



CITY OF DUBLIN.

**Office of the City Manager**

5200 Emerald Parkway • Dublin, OH 43017-1090

Phone: 614-410-4400 • Fax: 614-410-4490

# Memo

**To:** Members of Dublin City Council  
**From:** Dana L. McDaniel, City Manager */DMLC/dm*  
**Date:** October 8, 2015  
**Initiated By:** Angel L. Mumma, Director of Finance  
Jerry O'Brien, Chief Accountant  
**Re:** December 31, 2014 CAFR and Related Audit Reports

## Summary

Enclosed for your review are the following documents:

- 1) City of Dublin's published *Comprehensive Annual Financial Report for the fiscal year ended December 31, 2014* ("CAFR"), including the Independent Auditors' Opinion thereon;
  - *Independent Auditors' Report on Compliance and Internal Controls* for the audit period January 1, 2014 through December 31, 2014, which is the *Report on Internal Control over Financial Reporting and on Compliance and Other Matters based on an Audit of Financial Statements performed in Accordance With Government Auditing Standards* ("Internal Control Report")
- 2) Related *Management Letter* issued by the Independent Auditors; and
- 3) Additional communications made by the Independent Auditors to City Council, as required by Statement of Auditing Standards Number 114 ("SAS 114 Letter").

Included on page 19 of the CAFR is the Independent Auditors' Report, issued by Clark, Schaefer, Hackett & Co., which indicates that the financial statements are presented fairly in conformity with generally accepted accounting standards - an "unmodified opinion." Dave Yost, Auditor of State, notified the City that the audit was reviewed by his staff, and accepted it with no modifications.

The Internal Control Report indicates that the audit did not reveal any significant deficiencies or material weaknesses in the City's internal accounting procedures or controls. Additionally, no significant instances of noncompliance with provisions of any laws, regulations, contracts, or grant agreements were found.

The auditors did note two minor internal control related issues, which are described in the related *Management Letter*, along with their recommendations as to how to mitigate them. The first comment was that the Finance Department does not maintain a formal internal control policy and procedures manual documenting the day-to-day processing and controls. This was the second year in which the City received this comment. However, as explained to Council during the review of the 2013 CAFR and related audit reports, given the department's transition to a new financial system that will result in changes to our current processes and procedures, staff felt it was most appropriate to prepare a policy and procedure manual in conjunction with the new financial

system, not our current system. It is currently anticipated that the Finance Department will “go live” on the new system in the first half of 2016. As such, it is expected that the policy and procedure manual will be completed during 2016.

The second comment concerned an instance in which an incorrect rate of pay was entered into the payroll system for a new employee. As a result, for a period of time, the employee was under-compensated. While each payroll is reviewed by a supervisory employee within the Finance Department, we have further implemented verification of changes in rate of pay, including those for new hires, when the payroll is reviewed. Staff will be prepared to discuss these two issues in more detail at the Finance Committee, if so desired.

The SAS 114 Letter provides the auditors with the opportunity to highlight other matters they deem important, outside of the strictures of the formal audit opinion letter and internal control reports. The auditors emphasize that City management is responsible for the selection and use of appropriate accounting policies. They point out that City management used estimates for certain significant income tax receivable account balances and that the City depended on third parties for certain investment risk disclosure information. The auditors also mentioned they “encountered no significant difficulties in dealing with management in performing and completing our audit” and that “we are pleased to report that no disagreements [with management] arose during the course of our audit.”

If Council desires a post-audit meeting with Clark, Schaefer, Hackett and Co., to discuss the audit, staff will arrange for them to meet with Council. If no post-audit meeting is desired, staff will inform the auditors that Council did not request a meeting.

