



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (In Person) Thursday, March 16, 2023

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee to the meeting.

Committee Members Present: W. Dwayne Maynard (Chair) – (via WebEx), Ajmeri Hoque (Vice Chair), Emmet Apolinario, Susan Ortega, Yanling Yin, Isao Shoji, Zhen Xing, Chief Justin Páez, Deputy Chief Nick Tabernik, Deputy Chief Greg Lattanzi; Guests: HR Business Partner Whitney Aebker; Peg Kilty CIAC Member, Dee Marks Dublin City Schools, Nancy Wayner DEI Committee One Dublin
Minutes by: Becky Metcalf

Committee Business

Vice Chair Hoque welcomed all to the meeting and deferred to Chief Páez to call roll.

- **Attendance**

Chief Páez called roll for the meeting:
Chair Dwayne Maynard – present via WebEx
Vice Chair Ajmeri Hoque – present
Mr. Emmet Apolinario – present
Mr. Isao Shoji –present
Ms. Susan Ortega –present
Ms. Yanling Yin – present
Ms. Zhen Xing – present
Mr. Gaurav Goel – not present
Ms. Rama Billakenty – not present
Ms. Stella Villalba – not present

Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes

Vice Chair Hoque asked if all had an opportunity to review minutes from the January 19, 2023 meeting and February 16, 2023. Vice Chair Hoque asked for a motion to adopt the minutes. Emmet Apolinario motioned to adopt the minutes and all agreed. The minutes for January 19, 2023 and February 16, 2023 were approved.

Old Business

Vice Chair Hoque asked if there was any old business to be addressed, there was no old business. Chief Páez advised that there was no public commentary to share.

New Business

Diversifying police personnel

Chief Páez reiterated that the CAC works from its four aspirational goals. The department has taken steps over past several years to achieve the goal of Diversifying Police Personnel. Chief Páez introduced HR Business Partner Whitney Aebker to discuss the recruiting and hiring process. On a side note, Ms. Aebker was nominated and received the award for Civilian Employee of the Year for all the work and dedication to recruitment efforts and the police hiring process.

HR Business Partner Whitney Aebker introduced herself and provided some background on her role with the City of Dublin. She shared that since January 2021 she has been part of many discussions on recruitment and the hiring process. Since that time, the department has hired 13 new officers; 7 out of that 13 being diverse/female or 53.8% of the hiring pool. Currently in the department, 13.4% are diverse or female. NRECC has hired eight employees during this timeframe; 7 of 8 are diverse or female. Two other civilian employees were also hired, one male and one female. In addition, the City rewrote the AO (Administrative Order) on the selection process. The Chief of Police can select one of three paths when posting for the position of police officer: written test, application and resume, or lateral. Traditionally the written test requires they be physically present. The resume and application based process requires that they merely apply and upload their resume, then there are six questions at end of the application they are required to answer. The information is then reviewed by a panel and those candidates selected then proceed to the interview process. The third pathway is a lateral process, which is also a resume application based process.

Chief Páez added that the traditional testing process is followed by most municipalities; the company IPMA (International Public Management Association) has been used for testing and the standard sorting mechanism for approximately 20 years. The department has tried others, for example, the National Testing Network, which offers an online portal to take the test, paid by the applicant but the department was seeing fewer applicants. In the past, we would get 200-220 applicants come to take the police test; about a year ago, we ran a test and there were 65 applicants. Chief Páez advised that there is still validity in testing at the beginning of the process especially for those with no degree or experience. He wants to retain that opportunity at no cost to candidates to take the test. Regarding the lateral process, he advised that the department has traditionally done well hiring officers from other departments with experience; applications increased to 130 when we offered those additional options.

DC Lattanzi commented that the department wanted to create a process with few barriers. With National Testing applicants had to pay to submit their test. Some struggle with test taking and some struggle with being there at a particular time. He believes we are headed in the right direction and we will continue to evaluate those processes.

DC Tabernik commented that internally, when looking at resumes and applications, they looked at people with a wide range of experience. This is a very progressive program and internally we had to have the right people involved. DC Lattanzi added that part of that key group had to go through additional training on bias and other training to be part of the final interview panel; additionally, as part of the review of applications and resumes all identifying information was redacted so the committee could view without bias thus reviewing simply on what the candidate provided.

