



City of Dublin Planning and Zoning Commission

# Planning Report

Thursday, March 12, 2015

## COTA Park and Ride Relocation Emerald Parkway and Bright Road

### Case Summary

Agenda Item	1
Case Number	15-006Z/CU
Site Location	4030, 4000, 3960 Bright Road Northeast corner of the intersection Emerald Parkway and Bright Road.
Proposal	A <u>conditional use</u> to permit the use of the site as a public park and ride.
Request	Review and approval of a conditional use under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.236.
Owner	City of Dublin. Dana McDaniel, City Manager
Case Manager	Jennifer M. Rauch, AICP, Senior Planner   (614) 410-4690   jrauch@dublin.oh.us
Planning Recommendation	<u>Approval of Conditional Use</u> Based on Planning's analysis, this proposal complies with all applicable review criteria. Approval is recommended with no conditions.



 <p>City of Dublin</p>	<p>15-006Z/CU Rezoning / Conditional Use COTA Park &amp; Ride 4000 Bright Road</p>	<p>0 150 300 Feet</p> 
---	--	---

<b>Facts</b>	
Site Area	4.9 acres; 3.3 acres rezoned
Zoning	R-1, Restricted Suburban Residential District
Surrounding Zoning	West and South: R-1, Restricted Suburban Residential District East and North: PUD, Planned Unit Development - NE Quad
Site Features	The site is currently undeveloped and has frontage on both Emerald Parkway and Bright Road. Several single-family homes were previously demolished on the parcels for construction of the last section of Emerald Parkway and the new roundabout with Bright Road. Billingsley Creek and the associated floodplain are along the north property line. Existing vegetation is in the north portion of the site along the creek and along the east property line.
Neighborhood Contact	City and COTA representatives held a neighborhood meeting on January 7, 2015 to introduce the proposed COTA park and ride relocation. A summary of the comments and discussion have been included in the packet.
Ordinance 04-15	<p>City Council introduced Ordinance 04-15 on January 5, 2015, regarding the proposed development agreement and real estate exchange for the relocation of the COTA park and ride. The ordinance was tabled at the second reading on January 26, 2015 to await the outcome and review of the Planning and Zoning Commission for the rezoning and conditional use proposals. Council stated the importance of allowing the Planning and Zoning Commission review process to take place prior to making a final decision on the development agreement and real estate exchange.</p> <p>During the hearing, a number of residents outlined their concerns regarding the proposed park and ride at the Bright Road location. These concerns included the approval of the existing Bright Road Area Plan, impacts to the surrounding area, timing of the project, and neighborhood involvement.</p> <p>City Council requested additional information be provided, which include the Bright Road Area Plan history, proposed COTA bus routes and times, and COTA rider location information. This information has been provided in the packet for your reference. Additional information from COTA may be provided prior to the meeting.</p>
Update	<p>Planning and Zoning Commission reviewed the standard district rezoning and conditional use on February 5, 2015. At this meeting, the Commission made a recommendation of approval to City Council for the standard district rezoning from R-1, Restricted Suburban Residential District to SO, Suburban Office and Institutional District, as the Commission found that the proposal met the Community Plan. The proposal was forwarded to City Council and introduced (Ordinance 13-15) on February 23, 2105, with public hearing scheduled for March 9, 2015.</p> <p>At the February 5<sup>th</sup> meeting, Commission postponed action on the conditional use request to allow the applicant to address comments made by Commission members. The Commission recommended a naturalized buffer and plantings adjacent to the creek, the reduction in the size of the proposed retention pond through alternative stormwater techniques, increased setback of the pond from the creek, and additional tree preservation in the northeast portion of the site.</p>

