COMMUNITY INCLUSION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

SEPTEMBER 27, 2022 COMMITTEEE RETREAT MINUTES

10:00 AM - 3:00 PM

1. Call to Order

Chairman Malik called the September 27, 2022 Retreat of the Community Inclusion Advisory Committee to order at 10:00 am.

2. Roll Call

Committee Members Present: Imran Malik (Chair), Niki Lombardo (Vice), Dengke (Max) Xu, Erica Adams, Isao Shoji, Kristine Aldemir, Michael Haynes, Ming Yu, Noor Amara, Peggy Kilty, Vineet Goel

City Staff Present: Dana McDaniel, Chief Justin Paez, Kirby Dearth, Lindsay Weisenauer, Christine Nardecchia, Alison LeRoy, Rebecca Myers, Leah Dotson, Mitchell Ament

3. Review Minutes

Imran Malik proposed a motion to approve the September 6, 2022 meeting minutes. The motion was unanimously approved.

4. Communications and Public Information Background

Presentation

Lindsay Weisenauer began by introducing the CPI team and the individual functions of every person in the department. She then shared and explained the City of Dublin's organizational chart and structure, then described what CPI team members oversee which portions of the organization. The presentation continued with an explanation of CPI's broad responsibilities as a department.

Lindsay Weisenauer explained the various community touchpoints that residents can engage with online or through traditional media. After presenting this information, she gave the CIAC a look at a chart measuring social media by app, per year. She continued by enlightening the CIAC on ZenCity and how city staff utilizes this tool. Finally, the CIAC was told about the Weekly Newsletter that is accessible by all city staff, being the focal point for the sharing of information among all staff.

5. Communications and Public Information Indicators of Success

Presentation

The CIAC was made aware of the fact that the City releases official statements, materials, and digital content in several different languages. Currently the City of Dublin website has plug-ins for translations services alongside YouTube translations for meetings. Lindsay Weisenauer added that the new website will have further capabilities that will be shared and advertised once launched. The CIAC was asked to identify possible gaps in communication.

COMMUNITY INCLUSION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

SEPTEMBER 27, 2022 COMMITTEEE RETREAT MINUTES

10:00 AM - 3:00 PM

Questions/Comments

The Committee provided questions surrounding broader language translation capabilities for the release of City information and documents, as well as sign language interpreters when needed. City Staff and CPI specifically intend on advertising and promoting the current, as well as upcoming capabilities of online translation resources after the launch of the new website. CIAC members suggested utilizing schools' online capabilities and language options found on school forms to benchmark the City starting point by focusing on the number and type of languages involved. In addition, we need to do a study on what languages are spoken the most in Dublin.

Regarding how progress toward these goals is to be measured, the CIAC asked if attendance of city-sponsored ESL classes can be considered progress in the city. Further noting that members of the Committee could maybe leverage the local faith community for a count on how many people attend. City Staff then possibly publishing future data to engage with the community and gain resident feedback.

Another question posed to the CIAC by CPI staff is, when is it appropriate to ask demographic information on a survey? The CIAC recommended that staff only ask respondents about race and language spoken, followed by an explicit explanation as to why the question is being asked. The CIAC ended the conversation by identifying a specific success measure. Being that, the City gains resident trust to the point where demographic information is asked about in survey form, and residents trust that they are sharing this information, to City Staff, completely anonymously. Noting that staff is also to concentrate on top 5 languages spoken across the City of Dublin, then decide how information and signage is translated. CIAC members suggested collaboration with Dublin schools because they have an annual survey of languages spoken in the household!

Presentation

The second indicator of success relevant to CPI was presented; the City of Dublin's CPI Team reevaluates its communication channels to ensure that it is reaching all racial demographics and communities in Dublin. Lindsay Weisenauer stated that CPI is continuously reevaluating channels of communication, and asks all DEI committees (CAC, CEDEIC, CIAC) to share ideas. Alongside the mention that City Staff utilizes 2022 Attitudes Survey results.

COMMUNITY INCLUSION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

SEPTEMBER 27, 2022 COMMITTEEE RETREAT MINUTES

10:00 AM - 3:00 PM

Questions/Comments

Lindsay Weisenauer answered many questions about the details of the 2022 Attitudes Survey. Following this topic, she then asked what media platforms the CIAC members regularly use, or if they have suggestions about new apps that can be communicated through?

Committee Members stated that the Muslim community uses WhatsApp, and the City should continue utilizing WeChat. Other points made include the use of social media to influence residents to engage with future surveys. In addition, the CPI team should try to provide surveys with different language options.

Presentation

The third indicator relevant to the CPI Department states, the City seeks opportunities to amplify voices and communities through official City content, such as Dublin News Now and social media messaging.

Lindsay Weisenauer and Rebecca Myers described the ways in which CPI is already working towards the fulfillment of this goal. The CPI Department currently spotlights DEI committee members. They have done projects like the "Why I serve" series while working with CIAC Chair on content, they received an award for engagement on a Ramadan Instagram Reel, and are intentional in Dublin Link Bridge lightings and messaging. Rebecca Myers stated the CPI Team is excited to plan the 2023 Bridge Lighting Calendar later today, asking the CIAC please provide any feedback on this topic. She closed by explaining the City's relationship with Dublin Life Magazine.

Questions/Comments

No questions or comments on this indicator.

Presentation

Lindsay Weisenauer then presented another indicator, describing how the City leverages diverse community leaders to expand communications efforts regarding City practices and electoral engagement. The CPI Department currently has the Fuel the Future website showing hiring campaigns, they routinely share public meeting information as well as host voting and elections information online. The City of Dublin intends on ramping up education regarding how to run for office, and asks all DEI Committee Members (CAC, CEDEIC, CIAC) to share boards and commissions openings.

