



ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM

MEETING MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 10, 2015

ART Members and Designees: Vince Papsidero, Planning Director; Colleen Gilger, Director of Economic Development; Aaron Stanford, Senior Civil Engineer; Alan Perkins, Fire Marshal; and Jeff Tyler, Building Standards Director.

Other Staff: Devayani Puranik, Planner II; Marie Downie, Planner I; Rachel Ray, Economic Development Administrator; Nicki Martin, Planning Assistant; and Laurie Wright, Staff Assistant.

Applicants: Laura Timberlake, Big Sandy Superstores and Randy L. VanTilburg, The Mannik & Smith Group, Inc. (Cases 2 & 3); Logan Dilts, DaNite Sign Company (Case 3); Richard Letizia, Nestle Quality Assurance Center and Tony Weaver, Hixson Architecture, Engineering, Interiors (Case 4); Young Jin Kim, J Tiger Martial Arts (Case 5); and Melissa Spires, OHM Advisors; and Nelson Yoder, Crawford Hoying Development Partners (Case 7).

Others Present: Steve Stidhem, Planning and Zoning Commission member.

Vince Papsidero called the meeting to order. He asked if there were any amendments to the September 3, 2015, meeting minutes. The minutes were accepted into the record as presented.

INTRODUCTIONS

1. **Verizon Wireless Co-Location – Dublin Scioto High School** **4000 Hard Road**
15-088ARTW **Administrative Review – Wireless**

Marie Downie said this is a request for the installation of 12 antennas, 12 RRUs, 3 OVPs, 3 hybrid cables, and 12 coax cables on an existing field light pole as well as a 300-square-foot ground shelter to hold a generator at the Dublin Scioto High School. She said this is a request for review and approval of a wireless communications facility under the provisions of Chapter 99 of the Dublin Code of Ordinances.

Ms. Downie presented the site on the north side of Hard Road, west of the intersection with Emerald Parkway with an existing field light pole on the football field and the current compound. She said the existing pole is 150 feet in height. She explained the antenna arrays will be installed at 136 feet, which exceeds the current regulation at 120 feet, but since it is an existing co-location with a separate array located at the top of the pole it is a non-issue. She said the applicant is also proposing the construction of a 300-square-foot shelter at the base that is enclosed with a chain link fence that matches the existing fences on the site. She noted the proposed barbed wire on the eight-foot fence will need to be removed. She presented a photo of a shelter the applicant proposed to construct.

Ms. Downie indicated Planning recommends that landscaping be added at the base.

Rachel Ray reported that the antenna array exists, but does not currently hold any equipment. She said the shelter is an industrialized unit. Jeff Tyler clarified the shelter as an industrialized unit (IU) that will require state approval prior to a building permit.

Claudia Husak inquired about the height of the pole exceeding regulations. Ms. Ray explained the tower and antennas were erected prior to the adoption of the amendments to Chapter 99 in 2007 and that the poles are designed to handle multiple antennas at different heights.

Steve Stidhem asked if anyone had considered installing antennas on poles made to look more like trees, which is a new concept.

Ms. Ray said wireless co-location equipment is approved on a site-by-site basis. She pointed out that the existing pole is being used to hold field lighting for the high school so by Planning's standards, this equipment is stealth.

Vince Papsidero asked if there were any further questions or concerns regarding this application. [There were none.] He stated the ART determination is scheduled for September 17, 2015.

**2. Big Sandy's Superstore – Site Improvements
15-089BSD-MPR**

**6825 Dublin Center Drive
Minor Project Review**

Nicki Martin said this is a request for façade and site renovations to an existing building northwest of the intersection of Tuller Road and Dublin Center Drive. She said this is a request for review and approval of a Minor Project Review under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.

Ms. Martin presented an aerial view of the site and noted the warehouse-type building. She pointed out the proposed minor demolition of a planting island and existing sidewalk. She presented the façade and noted the proposed modifications that include three metal and glass portico entrances fronting the parking lot, a wing wall to balance out the façade and to cover the service center, and a new landscaping plan for beds along the building, planters, and parking lot islands.

