

Master Sign Plan

16-041MSP – BSD Sawmill Center Neighborhood

Goodwill, Toys 'R' Us, Big Lots – 6525, 6547, 6569 Sawmill Road

This is a proposal for a Master Sign Plan for an existing multiple-tenant building in the Bridge Street District located on Sawmill Road north of the intersection with Village Parkway. The applicant is requesting review and a recommendation of approval to the Planning and Zoning Commission for a comprehensive sign plan under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.065.

Date of Application Acceptance

Tuesday, May 31, 2016

Date of ART Recommendation

Thursday, June 30, 2016

Case Manager

Nichole Martin, Planner I | (614) 410-4635 | nmartin@dublin.oh.us

PART I: APPLICATION OVERVIEW

<i>Zoning District</i>	BSD Sawmill Center Neighborhood
<i>Development Proposal</i>	A comprehensive Master Sign Plan for an existing multitenant building including standards and example ground signs
<i>Building Type</i>	Existing Structure
<i>Property Addresses</i>	6525, 6547, and 6569 Sawmill Road
<i>Property Owners</i>	Rupp Real Estate, 6525 Sawmill Road Toys 'R' Us Property Company II LLC, 6547 Sawmill Road Ashton Woods Limited Partnership, 6569 Sawmill Road
<i>Representative</i>	Kevin McCauley, Stavroff Land and Development LLC
<i>Case Manager</i>	Nichole Martin, Planner I (614) 410-4635 nmartin@dublin.oh.us

Application Review Procedure: Master Sign Plan

The purpose of a Master Sign Plan (MSP) is to provide an opportunity for greater flexibility and creativity in sign design. The MSP provision of the BSD Code accounts for the unique nature of commercial developments and provides a comprehensive and flexible approach for review and approval of appropriate sign plans that are consistent with the BSD Sign Guidelines and may vary from the BSD Sign Code.

Application History

The existing one-story, multiple-tenant building is located on three separate parcels: 6525, 6547 and 6569 Sawmill Road. The site is bounded by Banker Drive to the south, Village Parkway to the north, Sawmill Road to the east, and Dublin Center Drive to the west. The site has full access off of Banker Drive, Village Parkway, and Dublin Center Drive, as well as limited right-in-right-out access on Sawmill Road. The multiple-tenant building, which was developed in the late 1980s, has a linear, suburban-style layout with parking located in front and is set back approximately 425 foot from Sawmill Road.

At the time of development, the structure and site were approved and subsequently developed as a single project on a single parcel. On March 24, 1988, a variance was granted to permit signs to exceed 15 feet in height, at 18 feet above grade, with a condition that the sign background be the same material as the building façade.

To allow for the ownership of individual tenant spaces, the original 11-acre parcel was split into three separate parcels. In 2006, the Board of Zoning Appeals granted a variance to permit a lot

split, deviations to development standards, and a shared parking agreement for 6525 Sawmill Road.

In 2008, the Planning and Zoning Commission reviewed and approved a Corridor Development District application for 6525 Sawmill Road to permit a sign at 21 feet-1 inch to the top of sign in order to allow the sign to be architecturally integrated within the sign band.

In June 2016, the Administrative Review Team reviewed and approved a Minor Project to permit site modifications for 6525 Sawmill Road triggered by tenant turnover including a vehicular canopy, awnings, and parking lot improvements. Additionally, landscape modifications for 6525, 6547, and 6569 Sawmill Road were also approved.

Application Summary

The proposed Master Sign Plan (MSP) permits signs in sizes and colors the applicant has indicated allow the auto-oriented development to remain competitive within the Sawmill corridor. The submittal includes a MSP text outlining the permitted sign types, standards, lighting and locations as well as drawings showing typical permitted multitenant ground signs. Generally, the MSP text follows the standards of the general sign provisions within §153.150 with respect to size, but provides additional allowances for ground signs and building mounted sign types, which generally follow the BSD Sign Code within §153.065(H). Additionally, the plan permits allowances for corporate colors and branding, and places limits on sign design and materials, which do not reflect any of the City's existing standards.

Tenant Signs

Each tenant is permitted a wall sign, which must be individually mounted letters affixed directly to the building above the tenant's space at a height no taller than 22 feet-3 inches to the top of the sign. A second wall sign is permitted for tenants with a second façade facing a street or parking lot. The applicant is proposing to provide the tenant with an option to allow the second wall sign to be substituted for an awning sign or a projecting sign these signs will follow the Bridge Street District sign provisions §153.065(H).

Multitenant Ground Signs

The plan proposes three multiple-tenant ground signs; one located on Sawmill Road south of the entrance drive, one located on Banker Drive west of the entrance drive, and one located on Village Parkway east of entrance drive. If approved, the landscape plan should be updated to reflect three permitted ground sign locations and not four. The applicant has indicated that the signs will display multiple tenant names. Since the current condition is that the tenant spaces are located on separate parcels, these signs as proposed would classified as "off-premise" for two of the three tenants. Under the code, a MSP is the only avenue to approve off-premise signs.

In detail, ground signs are permitted to be up to 8 feet wide and 8 feet tall, with 24 square-feet of graphic area. The sign base is proposed to be constructed of brick, stone, metal/ aluminum, a material compatible with the principal structure, or a material approved by the required reviewing body. The sign panel backgrounds must all be the same color. The tenant's name and

colors must be consistent with the tenant's primary wall sign. The tenants are permitted to include logos, which are not limited in the number of colors, as long as it not greater than 20 percent of the sign area. Examples of permitted ground signs are included with the application. If approved, the depictions are only one type of ground sign that would be permitted based on the permitted base materials.