COMMUNITY INCLUSION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

SEPTEMBER 27, 2022 COMMITTEEE RETREAT MINUTES

10:00 AM - 3:00 PM

The CPI Department asked if CIAC members have any suggestions on how to work towards this indicator of success.

Questions/Comments

Committee Members suggested that the City highlight engagement education and that having a seat at the table is not unattainable for residents, especially in communities where engagement and knowledge of it is not engrained culturally. Members also recommended including this information into the welcome packets in different languages, in addition to adding information about voting and city government structure/functions. Suggestions of an open house for residents, especially new residents, to see how local government works is also brought forward by the Committee. The CIAC asked City staff what the voting propensity if for newer members of the Dublin community are, especially new members from other countries?

Presentation

Lindsay Weisenauer presented information on the final indicator addressing translations services. Currently, the City relies on YouTube's translation service for public meetings that translate these events *after* they occur. While the CPI team occasional utilizes volunteers and Outreach and Engagement's language bank to assist with translation needs, they hope to make translation services available upon request and ask the Committee when this would be appropriate and what the best way would be to promote this service.

Questions/Comments

Multiple Committee Members stressed that if there is a City event where public speaking is taking place, an ASL interpreter should be provided. The CIAC agreed that making this service available upon request is a great place to start as it will allow the City to determine what the community's needs are and what events this service will be regularly utilized at. However, the Committee recommends that this request for service should be available at all City public meetings and events. Citizen perception and education must also be taken into account when looking into these services.

6. Lunch

7. Events Background

Presentation

Allison Leroy began her presentation by introducing the Events department and defining the types (three tiers) of City events run by the City of Dublin. After explaining the history of Dublin's five signature events, she explained their economic, community, and administrative impacts. Allison Leroy shared information about how the department helps residents walkthrough over 120 permitted events. The rest of the presentation

COMMUNITY INCLUSION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

SEPTEMBER 27, 2022 COMMITTEEE RETREAT MINUTES

10:00 AM - 3:00 PM

addressed funding through the inclusion of the Hotel/Motel Tax spreadsheet and further emphasized the variance in current City events through the use of an Events spreadsheet.

8. Event List and Involvement Discussion

Presentation

Allison Leroy went over industry best practices in determining City events and observances such as bridge lightings. The current bridge lighting schedule for the Dublin Link Bridge, which was originally based on the lighting schedule for the Empire State Building, was shown to the Committee Members. The form for submitting bridge lightings was also shared and included the policy on minimum number of days required for approval. Allison Leroy shared the current basis for lighting approval but also stressed that more guidance, especially from the CIAC, is still needed.

Kirby Dearth stressed the importance established policy and systems play in determining City events and observances, highlighting the City of Westerville as a current and close example. Jesse Shamp went over the legal meanings and stipulations for government speech. Emphasizing the need for procedure and criteria denial, he explained that government speech matters and that City events/supported bridge lightings are an extension of City speech.

Allison Leroy explained that the CPI team post each time the bridge is lit. To ensure quality events and bridge lightings, staff needs to be given adequate time to prepare, there needs to be push back on missed deadlines, and no exceptions must be made. However, currently, the Events team does try to give leeway if the City Manager or Council gives them specific direction on a particular event/observance. The fees associated for the three tiers of events are decided by a cost study and the tier of a specific event is decided internally. However, the fees for recent cultural events have been waved, especially if Events knew the Office of the City Manager was involved in its City recognition.

Questions/Comments

The Committee asked if the annual standard events/bridge lighting calendar will include CIAC commemorations and stressed that the bridge should be lit up as much as City staff can accommodate. Everything currently on the events/bridge lighting list is everything that has currently been approved. In response to the inclusion of health events on the calendar (which are typically resident requests), Committee Members suggested that annual events/observances could be signified on the calendar.

Within the conversation about religious holidays, the CIAC emphasized the need for awareness of who lives in Dublin and how they celebrate commemorations, pointing out

COMMUNITY INCLUSION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

SEPTEMBER 27, 2022 COMMITTEEE RETREAT MINUTES

10:00 AM - 3:00 PM

the need for representation of Christianity, Hinduism, Islam, Judaism, Sikhism, Jainism, Buddhism, and Bahaism. In regard to both lighting and messaging, the City must be flexible and make sure they are being informed by those who celebrate. Jesse Shamp also stressed that because the City will also recognize non-religious observances, the City will be considered religiously neutral. Every other event/observance must be brought through formal process in order to be considered. None must be outwardly political statements, however, the City can accomplish this if desired without directly saying it.

The Committee discussed the place of other country's independence days within the context of bridge lightings. Under the agreement that these independence days should be requested through the bridge lighting permit process and not a part of the standard calendar, Committee Members suggested recognizing these days only during commemorative milestones. In place of this annual recognition, the CIAC recommended observing national history months, as recognized by the federal government, annually to still ensure these communities are being represented every year in some capacity.

Members of the Committee also asked how many days should be allocated for these month long celebrations and what the current reasoning is for lighting the bridge for multiple days to acknowledge a single observance. City staff stressed that in the past the reasoning has been so resident have more than one day to enjoy the colors of the Dublin Link Bridge.

9. Adjourn

To end the meeting on time, the last three agenda items were not addressed within the CIAC Retreat.

Respectfully Submitted, Mitchell Ament, City Management Intern Leah Dotson, City Management Intern