



PLANNING REPORT

Planning & Zoning Commission

Thursday, April 20, 2017

Case Summary

Agenda Item	2
Title	Midwestern Auto Group (MAG) PUD, Subarea C
Case Number	17-014AFDP
Proposal	An amendment to the previously approved Land Rover and Jaguar building to reduce the building footprint and associated site improvements.
Request	Review and approval of an <u>Amended Final Development Plan</u> under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.050.
Site Location	On the south side of Venture Drive, approximately 600 feet south of the intersection with Perimeter Drive.
Applicant	Brad Parish, Architectural Alliance representing Midwestern Auto Group.
Case Manager	Logan M. Stang, Planner I (614) 410-4652 lstang@dublin.oh.us
Planning Recommendation	<u>Approval of an Amended Final Development Plan</u> In Planning's analysis, the proposal complies with the amended final development plan criteria. Planning recommends approval of this request with seven conditions: <ol style="list-style-type: none">1) That the approval of this application includes only the Jaguar and Land Rover wall signs and that they be included for review in the future cohesive sign package and that no permits may be issued for these signs until the cohesive sign package is reviewed and approved by the Commission and City Council;2) That the plans be revised to provide seven foot landscape islands from the inside of curb to ensure interior landscape requirements are met, prior to building permitting;

- 3) That the applicant revise the landscape plans to continue the 2:1 grove design along SR 161/US 33, subject to staff approval;
- 4) That the landscape plans be revised to ensure all existing and proposed plant materials are identified, prior to building permitting;
- 5) That the landscape plans be revised to include an additional deciduous tree behind the pond along SR 161/US 33 to satisfy the one tree per 40 feet requirement, prior to building permitting;
- 6) That the applicant work with Engineering to demonstrate continued compliance with stormwater requirements as defined in Chapter 53 to the satisfaction of the City Engineer; and,
- 7) That the applicant comply with the maximum allowable slopes along the retention basins as defined in the Stormwater Design Manual to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.



 <p>City of Dublin</p>	<p>17-014AFDP Amended Final Development Plan MAG Subarea C - Land Rover & Jaguar 6335 Perimeter Loop Road</p>	<p>0 150 300 Feet</p> 
---	---	---

Facts	
Site Area	±5.4 acres
Zoning	PUD, Planned Unit Development District, Midwestern Auto Group (MAG), Subarea C
Surrounding Zoning And Uses	<p>North: PCD, Planned Commerce District, Perimeter Center, Subarea D (Undeveloped Parcel)</p> <p>East: PCD, Planned Commerce District, Perimeter Center, Subarea M (Nationwide Children’s Hospital)</p> <p>South: Across SR 161/US 33, TF, Technology Flex District (Gerber Collision & Repair)</p> <p>West: PUD, Planned Unit Development District, Midwestern Auto Group, Subarea B (MAG BMW, Mini & Audi)</p>
Site Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vacant, undeveloped parcel. • Large stormwater retention basin serving the existing MAG campus located along the western property line. • Landscaping and mounding along SR 161 consistent with the MAG campus frontage to the west. • Minimal grade change throughout the majority of the site. • Substantial landscaping around the stormwater basin.
Case Background	<p>The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a final development plan for an approximately 30,000-square-foot facility for the Jaguar and Land Rover franchises along with the campus “finger” vehicle display areas and other associated site improvements on April 21, 2016. At the meeting, the Commission revised a condition to permit the installation of the pond along the southern property line to keep with the design and character of the campus. The Commission also added a condition that this approval included only the proposed wall signs and that no permits could be issued until the cohesive sign plan was reviewed by both the Commission and City Council.</p> <p>The Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval to City Council of incorporating this site into the MAG campus for the Land Rover/Jaguar franchises in January of 2016. During the City Council review of the rezoning ordinance, Council members discussed the proposal for an aesthetic pond along the southern property line of Subarea C and the sign regulations for the entire campus. Council added Condition 14 to the approval of the rezoning ordinance requesting the applicant work with staff to explore the elimination of the aesthetic pond on the west side of the southern boundary of Subarea C and provide undulated mounding in its place to the extent possible.</p> <p>Council members were also concerned about the number of signs permitted</p>

