



July 23, 2014

Development Plan and Site Plan

15-059 DP/SP – Home2 Hotel

BSD Commercial District

This is a request for a new four-story hotel to include 129 suites and associated site improvements on a 2.57-acre site on the west side of Frantz Road between West Bridge Street and Upper Metro Place.

This is a request for review and approval of a Development Plan Review and Site Plan Review in accordance with §153.066(E)-(F). This is also a request for review and approval for Site Plan Waivers under the provisions of §153.066(I).

Date of Application Acceptance

Wednesday, June 22, 2015

Date of ART Recommendation to the Planning and Zoning Commission

Thursday, July 23, 2015

Date of Planning and Zoning Commission Decision

Thursday, August 06, 2015

Case Manager

Devayani Puranik, Planner II, (614) 410- 4662 | dpuranik@dublin.oh.us

Jennifer Rauch, AICP, Senior Planner, (614) 410-4690 | jrauch@dublin.oh.us



PART I: APPLICATION OVERVIEW

<i>Zoning District</i>	BSD Commercial District
<i>Review Type</i>	Development Plan and Site Plan Review
<i>Development Proposal</i>	A four story, 80,481 square foot hotel, and a 14,000 square foot office building (future phase), 122 parking spaces, 1,900 sq-ft open space, and associated site improvements on a ±2.57 acre site.
<i>Use</i>	Hotel
<i>Building Types</i>	Corridor Building
<i>Property Owner</i>	Crawford Hoying Development Partners
<i>Applicant</i>	Melissa Spires, OHM Advisors
<i>Representative</i>	Nelson Yoder, Crawford Hoying Development
<i>Case Managers</i>	Devayani Puranik, Planner II, (614) 410- 4662 dpuranik@dublin.oh.us Jennifer Rauch, Senior Planner, (614) 410-4690, jrauch@dublin.oh.us

Summary of required actions

1. Development Plan
ART Recommendation: Approval with conditions (2) and waivers (0)
2. Site Plan
ART Recommendation: Approval with conditions (4), waivers (5), and administrative departures (1)
3. Parking Plan
ART Recommendation: Approval with condition (1)
4. Master Sign Plan:
ART Recommendation: (Determination on July 30)

Application Review Procedure

The Development Plan and Site Plan Reviews are the final step in the zoning review process following approval of the Basic Development and Basic Site Plan Reviews.

Development Plan

An application for a **Development Plan Review** is required if the application involves the construction of more than one principal structure on one or more lots. The Purpose of the Development Plan Review relevant to this case is to ensure that:

- Planned open spaces and building types, when known, will meet the applicable general siting requirements of §§153.062 and 153.064;
- The proposed development is consistent with the general development requirements of the City with respect to such elements as infrastructure, transportation, and environmental considerations; and
- The proposed development will contribute to the creation of signature places in the city consistent with the Bridge Street District Area Plan through an evaluation of long term phasing plans, transitional development conditions, and planned placemaking elements.

Site Plan Review

The purpose of the application for **Site Plan Review** is to confirm that the proposed development of an individual site, building, and/or open space is consistent with the BSC district regulations.

The site plan review process is intended as a review of the individual development regulations of § 153.059 and §§ 153.062 through 153.065. Approval of the site plan review includes assuring that the dimensions of a parcel meet the lot size requirements for the applicable building type(s) and that the surrounding street network meets the applicable requirements of §§ 153.060 and 153.061.

Waivers

Waivers may be submitted for any project elements that deviate from one or more of the requirements of the Bridge Street District zoning regulations and that do not qualify for an Administrative Departure (§153.066(H)). The required reviewing body must find that the requested Waivers meet the criteria of §153.066(I)(6) prior to approval.

Parking Plan

A Parking Plan is submitted for intended shared parking for the Hotel and future office building. Applications that include a request for an adjustment to required vehicle parking as permitted in §153.065(B)(2)(b), or where a change in conditions renders an approved adjustment insufficient to meet the parking needs of a use, building or lot.

The BSD Code requires that the use of off-site parking to meet the minimum parking requirement needs an approved parking plan as described in §153.065(B)(1)(f). If not under single ownership, provisions for off-site parking should be made by binding agreements between two or more property owners. Written easements which provide for continued use and maintenance of the parking should be submitted to the City for approval.

Master Sign Plan

The purpose of a master sign plan is to allow a greater degree of flexibility and creativity in sign design

and display. Further, master sign plans are intended to be used for multiple signs for either a single building or a group of related buildings to ensure that the requested signs work in a coordinated fashion to meet the general intent of signs in the District. It is not intended to simply permit larger or more visible signs or additional signs than may be permitted, without any consideration for unique sign design and display. Master sign plans should maintain the purpose and intent of the sign and graphic standards for the applicable BSD zoning district.

Application History

The proposal was presented to *Administrative Review Team* for review on the following dates:

- Pre-application- Feb 19, 2015
- Basic Plan: Introduction- Feb 26, 2015
- Basic Plan: Case Review- March 5, 2015
- Basic Plan: Case Review- March 26, 2015
- Determination- April 30, 2015 (Approval with Waivers and Conditions)
- Informal Review for Architecture- May 28, 2015
- Final Plan: Introduction- June 25, 2015
- Final Plan: Determination- July 23, 2015

The Administrative Review Team comments provided during the case review focused on finalizing the pending details related to site development during basic plan review, and architecture, massing, and building materials.

