



PLANNING REPORT

Architectural Review Board

Wednesday, February 22, 2023

114 S. HIGH STREET 22-173ARB-MPR

www.dublinohiousa.gov/arb/22-173

Case Summary

Address	114 S. High Street, Dublin, OH 43017
Proposal	Exterior modifications including landscaping, and deck and HVAC screening to an existing commercial building located within the Historic District.
Request	Review and approval of a Minor Project Review under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.176 and the <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> .
Zoning	HD-HS, Historic South District
Planning Recommendation	<u>Approval of the Minor Project Review with Conditions.</u>
Next Steps	Upon review and approval of the Minor Project by the Architectural Review Board (ARB), the applicant shall revise an open building permit through Building Standards.
Applicant	Jeff Baur, JBM Development Brandon Dubinsky, JBM Development
Case Manager	Taylor Mullinax, Planner I 614.410.4632 tmullinax@dublin.oh.us

Site Location Map



22-173MPR | 114 S. High St

- Site Features**
- 1 Existing building
 - 2 Approved deck location
 - 3 Approved HVAC location



1. Background

Site Summary

The 0.20-acre site features an existing ±1,605-square-foot one-and-one-half-story building that was built in 1948 and is historically known as the Dr. Harry Karrer office. The building was built in the Colonial Revival style and contains a stone foundation, and its exterior walls are clad with stone and clapboard wood siding. According to the 2017 Historic and Cultural Assessment (HCA), the building is in good condition, has excellent integrity, and is recommended contributing to the district.

The site is located ±85 feet southeast of the intersection of Pinneyhill Lane and S. High Street and is zoned HD-HS: Historic District- South. It is surrounded by businesses to the north, south, and west and single-family homes to the east. Existing sidewalks lead to the front entry off S. High Street and the side entry on the north elevation. An existing parking lot is along the rear elevation, and a mature tree line separates the site's parking lot from residential properties to the east. The site's existing landscaping and front door stoop were removed prior to approval; this request will bring the property back into compliance.

Development History

November 2022: ARB approved a minor project for window replacements and modifications to an approved deck addition and ADA ramp with four conditions. Two conditions were added at the meeting; one of which required the applicant to provide erosion and sedimentation control measures for the site after all landscaping was removed. The proposed landscape plan with MPR application 22-173 will replace the previous approved landscape plan.

October 2022: ARB approved a minor project for exterior modifications to the building with nine conditions which included a condition that the applicant provide additional window documentation with their next MPR application within three months. All conditions are satisfied except for the three ground sign tenant panel conditions. Further details are needed from the applicant for the tenant panel before Planning approval can be granted.

May 2022: Administrative Approval for the excavation of the basement and full restoration of the rear elevation.

April 2019: The ARB approved a Master Sign Plan (MSP) for future tenant panels on a ground sign with one condition.

April 2018: The Administrative Review Team (ART) made a recommendation of approval to the ARB for a MSP with one condition.

February 2016: The ARB approved a MSP for a new ground sign without conditions.

Process

The purpose of the Minor Project Review (MPR) is to provide an efficient review process for qualified minor projects located within the Historic District, ensuring that applications meet the requirements of Code Chapter 153. Typically, a Certificate of Zoning Plan Approval would be required for applicable commercial building modifications; however, since an open building permit exists for the Administrative Approval, the applicant is able to submit revisions to their existing building permit after ARB approval.

2. Zoning Code

HD-HS: Historic South District

The intent of the Historic South District, as outlined in the Code, is ensuring “sensitive infill development and redevelopment and providing an improved environment for walking while accommodating vehicles.” All structures that are within Historic Dublin require the review and approval of the ARB to make modifications.

Historic Design Guidelines

The development standards are supplemented by the *Historic Design Guidelines*, which provide the Board additional direction on preservation, sensitive design, and complementary materials. The Guidelines provide best practices for rehabilitation, new construction, and site design. Specifically, Chapter 4 refers to rehabilitation, Chapter 5 refers to new construction, and Chapter 6 refers to site design.

3. Project

Details

This is a request for exterior modifications to an existing commercial building which includes the following improvements:

- A new front door tread/stoop;
- Screening for the underside deck addition and HVAC units; and
- Landscaping for the site and ground sign.

Lot Coverage

In the Historic South District, a maximum lot coverage of 65 percent is permitted. The existing lot coverage totals 58.4 percent, and with the new 40 SF HVAC concrete pad, the modified lot coverage totals 58.9 percent and continues to meet the Code requirement.

Exterior Modifications

Front Door – Tread/Stoop

The Historic District Code requires all principal entrances to address the street, be pedestrian in scale, and give prominence to the entry on the façade. Stoops can be located on the front façade of the building as long as the stoop and steps are not located within the public right-of-way. The *Historic Design Guidelines*, Section 4.7 (a) and (c), state that the functional, proportional, and decorative features of a primary entrance shall be preserved, and colors should be compatible with historically appropriate colors on the existing building. Section 5.8 (a-c) recommends new materials are traditional to Historic Dublin, incorporate similar colors to other buildings in the district, and use durable materials for the Central Ohio climate. The ARB may approve of contemporary materials with similar characteristics to historic materials.

The previously existing stone stoop was deteriorating and was removed by the applicant prior to ARB approval to improve the safety of the principal entrance. The applicant is proposing a stoop replacement with a 6-inch Oberfields Olentangy Bluff Tread in the Mohican Blend color. The manufactured stone is made of concrete and contains the character of a natural stone. High quality manufactured stone is permitted by Code if found to be appropriate for the Central Ohio Climate. Staff has no concerns with the proposed stoop material.

