



MEETING MINUTES

Community Inclusion Advisory Committee

Tuesday, August 29, 2023

Call to Order

Imran Malik, Chair, called the meeting to order at 6:07 p.m.

Roll Call

Committee Members Present: Imran Malik (Chair), Noor Amara, Kristine Aldemir, Katawi Cato, Peggy Kilty, Isao Shoji, Vineet Goel, Michael Haynes, Max Xu, Ming Yu

Absent: Vice Chair Lombardo (excused)

City Staff Present: Christine Nardecchia, Chief Justin Páez, Sarah Esala

Public Comments Not On Agenda

There were no public comments

Approval of Minutes

Ms. Aldemir moved to approve, seconded by Mr. Shoji. Approved unanimously.

Priority Area 8 – Facilitated Discussion Chair Malik

Ms. Nardecchia provided a handout of proposed learning targets and topics for a DEI speaker series. These topics were sourced directly from previous C.I.A.C. meetings' minutes. Ms. Nardecchia asked members to see if they felt this list reflected their discussions.

Chair Malik expressed that everything was captured comprehensively.

Mr. Haynes asked for clarification on points three and six and wondered if they were topics or targets.

Ms. Nardecchia thought these were learning targets that were brought forth by Chair Malik and Vice Chair Lombardo.

Chair Malik asked for a deadline on the CIAC submission.

Ms. Nardecchia said there is no specific deadline. The role of C.I.A.C. is to make a recommendation and the city will handle implementation if it is moved forward. The committee's next step is to see if anything is missing. She has already spoken with some potential speakers. She also added that an MLK Sunday Supper is already budgeted and that a related topic could be presented for that program as well.

Ms. Kilty added the topics of Stereotypes and Myth busting. She went on to describe it has how to dissolve preconceived notions of others that are different from ourselves. She also asked for the addition of the topic of how Dublin became so diverse and history of the community's demographics - a good introduction to the series and DEI and belonging, to ease people in to why it is important to look at these topics.

Mr. Shoji added that he was deeply in agreement that we don't want anything that can be perceived as controversial or invite opportunity for misinterpretation or headline that can be different than was intended. He went on to say that the environment may be ripe for misunderstanding adding that he was surprised that C.I.A.C. hasn't made waves in the community already. He expressed his agreement with Ms. Kilty to start with background of what happened to Dublin and the community instead of "this is what we think" or "these are the things not going well". This would get people's attention that would not typically attend a DEI discussion.

Chair Malik agreed that angles of caution be added to recommendation and thanked members for their comments and asked Mr. Haynes his thoughts.

Mr. Haynes thought list broadly speaking covered topics. He liked the idea of starting with content which is approachable but also voiced that while it is important to properly vet the right speaker, there are people in the community and surrounding communities who will be happy to misrepresent whatever people try to do in the name of DEI. It makes it a little disheartening to hear so many notes of caution although recognized this is a part of the discussion. The City made a clear and bold statement in 2021 with nondiscrimination ordinance passed unanimously. He felt that the recommendations shouldn't be so cautious as to fail to meet objectives. He said the committee may want to clarify objectives.

Ms. Aldemir agreed a about avoiding some controversy but shared that we sometimes must ask deeper questions. Why is there a fear? If you can understand basic emotions and reasons behind it, you can tackle real issues. To avoid talking about it or to sugar coat it, one may just end up skimming the surface.

Mr. Shoji said he understands Mr. Haynes' point. He thinks there is a difference between moving goalposts so we don't offend anyone and keeping the goalpost where it is, but to purposefully decide that we need to take time to get there. Not moving the goalpost isn't an answer as there is a mandate the City was bold enough to create it in the first place. The Chief's Advisory Committee also asks for bold things and there is a time and place for that.

Community Inclusion Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

August 29, 2023

Page 3 of 10

Perhaps if this is a one-time shot, we should take it, but this is the start of a series. Let's be clear about what we want to reach but not be in a hurry to get there in the first shot if taking time betters chances of ultimately getting there.

Chair Malik sees benefit of both sides, adding that we cannot shy away from controversy but also can be natural progression in bringing in a series of speakers. He went on to share how success can be measured by engaging the community and taking that as feedback and guidance for the next in the series. Sometimes topics have to be addressed openly and transparently.

Mr. Haynes asked for clarification about series. Is budgeting an annual cycle?

Mr. Haynes asked how many speakers would be part of the series and whether this had been defined.

Ms. Nardecchia said it had not.

Chair Malik said C.I.A.C. did a comparison analysis on what we want to present to council and what is happening in other principalities and councils. Like New Albany which may be larger than we are looking at but this speaker series is a step in the direction of other Columbus communities.

Ms. Nardecchia clarified that the direction in the framework is very broad. Recommended that a two time series may be the right number and asked for the committee's thoughts.