Details	Conditional Use
Plan Overview	The proposal includes a COTA park and ride with 169 parking spaces, a 48-square-foot bus shelter, and associated site improvements.
Site Layout	The proposed COTA park and ride relocation is proposed at the northeast corner of the Emerald Parkway and Bright Road roundabout. The site includes two access points on Emerald Parkway and Bright Road, respectively. The internal site circulation provides a separated bus lane for passenger drop-off and pick-up that runs parallel to the Emerald Parkway and Bright Road frontages. The 169 parking spaces are north and east of the bus lane. A proposed stormwater management area located in the northeast corner of the site, adjacent to the creek.
Setbacks	<p>The front yard setbacks for buildings are based on the width of the rights-of-way and measured from the center line of the road. The required building setbacks from Bright Road are 133 feet and 201 feet from Emerald Parkway. The proposed plans show the bus shelter located within the building setback along Emerald Parkway. The conditional use process (Section 153.236 (C)(2)) permits the Commission to approve this encroachment with the conditional use. The shelter is appropriately placed and does not interfere with sight distance or otherwise obstruct the setback area.</p> <p>Code permits parking areas to encroach by up to 40% of the required building setback, which would be 80 feet along Bright Road and 121 feet along Emerald Parkway. These setbacks, while labeled incorrectly, meet the requirements. A 15-foot Code required side (east) and rear (north) yard setbacks are met.</p>
Shelter	Code permits one passenger shelter, not to exceed 50 square feet, and designed to be harmonious with the architectural character of the surrounding area. The proposed shelter is 48 square feet and is a detailed black metal and glass shelter placed on the west side of the bus lane along Emerald Parkway.
Landscaping	<p>The site complies with Code required landscape provisions (Section 153.130). Landscaping includes the required perimeter buffering with mounding (42 inches high) and landscaping (1 tree per 30 feet) along the Emerald Parkway and Bright Road frontages to screen the parking area and bus drive aisle. Evergreen shrubs (3 feet high) and trees (1 tree per 30 feet) are shown along the north and east edges of the parking area.</p> <p>Code required interior landscape areas (3,865 square feet) and trees (16) are provided within the parking lot landscape islands.</p> <p>There will be 73 trees (1,109 inches) removed, of which 795 inches are required to be replaced. The applicant has worked with Staff to maximize the replacement on-site and the remaining inches not replaced will be mitigated by a fee.</p> <p>The Planning and Zoning Commission had recommended that the northwest row of parking spaces be reevaluated to determine if additional tree preservation could be accommodated. The City's landscape inspectors have inspected and evaluated these trees and determined that they are in poor condition and that their removal is appropriate.</p>

Details	Conditional Use												
Stormwater	<p>The previous version of the proposal included a large retention pond in the northeast portion of the site, which met the stormwater management requirements. At its review, the Commission recommended that alternative stormwater management methods be incorporated on the site to reduce the size of the pond, move it farther from the creek and the 100-year floodplain, and make the area appear more natural. To address these comments, a combination of underground storage for the stormwater and a series of bioretention basins have been incorporated into the design. Additionally, a more naturalized planting area is proposed around the bioretention basins to better blend with the existing vegetation and creek to the north and west.</p>												
Sign	<p>Code requires ground signs to be set back 8 feet from the right-of-way. The plans indicate one proposed ground sign at the right-of-way line in southwest portion of the site adjacent to the roundabout. Given the significant depth of the rights-of-way for this site and the existing utilities with the vicinity of the proposed sign, Planning recommends the sign be permitted in the proposed location and approved as part of the conditional use review as permitted by Section 153.236 (C)(2).</p>												
Parking and Lighting	<p>The park and ride lot has 169 parking spaces at the Code required dimensions (9 feet x 19 feet). The site includes internal parking lot lighting, which include 20-foot tall poles spaced throughout the parking lot. The site will be required to meet the lighting provisions of the Zoning Code (Section 153.206 (A)) with the building permit process.</p>												
Traffic	<p>Extensive discussion regarding traffic was held as part of the initial review of the proposal with the Planning and Zoning Commission. The overall traffic patterns, impacts to the surrounding area, future improvements for Bright Road and at its intersection with Sawmill Road were discussed at length. The information provided by Engineering concluded the proposed use would generate fewer trips and have less impact than a standard office use. In addition, individual vehicle trips are being consolidated across the roadway network as a result of the COTA bus service. As previously provided, the traffic study has been accepted by Engineering with expected traffic generation as follows.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Time Period</th> <th>Entering Trips</th> <th>Exiting Trips</th> <th>Total Trips</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Weekday AM Peak</td> <td>85</td> <td>23</td> <td>108</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Weekday PM Peak</td> <td>27</td> <td>80</td> <td>107</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Although not part of the traffic study, some comparison numbers are appropriate. A regular office building of approximately 31,350 square feet would be within the permitted Community Plan density anticipated for this site. According to the Institute of Transportation Engineers, <i>Trip Generation Manual</i>, this use would generate approximately 115 trips in the evening peak hour, or roughly 550 for the day as traffic activity could be expected from visitors, employees leaving for appointments or lunch, or other reasons. This pattern of traffic movement would not apply to the park and ride use as all activity takes place at specific periods of the morning and evening.</p>	Time Period	Entering Trips	Exiting Trips	Total Trips	Weekday AM Peak	85	23	108	Weekday PM Peak	27	80	107
Time Period	Entering Trips	Exiting Trips	Total Trips										
Weekday AM Peak	85	23	108										
Weekday PM Peak	27	80	107										