Vice Chair Hoque asked Ms. Aebker if she could determine the numbers of diverse or female candidates prior to 2021. Ms. Aebker advised she would get that information for next meeting. Vice Chair Hoque advised that this information could aid in documenting the progress of the CAC.

Vice Chair Hoque asked for a description of police test. Chief Páez advised that it is a very standardized test. Someone without experience could navigate the test based on the directions. Candidates get a lot of instruction on how the test will work and elements they will experience. They receive a test information packet and all have 20 minutes to review the material, trying to absorb as much of that information as possible. At the end of the 20 minutes, the information packet is collected and the tests distributed. There are 100 questions on the test some related to that packet and some not.

Vice Chair Hoque asked what if anything stuck out after making the change. Ms. Aebker advised that being through both options she did not see a drastic change; you get a wide array of candidates. We do get good quality applicants and she believes we did get some in that resume/application process that did not test well previously, which is the goal.

Yanling Yin asked if the purpose of the test is to evaluate critical thinking; what do you get from taking the test.

Ms. Aebker it tests the ability to learn and apply, the ability to observe and remember; also to recall details, judgement, logic, follow directions, verbal vocabulary and reading comprehension.

Zhen Xing asked if there are any requirements? Ms. Aebker advised that candidates must be at least 21 years of age, be a permanent resident, and have a high school diploma or GED.

Susan Ortega asked if there ever accommodations for testing, for instance maybe in different languages. Chief Páez advised that on language, he does not know but they have in the past made accommodations for test taking when asked. Ms. Aebker advised that as long as they communicate the need she would make arrangements. She has not been asked about translation but believes they could make those accommodations.

Guest asked about pay equity; has Dublin ever done an assessment regarding pay equity. Ms. Aebker advised that police officers are part of a union contract; pay is based on steps and all come in at particular step. Chief Páez added that NRECC (dispatchers) and officers are part of two separate bargaining unions.

Yanling Yin asked that when trying to bring in a diverse work force, do they stay at a lower level; it seems the higher the rank the less you see of diversity. Chief Páez advised that yes, we do still see that and it is something that we are trying to resolve.

DC Lattanzi spoke about a panel he sits on with a professor at Cedarville University and other law enforcement leaders. They have had discussions about recruitment and diversity. They met a couple of weeks ago with leaders from throughout the state to discuss what is and is not working and there was much conversation about Dublin's process, which is not tied to civil service regulations.

Yanling Yin asked if there is anything special for current female officers. Chief Páez advised that from that perspective there is work for us to do; not all officers want to be out in the forefront; have discussed working on a policy with considerations unique when hiring female officers; for instance bringing more overt awareness as part of our recruiting to our family leave policy.

Guest asked if the department has studied when there is a problem with retention of females, where does it line up in their lives. Ms. Aebker advised that some of our female officers retired after long careers and some did not seek advanced positions within the agency.

Guest asked if all employees have the opportunity for family leave. Ms. Aebker advised that yes all employees are available for 12 weeks of family leave, paternity leave.

Susan Ortega commented that Dublin does a nice job in communicating diversity in hiring.

Guest commented that it would be interesting to see, statewide and nationwide, how Dublin lands with female officers. Chief Páez advised that we could look at that.

Zhen Xing asked if there is a requirement for physical fitness. Chief Páez advised that is a part of the process as well; DC Lattanzi has also been involved at the state level as to what those physical fitness standards look like. Zhen Xing asked if the standards are the

same for men and women. DC Lattanzi advised that the standards are all based on "Cooper Standards" which are broken down by male and female candidates based on age; consists of a 1½ mile run, pushups and sit ups in given time frame. He anticipates looking at alternatives, there is a standard of fitness for the job, but to what end does a run, pushup and sit up convey toward that standard. Chief Páez advised that ultimately those standards are enacted at the state level.

Dee Marks asked if there is a look at their mental health and what other standards. Ms. Aebker advised that candidates are required to take a polygraph, physical and psychological exam as part of the conditional offer process.

Vice Chair Hoque asked if they could include numbers outside race and gender, for instance LGBTQ information.

Isao Shoji asked if that is something that comes out in an interview. DC Lattanzi advised only if the candidate offers that information.

Chief Páez shared that in this profession, there are things that officer's feel they can't share; the hope is that we are creating a culture that they can be their full self.