The proposal was presented to *Planning and Zoning Commission* for review on the following dates:

- Basic Plan Review- May 7, 2015 (Approval with waivers and Conditions): The Basic Development Plan and Site Plan were approved with six conditions and two waivers. The conditions and waivers were related to finalizing the site and landscaping details as well as finalizing the architectural details.
- Informal Review of Architecture- June 11, 2015: The Commission comments at the informal review focused on improving the architecture for the signature building at the gateway location. The Commission expressed their preference for the approved materials per the BSD Code. Detailing the architectural elements, and simplification of the articulation for the proportionate massing were also suggested.

The meeting minutes are also provided in the packet for reference.

Next Steps

The applicant is processing the Minor Project review application for demolition of the existing building and mass excavation to prepare for the project construction as well as an application for Preliminary and Final Plats.

Application Overview

The proposed plan includes the redevelopment of an existing commercial property on a \pm 2.57 acre site located on Frantz Road (east), between Bridge Street (north) and Upper Metro Place (south). The Embassy Suites site shares the northern property line. The proposed hotel is located at the corner of the Frantz Road and Bridge Street intersection, and the future office is shown at the corner of the Frantz Road and Upper Metro Place intersection.

Access to the site is provided from the existing curb cut on Upper Metro Place. Shared parking is located to the side and rear of the proposed buildings.

The open space is distributed within two pocket plazas, one of which is toward the north-east corner and other along Frantz Road.

The architecture of the building is contemporary with elements of traditional building materials such as brick and stone.

The proposed project includes:

- A four-story Corridor Building- 80,481-square-foot hotel with 129 units
- 1,900 sq-ft of Open Space
- 122 parking shared parking spaces

A 2-story, 14,000-square-foot office building is proposed as Phase II of the project.



PART II: ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM COMMENTS

The Administrative Review Team has conducted its analysis of the project based on the information submitted. The ART has also reviewed the proposal in light of the detailed review standards and the applicant is aware of the additional information that will be needed as this proposal advances.

Planning, Engineering, Building Standards, and Parks & Open Space

The 5000 Upper Metro Place serves as the gateway to the City of Dublin for visitors traveling along SR-161. Given its high visibility along SR-161 and Frantz Road, this development has the potential to set the tone for the Bridge Street District, serving as a model and making a statement about the ability to implement urban development in suburban communities like Dublin.

The block framework, site, building, and open space designs for the proposed development *must* serve as examples of desirable Bridge Street District development, and this can only be accomplished through exacting attention to detail, thorough and well-coordinated planning, and adherence to applicable Code requirements. Since the Basic Plans have been approved, the analysis is primarily for finalizing the details for site layout and buildings

Development Plan

The project elements reviewed as part of the Development Plan Review include the proposed street network, block framework and street types in accordance with §§153.057, 153.058, 153.060, 153.061, and 153.063. Refer to the attached ART Analysis & Determinations for an analysis of these Code requirements.

Streets. No new streets are created with the proposal. The site is bound by three public streets: the portion of Bridge Street (State Route 161) to the north is a limited access highway, Frantz Road to the east is a Corridor Connector Street and Principal Frontage Street, and Upper Metro Place is as a Neighborhood Connector Street. Engineering has indicated the need for additional right-of-way due to future intersection improvements at Bridge Street and Frantz Road, and the SR161 and I-270 interchange improvements. Although the site plan reflects the proposed right-of-way changes, the labeled dimension and bearings will be needed according to the ODOT right-of-way drawings prior to building permit approval.

Block Size and Access. The proposed development is shown on a single block, which meets the block dimensions. Per Code the western property line would require the creation of an additional street connection north-south from Bridge Street (SR161) to Upper Metro Place to create a true block. However, an exemption to this requirement is granted through the Code, as the access to Bridge Street (SR 161) at this location is prohibited due to the limited access restrictions.

The Code, however, requires specific dimensions for the fire access room to pass (26 feet) and building access zones coordinated with fire hydrant locations and loading zones. The building

access zones, loading areas, and hydrant locations are identified on the site plan and are in accordance with the BSD Code requirements.

Site Conditions. The attached plans show the existing site conditions, including lot lines, right-of-way, building footprints, vehicular use areas, grades, and utilities. This project is a redevelopment project, which will require the demolition of the existing building on the site. The applicant is processing a Minor Project application for the demo of the existing building and mass excavation of the site to prepare for the construction.

Plat. The applicant has filed a separate application to update the original Upper Metro plat (2001) to remove outdated information and reflect changes to the right-of-way and include any additional requirements outlined in the Bridge Street District code provisions.

Site Plan

The project elements of the Site Plan Review include details of building types/architecture, open spaces, parking, landscaping, stormwater, and signs in accordance with BSD Zoning Code Sections 153.059, 153.062, 153.064, and 153.065. Refer to the attached ART Analysis & Determinations for an analysis of these Code Sections.

Principles of Walkable Urbanism.

The Principles of Walkable Urbanism (§153.057(D)) serve as a guiding framework to be used in the review of development proposals to ensure the requirements and standards of the BSD zoning regulations are applied in a manner that contributes to the creation of exceptional walkable, mixed-use urban environments.

The proposed development is sited in a pedestrian-friendly manner closer to the streets and addressing the major streets in the City of Dublin. The public spaces such as main hotel lobby, bar, fitness center are facing the Frantz Road to activate the street. An entrance is provided at the intersection at the Tower. However, it can be used only by the keycard holders. Another set of doors along Frantz Road is open to public during the normal business hours accessing the main lobby and other public spaces.

Pedestrian-Oriented Design.

Two pocket plazas are proposed along Frantz Road connected to the existing shared-use path located along Frantz Road, which add to the pedestrian experience and activate the space. The right-of-way takes and temporary easement for the SR 161 and I-270 improvement projects have been resolved for the West Bridge Street and the connections to the existing bike path have also been identified.