Laura Timberlake, Big Sandy's Superstore, said this is a family-owned business consisting of 12 retail stores. She noted the newest and closest store to Dublin, Ohio is in Lancaster, Ohio and that there is no strong player from a home furniture standpoint in the Columbus, Ohio area. She reported Big Sandy's Superstore has 60% of the market share in other areas, they have 600 employees, and this will be a 5,000-square-foot showroom space. She said Big Sandy's Superstore covers all home furnishings (electronics, furniture, and bedding). She indicated through their aggressive advertising that they will drive traffic in to this center.

Claudia Husak asked if there were before and after illustrations of the elevations. Ms. Timberlake said she could provide that. Ms. Husak clarified there should be at least photographs of the site before modifications.

Ms. Timberlake provided a printed 'before' photo indicating the existing main entrance on the east side of the front façade. She said the front façade will be extended 12 feet and a metal-motif awning with slate roofing is proposed over the sidewalk. She said the proposed entrances are glass and steel with a brick inset.

Vince Papsidero asked if there were any further questions or concerns regarding this application. [There were none.] He stated the ART determination is scheduled for September 17, 2015.

**3. Big Sandy's Superstore – Signs
15-090BSD-MSP**

**6825 Dublin Center Drive
Master Sign Plan**

Nicki Martin said this is a request for the installation of one primary and two secondary entrance signs, one wall sign and one wayfinding sign to be coordinated with the proposed façade and site renovations. She said this is a request for review and recommendation of approval to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a Master Sign Plan under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.

Ms. Martin presented an aerial view of the site and pointed out the location of the five proposed signs: three building mounted signs over the one primary and two secondary entrances on the south elevation; one wall sign on the east elevation; and one wall sign on the north elevation as a wayfinding sign to provide direction for semi-trucks and customers loading/unloading products.

Ms. Martin said Code permits one ground sign per street frontage (maximum of two signs) and one wall sign per street frontage limited to 15 feet in height and one-half square feet per each lineal foot of building frontage (maximum 50 square feet). She indicated that the proposal exceeds Code but the applicant can submit a Master Sign Plan for architecturally integrated and creative signs, not just for requesting additional signs and sizes that exceed Code.

Ms. Martin said the proposed 114.66-square-foot primary entrance sign is 15 feet in height and reads "Big Sandy Superstore". She said the proposed sign is three colors – white, red, and has a slate background.

Ms. Martin said there are two proposed secondary entrance signs. She said they are consistent in design with red and white letters mounted on two separate canopies. She said the sign proposed to the west of the primary entrance is 46 square feet, at a height of 15 feet and reads "Sleep Solutions". She said the proposed sign to the east of the primary entrance is 51 square feet, at a height of 15 feet and reads "HDTV & Appliances". She said Code requires that letters not extend past 14 inches from the front façade.

Ms. Martin said the wall sign for the east elevation is 88 square feet and the height is greater than 20 feet. She said the applicant will need to lower the sign to a maximum height of 15 feet. She noted the location was proposed based on the brick placement where this sign would be architecturally integrated. She said the secondary image is under 20% of the sign's size and is three colors – white, red, and slate.

Ms. Martin said the proposed non-illuminated wall sign on the north elevation is 31 square feet at a height of 10 feet. She said the sign is proposed to be white with text that reads "Pick up" and an arrow to direct semi-trucks and customers to the loading/unloading location. She suggested the applicant consider a directional sign that meets Code. She said directional signs do not require a sign permit but cannot exceed 4 square feet or a height of 3 feet.

Jeff Tyler asked if the signs were sent to the City's consultant for review. Ms. Martin confirmed that the signs had been sent.

Claudia Husak asked if a ground sign would work in place of the wall sign on the north elevation. Laura Timberlake, Big Sandy's Superstore, said a ground sign would not be visible to the full semi-trucks.

Randy VanTilburg, The Mannik & Smith Group, Inc., said the sign on the north elevation would be so far back from Tuller Road that it would need to be large. Ms. Timberlake added the dense vegetation would cover a ground sign.