Mr. Haynes asked to clarify if Ms. Nardecchia meant two events.

Ms. Nardecchia confirmed two events plus the MLK Sunday Supper.

Chair Malik asked for more information about the MLK Sunday Supper.

Ms. Nardecchia provided historic reference that MLK Sunday Supper (pre-COVID) was a deliberate facilitated community conversation about what makes us a community. During COVID the City asked that people have these discussions at home. MLK Supper is an event we can and have budgeted for in 2024 and plan to have at Ballantrae on the Sunday night of MLK weekend. C.I.A.C. recommended the MLK Civic Service Series which has launched and is about reaching out and serving one another. Next one is from CHOICES and will be collecting kits for people facing domestic violence.

Mr. Haynes suggested the speaker series be 4-6 per year, including the Sunday Supper. Maybe quarterly, with one as the Sunday Supper

Chair Malik stated that Columbus has a similar series and they do four times a year. They don't overlap into holiday season, so start in March and end by September. Still 4-5 but avoiding the beginning and end of the year.

Community Inclusion Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

August 29, 2023

Page 4 of 10

Ms. Nardecchia said that New Albany has a robust and well-endowed series produced by New Albany Foundation, not the City, and that she wasn't sure if its purpose was about DEI. There have also been discussions about something like that here but spearheaded by the Ohio University Dublin campus. They will soon be announcing their speaker series and have chosen healthy aging as the first topic to be presented at their medical campus. OU has the structure, experts and donor funds in their DNA and it's also a great goal to get people to their campus in Dublin, extending their reach to the Dublin community. The first speaker event is on Sept. 27. Ms. Nardecchia will send follow-up.

Ms. Nardecchia asked that C.I.A.C. provide recommendations for outcomes and impact which she understood could be hard to measure. What do you want people knowing, feeling? What is success? Is it filled seats?

Mr. Xu expressed that we are not limited to the next year but could be next year and the year after. If we need to be conservative with topics, we don't have to limit ourselves with the number of topics but with the quality of the event. If just twice, there may be many years of the series. If full house, that can justify more events in the future.

Mr. Goel asked who will be the audience? Chair Malik answered the Dublin community at-large.

Ms. Nardecchia said she is talking to a speaker in Chicago about a culture of belonging and what that accomplishes in a community and all that goes into that. If we are going to invest into a speaker, would it be a good idea to double up? During day, they could present to city staff, in the evening to our community and another day for our companies. Staff could also partner with other communities to see if they want to partner, but it may be too big of a focus, as this is about Dublin.

Ms. Aldemir shared that she wants people to be inspired, to feel they belong to this movement and want to do something about it. How can I volunteer? How can I jump in?

Mr. Haynes said that, as far as audience, both Dublin residents and workers in Dublin would be the answer. There would be collateral benefit if others want to join as well. He also likes the idea of including City staff adding that the idea of being able to take advantage of that is good. However, the Framework is for the general public, which should be the priority. But if we can double up, that would be beneficial.

Ms. Aldemir said she went to New Albany lectures because topics were interesting and has also been to speaker series at The John Glenn College of Public Affairs. The City may have the opportunity to tap into those connections to give us the series we want provide once we know what direction we want to go.

Ms. Kilty added the Kirwan Institute at OSU as an additional resource possibility.

Chair Malik asked what support impact would be needed to handle these events. Expressed that 3-4 in the series might be best. If it is a full day with city staff and community and another day of businesses, it will require a lot of staffing and may bring a scope of work that is limiting.

Ms. Kilty - Parents and Educators Raising our Community (PERC) brought in an author and psychologist and shared presentations with Nationwide Children's and others, including Dublin.

Mr. Shoji asked when we say two times per year or quarterly, are we all thinking in 2024 or are we thinking about something that goes on perpetually?

Ms. Nardecchia stated that the Framework does not address that question. It is yet to be seen, and up to Council's direction to C.I.A.C. on annual focus topics. Once this gets started, we may find we have something successful in our hands and can look for partnerships and funding opportunities to keep it going.

Mr. Shoji stated that funding will always be an issue so it may be best to set that aside for the moment. He cannot remember this conversation on the Taskforce and does not sound like it was discussed in detail.

Ms. Kilty reviewed Priority Area 8, which references open speaker events, town halls and DEI training. She read over the section of the document to the committee.

Mr. Haynes expressed that C.I.A.C's role is to recommend to the City that this be done in 2024, but we can also recommend that it be something annual. But with budget year by year, funding is for 2024. One, it will need to show benefit to justify continuing being done. Whether it shows benefit or not, priorities change. If it is recommended to be ongoing, funding is for 2024 and that is the only year we can rely on it happening. Understanding we want to start it at a 101 level, providing info to people who don't have info yet, what do we want to get done in 2024 because no guarantee that we can do it beyond into 2025?