The placemaking intent of the BSD regulations is addressed by placing the principal building (hotel) at the intersection of the West Bridge Street and Frantz Road. However, because of the SR-161 ROW limitations and on-going interchange improvements, activating West Bridge Street by providing any pedestrian activity is not practical. The main lobby to the hotel, patio, fitness center and other public activity areas is provided to overlook Frantz Road (Principal Frontage Street) to help activate the street level.

A pedestrian entrance is provided connecting the shared-use path, pocket plaza along Frantz road, and the main entrance to the hotel. The applicant should also strive to ensure that the building has an accessible pathway for ADA accessibility compliance.

Building Types and Architecture.

The BSD Commercial District permits a limited number of building types such as Mixed Use, Commercial Center, Large Format Commercial Building, Civic Building and Parking Structure. A Corridor Building Type is proposed for this development considering the location of the site and the proposed use. A waiver is approved as part of the Basic Site Plan approval to permit this building type in the BSD Commercial District.

During the earlier reviews by ART and Basic Development and Basic Site Plan review by Planning and Zoning Commission, the focus of the comments was on architecture for the gateway building at the key location within the City of Dublin. The applicant has been working diligently to incorporate comments and suggestions made during the earlier ART and Planning and Zoning Commission reviews related to architecture including materials, and massing details. The building design is improved substantially since the very first submittal and renderings.

However, during the informal review of the architecture by the Planning and Zoning Commission, it was stressed that the building at this location should be notable as a gateway building for the City of Dublin. The City Council members have expressed their expectations of a prominent and noteworthy building at this location as well. Though the proposed building is following the Code requirements with minor waiver requests, it can be developed further. An introduction of the innovative materials such as metal panels to accent the corners and edges can add to the interest with new textures and proportions. The applicant is requesting waiver/s for transparency requirements for street facing façades. Introducing additional glass elements may help with the transparency requirements as well as add interest to the facades.



Façade Materials. Brick, stone, and glass are the permitted primary building materials for a Corridor Building. The building materials and colors proposed include stone veneer at the base, a combination of light and darker thin brick veneer for upper story surfaces and bronze glass for windows as primary materials. Secondary and accent materials include EIFS cornice and banding and fiber cement boards in dark and light colors for tower beacon and side band as secondary materials. The aluminum integrated window system is proposed to include louvers.

In addition to the proposed materials, introducing high quality metal panels as the accent for the corners and edge and additional glazing may help to create additional textures, colors, and interest.

The glass color for the windows is specified in the Finishes presentation. However, it is unclear that the same glass will be used for the Towers as well. Additional information is needed.

Entrance Design. Code requires a Principal Entrance which by definition is the primary door into the building for pedestrians for which access is available to the majority of the uses within the building; it is generally located on the front façade. Two set of doors are provided on the Primary Street Façade (Frantz Road): one set of doors will be open to the public during business hours, and the other is part of the tower at the Frantz Road and West Bridge Street intersection. It can only be used as an egress by the hotel patrons and visitors and can only be used as an entrance with a keycard. The main entrance to the building is accessed internally off the drop-off area under the canopy. The entrance on Frantz Road near the patio, though not the main entrance to the building, will provide access to the public uses in the building. It is considered as Principal entrance located on front façade in this case.

Corridor Building Requirements

Transparency. The transparency numbers have been changed since the Basic Site Plan review and need either additional waivers or administrative departures for Code compliance.

Elevation	Story	Required	Provided	Administrative Departure (within 10%) / Waiver
North (SR 161-Street Facing)	Ground	60	38	Waiver approved at Basic Site Plan for 43%. New waiver
	2 nd	30	25	Waiver
	3 rd	30	27	Administrative Departure
	4 th	30	27	Administrative Departure
East (Frantz-Street Facing)	Ground	60	61	Met
	2 nd	30	37.5	Met
	3 rd	30	27	Administrative Departure
	4 th	30	27	Administrative Departure
South (Non-street)	Ground	15	40.5	Met
	2 nd	15	15	Met
	3 rd	15	15	Met
	4 th	15	15	Met
West (non-street)	Ground	15	40	Met
	2 nd	15	14	Administrative Departure
	3 rd	15	14	Administrative Departure
	4 th	15	14	Administrative Departure

Blank Wall.

Most of the blank wall sections are within the 15' requirement of the Code. However, a blank wall extends to approximately 26' at the ground story under the Tower along south elevation. This area needs additional articulation to break the blank wall effect.

Open Space Type, Distribution, Suitability and Design.

One of the opportunities for the proposed development is the provision of usable, high-quality urban open spaces at this high visibility gateway. Approximately 1,890 sq-ft of open space is required for the hotel and office buildings. The applicant is proposing 1,900 sq-ft of open space distributed between two pocket plazas identified on the site plan to cover the requirement for

both buildings. One of the pocket plazas is proposed at the northeast corner of the site and another along Frantz Road. Public access easements for all accessible open spaces will need to be provided.

The Code requires that the open space types are sized at a ratio of not more than 3:1, length to width. The pocket plaza along Frantz road next to the hotel patio has a proportion of approximately 5.6:1. The pocket plaza design and location is appropriate as an extension of the outdoor patio space. A waiver will be needed to process this request.

In addition, a Dublin dry-laid, stacked stone wall runs along West Bridge Street and Frantz Road. The applicant has determined the areas where the wall will be reconstructed. The applicant is proposing the Dublin wall along north and east side of the development and combination of masonry posts and landscaping along the Upper Metro Place S to screen the vehicular areas.

Parking and Loading.

The total required shared parking for hotel and the office is 131 spaces. The applicant is proposing 122 spaces considering the overlap of hours of operation for hotel and office. A loading space is provided under the canopy which meets the area requirement for the loading space per the BSD regulations. The applicant is requesting parking plan approval to adjust the number of required parking spaces.