We are happy to report that the City was awarded the Auditor of State Award with Distinction for the 2014 CAFR and audit report by the Ohio Auditor of State Dave Yost. The following criteria must be met in order for an entity to receive this award:

- The entity must file timely financial reports with the Auditor of State’s office in the form of a CAFR;
- The audit report does not contain any findings for recovery, material citations, material weaknesses, significant deficiencies, Single Audit findings or questioned costs;
- The entity’s management letter contains no comments related to:
  - Ethics referrals
  - Questioned costs less than \$10,000
  - Lack of timely report submission
  - Reconciliation
  - Failure to obtain a timely Single Audit
  - Findings for recovery less than \$100
  - Public meetings or public records
- No other financial or other concerns exist that involve eligible entity.

A representative of the Auditor of State’s Office will be at the Council meeting on October 12, 2015, to present the award. The 2014 CAFR will be posted on the City’s website at [www.dublinohiousa.gov](http://www.dublinohiousa.gov).

Staff submitted the 2014 CAFR to the Government Officers Finance Association ("GFOA") to determine its eligibility to receive a "Certificate of Achievement for Excellence in Financial Reporting," an award the City has received for 25 consecutive years. Staff anticipates that the 2014 CAFR will also be so certified when the City is notified by the GFOA in late December.

**Recommendation**

Information for review purposes only. Staff will be present at the October 12, 2015 Finance Committee meeting for additional discussion regarding the audit.

**INDEPENDENT AUDITORS' REPORT ON INTERNAL CONTROL OVER  
FINANCIAL REPORTING AND ON COMPLIANCE AND OTHER MATTERS  
BASED ON AN AUDIT OF FINANCIAL STATEMENTS PERFORMED IN  
ACCORDANCE WITH GOVERNMENT AUDITING STANDARDS**

Honorable Mayor, City Council  
and City Manager  
City of Dublin, Ohio

We have audited, in accordance with the auditing standards generally accepted in the United States of America and the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States, the financial statements of the governmental activities, the business-type activities, each major fund, and the aggregate remaining fund information of the City of Dublin, Ohio (the City), as of and for the year ended December 31, 2014, and the related notes to the financial statements, which collectively comprise the City's basic financial statements, and have issued our report thereon dated June 24, 2015.

**Internal Control Over Financial Reporting**

In planning and performing our audit of the financial statements, we considered the City's internal control over financial reporting (internal control) to determine the audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances for the purpose of expressing our opinions on the financial statements, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of The City's internal control. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion on the effectiveness of the City's internal control.

A deficiency in internal control exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, misstatements on a timely basis. A material weakness is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control, such that there is a reasonable possibility that a material misstatement of the entity's financial statements will not be prevented, or detected and corrected on a timely basis. A significant deficiency is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control that is less severe than a material weakness, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Our consideration of internal control was for the limited purpose described in the first paragraph of this section and was not designed to identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies. Given these limitations, during our audit we did not identify any deficiencies in internal control that we consider to be material weaknesses. However, material weaknesses may exist that have not been identified.

14 east main street, ste. 500  
springfield, oh 45502

www.cshco.com  
p. 937.399.2000  
f. 937.399.5433

**Compliance and Other Matters**

As part of obtaining reasonable assurance about whether the City's financial statements are free from material misstatement, we performed tests of its compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts, and grant agreements, noncompliance with which could have a direct and material effect on the determination of financial statement amounts. However, providing an opinion on compliance with those provisions was not an objective of our audit, and accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. The results of our tests disclosed no instances of noncompliance or other matters that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*.

**Purpose of this Report**

The purpose of this report is solely to describe the scope of our testing of internal control and compliance and the results of that testing, and not to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the City's internal control or on compliance. This report is an integral part of an audit performed in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* in considering the City's internal control and compliance. Accordingly, this communication is not suitable for any other purpose.

*Clark, Schaefer, Hackett & Co.*

Springfield, Ohio  
June 24, 2015

## **MANAGEMENT LETTER**

Honorable Mayor, City Council  
and City Manager  
City of Dublin, Ohio

In accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* applicable to financial audits, we have audited the financial statements of the City of Dublin, (the City), as of and for the year ended December 31, 2014, and have issued our report thereon dated June 24, 2015.