Mr. Shoji said that his image is an ongoing perpetual series of one to two times per year. Anything we do is not going to be an event but a process. It isn't going to change people's minds overnight and it takes time to shift things and we want to measure the impact of what we are doing. If we see how people's minds change over time and that should be the measurement of the work and impact instead of what was a person thinking when they walked in compared to when they walked out. Instead, what does the public feel this year compared to five years down the road? This is what has been talked about how to measure ourselves.

Mr. Haynes cautioned that it shouldn't be relied upon to be an annual series.

Ms. Kilty felt that it has already been recommended as an annual speaker series.

Ms. Amara referred to outcomes and that reframing people's thought processes is a long-term process. An objective can be the type of residents we attract and workforce in our community.

Ms. Cato added that a consideration should be what the continuing conversation is. Like the Culture Corner at the Dublin Community Recreation Center – not everyone knows about this. She suggested that the months not being highlighted already be used as an extension from this

series. There could be a social media series afterwards, continued conversation, and so on - not just speakers

Ms. Nardecchia said that in the volunteer management, we have a tenant that "recognition is not an event, but a philosophy." This isn't necessarily about producing an but we are producing a philosophy or culture that attracts people here and is year round, whether it is two or four times per year. She asked members if they made the assumption this would be an annual series.

The group indicated yes, they would expect it to be annual

Ms. Aldemir acknowledged that budget could be an issue, but there are also speakers who can talk for free. We must remember to tap into those people and resources.

Chair Malik brought the discussion back to the topic of measurability. How do we measure success? A one-time transaction isn't going to help us measure so has to be more than a once or twice per year commitment to see an impact on discussion and deliberation. How can we build on next steps forward once we have that information? Social media and feedback on posts can also be a calibration of success of a certain speaker. It should probably be more than a couple of year commitment to see an impact.

Ms. Nardecchia will put together a proposal for the September meeting and ask members if it reflects the discussions while aligning with City strategic initiatives. She will express this as annual and ongoing and starting as three events. She will also look at the landscape at what other communities are accomplishing. The goals could be annual. She also stated that this city is exceptional at measurement and keeps and tracks data in areas more than likes and shares on social media. We consistently survey residents with community surveys and even surveys that compare us nationally. We have the people that can help us figure it out in the city and our corporate community and market research analysis.

Chief Páez agreed the City does a good job collecting data and has the right people to help interpret the data and use it to project forward into a continuation of the program.

Ms. Amara mentioned that collecting inventory of DEI events would be a novel thing. Parade of DEI – Cultural Corner and series at OU. Maybe a map for residents of how we are celebrating it?

Mr. Goel asked how we are going to present this? Educational speaker series?

Ms. Nardecchia agreed with educational speaker series. Thanked Ms. Yu who described last month about going to a dance event with her community and asked how we can "step outside of our circles" to develop understanding of one another.

Ms. Kilty expressed that she want to engage and learn and intersect but doesn't always know if she belongs. She wants to be welcome as an observer and someone who is learning but not overstep, because sometimes there are boundaries. I find myself asking, "Do I belong?"

Chair Malik felt that "educational" might not catch everything. If the first year is belonging and culturalism, could have something catchy under title. How do we intersect all the cultures? Could be an angle for the first year

Ms. Kilty expressed concern that in July, the Supreme Court made decision about affirmative action that may have an impact on our communities. She said she would e-mail CIAC about it.

Ms. Nardecchia reminded the group about group e-mails/not conducting business via e-mail. Instead, she may choose to read the e-mail the next meeting.

Ms. Kilty referenced "The Daily: How affirmative action changed their lives." This described how lives and careers were impacted by affirmative action. Ms. Kilty also referenced another Columbus source on how affirmative action affects DEI.

Ms. Nardecchia asked if members were comfortable with receiving a comprehensive plan outline draft at the September meeting.

The group indicated yes.

Chair Malik asked for other thoughts.

Ms. Amara asked what C.I.A.C.'s role is moving forward and if they would be tasked with lining up the speakers or just recommending the topics.

Ms. Nardecchia said that C.I.A.C. will provide recommendations but will not need to do any of the work of finding speakers. There may be actionable ways they could help if the series gets off the ground (such as welcoming/ushering/etc.) that she would ask the community to do in general.

Chair Malik asked if there a screening process or background check for speakers.

Ms. Nardecchia stated yes.

Chair Malik expressed that C.I.A.C. would look forward to offering feedback on the plan draft.

Outreach & Engagement Updates

Ms. Nardecchia provided an update on the Outreach and Engagement department's work.

There will be an OU speaker series and committee members will receive and invite and flier.

The October C.I.A.C. meeting will have nonprofits present on how they address DEI methods.