Ms. Husak said there are minimum/maximum parking requirements within the West Innovation District. She said with the current proposal, a total of 221 spaces will be located on site. She said the total parking requirements per Code for the existing facility with the approved building addition is 103 spaces. She said the current facility has a known parking shortage and has a shared parking agreement with the nearby church to accommodate its current parking needs. She said additional documentation provided indicates the approved expansion has increased the number of employees and the need for additional parking. She clarified that the applicant is asking for ART approval of a parking modification to exceed the Code requirements.

Ms. Husak said the applicant will need to provide any necessary additional bicycle parking spaces, if needed. She said a total of 15 bicycle spaces are required for the entire site, including the two additional spaces for the proposed parking expansion.

Ms. Husak said two additional trees are required with the proposed improvements to meet the required parking lot tree plantings.

Tony Weaver, Hixson Architecture, Engineering, Interiors (participated by phone) asked about the additional two trees required as he thought only one would need to be provided. Ms. Husak asked the applicant to confirm numbers at building permitting.

Mr. Weaver asked what was to be included in the request for more detailed analysis.

Aaron Stanford said for areas over 2000 square feet, the engineer providing the analysis needs to finalize and sign off of on the plans to meet Code.

Ms. Husak said approval is recommended for a Development Plan with three conditions:

- 1) That the applicant provide any landscaping required by Code, subject to approval by Planning;
- 2) That the applicant demonstrates that the 15 bicycle parking spaces area is provided on-site; and
- 3) That the applicant provides a more detailed analysis with the building permit demonstrating how the proposed parking area meets the City's stormwater management requirements.

Mr. Papsidero asked the applicant if he agreed to the conditions to which Mr. Weaver said he did.

Mr. Papsidero asked if there were any further questions or concerns regarding this application. [There were none.] He confirmed the ART's approval of the Development Plan with three conditions.

**5. BSD-SCN – J Tiger Martial Arts – Sign
15-086MPR**

**6627 Dublin Center Drive
Minor Project Review**

Marie Downie said this is a request for the installation of a new wall sign for a tenant in the Dublin Village Center shopping center on the west side of Dublin Center Drive, east of Village Parkway. She said this is a request for review and approval of a Minor Project Review under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.

Ms. Downie presented revised signs from the applicant. She said the logo was removed from the wall sign and included as a window sign to be located to the right of the entrance. She reported the proposed wall sign meets Code for size, location, height, color, and number. She said the proposed window sign

meets Code for location, color, and number, but additional information is needed to determine if the sign meets the size requirements but adjustments can be made at sign permitting.

Ms. Downie said approval is recommended for a Minor Project Review with one condition:

- 1) That the applicant provide additional dimensions at the time of permitting to confirm that all size requirements are met for the window sign.

Young Jin Kim, J Tiger Martial Arts, agreed to the condition.

Mr. Kim inquired about the possibility of additional signs or banners. Ms. Downie confirmed the tenant is permitted two wall mounted signs and any changes would need to be brought back to the ART for review and approval.

Vince Papsidero asked if there were any further questions or concerns regarding this application. [There were none.] He confirmed the ART's approval of the Minor Project Review with one condition.

**6. BSD-SCN – Training Grounds – Sign
15-087MPR**

**6791 Dublin Center Drive
Minor Project Review**

Marie Downie said this is a request for the installation of a new wall sign for a tenant in the Dublin Village Center shopping center south of Tuller Road, east of Village Parkway. She said this is a request for review and approval of a Minor Project Review under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.

Ms. Downie presented the proposed sign and reported that the sign meets Code. She said Studio Graphique reviewed this proposal and recommended that the sign be centered between the two brick columns.

Jeff Tyler said a building permit was required prior to a sign permit.

Ms. Downie said approval is recommended for a Minor Project Review with one condition:

- 1) That the sign be centered between the two brick columns.

Eric Hilty, Hilty Signs agreed to the condition, prior to the meeting.

Vince Papsidero asked if there were any questions or concerns regarding this application. [There were none.] He confirmed ART's approval of the Minor Project Review with one condition.