Bicycle parking racks are provided for 12 bikes. Metal/ Steel bike rack design is also provided along with the construction details.

The site plan shows the access easements for sharing parking and drive isles between the two lots. The limits of the access easement should be expanded to at minimum encompass the entire curd cut and should also include the entire drive isle that leads to the parking areas.

Landscaping.

Tree Preservation. A tree survey is provided which includes a table listing the tree condition and the trees to be kept and removed. Section 153.065(D)(9)(b) provides for exemptions to tree replacements requirements when trees were required as part of a previously approved development plan, where structures are located where required by the Zoning Code, and for the provision of utilities. The tree survey complies with the tree preservation requirements

The demo plan will be reviewed in detail at the time of Minor Project Review but for clarification, "remove tree (typ.)" note from the plan should be removed from the demo sheet included with this packet.

The applicant will also have to add the tree protection fence notes and provide tree protection fence details prior to the demolition permit.

The tree #35 is a 9" Red Oak in good condition which is proposed to be removed but should be preserved. It appears that it is close to the building footprint but appropriate tree protection means can help preserving this tree.

Landscaping Plan All the details regarding the pocket plaza designs including plat pot, planters, benches, trash bins, trees and species have been provided.

However, following changes are requested-

- Substitute American Sycamore w/London Planetree 'Platanus acerifolia'
- Substitute Kentucky Coffeetree w/ Kentucky Coffeetree 'Espresso' within the parking lot
- Substitute Red Maple 'Armstrong' w/ another upright species eg. European Hornbeam, Beech 'Dawyck', Sweetgum 'Slender Silhouette' etc.
- Recommended Street trees along Frantz Road are Ivory Silk- Japanese Lilac

The Dublin wall adjacent to Frantz Road south of the pedestrian entrance will need shrubs at 5 per 25 linear feet for augmentation along entire wall including intersection corner. The placement of the shrubs can be continuous or clustered.

Site, Utility, and Grading.

The labeling and bearing of the property line is incorrect at the northeast corner of the site. It needs to match the updated right-of-way line associated with the interchange. The site work in this area will also have to be coordinated with the interchange improvements and timing of the construction easement.

A utility plan is provided including approximate location and size of underground stormwater storage, proposed storm and sanitary sewers, catch basins, fire hydrants and preliminary calculations. A grading plan is also provided noting the proposed grade changes to the existing site. The site plan shows the drainage easements for the shared use of underground stormwater storage system. The limits of the drainage easement should be enlarged to encompass the entire stormwater treatment system that will serve the future office development.

Washington Township Fire Department

The proposed layout for the new four-story hotel meets the requirements of the Dublin Fire Code (DFC).

Police, Economic Development

No comments.

PART III: APPLICABLE REVIEW STANDARDS

A. Waiver Review Criteria

Development Plan Waivers

None identified.

Site Plan Waivers

The Administrative Review Team reviews the proposed Waivers based on the following review criteria.

1. Corridor Building- Transparency–Section 153.062(O)(5): Ground Story Street Facing Transparency 60% (required); 43% for north elevation (approved); 38% for north elevation (requested)
 - a. Request is caused by unique site, use or other circumstances.
Criterion met: The transparency requirement waiver is triggered due to the building type and proposed use.
 - b. Not requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.
Criterion met
 - c. Request does not authorize any use or open space type not permitted in the District.
Criterion met: Not applicable.
 - d. Request will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality
Criterion met: The “Corridor Building” type standards are intended for ground story retail use, hence require higher transparency percentages. The transparency requirement is met for the elevation fronting on Frantz Road for this proposal. It is not met for the elevation fronting on Bridge Street.
2. Corridor Building- Transparency–Section 153.062(O)(5): Upper story Street Facing Transparency 30% (required); 25% for north elevation (requested).
 - a. Request is caused by unique site, use or other circumstances.
Criterion met: The transparency requirement waiver is triggered due to the building type and proposed use.
 - b. Not requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.
Criterion met
 - c. Request does not authorize any use or open space type not permitted in the District.
Criterion met: Not applicable.
 - d. Request will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality

Criterion met: The “Corridor Building” type standards are intended for ground story retail use, and upper story office use hence require higher transparency percentages.

3. Corridor Building - Blank Wall Limitations - Section 153.062(O)(5): Maximum 15 feet horizontal (required); 26 feet for ground story under the tower (requested).
 - a. Request is caused by unique site, use or other circumstances.
Criterion not met: The blank wall is covering the mechanical room for the pool under the Tower not caused by the unique site condition
 - b. Not requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.
Criterion met
 - c. Request does not authorize any use or open space type not permitted in the District.
Criterion met: Not applicable.
 - d. Request will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality
Criterion not met: This Waiver can be mitigated by introducing openings or other architectural details to break the monotony of the blank wall.
4. Open Space - Section 153.064(G)(1)(b): 3:1 Length to width (required); 5.6.1 feet for staircase (requested).
 - a. Request is caused by unique site, use or other circumstances.
Criterion met: The pocket plaza is proposed to activate the Frantz Road frontage. This waiver is triggered due to the building location standards and RBZ standards.
 - b. Not requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.
Criterion met
 - c. Request does not authorize any use or open space type not permitted in the District.
Criterion met: Not applicable.
 - d. Request will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality
Criterion not met: The waiver will permit the pocket plaza as an extension of the outdoor patio space for activating the Frantz Road frontage.
5. Site Design Standards - Section 153.065(D): Street Trees along SR 161
 - a. Request is caused by unique site, use or other circumstances.
Criterion met: The north property line abuts the ODOT right-of-way. There are limitations as to the new street trees and other landscaping treatment in that area.
 - b. Not requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.
Criterion met
 - c. Request does not authorize any use or open space type not permitted in the District.
Criterion met: Not applicable.