Analysis	Conditional Use
<p><i>Conditional Use Intent and Process</i></p>	<p>Specifically listed conditional uses are provided within the zoning district regulations in recognition that such uses, although often desirable, will more intensely affect the surrounding area in which they are located than the permitted uses of such zoning districts. The Zoning Code sets forth development standards and criteria for locating and developing a conditional use in accordance with the nature of the surrounding area, conditions of development and with regard to appropriate plans. Section 153.236 of the Zoning Code identifies the criteria for the review and approval of a conditional use (full text of criteria at the end of this report).</p>
<p>1) <i>Harmonious with the Zoning Code and/or Community Plan.</i></p>	<p><b>Criterion met:</b> This proposal is consistent with the requirements of the Zoning Code and the Community Plan but requires a rezoning to SO. If approved, the conditional use would not be effective until the effective date of the rezoning by City Council following the second reading of the rezoning ordinance on March 9, 2015.</p>
<p>2) <i>Complies with applicable standards.</i></p>	<p><b>Criterion met:</b> This proposal is consistent with the specific requirements of the SO District of the Zoning Code, with the exception of the shelter and sign locations. Planning recommends approval of both exceptions as part of the conditional use review (Section 153.236 (C)(2)).</p>
<p>3) <i>Harmonious with existing or intended character in vicinity.</i></p>	<p><b>Criterion met:</b> The proposed use will not alter the essential character of the area. The proposed COTA park and ride site is set back significantly from the street with substantial landscaping and mounding to screen the use. Lighting fixtures and levels are managed through the Zoning Code. The operation of the use is concentrated primarily in the morning and early evening, with little activity during the day or weekends. Other uses permitted in the district would have similar sized parking areas, but would have the potential for additional activity during the day and weekends. As such, this is use generally less intrusive and has a lesser effect on surrounding uses.</p>
<p>4) <i>Will not have a hazardous or negative impact on surrounding uses.</i></p>	<p><b>Criterion met conditions:</b> Proposed operations will not have an adverse effect on surrounding uses.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lighting is managed through the Zoning Code. Nearby uses are sufficiently separated from this site.</li> <li>• Activity will be limited generally to daylight and early morning/evening during bus route operating hours.</li> <li>• Traffic is generally less than that which would be expected with an office use, and much less intrusive than could be permitted by a restaurant, which could include requests for a drive through restaurant (also allowed by conditional use approval).</li> <li>• The environmental effects are likely less than what could be permitted by the district. For example, the proposed lot coverage for this property is at 49%. An office or other use permitted through the SO zoning would permit up to 70% lot coverage.</li> </ul>
<p>5) <i>Will provide adequate services and facilities.</i></p>	<p><b>Criterion met:</b> Nearby streets are sufficient to accommodate expected traffic movements. The submitted traffic study demonstrates that the access points to the park and ride operate at an acceptable level of service (C). The operator (COTA) has indicated that this facility meets their needs for location and size.</p>