Facts

on the MAG campus. The applicant provided a comprehensive sign plan indicating the current signs with pictures and size and type details. City Council conditioned that the applicant return to the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council for a comprehensive review and approval of a Master Sign Plan prior to the issuance of sign permits for Subarea C. This proposal includes the previously submitted signs for Subarea C. However, permits for signs cannot be issued until the Master Sign Plan is approved by the Commission and City Council.

Over the years, the MAG campus was rezoned and multiple final development plans and amendments have been approved by Council and the Commission. The full history of the campus development is summarized at the back of this report.

Details

Amended Final Development Plan

Proposal

This proposal is to amend an approved final development plan for MAG Subarea C to reduce the development to approximately 26,700-square-foot car dealership facility for the Jaguar and Land Rover brands, two stormwater retention ponds, and "finger" vehicle display areas typical to the MAG campus on a 5.4 acre vacant site.

Layout

The proposed site layout is similar to the previous approval with the orientation of the main building showroom facing SR 161/US 33 and the service area located to the north facing Venture Drive. The service entry is located in the middle of the building with buffering along the southeast side to minimize visibility from SR 161/US 33. The building is slightly smaller than the previous approval by approximately 3,000 square feet.

The site uses the three access points previously shown with two being located in Subarea B to the west and one shared access with Nationwide Children's Hospital to the east. The "finger" display areas follow the similar radial pattern but have been reduced in size to allow for a larger stormwater retention pond along the eastern edge. This stormwater pond originally encompassed a small portion of the northeast corner of the site but has been expanded to remove underground storage. The Commission approved the inclusion of the southern pond along SR 161/US 33 at the April 21, 2016 meeting as a condition and the proposal is substantially similar to that design.

Architecture/Building Materials

The proposed building continues the contemporary design of the MAG campus by utilizing materials such as glass and metal as primary materials. The showroom elevation on the south has recessed storefronts to create aesthetic viewpoints along the façade and breaks up the massing of the building. The overhead doors are placed in locations that minimize their

Details	Amended Final Development Plan
	<p>visibility by using the massing of the building and landscape buffering throughout the site. The changes in materials along with the dimensionality enhance the contemporary look of the building and aid in the overall aesthetics of the campus.</p>
<p>Tree Preservation and Replacement</p>	<p>The applicant has provided a tree preservation plan indicating that the majority of the trees will be transplanted and incorporated into the new site design. No protected trees are being removed with this application, however all existing trees were required for tree replacement with the development of Subarea B to the west. Existing trees having been removed from the site were done so due to impacts by the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) interchange project. The applicant will be required to ensure all existing and proposed materials are identified on the landscape plans prior to filing for building permits.</p>
<p>Landscaping</p>	<p>The proposal continues the cohesive theme for the MAG campus by providing similar treatments along the SR 161/US 33 frontage and around the perimeter of the "finger" display areas. All of the existing trees have been incorporated into the proposed design and sufficient buffering has been provided along Venture Drive and the service entry to minimize the visibility of the service areas. Minimal changes will be required at the building permit stage to ensure compliance with landscape requirements outlined in the code and development text.</p>
<p>Signs</p>	<p>The sign package submitted for review is identical to the original proposal for this site. The development text allows for five different sign types to fit the needs of the vehicle manufacturers and the overall campus. The proposal contains a total of five signs consisting of two wall signs, two brand signs near the service entrance, and a single campus identification sign located along Venture Drive near the Nationwide Children's entrance.</p> <p>The wall signs located on the south elevation were originally shown at a height of 19 feet 10 inches. Due to the changes to the building the signs have been reduced to a height of 17 feet 9 ½ inches to correspond with the architecture. The proposed wall signs meet the requirements of the development text and condition of approval from the preliminary development plan allowing for one wall sign, Land Rover, to be 55 square feet in size so long as both signs don't exceed 100 square feet total. The Jaguar sign is approximately 41 square feet, meeting this condition.</p> <p>During the original review the Planning and Zoning Commission expressed concern reviewing and approving the proposed signs as the applicant was required by City Council to submit a cohesive sign package for review. The Commission added a condition during the meeting stating that this approval would only include the Jaguar and Land Rover wall signs and that no permits may be issued for either sign until the cohesive sign package is reviewed by the Commission and City Council. This condition will be applied to this application as well to ensure the cohesive sign package is reviewed</p>