- d. Request will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality
Criterion met: Not applicable

Parking Plan

A Parking Plan is submitted for intended shared parking for the Hotel and future office building. The BSD Code encourages the shared parking wherever possible to avoid large asphalt lots within the urban district.

This development needs 135 parking spaces per the BSD Code shared parking standards. The applicant is proposing 122 parking spaces for the Hotel and future office building considering the different timings for both uses.

Required bicycle parking is included as part of the parking plan as well.

The limits of the access easement shown on the site plan should be expanded to at minimum to encompass the entire curd cut and should also include the entire drive isle that leads to the parking areas.

Master Sign Plan

Please refer to the attachment.

B. Plan Review Criteria – Development Plan

The Administrative Review Team should review this application based on the review criteria for applications for Development Plan Review, and consider the following responses:

1. Development Plan is Substantially Similar to Basic Plan
Criterion met: There are no major changes regarding the layout since the Basic Development Plan approval.
2. Lots and Blocks Meet Requirements of Section 153.060
Criterion met: The project involves only one block, which meets the applicable Code requirements of Section 153.060, with the exception of the street along west property line. The Preliminary and Final Plat application is being processed concurrently to update the Upper Metro Plan (2001).
3. Street System is Consistent with the BSC Street Network Map of Section 153.061 and Traffic Can Be Adequately Accommodated
Criterion met with condition: The proposed site plan notes the improvements to Bridge Street ROW due to interchange improvements. The northeast corner dimensions and the angel of the site should match the newly acquired right-of-way line associated with the interchange. The applicant should coordinate site work in this area with the interchange improvements and timing of the construction easement.
4. Street Types are Consistent with the Principles of Walkable Urbanism of Sections 153.057-058 and Coordinate with the Proposed Development

Criterion met with condition: The varied massing and scale of the building and the pedestrian areas along Frantz Road have been laid out to create a walkable, pedestrian scale environment. Development of the connections to existing paths also contribute to connectivity. The applicant should investigate the requirements for ADA accessible ramp connecting the pocket plaza along Frantz road to the main entrance of the building.

5. Buildings and Open Spaces are Appropriately Sited

Criterion met: The siting of the building and the open space is adding to the pedestrian experience along Frantz Road.

6. Phasing

Criterion met: The applicant is processing a demo and mass-ex application concurrently to prepare for the construction.

7. Consistency with Bridge Street District Vision Principles, Community Plan and other Policy Documents

Criterion met: Based on the submission to date, the project is consistent with the Principles of Walkable Urbanism of Section 153.057.

8. Adequate and Efficient Infrastructure

Criterion met: The proposed orientation to the existing streets, proposed public open spaces, and pedestrian network is appropriate.

9. Utilities

Criterion met. Proposed Utility lines are adequately sized and located to serve the development.

Plan Review Criteria- Site Plan

The Administrative Review Team should review this application based on the review criteria for applications for Site Plan Review, and consider the following proposed responses:

1. Site Plan is Substantially Similar to Basic Plan

Criterion met: There are no major changes regarding the layout since the Basic Site Plan approval.

2. Consistency with Approved Development Plan

Criterion met: The Site Plan is consistent with the Development Plan

3. Meets Applicable Requirements of Sections 153.059 and 153.062 through 153.065

Criterion met with conditions or Site Plan Review Waivers. As reviewed in this report, all appropriate *sections* of the Code are met, met with conditions, or met with Waivers.

4. Safe and Efficient Circulation

Criterion met. This project is proposed on a single block using existing infrastructure. The internal circulation accommodates 122 parking spaces, 12 bicycle spaces, loading area, building access area, and drop-off area for the hotel.

5. Coordination and Integration of Buildings and Structures
Criterion met with condition and Waivers. The applicant has worked with the City to develop the buildings that relate to the streets. The potential Waivers have been identified for the proposed building. Some, if approved, will continue to maintain the image of Dublin as a high quality community with a commitment to exemplary planning and design.
6. Desirable Open Space Type, Distribution, Suitability, and Design
Criterion met with conditions. The proposed open space within two pocket plazas is appropriate for this development. Provide public access easements for all publicly accessible open spaces and pedestrian connections. Other landscaping details as listed above should be resolved prior to the demolition permit.
7. Provision of Public Services
Criterion met. This proposal includes the details for providing services in a desirable manner.
8. Stormwater Management
Criterion met with Condition. The stormwater management plan is according to the Code requirement. The limits of the drainage easement as shown on the site plan should be enlarged to encompass the entire stormwater treatment system that will serve the future office development.
9. Phasing
Criterion met. The overall development will be completed in two phases. The Hotel lot will be completed in one phase following the demolition. Phase 1 is capable of independent consideration and does not depend on any additional phases. The demolition application process being processed simultaneously to finalize the interim plan and construction phases.
10. Consistency with Bridge Street District Vision Principles, Community Plan and other Policy Documents
Criterion met. The proposal is consistent the goal of creating a vibrant mixed-use walkable development within the BSD Commercial District and is consistent with the Principles of Walkable Urbanism described in Section 153.057 and as described above.

PART IV: ART RECOMMENDATIONS

Development Plan- the Administrative Review Team recommends that the Planning and Zoning Commission consider the following Development Plan Conditions:

Conditions

1. Reflect the Bridge Street and Frantz Road ROW change details and coordinate site work in this area with the interchange improvements and timing of the construction easement prior to the building permit review.
2. Investigate the requirements for ADA accessibility compliance connecting the pocket plaza along Frantz road to the main entrance of the building prior to the building permit review.