Next month is the group photo.

Sarah Esala is working on scheduling another naturalization ceremony in 2024. All indications seem to point to the first week in May.

Language translation continues to be a citywide project with more staff becoming trained in accessing translation services. The City is also contracting with ASL speakers to be at the ready for public meetings.

A Hearing Loop system is being researched for City Hall Council Chamber as well as a portable system that may be used for other public meetings.

Ms. Kilty noticed the website changed with City Council meetings and felt it was accessible on how can move to different points on the meeting.

Ms. Nardecchia affirmed the updated website with a new contractor that is commonly used for cities.

Ms. Cato asked which nonprofits would be joining the next meeting.

Ms. Nardecchia said the [Dublin Food Pantry](#), which is moving to new location in October and serves a diverse population. [One Dublin](#), which helps with emergency financial assistance. [Neighborhood Bridges Dublin](#), which anonymously helps people and matches needs to people. [FESTA](#) – opening in Dublin, offering 3-generation ESL programs. Game changer for learning English because childcare can be such an issue.

Chair Malik said Dublin Bridges can add to their volunteer list and if there is something you can help with, you can sign up.

Ms. Aldemir said Dublin Food Pantry needs help moving in October and they need fresh fruit and produce. She recommend that residents bring something to public meetings.

Ms. Nardecchia added that the September 17th Dublin Food Pantry event Bounty in Bridge Park event is sold out, but they are still looking for a few more volunteers.

Chair Malik asked for other comments. There were none and he opened the discussion to Chief Páez.

Chief's Advisory Committee (C.A.C.) Updates

Chief Páez said that the C.A.C. discussed Rules of Order and had discussion and recommendations which were submitted to Clerk of Council's office. Their agenda focused on officers involved in critical instances, a presentation done previously but was repeated for new members.

The Director of the NRECC Communication Center will be retiring in September.

Police held Safe Space updates and training at Dublin Methodist Hospital in August. Officer Scott Brown delivered the training to a first round of staff at the hospital.

Scott Brown has done tremendous work and will be recognized by Asian American Commerce Group of Columbus in September.

Chair Malik congratulated Officer Brown.

Ms. Cato asked for update on the job posting coordinated with Syntero and police.

Chief Páez said that Syntero and Police are working through applications and an interviews.

Roundtable

Mr. Shoji shared about his summer absence. He wants children to see both Japan and the U.S. as "home" and that summer is the time for family to go to Japan and live and attend school there. He travels there to stay for a few weeks. He is grateful to be able to do this and sees it as a blessing.

Ms. Nardecchia congratulated Chair Malik on being inducted into Diversity Hall of Fame in Columbus and the group added its congratulations.

Chair Malik said the event is September 21 at 5:30 p.m. at the Lincoln Theater. He admires other honorees and gives credit to others that have guided and given space to the Chair; it is a celebration of all those relationships. C.I.A.C. can join and is welcome. He added that he continues to learn and every relationship teaches him a lot.

Chair Malik reminded everyone of the New Americans Book Fair taking place on Saturday, Sept. 23 at the Dublin Library. There will be volunteer opportunities. Chair Malik added that there is synergy building among the authors, Dublin City Schools and the community.

The Ohio State University's International Affairs hosted a Dialogue Event with Gurudev Sri Sri Ravi Shankar and honored him for his work on global peace. Mayor Jane Fox joined the event and issued a proclamation on behalf of Dublin City Council. Many other governmental entities were present and did the same.

Chair Malik thanked Council and also recognized C.I.A.C. members for their work.

The public is welcome to attend 9/11 Ceremony at Washington Township Fire Department at 10:00 a.m., adding that members could go together or with families or just be there in spirit.

Independence Day Celebration of Pakistani community and all the festivities was very appreciated. Dublin is very accommodating and a global city.

Ms. Kilty asked how many people attended each.

Chair Malik said that attendance was double for the Pakistani celebration.

Mr. Goel said there were 500 people for Indian Independence Day celebration.

Mr. Shoji said the Obon Festival is a period in summer where the souls of ancestors are believed to come back home to spend with families and everyone goes back home. Summer Festival is celebrated in Dublin with JASCO. This is around the fifth year of a rendition of a summer

Community Inclusion Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

August 29, 2023

Page 10 of 10

festival. Around 3,000 people attended and all appreciate the crowd diversity, saying that the majority of attendees were non-Japanese that came out to celebrate and learn about the culture at the great venue of Riverside Crossing Park. He shared his gratitude to the City and the Police.

Chair Malik reminded everyone about next month's photo.

Adjournment

Ms. Aldemir motioned to adjourn.

Mr. Shoji seconded and the meeting was adjourned at 7:36 p.m.



Imran Malik, Chair



Sarah Esala, Coordinator
Outreach & Engagement