Color

Signs are generally limited to three colors including white and black with the exception of Corporate Brand Identities and Trademarks which are not limited in color. A Corporate Brand Identity is defined as the way a business represents their brand to the public including company name, logo, colors, and font. These elements could represent the entire sign or part of the sign face.

Lighting

Wall signs must be internally-illuminated or halo-illuminated. The plan provides additional standards for wall sign lighting to ensure that adjacent signs are affixed and lit in a consistent manner with like features. No direct or distracting lighting is permitted.

Ground sign may be internally or externally illuminated. If approved, the ground sign illumination requirements should be included as part of the Signage Illumination section.

Additional Details

As submitted, the plan permits additional sign types, which are temporary in nature, and which would not require a sign permit, or are indented to provide information regarding hours of operation and accepted methods of payment. Respectively, these include Window Display Signs §153.057(K), Directional Signs §153.057(L), and Informational Window Signs §153.057(M).

The plan prohibits changeable copy signs, and stipulated in the event of conflicting standards that the more restrictive of the two standards shall apply.

PART II: ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM COMMENTS

Planning, Building Standards, Economic Development

§153.065(H)(e) – Master Sign Plan

A MSP for properties located in the Sawmill Center Neighborhood District must meet the intent and purpose outlined in BSD Sign Code §153.065(H)(e) and BSD Neighborhood Standards §153.063(C)(5)(b). The Sawmill Center Neighborhood standards require that the sign and graphics standards contribute to the vibrancy of district and contribute to the creation of a high quality environment. The applicant is seeking a sign plan that allows greater flexibility which the Code permits; however, it clearly states that MSPs are not intended to permit larger or more visible signs or additional signs that may not be permitted, without any consideration for unique sign design or display.

A MSP for properties located in the Sawmill Center Neighborhood District must meet the intent and purpose outlined in BSD Sign Code §153.065(H)(e) and BSD Neighborhood Standards

§153.063(C)(5)(b). The Sawmill Center Neighborhood standards require that the sign and graphics standards contribute to the vibrancy of district and contribute to the creation of a high quality environment. The applicant is seeking a sign plan that allows greater flexibility than the BSD sign provisions permit; however, the code clearly states that MSPs are not intended to permit larger or more visible signs or additional signs that may not be permitted, without any consideration for unique sign design or display.

ART encouraged the applicant to apply a more creative approach in their proposed sign standards, taking into consideration the scale of the center. The applicant received feedback that a MSP is the appropriate tool to address the interim development condition, but that careful consideration should be paid to signs along Sawmill Road to ensure such signs are consistent with the intentions of the BSD sign standards and not just responsive to the standards of surrounding jurisdictions.

The proposed standards allow signs that are more colorful and more visible, and some signs that would be larger while still permitting combinations of multiple sign types. ART determined the proposed MSP text does not meet the intent of the MSP provisions and instead incorporates the upper limits of each set of sign provisions (previous code and BSD), as well as reduces sign creativity, which conflicts with the codified intent of a MSP; therefore the provisions of §153.065(H)(e) are not met.

Proposed Wall Signs		
Permitted BSD		Proposed Requirement
Size	½ sq. ft. per lineal foot max. 50 sq. ft.	1 sq. ft. per lineal foot max. 80 sq. ft.
Number	2 building mounted signs of different types (1 permitted to be wall sign)	1 per tenant space; 2 if second façade faces public street or private parking lot
Height	15 ft.	22 ft. 3 in.
Colors	Max. 3 (including unlimited Registered Trademark/Logo)	Max. 3 <u>OR</u> Corporate Brand Identity: Unlimited Trademark: Unlimited
Illumination	Internal or external	Internal or Halo
Proposed Ground Signs		
Permitted BSD		Proposed Requirement
Size	24 sq. ft.	24 sq. ft. graphic area; not to exceed 8 ft. wide
Number	1 per building or parcel, per street frontage not to exceed 2	2
Height	Max. 8 ft. tall	Max. 8 ft. tall
Location	8 ft. from ROW, if multiple signs must be located on different frontages	8 ft. from ROW, if multiple signs must be located on different frontages
Colors	Max. 3 (including unlimited Registered Trademark/Logo)	Max. 3 <u>OR</u> Corporate Brand Identity: Unlimited Trademark: Unlimited
Construction	Masonry base or base clad in material compatible with the structure	Brick, stone, metal/ aluminum, a material compatible with the principal structure, or one approved by the required reviewing

Proposed Wall Signs		
Permitted BSD		Proposed Requirement
		body
Illumination	Internal or external	Internal or external

Parks & Open Space, Fire, Engineering, Police

No comments.

PART III: APPLICABLE REVIEW STANDARDS

Applicable Master Sign Plan Criteria

The Administrative Review Team has reviewed this application based on the intent and purpose outlined in the Code for a master sign plan, as follows:

- a) Allow a greater degree of flexibility and creativity in sign design and display.
- b) Ensure sign work is in a coordinated fashion to meet the general intent of signs in the District.
- c) Not intended to permit larger signs, more visible signs, or additional signs than permitted, without any consideration for unique sign design and display.

The Bridge Street District Sign Guidelines provide a variety of examples of one-of-a-kind, context-sensitive, memorable, and forward thinking signs that are appropriate for the Bridge Street District. The guidelines also emphasize the following for Master Sign Plans:

- a) Signs and graphics should contribute to the vibrancy of the area
- b) Placement of signs and graphics should assist with navigation, provide information, and identify businesses
- c) Sign locations and designs should be properly coordinated with architectural character

PART IV: PROPOSED ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TEAM DETERMINATION

Disapproval is recommended for a Master Sign Plan permitting standards that do not meet the intent of a Master Sign Plan to allow for creative and integrated sign design, and not additional signs or larger signs.