side of the Blazer Parkway entrance (Sign 7) and one at the northwest corner of Blazer Parkway and Parkcenter Circle (Sign 6). Both signs are 50 square feet and 9 feet high, meeting the text. The Parkcenter Circle/Blazer Parkway sign is single-sided, oriented toward the intersection; the Blazer Parkway entrance sign is perpendicular to the street and double-sided.</p> <p>Code requires signs be set back 8 feet from the right-of-way. Sign 6 is 10 feet from the right-of-way. Sign 7 is in the required setback and must be moved to the west to meet the setback requirement.</p> <p>The sign design is a black aluminum cabinet with white individual raised tenant panels, mounted on a concrete base. The top of the sign has a blue accent panel with the building address/owner in white raised</p>																															

Details	Final Development Plan
	<p>lettering. The tenant panels have black raised copy. Concealed fasteners are used for each panel. The signs will be externally illuminated with small-scale up-lights.</p>
<p>Canopy Signs</p>	<p>Canopy signs are proposed on the two main building entrances along Atrium Parkway to identify the appropriate tenant building entrances for each tenant space (Signs 1 and 3). The proposed signs have address numbers and street name with a maximum letter height of 24 inches. The address numbers are individual aluminum, white channel letters mounted to the top of the canopies. The street name will be white vinyl letters applied to the surface of the metal canopy. Maximum letter heights are met. No illumination is proposed.</p> <p>The sign elevation indicate minor changes to the design of the canopies which will require administrative approval.</p>
<p>Internal and External Directional Signs</p>	<p>The internal signs are proposed at the three building entrances, the north entrance (Sign 5) and one at each Atrium Parkway entrance (Signs 2 and 4). The text permits each sign at 6 square feet and 6 feet high with individual tenant names, suite and floor number. Each sign meets the area and height requirements and incorporates the same of black, blue and white color scheme of the ground signs. Each is single-faced with blue sign posts and a white background with black lettering for the individual tenant panels. No illumination is proposed.</p> <p>The external directional sign is at the southwest corner of the property along Parkcenter Circle approximately 70 east of the Atrium Parkway intersection (Sign 8). It is 4 square feet and 3 feet high, with only the building address, which meets the Code requirements for directional signs. The double-sided sign has a black background and white copy with the similar blue arched detail as the monument sign. The sign will be externally illuminated with the same type of fixture as the monument signs.</p>
<p>Sign Landscape Improvements</p>	<p>The landscape improvements included in Phase One will include only plant material associated with the new sign locations. The three planting areas include a variety of evergreen and deciduous trees and shrubs, as well as perennials.</p>
<p>Site Landscape Compliance</p>	<p>The development text requires a three-foot mound with trees planted one per 40 feet along Blazer Parkway, and each interior parking island is required to contain two trees. The existing site is compliance with these requirements and with regard to the interior vehicular use area and property perimeter landscape requirements within the Code.</p>

Details	Final Development Plan
Phase Two	Phase Two includes the reconfiguration of the existing parking lot, removal of a large landscape island, installation of additional parking and the majority of the required tree replacement. Per the approved development text, Phase Two improvements may not occur until the City is provided written documentation of need by the Owner.
Existing Parking	The required parking ratio is 4 spaces per 1,000 square feet, or 466 spaces. The 571 existing parking spaces equal a ratio of 4.9 spaces per 1,000, with 206 spaces in the south, and 365 in the north. All parking spaces dimensions are 9 feet by 20 feet.
Summary of Proposed Parking Changes	<p>The proposed modifications to the site include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) a decrease in parking space width; 2) the removal of interior landscape islands; and 3) a reconfiguration of the north parking area to remove an existing open space. <p>The proposed modifications could result in an additional 106 parking spaces for a total of 677 parking spaces at ratio of 5.8 spaces per 1,000.</p>
1) Parking Space Width	The approved development text permits a decrease in parking space width from 9 feet to 8.5 feet. The proposal decreases the width of 410 parking spaces. The remaining spaces in the shorter parking rows would not change.
2) Interior Landscape Islands	The proposal removes a series of interior landscape islands in the middle portions of the parking bays and along the east parking lot edge. The proposal continues to meet the interior landscape requirements. Code does not specify a number of interior landscape islands per number of parking spaces, only a percentage of landscape within the parking lot.
3) Open Space Removal	The proposal removes the open space area within the north parking lot. The open space area contains a significant number of landmark trees and acts as an outdoor amenity for this site with picnic tables.
Tree Relocation, Removal, and Replacement	The applicant is proposing to relocate 16 trees caused by the removal and modification of the landscape islands. The proposal includes the removal of 18 trees, or 271 inches. The approved development text requires a total inch replacement for the site regardless of tree condition. The proposed plans indicate the relocated and replacement trees along the perimeter of the parking areas, with particular emphasis along Rings Road to address screening concerns raised at City Council.
Lot Coverage	Lot coverage is 61%. The development text permits lot coverage at 75%, and 25% for building coverage.

Details	Final Development Plan
Stormwater	The applicant has submitted a stormwater management report that demonstrates compliance with the City of Dublin Stormwater Management Code.