Details		Amended Final Development Plan
		by all applicable reviewing bodies.
Stormwater Management		<p>The proposal includes the conversion of a “regional” retention basin into two retention basins that will serve Subareas B and C. The retention basins are located within proposed Subarea C. The proposed retention basins are along the eastern property boundary near Nationwide Children’s Hospital and along the southern property boundary.</p> <p>A proposed storm sewer will outlet the eastern retention basin to an existing catch basin along Venture Drive as a means to discharge the site runoff. The southern retention basin serves as an overflow pond to the eastern retention basin to store runoff during less frequent storm events. The southern pond was added and the eastern pond was increased in volume from the previously approved Amended Final Development Plan to replace the previously proposed underground storage chambers.</p> <p>A dual stage outlet control device installed in the outlet control structure is proposed to regulate the site runoff release rate for both water quality and quantity. Calculations submitted demonstrate compliance with stormwater requirements as defined in Chapter 53. The applicant will be required to work with Engineering to continue to demonstrate compliance with stormwater requirements as defined in Chapter 53 to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.</p>
Utilities, Lighting and Grading		<p>The development will include proposed utility services with connections to the existing sanitary sewer and water mains along Venture Drive.</p> <p>The proposed photometric plan and associated cut sheets indicate that sufficient lighting is provided for the site while minimizing impacts to adjacent properties. The proposed lighting is consistent with the existing campus and meets all applicable standards.</p> <p>Proposed grading for the site generally matches existing conditions and slopes from west to east. Drainage structures are proposed at lowpoints along the site and discharges into the retention basins. The applicant will be required to comply with the maximum allowable slopes along the retention basins as defined in the Stormwater Design Manual to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.</p>

Analysis		Amended Final Development Plan
<i>Process</i>		Section 153.050 of the Zoning Code identifies criteria for the review and approval for an amended final development plan. Following is an analysis by Planning based on those criteria.

Analysis	Amended Final Development Plan
1) Consistency with the approved preliminary development plan.	Criterion met: The proposal is consistent with the requirements of the Zoning Code and the MAG PUD development text.
2) Traffic and pedestrian safety	Criterion met: The applicant provided a traffic study at the time of the rezoning based on the original, larger building and the site provides for safe connections for pedestrian travel and vehicular movement.
3) Adequate public services and open space	Criterion met: The site has access to adequate public utilities and no additional open space is required with this application.
4) Protection of natural features and resources	Criterion met: The proposal utilizes all existing trees in the landscape plan and ensures that all plant materials will be kept in the best condition possible.
5) Adequacy of lighting	Criterion met: The applicant has submitted a photometric plan that provides sufficient and appropriate lighting for the site.
6) Proposed signs are consistent with approved plans Condition 1	Criterion met with Condition: The proposed signs meet the regulation outlined in the MAG PUD development text. The approval of this application will only include the Jaguar and Land Rover wall signs and the applicant will submit a cohesive sign package for review, including wall signs, by the Commission and City Council before any sign permits can be issued.
7) Appropriate landscaping to enhance, buffer, and soften the building and site Conditions 2-5	Criterion met with Conditions: The proposal includes a consistent landscape plan that corresponds to the previous approvals in Subareas A & B. The applicant will need to ensure compliance with requirements outlined in the landscape code by revising landscape islands, ensuring all plant materials are properly identified, and providing additional plant material to meet specific buffering or spacing requirements.
8) Compliant stormwater management Conditions 6 & 7	Criterion met with Conditions: The calculations submitted demonstrates compliance with stormwater requirements as defined in Chapter 53. The applicant will be required to work with Engineering to continue to demonstrate compliance with stormwater requirements as defined in Chapter 53 to the satisfaction of the City Engineer. The applicant will also be required to comply with the maximum allowable slopes along the retention basins as defined in the Stormwater Design Manual to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.
9) All phases (if applicable) comply with the previous criteria.	Not applicable.