Screening & Site Landscaping

Building foundation plantings are required along all sides of a building facing a public or private street or a surface of parking area located on the same lot. The ARB may approve alternative landscaping that is consistent with the intent of Code Section 153.173 (H), to accommodate unique site conditions, and similar applications approved for surrounding uses. Guidelines Section 6.3 (b) and (c), recommends landscape design provides year round interest and plant species native to Ohio. Additionally, building foundation plantings are required to soften the appearance of buildings along the street. Lastly, Guidelines Section 6.8 (a) states that mechanical equipment should be screened from view of any public right-of-way or an adjacent property with landscaping or screen walls located to the rear of the building.

Deck Screening and Site Landscaping

The applicant is proposing a variety of shrub plantings and two dogwood trees to fulfill building foundation requirements along the west and south elevations. During landscape removal, no existing trees were removed, and therefore there are no tree planting requirements.

The applicant is required to fulfill a condition of approval from October 2022, to provide underside deck screening and landscaping as part of this MPR application. Due to limited space between the approved deck and the existing sidewalk and steps, the proposed underside deck screening includes a Jakob GreenGuide metal wire trellis system along the north and east sides of the deck addition with Boston Ivy planted to grow up the trellis. This is an alternative solution for providing building foundation plantings along the north elevation of the building. Similar trellises with Boston Ivy have been approved for 38 W. Bridge Street, and the Columbus Metropolitan Library garage.

The Code and *Guidelines* are met, and Staff is supportive of the proposed site landscaping and screening. Building foundation plantings along the rear (east elevation) cannot be accommodated since the existing parking lot terminates at the building foundation and is an existing condition which would negatively affect their parking if incorporated. Staff is recommending two conditions of approval including: that all existing shrub, tree species, and sizes are labeled on the landscape plan; and that the applicant provide grasses or another tall planting at the base of the trellis along the east elevation for additional visual interest at the rear of the building and parking lot.

HVAC Screening

The HVAC units were previously approved to be located on the south side of the existing building. A new 40 SF concrete pad will be installed underneath the units and will be screened on all sides by boxwood evergreens. The plans do not note if the boxwoods will fully screen the height of the HVAC units, and variety heights vary widely. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the HVAC units be fully screened to the top of the units and that this is field verified by Staff when planting is installed at building permitting.

Ground Sign Landscaping

The ground sign was previously approved by the ARB with conditions. The Code requires all ground signs be landscaped appropriately according to site conditions. Five boxwood evergreens are shown on the plan. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that

additional evergreen shrubs be added to complete plantings around the entire circumference of the ground sign pole.

4. Plan Review

Minor Project Review Criteria	
Criteria	Review
1. The MPR shall be consistent with the Community Plan, applicable Zoning Code requirements, <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> , and adopted plans, policies, and regulations.	Criteria Met with Conditions. The proposal is consistent with the Community Plan and all adopted plans, policies and regulations with Conditions. The applicant will need to continue to work with Staff on the proposed conditions.
2. In cases where a MPR is proposed within or as part of an approved PDP or FDP, the MPR shall be consistent with such approved PDP or FDP.	Not Applicable: There is no PDP or FDP for this site.
3. The MPR shall be consistent with the record established by the required reviewing body, the associated staff report, and the Director’s recommendation.	Criteria Met with Conditions. The MPR is consistent with the established record and meets the Code and <i>Guidelines</i> with conditions. Once all conditions are finalized with Staff, the applicant is required to submit all revised plans to Building Standards to finalize their open and existing building permit.
4. The proposed land uses meet all applicable requirements and use specific standards of Section 153.172 Uses.	Not Applicable. The land uses will not change with this request.
5. The proposed development is consistent with the <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> .	Criteria Met with Conditions. The proposed exterior modifications, for the site including the site and sign landscaping and screening, meet the <i>Guidelines</i> with conditions.
6. The proposed MPR is consistent with surrounding historic context, character, and scale of immediately surrounding area and the district as a whole.	Criteria Met. The proposed exterior modifications are appropriate with the surrounding context, character, and scale of the district. A previous condition of approval from the October 2022 MPR application is satisfied through this application for the underside deck and HVAC screening.

7. The proposed buildings are appropriately sited and conform to the requirements of Section 153.173 Site Development Standards and the *Historic Design Guidelines*.

Criteria Met. The site development standards and Guidelines are met.

8. The proposed site improvements, landscaping, screening, signs, and buffering shall meet all applicable requirements of the Code and respond to the standards of the *Historic Design Guidelines*.

Criteria Met. The proposed improvements for site and ground sign landscaping, screening, and the modification to the front door stoop meet all development standards and *Guidelines*.

Recommendation

Planning Recommendation: Approval of the Minor Project Review with conditions:

- 1) The applicant update their existing building permit after ARB approval to reflect these changes, subject to staff review and approval;
- 2) All existing shrub, tree species, and sizes are labeled on the landscape plan to be submitted at building permitting;
- 3) The HVAC units be fully screened to the top of the units by evergreens, to be field verified by Staff when planting is installed, at building permitting;
- 4) Additional grasses or other appropriate plantings be provided at the base of the underside deck screening along the east elevation, room permitting, finalized by Staff at building permitting; and
- 5) Additional evergreen shrubs be added to complete the 360 degree plantings around the ground sign pole, finalized by Staff at building permitting.