Waivers

None proposed

Site Plan- the Administrative Review Team recommends that the Planning and Zoning Commission consider the following Site Plan Waivers and Conditions:

Condition

1. Provide public access easements for all publicly accessible open spaces and pedestrian connections on the Plat prior to the Council review.
2. Modify the limits of the drainage easement to encompass the entire stormwater treatment system that will serve the future office development on the updated plat.
3. Specify the material (glass) details for both Towers.
4. Resolve the landscaping details prior to the demolition permit.

Waivers

1. Ground Story Transparency- Corridor Building: Previously approved for 43%; new request for 38%: Approval
2. Upper Story Transparency- Corridor Building: Approval
3. Blank Wall- Corridor Building: Disapproval
4. Open Space proportion: Approval
5. SR 161 Street Trees: Approval

Administrative Departures

1. Upper Story Transparency: North Elevation (3rd and 4th)
East Elevation (3rd and 4th)
West Elevation (2nd, 3rd, and 4th)

Parking Plan

ART recommended approval of the parking plan with one condition based on the different timings of the main uses and BSD intent of shared parking.

Condition

1. Expand the limits of the access easement to at minimum encompass the entire curd cut and should also include the entire drive isle that leads to the parking areas.

Master Sign Plan

Refer to attached analysis.

ART ANALYSIS AND DETERMINATIONS – BASIC DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Applicable Development Plan Review Criteria

Includes 153.060 - Lots and Blocks, 153.061 – Street Types

153.060 – Lots and Blocks		
Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(A)	Intent	Met. Existing block.
(B)	Applicability	Met. This project involves two buildings on a single block, lot subdivision and therefore the provisions of §153.060 apply.
(C)(1)(a)	Interconnected Street Pattern	Met. No street connection is provided on northern property line. Code permits an exemption regarding street extensions due to existing barriers (i.e. roadways with limited access). Bridge Street District Street Network Map does not indicate a street connection in this location.
(C)(2)(b)/ Table 153.060-A	Maximum Block Dimensions	Met. Commercial: 500 ft. Maximum Block length allowed. Frantz Road: 461 ft.; Upper Metro 285 ft.; west property line: 361 ft.; SR-161: 297 ft. Total perimeter: 1,195 ft. (1,750 ft. allowed)
(C)(2)(c)	Shopping Corridors	N/A
(C)(3)(a)	Block Configuration	Met. Block is generally rectangular in shape.
(C)(3)(b)	Front Property Lines (FPL)	Met. SR-161, Frantz Road, and Upper Metro Place are all considered FPL.
(C)(4)(a)- (c)	Principal Frontage Streets (PFS)	Met. Frantz Road is designated at a PFS
(C)(5)	Block Access Configurations	Met. Vehicular access is provide by an existing curb cut on Upper Metro Place.
(C)(6)	Mid-Block Pedestrianways	Met. A publically accessible mid-block pedestrian way is provided between the Hotel and Office building
(C)(7)	Typical Lot Dimensions	Met. 50 ft. minimum is required. Irregular lot shape. The proposal indicates min. dimension along front property line approximately 120 ft.
(C)(9)	Street Frontage	Met. SR-161, Frantz Road, and Upper Metro Place for hotel. Frantz Road and Upper Metro Place for Office.

153.061 – Street Types			
Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes	
(A)	Intent	Met.	
(B)	Applicability	Met.	
(C)(1)	Street Families	Frantz Road	Corridor Connector Street; 76-100 ft. right-of-way; PFS
		Upper Metro Place	Neighborhood Street; 65 ft. right-of-way
(C)(3)	Existing Streets	Met	
(C)(4)	Street Network Map	N/A.	
(D)(1)	Street Frontage Requirements	Met.	
(D)(2)	Vehicular Access	Met. Vehicular access is provide by the existing curb cut along Upper Metro Place.	
(D)(3)	Multiple PFS	N/A.	
(E)(1)	Typical Street Elements	N/A. <i>Bicycle Facilities</i>	
		N/A. <i>Vehicular On-Street Parking</i>	
		N/A. <i>Crosswalks</i>	
(F)	Curb Radii	N/A.	
(G)	Fire Access	Met. <i>Room to Pass</i> – 26 ft. street width	
		Met. <i>Building Access Zones</i> – Coordinated with fire hydrant locations	

ART ANALYSIS AND DETERMINATIONS – BASIC SITE PLAN

Applicable Site Plan Review Criteria

Includes §153.059 - Uses, §153.062 – Building Types, §153.064 – Open Space Types, and §153.065 – Site Development Standards (Parking, Stormwater Management, Landscaping and Tree Preservation, Fencing Walls and Screening, Exterior Lighting, Utility Undergrounding, and Signs).