Analysis	Amended Final Development Plan
<i>10) Compliance with all other laws and regulations.</i>	Criterion met: The proposal complies with all other known applicable local, state, and federal laws and regulations.

Recommendation	Amended Final Development Plan
Approval	In Planning’s analysis, the proposal complies with the amended final development plan criteria. Planning recommends approval of this request with seven conditions.
Condition	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) That the approval of this application includes only the Jaguar and Land Rover wall signs and that they be included for review in the future cohesive sign package and that no permits may be issued for these signs until the cohesive sign package is reviewed and approved by the Commission and City Council; 2) That the plans be revised to provide seven-foot landscape islands from the inside of curb to ensure interior landscape requirements are met, prior to building permitting; 3) That the applicant revise the landscape plans to continue the 2:1 grove design along SR 161/US 33, subject to staff approval; 4) That the landscape plans be revised to ensure all existing and proposed plant materials are identified, prior to building permitting; 5) That the landscape plans be revised to include an additional deciduous tree behind the pond along SR 161/US 33 to satisfy the one tree per 40 feet requirement, prior to building permitting; 6) That the applicant work with Engineering to demonstrate continued compliance with stormwater requirements as defined in Chapter 53 to the satisfaction of the City Engineer; and, 7) That the applicant comply with the maximum allowable slopes along the retention basins as defined in the Stormwater Design Manual to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.

AMENDED FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Review Criteria

In accordance with Section 153.055(B) *Plan Approval Criteria*, the Code sets out the following criteria of approval for a final development plan:

- 1) The plan conforms in all pertinent respects to the approved preliminary development plan provided, however, that the Planning and Zoning Commission may authorize plans as specified in §153.053(E)(4);
- 2) Adequate provision is made for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulation within the site and to adjacent property;
- 3) The development has adequate public services and open spaces;
- 4) The development preserves and is sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site in a manner that complies with the applicable regulations set forth in this Code;
- 5) The development provides adequate lighting for safe and convenient use of the streets, walkways, driveways, and parking areas without unnecessarily spilling or emitting light onto adjacent properties or the general vicinity;
- 6) The proposed signs, as indicated on the submitted sign plan, will be coordinated within the Planned Unit Development and with adjacent development; are of an appropriate size, scale, and design in relationship with the principal building, site, and surroundings; and are located so as to maintain safe and orderly pedestrian and vehicular circulation;
- 7) The landscape plan will adequately enhance the principal building and site; maintain existing trees to the extent possible; buffer adjacent incompatible uses; break up large expanses of pavement with natural material; and provide appropriate plant materials for the buildings, site, and climate;
- 8) Adequate provision is made for storm drainage within and through the site which complies with the applicable regulations in this Code and any other design criteria established by the City or any other governmental entity which may have jurisdiction over such matters;
- 9) If the project is to be carried out in progressive stages, each stage shall be so planned that the foregoing conditions are complied with at the completion of each stage; and
- 10) The Commission believes the project to be in compliance with all other local, state, and federal laws and regulations.

