

Minor Project Review

15-065 MPR – BSC Residential District

Tuller Flats Apartments

Alternative Window Material

4313 Tuller Road

This is a request for an alternative window materials for the previously approved Tuller Flats residential Development Project. The development consists of 420 units with windows of various sizes and shapes. The development was approved with code compliant aluminum window, the applicant has determined that a composite (polymer/wood-fiber) window will provide a better quality product and has requested the change through the minor project review process. The alternative material must be approved by PZC in accordance with code section 153.062 (H)(1).

Date of ART Recommendation

Thursday, 30th of July 2015

Date of Planning and Zoning Commission Determination

Thursday, 6th of August 2015

Case Managers

Joanne L. Shelly, RLA, AICP, LEED BD+C | Urban Designer / Landscape architect
614.410.4677 | jshelly@dublin.oh.us

Nichol Martin | Planning Assistant
614.410.4600 | nmartin@dublin.oh.us

PART I: APPLICATION OVERVIEW

<i>Zoning District</i>	BSC Residential District
<i>Review Type</i>	Minor Project Review
<i>Development Proposal</i>	Alternative Window Material
<i>Property Address</i>	4313 Tuller Road
<i>Applicant</i>	Kolby Turnock, Casto Tuller LLC
<i>Case Manager</i>	Joanne L. Shelly, RLA, AICP, LEED BD+C Urban Designer Landscape architect 614.410.4677 jshelly@dublin.oh.us Nichol Martin Planning Assistant 614.410.4600 nmartin@dublin.oh.us

Application Review Procedure: Minor Project Review

The purpose of this Minor Project Review is to provide an opportunity for the applicant to request approval of window materials that depart from Zoning Code §153.062(H) provided the intent and purpose of these standards for the applicable BSC district are maintained. Minor Project Review applications are reviewed by the Administrative Review Team and a recommendation made to the Planning and Zoning Commission. This request for the material change must be approved by the reviewing body, the Planning and Zoning Commission.

Application Contents

The Tuller Flats site plan was approved by the Planning & Zoning Commission on the 12th of March 2015. The approved site plan included an aluminum window, identified as "Crystal" aluminum, single-hung windows. The applicant is proposing an alternative window, Anderson Series 100, single-hung window. The purpose of the substitution is to afford an upgrade in the quality and performance of the windows.

The substitute windows are comprised of a wood composite frame constructed with "Fibrex" that is described as a strong durable material with improved energy efficiency. The color is integral to the product and is added through a co-extruded process. The windows are backed by the Anderson with a transferable warranty of 20 years on glass and 10 years on non-glass components.

PART II: ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM COMMENTS

Planning & Building Standards

Per BSD Code §153.062(H)(1) for Windows and with regards to this application, the required reviewing body may approve other high quality synthetic materials. The applicant must provide examples of successful, high quality installations in comparable climates.

The following factors have been identified for the purpose of the ART review: materials, color, energy performance, and installation.

Materials: The "Fibrex" material is composed of 40% wood fiber and 60% thermo-plastic polymer. The literature provided states that this composite is twice as strong as vinyl and dimensionally stable in all

climates. An audit of reviews of this product, seem to substantiate this claim. Because Fibrex has a wood fiber base material, the texture visually resembles a wood window frame.

Color: The window color is integral to the product through a co-extruded process so the finish is resistant to fading, flaking, blistering, chalking or peeling and does not need to be painted or repainted.

Energy Performance: Anderson 100 series windows achieve a U-value of 0.30 compared to the previously approved Crystal aluminum window's U-value of 0.40. The lower the U-factor the better the window insulates ([www. Energystar.gov/index](http://www.Energystar.gov/index)).

Installation: The Anderson 100 Series windows come pre-assembled from the factory and therefore require no field assembly. This eliminates the need for a special glazing contractor, reducing the potential for an installation error. The applicant has indicated that from their experience, Anderson has a strong support service both for the installer and for the homeowner. In contrast, the Crystal windows require significant field assembly and there is little support of the product by the manufacturer. The applicant has provided details for each building material installation type, demonstrating how the brick and siding materials will return to provide both the physical and visual depth associated with a quality architectural product.

For approval to be granted, the applicant is required to provide examples which demonstrate successful, high quality installations, in comparable climates. The following projects both residential and commercial have been identified by the Anderson product representative:

- Historic Structure, the Quilt Foundry, Buttergilt Bldg. 234 West Wayne St., Maumee, OH 43537
- Residence, 1419 Kearney Way, Parade of Homes, Delaware, OH 43015
- Anna Louise Inn, Women's Shelter, 2401 Reading Rd., Cincinnati, OH 45202
- 412 Loft Apartments, Minneapolis, MN 55414

The Anderson product representative has also identified the following projects in Dublin that have or plan to use the 100 series windows:

- Sunrise Assisted Care
- Riviera, planned residential development
- Stansberry, planned residential development, Muirfield Village

The installation details are an important component of the windows performance, not all of the aforementioned projects have established the appropriate level of installation detail. As noted previously, the applicant has supplied drawings which detail how the window will be installed at both brick and siding façade material locations.

In summary, the factors identified for the purpose of the ART review were: materials, colour, energy performance, installation. The Fibrex window material seems to meet the criteria for an alternative material, and will perform equal to or better than the previously approved aluminum windows.

Engineering, Parks and Open Space, Fire, Police, Economic Development

No comments.

PART III: APPLICABLE REVIEW STANDARDS

The Administrative Review Team has reviewed this application based on the applicable review criteria related to this proposal for Minor Projects, which include the following:

(c) Meets Applicable Zoning Regulations

Criterion Met: The proposed alternative material meet the Code's intent for a Minor Project Review and alternative material option which is to allow for a greater degree of flexibility and creativity in window materials. The Fibrex material is a climate stable, durable material, with integrated color, lower U-factor values, and appropriate installation detailing meeting the criteria for an equal or better material.

PART IV: ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM RECOMMENDATIONS

Minor Project Review

The Administrative Review Team has conducted its analysis of the project based on the information submitted and recommends **approval** to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a Minor Project Review allowing for an alternative window material.