153.059 – Uses

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
Table 153.059- A	Permitted and Conditional Uses	Met. All proposed uses are permitted. The proposed Principal Uses are: Hotel and Office.
	Accessory Uses	N/A

153.062 – Building Types

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(B)(3)	General Requirements	Met with Approved Waiver A waiver for corridor building was approved with Basic Site Plan
		Met. Uses: Proposed uses are permitted in the District.
		Met. The proposed building type is Corridor Building for the Hotel. The building type for the future office has not been specified.
		Met. Permanent Structures: The proposed buildings are permanent structures.
		N/A. Accessory Structures
(C)	General Building Type Layout and Relationships	Met. Incompatible Building Types: No building type incompatibilities are present.
		N/A. Shopping Corridors
(D)(1)	Parapet Roof Type Requirements	Met. Parapet Height: Min. 2 ft; Min 2'8" provided Secondary roof drain details, in compliance with the Ohio Plumbing Code, shall be submitted and approved as part of the permit application process.
		Met. Parapet Wraps all Facades: The parapet wraps around all facades per the submitted elevations
		Met. Horizontal Shadow Lines Parapet is distinguished by material and color changes
		Met. Occupied Space: The building does not incorporate occupied space or a half story within the roof.
(D)(2)	Pitched Roof Type	N/A.
(D)(3)	Flat Roof Type Requirements	N/A. Eaves
		N/A. Interrupting Vertical Walls
(D)(4)	Towers	Met with ART approval. Quantity; only one tower is allowed per building

153.062 – Building Types		
Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
		<p>unless approved by the required reviewing body. – ART requested a gateway Tower feature for the intersection. Additional tower feature is proposed closer to the main lobby for the staircase.</p> <p>Met. Tower Height; Tower may exceed max bldg. height; tower shall not be greater than the height of one addition upper floor of the building to which the tower is applied.</p>
(E)(1)	Façade Materials	Met. Stone, Brick (thin brick veneer), Glass
(E)(2)	Façade Material Transitions	Met. Heavier material shall be incorporated below lighter material- Stone is used for the base followed by brick and fiber cement panels.
(E)(3)	Roof Materials	Met. TPO (Thermoplastic PolyOlefin)
(E)(4)	Color	Met. Gray
(F)(1)	Entrances & Pedestrianways – Quantities and Locations	See Building Type Requirements Tables for each Building
(F)(2)	Recessed Entrances	Met. Minimum 3 ft. from the property line.
(F)(3)	Entrance Design	Met. Quantity- The quantity of the entrances matches the requirement. Location – §153.062(O)(5) Two additional doors are provided on Primary Street Façade (Frantz Road). One set of doors will be open for public during business hours. The other set of doors is part of the tower at Frantz Road and SR-161 intersection. However, it will be used by the general public only as an egress. Patrons can enter using a keycard.
(G)	Articulation of Stories on Street Façades	Met.
(H)	Windows, Shutters, Awnings, and Canopies	Met. Applicant has indicated that slightly darker bronze color glass will be provided for the Tower feature and a lighter variety will be used for the windows. Specifications provided
		Vehicular canopy is proposed at the main entrance and drop-off area. The canopy design is similar to the proposed architecture of the building.
(I)	Balconies, Porches, Stoops, and Chimneys	N/A
(J)	Treatments at Terminal Vistas	N/A
(K)	Building Variety	<p>Met. Building designs must vary from adjacent buildings by the type of dominant material (or color, scale or orientation of that material). Building designs must also vary through at least two of the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) The proportion of recesses and projections (2) A change in the location of the entrance and window placement (3) Changes to the roof design, including roof type, plane, or material

153.062 – Building Types						
Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes				
		Adjacent Buildings	Dominant Material	Recesses and Projections	Entrance and Window Placement	Roof Design
			Required	2 of 3 Required		
		Embassy Suites of Dublin	Brick/stone/glass-significantly different colors	Yes	Yes	Pitched/Flat
(M)	Signs	Master Sign Plan.				
(N) & (O)	Individual Building Type Requirements	Met. Street Frontage – occupation of RBZ by building, landscape, patio or streetscape treatment. Refer to Corridor Building analysis <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Building areas – Height – Façade Requirements / Transparency – Façade Divisions 				

153.062(O)(5) – Corridor Building Requirements			
Building Type Requirements	Code Requirement	Provided	Met, N/A, Adm. Dep., Waiver, Other
Number of Principal Buildings Permitted (per Lot)	Multiple Permitted	One on each lot, total two on a block	Met
Front Property Line Coverage (%)	Min. 75	74% by the building. (for hotel on a hotel lot) 100% with the stone wall	Met
Occupation of Corner Required (Yes/No)	Yes	Yes	Met
Front Required Building Zone Required (range, ft.)	0-15	±15	Met
Corner Side RBZ Required (range, ft.)	0-15	±2	Met
Side Yard Setback Required (ft.)	5	5' for north	Met
Rear Yard Setback Required (ft.)	5	6	Met
Minimum Lot Width Required (ft.)	50	Approx.178	Met
Maximum Lot Width Required (ft.)	None	N/A	N/A
Maximum Impervious Lot Coverage (%)	80	76	Met

153.062(O)(5) – Corridor Building Requirements			
Building Type Requirements	Code Requirement	Provided	Met, N/A, Adm. Dep., Waiver, Other
Semi-Pervious Lot Coverage (%)	10	0	Met
Loading Facility Permitted (location relative to principal structure)	Rear and Side Façades	Side Façade close to the main entrance	Met
Entry for Parking within Building (relative to principal structure)	Rear & Side Façade; Corner Side Façade on Non-PFS	N/A	N/A
Minimum Building Height Permitted (stories)	3	4	Met
Maximum Building Height Permitted (stories)	6	4	Met
Ground Story Height (ft.)	12 Minimum 16 Maximum	12.6	Met
Upper Story Height (ft.)	10 Minimum 14 Maximum	10.0	Met
Minimum Finished Floor Elevation Permitted (ft.)	None	N/A	N/A
Minimum Occupied Space Required (ft.)	30 req. on upper stories facing Streets	No non-occupied space where applicable	Met
Parking within Building	Permitted in rear of first 3 floors and fully in basement	N/A	N/A
Ground Story Street Facing Transparency Required (%)	Minimum 60	North Elevation—38 East Elevation—61	Previous approved Waiver (43); lower transparency than approved waiver
Upper Story Street Facing Transparency Required (%)	Minimum 30	North Elevation—25, 27, 27 East Elevation- 37.5, 27, 27	Waiver and administrative departure
Non-Street Façade Transparency	Minimum 15	South Elevation—40.5, 15, 15, 15 West Elevation- 40, 4, 14, 14	Waiver and administrative departure
Blank Wall Limitations (Yes/No)	Yes (Max 15 ft. horizontal)	South elevation ground story	Waiver
Principal Entrance Location Required (relative to principal structure)	Primary Street Façade of Building	Entrance provided on Frantz Road	Met
Number of Street Façade Entrances Required (per ft. of facade)	1 per 75 ft. of façade, minimum	North Elevation- None East Elevation—2 Req., 2 Provided	Met
Number of Parking Lot Façade Entrances Required	1 per 100 ft. of façade, minimum	5 doors provided	Met
Mid-Building Pedestrianways Required	In shopping corridors, required for buildings	N/A	N/A