DETAILED SITE HISTORY

2016

- On April 21, 2016, The Planning and Zoning Commission approved the development of an approximately 30,000-square-foot dealership facility for the Jaguar and Land Rover manufacturers and associated site improvements.
- In February, City Council approved the rezoning of approximately 30 acres from PCD, Planned Commerce District (Perimeter Center, Subarea D) & PUD, Planned Unit Development District (Midwestern Auto Group) to PUD, Planned Unit Development District (Midwestern Auto Group). This rezoning application included the existing MAG campus, Subareas A & B, along with the creation of a third subarea, Subarea C.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval to City Council of a rezoning at their January 7, 2016 meeting.

2015

- On October 1, 2015, the Commission provided non-binding feedback on a proposal for a future expansion to the Midwestern Auto Group (MAG) campus to incorporate an additional 5.4 acres into the PUD for an approximately 29,000-square-foot showroom for the Jaguar and Land Rover franchises, the demolition of the existing Land Rover showroom and the construction of a new 9,000-square-foot showroom for the Porsche franchises, and the addition of an elevated showroom addition to the main building for the Lamborghini franchise and all associated site improvements.

2014

- PZC approved the demolition of the Land Rover showroom and the construction of a new 30,000-square-foot showroom for the Land Rover/Range Rover and Jaguar franchises; a sky bridge connecting the proposed building to the main MAG building; and text modifications to decrease the pavement setbacks along US33, decreased parking for service bays in Subarea A and wall signs for the new building in Subarea A.

2013

- PZC approved a material change for the rear elevation of the Audi building.

2012

- PZC approved amended final development plan for a separate Audi showroom and the incorporation of a non-public car wash for the BMW/Mini building.
- PZC approved an amended final development plan for the BMW/Mini showroom with conditions to remove the proposed Audi building from the plan and to revise the architecture to be more in line with other campus buildings and the approved BMW/Mini building.
- City Council approved a rezoning on March 12, 2012 for a 40,000-square-foot building with approximately 4,000 square feet for expansion area, 225 parking spaces and 57,000 square feet of vehicle display area for the BMW and Mini franchise.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval of a rezoning with preliminary development plan and final development plan to develop additional land into the MAG PUD for the Mini and BMW franchises.

2011

- The Planning and Zoning Commission informally reviewed a proposal to incorporate additional land into the MAG PUD for the Mini and BMW franchises to move from Post Road.

2010

- City Council approved a rezoning with preliminary development plan that removed Subarea J and portions of Subareas D and J-1 from the Perimeter Center PCD and established a 15.6-acre MAG PUD.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a final development plan with the recently constructed addition for the Volvo and Porsche franchises. The addition includes an owner's residential suite. This rezoning moved MAG out of the Perimeter Center Planned District and into a separate PUD (MAG plan).

2008

- City Council approved a rezoning with preliminary development plan to remove part of Subarea D place it into Subarea J-1 to accommodate a free-standing parking lot for the MAG dealership.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission disapproved an amended final development plan for exterior building modifications and a wall sign for Porsche franchise.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval of a rezoning with preliminary development plan to remove part of Subarea D place it into Subarea J-1 to accommodate a free-standing parking lot for the MAG dealership.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission informally a proposal for exterior building modifications and a wall sign for Porsche franchise.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission informally reviewed a proposal to accommodate a free-standing parking lot for the MAG dealership.

2005

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved an amended final development plan for the construction of an 18,081-square-foot expansion and skywalk addition for the MAG dealership.

2004

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a revised final development plan for architectural and site modifications to the Rolls Royce brand within the MAG dealership.

1998

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a development plan for the construction of the 7,335-square-foot Land Rover building within the MAG dealership.

1997

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a development plan for the construction of the 71,000-square-foot main MAG dealership building.
- Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval and City Council approved a rezoning to create a 14-acre Subarea J of the Perimeter Center plan for auto dealerships and other uses, with several automotive franchises as a part of the Midwest Auto Group (MAG) campus.