Analysis	Conditional Use
6) <i>Will not harm the economic welfare.</i>	<b>Criterion met:</b> This proposed use contributes positively to the economic climate of the city by providing an additional community amenity and supporting the goal of reducing peak hour vehicular traffic by taking individual vehicles off the road.
7) <i>Create no use or characteristic that is detrimental to the surrounding uses.</i>	<b>Criterion met:</b> The use will not be detrimental to the surrounding area. The proposed park and ride facility will serve an amenity for the area and future office development. Development east of the site is expected to be additional offices or other neighborhood level services as permitted by the SO District. Development to the south is expected to continue the residential development to the east. None of these uses will be adversely affected or discouraged from development by the presence of the COTA lot.
8) <i>Vehicular circulation will not interfere with existing circulation.</i>	<b>Criterion met:</b> Site circulation and stacking are accommodated on site. Nearby streets are sufficient to accommodate expected traffic movements. Access to the site is separated from the beginning of the roundabout area and has been approved by Engineering.
9) <i>Not detrimental to property values in the vicinity.</i>	<b>Criterion met:</b> This proposal will not be detrimental to property values. All site facilities are well set back from the surrounding streets and adjacent properties. The use will generally have fewer and less adverse effects than what might be anticipated by an office development or other uses that could be approved.
10) <i>Will not impede the development or improvement of surrounding properties.</i>	<b>Criterion met:</b> This proposal uses are contained on site and will not impede development or improvement to the surrounding properties. Office and other related uses may be anticipated on adjacent properties to the east as the Community Plan shows these properties as Neighborhood Office. None of these uses will be adversely affected or discouraged from development by the presence of the COTA lot.

Recommendation	Conditional Use
Approval	Planning recommends approval of the proposal with the alteration of the shelter location and the sign location, as it complies with the conditional use review criteria of Section 153.236(C).

## CONDITIONAL USE REVIEW CRITERIA

Section 153.236(C) sets out criteria for the review and approval of a Conditional Use.

- (C) Action by the Planning Commission. The Planning and Zoning Commission shall hold a public hearing and shall not approve a conditional use unless it finds that such use at the proposed location meets all of the following requirements:
- 1) The proposed use will be harmonious with and in accordance with the general objectives, or with any specific objective or purpose of the Zoning Code and/or Community Plan.
  - 2) The proposed use will comply with all applicable development standards, except as specifically altered in the approved conditional use.
  - 3) The proposed use will be harmonious with the existing or intended character of the general vicinity and that such use will not change the essential character of the same area.
  - 4) The use will not be hazardous to or have a negative impact on existing or future surrounding uses.
  - 5) The area and proposed use(s) will be adequately served by essential public facilities and services such as highways, streets, police, and fire protection, drainage structures, refuse disposal, water and sewers, and schools; or that the persons or agencies responsible for the establishment of the proposed use shall be able to provide adequately any such services.
  - 6) The proposed use will not be detrimental to the economic welfare of the community.
  - 7) The proposed use will not involve uses, activities, processes, materials, equipment and conditions of operations, including, but not limited to, hours of operation, that will be detrimental to any persons, property, or the general welfare by reason of excessive production of traffic, noise, smoke, fumes, glare, odor or other characteristic not comparable to the uses permitted in the base zoning district.
  - 8) Vehicular approaches to the property shall be so designed as not to create interference with traffic on surrounding public and/or private streets or roads.
  - 9) The proposed use will not be detrimental to property values in the immediate vicinity.
  - 10) The proposed use will not impede the normal and orderly development and improvement of the surrounding property for uses permitted in the district.