153.062(O)(5) – Corridor Building Requirements			
Building Type Requirements	Code Requirement	Provided	Met, N/A, Adm. Dep., Waiver, Other
(# per ft. of facade)	longer than 250 ft. in length		
Vertical Increments Required (location on principal structure)	No greater than every 45 ft.	Materials and surface change	Met
Horizontal Facade Divisions Required (per ft. of facade)	On buildings 3 stories or taller; within 3 ft. of the top of the ground story. Required at any building step-back	Provided at top of ground Story	Met
Permitted Primary Materials (types)	Stone, brick, glass	Stone, brick (thin brick veneer), glass	Met
Minimum Primary Façade Materials (%)	80	North Elevation—89 East Elevation—84 South Elevation—87 West Elevation—88	Met
Changes in Roof Plane/Type Required (per ft. of facade)	None	N/A	N/A
Roof Type(s) Permitted (types)	Parapet, Pitched, Flat	Parapet	Met
Tower(s) Permitted (Yes/No)	Yes; 1 permitted	2 proposed	Approval

153.064 – Open Space Types		
Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(C)	Provision of Open Space	Met. 0.043 acres required; 0.044 provided
(D)	Suitability of Open Spaces	Met -Two pocket plazas have been provided suitable for the location
	Fee-in-Lieu of Open Space	N/A
(F), (G)	Open Space Types & General Requirements	Met with waiver and condition — Both pockets plazas are within the size range required by the Code. Frantz Road Pocket Plaza proportion requirement- 3:1 length to width is required;54' and 10'- 5.4:1 Landscaping plan is provided for the pocket plazas. Public access easements should be noted on the plans.

153.065(B) – Site Development Standards – Parking and Loading		
Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(1)(b)	Parking Location	Met. Provided on-site.

153.065(B) – Site Development Standards – Parking and Loading

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(2)	Required Vehicle Parking	Parking Plan Required min. Hotel parking- 96 Required min. Office (future) parking- 35 Total required min- 131; Total provided- 122
(3)	Required Bicycle Parking	Met. Required- 11; Provided- 12 Provided- 12
(4)	Off-Street Parking Space and Aisle Dimensions	Met
(5)	Parking Structure Design	N/A.
(6)	Surface Parking Lot and Loading Area Design and Construction	Met. The dimensions of the parking isles and spaces are according to the Code requirement
(7)	Required Loading Spaces	Met. Single loading area is provided at the main entrance under the canopy.

153.065(C) – Site Development Standards – Stormwater Management

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
153.065 (C)	Stormwater Management	Met. Proposed underground stormwater storage area and required storm sewer has been identified on the utility plan which meets the Stormwater guidelines. The applicant has coordinated with ODOT for the sewer connection to the north.

153.065(D) – Site Development Standards – Landscaping & Tree Preservation

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(2)	General Landscaping and Tree Preservation Req.	Met with Condition. <i>Tree Protection:</i> The applicant has submitted the tree survey plan. Tree protection fence details will be required prior to the demo permit.
		Met. <i>Landscape Beds:</i> The details regarding landscaping beds and planter boxes are provided
		Met. Irrigation systems, Site Visibility Triangles - Use of a Landscape Architect to prepare plans.
(3)	Street Trees	Met with a Waiver. <i>Spacing and Location:</i> The street tree planting along SR-161 is not a possibility due to ODOT right-of-way limitations. However, City of Dublin will be installing the landscaping complementing the proposed boulevard.
		Met with Condition. <i>Planting Details</i> The staff is recommending changes for the proposed plant species at certain locations.

153.065(D) – Site Development Standards – Landscaping & Tree Preservation

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(6)	Required Building Zone (RBZ) Treatment	Met. Landscape and Patio RBZ Treatment types
(7)	Foundation Planting	Met
(8)-(11)	Tree Preservation and Replacement	Met. Tree replacements are not required because the existing trees were installed as a result of a previously approved development plan.

153.065(E) – Site Development Standards – Fencing, Walls, and Screening

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(1)	Fence and Wall Standards	Met — The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the “Dublin Wall” in-kind for north and east property line. South property will have a combination of masonry posts and landscaping
(3)	Screening	Met.

153.065(F) – Site Development Standards – Exterior Lighting

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(3)	Exemptions	Met. Lighting Plan meets the requirement
(4)	Fixture Power and Efficiency	Met.
(5)-(8)	Shielding, Lighting Uniformity/Trespass, Light Poles	Met.
(9)-(10)	Wall & Canopy Lighting	Met.

153.065(G) – Site Development Standards – Utility Underground

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(G)	Utility Undergrounding	Met. The proposal is according to the Code requirements.

153.065(H) – Site Development Standards – Signs

Code Section	Requirement	Met/Notes
(H)	Signs	Refer to Master Sign Plan analysis