*Government Auditing Standards* also require that we describe the scope of our testing of compliance with laws and regulations and internal control over financial reporting and report any irregularities, illegal acts, other material noncompliance and significant internal control deficiencies. We have issued the required report dated June 24, 2015, for the year ended December 31, 2014.

We are also submitting for your consideration the following comments on the City's compliance with applicable laws and regulations and on its internal controls. These comments reflect matters that, while in our opinion do not represent a material instances of noncompliance or significant internal control deficiencies, we believe represent matters for which improvements in compliance or internal controls or operational efficiencies might be achieved. Due to the limited nature of our audit, we have not fully assessed the cost-benefit relationship of implementing the recommendations suggested below. However, these comments reflect our continuing desire to assist the City. If you have any questions or concerns regarding these comments please do not hesitate to contact us.

### **Internal Control Policies and Procedures Manual**

While the City has started to accumulate and develop documentation of internal control policies and procedures documenting the day-to-day processing and controls currently utilized, this informal manual was not complete. The City is at risk if critical tasks are completed properly or timely due to an extended or unforeseen absence of certain personnel. The City should place an emphasis on completing the documentation of the key internal controls and procedures performed and have the complete manual available to appropriate staff members to ensure all transactions are processed according the City's standards. Furthermore, this manual could assist the City in the training of new employees thereby reducing the amount of time required away from the daily tasks. This document should be reviewed and updated for any system or policy changes on a timely basis to ensure all contents are up-to-date.

14 east main street, ste. 500  
springfield, oh 45502

www.cshco.com  
p. 937.399.2000  
f. 937.399.5433

### **Review and Approval of Payroll Changes**

Our audit testing disclosed that an employee was paid at a rate that did not agree to the agreed upon compensation amount. Although the City has procedures in place for prior review of and approval of gross pay changes made to the payroll records, we suggest that the current review and approval process be reevaluated to determine if changes to the controls in this area are appropriate. An effective system of internal control should include procedures for such review on a timely basis by an employee not responsible for performing this function. We recommend that an individual in the Human Resources department approve all changes to an employee's gross pay, (including new hires' gross pay) indicated with appropriate sign-offs, before information may be entered into the payroll system. The payroll employee responsible for processing these changes should also have his/her work reviewed to ensure any changes entered are appropriate.

We will review the status of these comments during our next audit engagement. We have already discussed these comments and our suggestions with the Director of Finance, and we will be pleased to discuss them in further detail at your convenience, to perform any additional study of these matters, or to assist you in implementing the recommendations.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the City Council, management, others within the City, and the Auditor of the State of Ohio and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.

*Clark, Schaefer, Hackett & Co.*

Springfield, Ohio  
June 24, 2015

June 24, 2015

To the Members of the City Council  
City of Dublin, Ohio  
Attn: Michael Keenan, Mayor  
5200 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, Ohio 43017-1006

We have audited the financial statements of the governmental activities, the business-type activities, each major fund, and the aggregate remaining fund information of the City of Dublin, Ohio (the City) for the year ended December 31, 2014. Professional standards require that we provide you with information about our responsibilities under generally accepted auditing standards and *Government Auditing Standards*, as well as certain information related to the planned scope and timing of our audit. We have communicated such information in our letter to you dated March 16, 2015. Professional standards also require that we communicate to you the following information related to our audit.

**Qualitative Aspects of Accounting Practices**

Management is responsible for the selection and use of appropriate accounting policies. The significant accounting policies used by the City are described in Note A to the financial statements. We noted no transactions entered into by the City during the year for which there is a lack of authoritative guidance or consensus. All significant transactions have been recognized in the financial statements in the proper period.