Susan Ortega inquired about what they share about themselves during that psychological evaluation; what is done with that information. Ms. Aebker advised that the information is held in a medical file separate from all other information. The psychologist uses a series of tests in evaluation of candidates and does dive pretty deep into what that candidate would share; there have been occasions where they do not feel the candidate should go forward due to those findings.

Chair Maynard shared his experience as the community member participating in the interview process and offered to answer any questions from the committee.

Chief Páez thanked Chair Maynard for his involvement and having him take part in the interview process. He had been involved in our recruiting process long before participating in this portion of the process. He did a wonderful job articulating that diversity is not just a term; it is the way we see and interact with our community. It is important for our candidates coming in to hear what is important to our department.

Yanling Yin thanked Chair Maynard for his time and representing the CAC. She asked Chief Páez if there were any female or people of color candidates in the final interview and prior to that what was the proportion. Ms. Aebker advised that they do not know any of that identifying information prior to their arrival for the interview as that information is redacted.

Guest asked if candidates being bilingual or multi lingual is a consideration. Chair Maynard advised there were two people that he recalled in the interviews. Ms. Aebker advised that the app does allow them to list languages and or sign language; those qualities do factor into experience.

Dee Marks asked what were the experience levels of the new officers. Chief Páez stated that out of the group, six had experience; four had no experience or were not certified. There is a good blend of candidates.

Chief's Update

Chief Páez provided a brief overview of recent crime and police activity. Overall activity is less than where we were at this point last year and we are seeing less activity with those serious offenses or a downward trend. He advised that as we get into Spring, the department would continue to remind all to remove any valuables from their vehicles. If residents own a Kia or Hyundai, they are encouraged to get steering wheel locks; the department has over 200 available to the public. They just need to come to the department to get one; this helps reduce the likelihood of theft. Kia/Hyundai have some fixes on the horizon; the issues only affect specific years and vehicles that have a traditional key.

In regards to burglary and breaking & entering, numbers are up from last year for residential areas; he encourages all that if you have an alarm system to please use it; also rely on others to watch your home while you are away or sign up for a house watch.

Dee Marks asked if overall are our trends are similar to bordering communities. Chief Páez advised that surrounding communities are likely seeing very similar types of crimes.

Susan Ortega asked if the department ever sends out a "tip sheet" to HOAs, something with helpful tips. Chief Páez advised that the department does this; he also asked members to share that the department would love to come out and talk with HOAs to share updates, hear concerns, and share information on prevention; if any members have contact with HOA leaders let them know we would love a chance to come out and meet with their group.

Yanling Yin asked if there is official language about the KIA and Hyundai vehicle locks that she can share. Chief Páez advised that Rebecca Myers is getting ready to share the information; can connect with her to reach as many folks as possible.

April meeting: FBI presentation, group photo, new date

Chief Páez shared that they had an opportunity to meet with the Joint Terrorism Task Force (JTTF) Assistant Agent In Charge. DC Tabernik advised that the department has had a good relationship with JTTF for about four years. The Assistant Agent In Charge is a Dublin resident and community partner. They had good conversation on various

topics and JTTF offered the opportunity to partner with their behavior analysis specialist and threat assessment person at the school level. They wanted to opportunity to communicate with the public and share information so DC Tabernik invited them to come speak at an upcoming CAC meeting; they want to answer any questions, share what they offer, and have, moving forward, the joint goal of safety. They were very appreciative of the offer and will participate at a future meeting.

April 20 school event and CAC meeting conflict. The committee discussed moving the meeting to a different date so members can be involved in the school event. The group decided that the next meeting would move to 4/13 to afford members the opportunity to attend the school event on 4/20.

Chief Páez thanked Isao Shoji for his commitment as this is likely his last meeting; thanked him for his work and input over the past few years and looks forward to working with him on the other committee in the future.

Isao Shoji thanked all for opportunity to be a part of the CAC. He commented that it was a privilege and honor and that he enjoyed meeting and working with all the partners. He stated that his heart tells him this is where he wants to be, but his head tells him it is time to step away. This is the end of his official commitment to the CAC but he will join in an unofficial capacity on occasion.

Vice Chair Hoque shared that Ramadan starts next week thru 4/20. She asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Isao Shoji motioned to adjourn and Emmet Apolinario seconded the motion. All agreed and the meeting officially adjourned at 7:27 PM.

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information
614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez
jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville
jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi
glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard
dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik
ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey
amccloskey@dublin.oh.us