**7. BSD-C – Home2 Hotel
15-059BSD-DP/SP/MSP**

**5000 Upper Metro Place
Development Plan/Site Plan
Master Sign Plan**

Devayani Puranik said this is a request for the construction of a new four-story hotel with 126 suites and associated site improvements on a 2.57-acre site on the south side of SR161 and on the west side of Frantz Road between West Bridge Street and Upper Metro Place. She said this is a request for review and recommendation of approval to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a Development Plan, Site Plan, and Master Sign Plan under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.

Ms. Puranik presented an aerial view of the site and a summary of the application that includes a Development Plan, Site Plan, Parking Plan, and Master Sign Plan. She said the Final Plat will be a separate application.

Ms. Puranik said the Development Plan consists of an existing 2.57-acre commercial site to be split into two lots; a four-story, Corridor Building; 80,481-square-foot hotel with 129 units; 1,900 square feet of Open Space; 122 shared parking spaces; and a 2-story, 14,000-square-foot office building (Phase II).

Ms. Puranik said the required Open Space for the Site Plan is 1,890 square feet and the applicant has proposed 1,900 square feet and two pocket plazas located along Frantz Road with a connection to a multi-use path.

Ms. Puranik presented the Site Plan façade materials as shown on each elevation. She said City Council reviewed this application last month and as a result of those comments the materials have not changed but the color is now a brick red.

Ms. Puranik said the required parking for the site includes 135 parking spaces and 13 bicycle parking spaces. She said the applicant is requesting a Parking Plan for 122 parking spaces and 12 bicycle parking spaces, but the applicant should work with Staff to provide one additional bicycle parking space.

Ms. Puranik presented updated elevations illustrating façade materials.

Ms. Puranik presented the recommendations and actions being requested of the ART today:

Development Plan Review

- o Development Plan recommendation of approval (no conditions or Waivers)

Site Plan Review

- o Administrative Departures approval (4 proposed)
- o Material Request recommendation of approval
- o Site Plan Waivers recommendation of approval (10 proposed)
- o Site Plan recommendation of approval (5 conditions)

Parking Plan recommendation of approval (1 condition)

Ms. Puranik said the Master Sign Plan will be reviewed at a later stage.

Ms. Puranik said approval is recommended for four Administrative Departures:

1. Transparency Requirements: Street facing upper story - 30% required; 27% provided
2. Landscape Islands (2 islands): Minimum Width - 10 feet required; 9 feet provided
3. Curb Radii at Public Right-of-Way: Curb radii for driveways connecting parking lots to public roadways cannot exceed 20 feet; 30 feet existing condition
4. Driveway width at Public Right-of-Way: Drive width cannot be wider than 22 feet at the intersection with the adjacent street right-of-way; 45 feet existing condition

The applicant, Nelson Yoder, Crawford Hoying Development Partners agreed to the departures.

Ms. Puranik said approval is recommended to the Planning and Zoning Commission for 10 Site Plan Waivers:

1. Street Frontage §153.062(N)(a)(2) – RBZ: 15-feet required; Building set at 30 feet requested
2. Street Frontage §153.062(N)(a)(5) – FPL Coverage: 75% required; 0% requested
3. Vehicular Canopy location §153.062(L)(1): Vehicular canopy location at the rear façade of the building required; side façade requested
4. Street Façade/Number of Entrances §153.062(E)(1)(3) - SR161: 1 per 75 feet of façade required; none requested
5. Corridor Building – Transparency §153.062(O)(5):
 - o Street Facing Façade - 30% required; SR161 façade 2nd story 26%, 3rd story 26% requested
 - o Non-street facing façade - 15% required; West elevation 2nd story 12%, 3rd story 11% requested
6. Corridor Building - Blank Wall Limitations §153.062(O)(5): Maximum 15 feet horizontal required
 - o East Elevation at the 4th story requested
 - o West Elevation at the 3rd and 4th stories requested - ART recommended disapproval for West façade blank wall.
7. Window Detailing - Lintels or Sills §153.062(H)(f): Windows in masonry walls shall have architecturally appropriate lintels and projecting sills required
8. Open Space – Proportions §153.064(G)(1)(b): 3:1 ratio length to width required; 5.6:1 ratio length to width requested
9. Street Trees §153.065(D): Street Trees along SR161 and Frantz Road
10. Landscape Islands §153.065(D)(5)(C)(2): Minimum width of a landscape peninsula or island shall be 10 feet with a minimum area of 150 square feet required; 10 feet to 6 feet tapered islands with 312 square feet – 2 islands requested

Mr. Yoder inquired about the fifth Waiver regarding transparency. Ms. Puranik said that the fourth story height is more than remaining stories and would affect the transparency calculations.