Analysis	Final Development Plan
Process	Section 153.050 of the Zoning Code identifies criteria for the review and approval for a final development plan (full text of criteria attached). Following is an analysis by Planning based on those criteria.
1) <i>Consistency with the approved preliminary development plan</i>	Criterion met: This proposed modifications to the site and the signs meet the requirements outlined within the approved development text.
2) <i>Traffic and pedestrian safety</i>	Criterion met: The proposed parking lot modifications retain the continuous drive aisle design and adequate aisle width to maneuver.
3) <i>Adequate public services and open spaces</i>	Criterion met: The site has adequate public services. No open space dedication is required.
4) <i>Protection of natural resources</i>	Criterion met: The proposal for Phase Two removes the large open space within the north parking field and requires the removal of the significant existing trees to provide additional parking for the existing building. The proposal meets the stringent tree replacement requirement of the development text.
5) <i>Adequacy of lighting</i>	Criterion met: The ground signs and external directional sign will be externally illuminated with small ground lights. The proposed lighting plan meets the lighting provisions of the Zoning Code.
6) <i>Proposed signs are consistent with approved preliminary development plan</i> Condition 1	Criterion met with condition: The proposed sign plan meets the development text, with the exception of the location for Sign 7. Sign 7 must be moved to the west to meet the required 8-foot setback from the right-of-way along Paul Blazer Parkway.
7) <i>Appropriate landscaping to enhance, buffer, and soften the building and site</i>	Criterion met: The site complies with the development text landscape requirements for the interior vehicular use area and property perimeter requirements.

Analysis	Final Development Plan
<p>8) <i>Compliant stormwater management</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: The applicant has submitted a stormwater management report that demonstrates compliance with the City of Dublin Stormwater Management Code.</p>
<p>9) <i>All phases (if applicable) comply with the previous criteria.</i></p> <p>Condition 2</p>	<p>Criterion met: The proposal will be constructed in two phases. Phase Two improvements may not occur until the City is provided written documentation of need by the Owner, as outlined within the development text.</p>
<p>10) <i>Compliance with all other laws and regulations.</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: The proposal complies with all other known applicable local, state, and federal laws and regulations.</p>

Recommendation	Final Development Plan
<p>Approval</p>	<p>In Planning’s analysis, this proposal complies with the final development plan criteria and the existing development standards within the area. Approval is recommended with conditions.</p>
<p>Conditions</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Sign 7 be moved to the west to meet the required 8-foot setback from the right-of-way along Paul Blazer Parkway. 2) Phase Two improvements will not occur until the City is provided written documentation of need by the Owner, as outlined within the development text.

FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

The purpose of the Planned Unit Development process is to encourage imaginative architectural design and proper site planning in a coordinated and comprehensive manner, consistent with accepted land planning, landscape architecture, and engineering principles. The PUD process consists of up to three stages:

- 1) Concept Plan (Staff, Commission, and/or City Council review and comment);
- 2) Zoning Amendment Request (Preliminary Development Plan; Commission recommends and City Council approves/denies); and
- 3) **Amended/Final Development Plan (Commission approves/denies).**

The intent of the final development plan is to show conformance with and provide a detailed refinement of the total aspects of the approved preliminary development plan (rezoning). The final development plan includes all of the final details of the proposed development and is the final stage of the PUD process. The Commission may approve as submitted, approve with modifications agreed to by the applicant, or disapprove and terminate the process. If the application is disapproved, the applicant may respond to Planning and Zoning Commission's concerns and resubmit the plan. This action will be considered a new application for review in all respects, including payment of the application fee. Appeal of any action taken by the Commission shall be to the Court of Common Pleas in the appropriate jurisdiction. Following approval by the Commission, the applicant may proceed with the building permit process. In the event that updated citywide standards are applicable, all subsequently approved final development plans shall comply with the updated standards if the Planning and Zoning Commission determines that the updated standards would not cause undue hardship.

Review Criteria

In accordance with Section 153.055(B) *Plan Approval Criteria*, the Code sets out the following criteria of approval for a final development plan:

- 1) The plan conforms in all pertinent respects to the approved preliminary development plan provided, however, that the Planning and Zoning Commission may authorize plans as specified in §153.053(E)(4);
- 2) Adequate provision is made for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulation within the site and to adjacent property;
- 3) The development has adequate public services and open spaces;
- 4) The development preserves and is sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site in a manner that complies with the applicable regulations set forth in this Code;
- 5) The development provides adequate lighting for safe and convenient use of the streets, walkways, driveways, and parking areas without unnecessarily spilling or emitting light onto adjacent properties or the general vicinity;
- 6) The proposed signs, as indicated on the submitted sign plan, will be coordinated within the Planned Unit Development and with adjacent development; are of an appropriate size, scale, and design in relationship with the principal building, site, and surroundings; and are located so as to maintain safe and orderly pedestrian and vehicular circulation;
- 7) The landscape plan will adequately enhance the principal building and site; maintain existing trees to the extent possible; buffer adjacent incompatible uses; break up large expanses of pavement with natural material; and provide appropriate plant materials for the buildings, site, and climate;
- 8) Adequate provision is made for storm drainage within and through the site which complies with the applicable regulations in this Code and any other design criteria established by the City or any other governmental entity which may have jurisdiction over such matters;
- 9) If the project is to be carried out in progressive stages, each stage shall be so planned that the foregoing conditions are complied with at the completion of each stage; and
- 10) The Commission believes the project to be in compliance with all other local, state, and federal laws and regulations.