Accounting estimates are an integral part of the financial statements prepared by management and are based on management's knowledge and experience about past and current events and assumptions about future events. Certain accounting estimates are particularly sensitive because of their significance to the financial statements and because of the possibility that future events affecting them may differ significantly from those expected. The most sensitive estimate affecting the financial statements was:

Management's estimate of income taxes earned during 2014 but not yet collected as of the end of the year is based on prior year collection trends. We evaluated these amounts by comparing the calculation to the amounts recognized in prior years as well as comparing the actual amounts received in prior years to the estimates established in those years.

Certain financial statement disclosures are particularly sensitive because of their significance to financial statement users. The most sensitive disclosure affecting the financial statements was:

The disclosure of the risks associated with the City's deposits and investments in Note B to the financial statements were developed in accordance with GASB Statement No. 40, *Deposit and Investment Risk Disclosures* and are based on information provided by the investment managers.

The financial statement disclosures are neutral, consistent, and clear.

14 east main street, ste. 500  
springfield, oh 45502

www.cshco.com  
p. 937.399.2000  
f. 937.399.5433

**Difficulties Encountered in Performing the Audit**

We encountered no significant difficulties in dealing with management in performing and completing our audit.

**Corrected and Uncorrected Misstatements**

Professional standards require us to accumulate all known and likely misstatements identified during the audit, other than those that are clearly trivial, and communicate them to the appropriate level of management. Management has corrected all such misstatements. In addition, none of the misstatements detected as a result of audit procedures and corrected by management were material, either individually or in the aggregate, to each opinion unit's financial statements taken as a whole.

**Disagreements with Management**

For purposes of this letter, a disagreement with management is a financial accounting, reporting, or auditing matter, whether or not resolved to our satisfaction, that could be significant to the financial statements or the auditor's report. We are pleased to report that no such disagreements arose during the course of our audit.

**Management Representations**

We have requested certain representations from management that are included in the management representation letter dated June 24, 2015.

**Management Consultations with Other Independent Accountants**

In some cases, management may decide to consult with other accountants about auditing and accounting matters, similar to obtaining a "second opinion" on certain situations. If a consultation involves application of an accounting principle to the City's financial statements or a determination of the type of auditor's opinion that may be expressed on those statements, our professional standards require the consulting accountant to check with us to determine that the consultant has all the relevant facts. To our knowledge, there were no such consultations with other accountants.

**Other Audit Findings or Issues**

We generally discuss a variety of matters, including the application of accounting principles and auditing standards, with management each year prior to retention as the City's auditors. However, these discussions occurred in the normal course of our professional relationship and our responses were not a condition to our retention.

**Other Matters**

We applied certain limited procedures to the management's discussion and analysis, budgetary comparison schedules, infrastructure summary condition schedule and related disclosures, which are required supplementary information (RSI) that supplements the basic financial statements. Our procedures consisted of inquiries of management regarding the methods of preparing the information and comparing the information for consistency with management's responses to our inquiries, the basic financial statements, and other knowledge we obtained during our audit of the basic financial statements. We did not audit the RSI and do not express an opinion or provide any assurance on the RSI.

We were engaged to report on the combining and individual fund financial statements, which accompany the financial statements but are not RSI. With respect to this supplementary information, we made certain inquiries of management and evaluated the form, content, and methods of preparing the information to determine that the information complies with accounting principles generally accepted in the United States of America, the method of preparing it has not changed from the prior period, and the information is appropriate and complete in relation to our audit of the financial statements. We compared and reconciled the supplementary information to the underlying accounting records used to prepare the financial statements or to the financial statements themselves.

We were not engaged to report on introductory section and statistical section, which accompany the financial statements but are not RSI. We did not audit or perform other procedures on this other information and we do not express an opinion or provide any assurance on them.

This information is intended solely for the use of members of the audit committee and management of City and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.

Very truly yours,

*Clark, Schaefer, Hackett & Co.*

Springfield, Ohio  
June 24, 2015