Claudia Husak asked if the ART accepts the elevation appearance. Jeff Tyler indicated the ART can accept transparency as architecturally appropriate. He said the ART can defer to the Planning and Zoning Commission to make the final determination.

Mr. Tyler asked why windows were removed that were previously proposed when there is a blank wall issue. Melissa Spires, OHM Advisors, explained they added a wrapped box at the corner on the SR161 elevation because it was not well received by the PZC. Ms. Spires said they could add the slit-style windows to meet the blank wall requirement.

Mr. Yoder agreed to the 10 Waivers.

Ms. Puranik noted Code Section 153.062(E)(1)(c) states that permitted primary building materials shall be high quality, durable materials including but not limited to stone, manufactured stone, full depth brick and glass.

Ms. Puranik said approval is recommended to the Planning and Zoning Commission for the following primary material for the facades and the architectural boxes to wrap the corners, suitable for wood construction, and consistency:

1. Thin Brick

Mr. Yoder demonstrated why the thin brick was being requested as a primary material. He presented the thin brick corner piece that looks like full depth brick even on the corners of a building. He said this brick would be consistent with the material used for the boxes.

Mr. Tyler indicated he supports the thin brick material for this project but it all depends on the detailing. He noted this ART decision is setting a precedent. Colleen Gilger asked if thin brick has been allowed in other parts of the City, just not the Bridge Street District. The ART said it has been approved and used for other developments.

Ms. Puranik said approval is recommended to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a Site Plan Review with five conditions:

- 1) That within the first three years of transplanting existing trees, the applicant replaces each failed transplanted tree with a 4-inch-caliper tree (location and species to be determined by the City Forester) to maintain the same number of trees as illustrated on the approved landscape plan;
- 2) That the applicant provides the exterior lighting photometric plan prior to building permitting;
- 3) That the applicant provides cut-sheets for proposed exterior lighting fixtures including wall mounted fixtures prior to building permitting;
- 4) That the applicant provides a Pedestrian Circulation Plan required by §153.065(I)(3)(b) prior to building permitting; and
- 5) That the applicant works with Staff to determine the suitability of the proposed interior color, its impact, and the appropriate process for the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council input for the tower element at SR161 and Frantz Road within three months following the occupancy permit.

Mr. Yoder agreed to the five conditions as written.

Ms. Puranik said approval is recommended to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a Parking Plan with one condition based on the different timings of the main uses and BSD intent of shared parking:

- 1) That the applicant works with Staff to provide for one additional bicycle parking space.

Mr. Yoder agreed to the condition.

Ms. Puranik said approval is recommended to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a Development Plan with no conditions or Waivers.

Ms. Puranik inquired about the Master Sign Plan and presented the locations for the three proposed signs. She asked the ART if the locations and height were appropriate. The ART responded they were supportive of the proposed signs. Mr. Papsidero said the two projecting signs complement each other.

Ms. Puranik said she will present the Master Sign Plan at the Planning and Zoning Commission for a determination on September 17, 2015.

Mr. Papsidero asked if there were any further questions or concerns regarding this application. [There were none.] He confirmed the ART's approval of the four Administrative Departures. He confirmed the ART's recommendation of approval to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a Development Plan; 10 Site Plan Waivers (one disapproval for west façade blank wall request); a Site Plan Review with five conditions; the Parking Plan with one condition; and the Material Request for Thin Brick.

ADMINISTRATIVE

Vince Papsidero asked if there were any additional administrative issues or other items for discussion. [There were none.]

Mr. Papsidero adjourned the meeting at 3:30 pm.

Approved by the Administrative Review Team on September 17, 2015.