



## PLANNING REPORT

# Architectural Review Board

Wednesday, May 24, 2023

## 60 FRANKLIN STREET 23-032MPR

[www.dublinohiousa.gov/arb/23-032](http://www.dublinohiousa.gov/arb/23-032)

### Case Summary

Address	60 Franklin Street
Proposal	Construction of an addition for a one-story home on a 0.35-acre site zoned Historic District – Historic Residential. The site is located northwest of the intersection of Eberly Hill Lane with Mill Lane.
Request	Request approval of a Minor Project Review and Waivers.
Zoning	HD-HR, Historic District – Historic Residential
Planning Recommendation	<b><u>Approval of four Waivers.</u></b> <b><u>Approval of Minor Project Review with condition</u></b>
Next Steps	Upon review and approval of Waivers and Minor Project Review (MPR), by the Architectural Review Board (ARB), the applicant may file for building permits through Building Standards.
Applicant	Jeffrey Bolyard
Case Manager	Sarah Tresouthick Holt, AICP, ASLA, Senior Planner (614) 410-4662 sholt@dublin.oh.us

Site Location Map

23-032MPR | 60 FRANKLIN STREET



- Site Features**
- 1 Addition location
  - 2 Previously-approved addition



## 1. Background

### Site Summary

The home was constructed in 1957 and is indicative of a Mid-century Modern ranch, which is the dominant style on Franklin Street. The home was recommended as contributing in the 2017 Historic and Cultural Assessment (HCA). At that time, the home was noted as having fair integrity, diminished by replacement materials. The home was noted as having retained overall design, setting, feeling, and association.

The site is on the east side of Franklin Street, south of Sells Alley. The parcel is .35 acres in size, has +/- 70 feet of frontage on Franklin Street and Mill Lane, and is +/- 215 feet deep.

### Development History

This project has come before the Board twice, under previous Bridge Street District Code and Guidelines.

#### *Board Approval 2007*

- Original wood siding replaced with stucco
- Faux stone watertable, decorative wood shingles in gables, and white vinyl windows

#### *Board Approvals 2008 and 2009*

Various site changes for retaining walls and steps

#### *Board Approval 2020*

- 683-square-foot addition approved for rear of house
- Finished in same materials as approved in 2007, including white vinyl windows

### Site Characteristics

#### *Natural Features*

The rear of the site is fairly heavily landscaped, and an existing buckeye tree and various shrubs are proposed for removal with the proposed addition.

#### *Road, Pedestrian, and Bike Network*

The property has double frontage: Franklin Street at the front and Mill Lane at the back. The Mill Lane frontage provides vehicular access for the site.

Sidewalks are not present along either street, although the new Franklin Street extension project, currently under construction, will include sidewalks on Franklin Street south to Waterford Drive. Mill Lane does not have sidewalk facilities. No specific bike facilities exist adjacent to the site.

### Process

Subsequent to Waiver and MPR approvals, the applicant may apply for building permits through Building Standards.

## 2. Zoning Code and Guidelines

### *HD-HR: Historic Residential District*

The intent of the Historic Residential District is to encourage the preservation and development of homes on existing or new lots that are comparable in size, mass, and scale, while maintaining the traditional residential character of the district. The Code identifies development standards, including maximum building size, lot coverage, and setbacks. All structures that are within Historic Dublin require the review and approval of the ARB to make modifications.

### *Historic Design Guidelines*

The Code standards are supplemented by the *Historic Design Guidelines*, which provide the Board additional direction on preservation, sensitive design, and complementary materials. The Guidelines provide best practices for additions (Chapter 4) and new construction (Chapter 5).

As described, previous additions were approved and constructed prior to the adoption of the current Code and Guidelines, which are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. There are a number of fundamental, existing conditions that likely would not have earned approval under the new Code and Guidelines (Section 4.12):

- Additions to be subordinate and inset from existing buildings;
- Additions to be clearly distinguishable from existing buildings;
- Reveals/hyphens to be between additions and existing buildings;
- Additions should not destroy existing materials;
- Roofline heights of additions should be below the original structure;
- Avoid adding faux historicisms, in this case Craftsman-like details; and
- Vinyl windows are no longer permitted in the district.

## 3. Project

The applicant desires to construct a 286-square-foot master bath addition, wishing it to appear to be part of the architecture of the house as it now exists. A total of four Waivers are requested in seven locations. Staff supports these Waivers in order to ensure that the structure is cohesive in appearance.

### **Lot Coverage, Setbacks, Building Size**

The maximum permitted lot coverage in the Historic Residential district is 45 percent, per Table 153.173A. Proposed is 34.7 percent, thus meeting this requirement.

The required setbacks are:

Front	25'
Side	4', with total side yards being no less than 12'
Rear	20% of lot depth, NTE 50"

All setbacks have been met with this proposal.

### **Massing and Materials**

#### *West Elevation – Franklin Street*

Originally, the applicant sought to include a Craftsman-style extended porch on this elevation. Karen Bokor, our preservation architect, and staff agreed that the porch proposal was not appropriate as proposed for the Mid-century Modern neighborhood. The applicant has removed this element from his request and plans to reconsider it separately in the future.

*North Elevation – Left Side Yard*

The north elevation shows the bedroom addition behind, and perpendicular to, the original gable parallel to Franklin Street. It is shown inset 1-foot, 10-inches at the foundation. The addition location meets the rear location directed by Guideline Section 4.12B, and the break or reveal anticipated in 4.12C is minimally met. Staff is satisfied.

The roof sits below the original building gable, thus meeting Guideline Section 4.12G and H. The proposed roof pitch is 7:12, which meets the Code requirements of 153.174(B)(4)(c)(1). Shingles to match the previously-approved roof, Certainteed – Landmark in Driftwood, are proposed. Cedar shakes are proposed for the gable end, painted Roycroft Bronze Green, SW2846, to match other gable ends. Azek trim, painted Extra White (SW7006), is proposed for the new window installations; this requires a Waiver. New Jeld-Wen white vinyl windows are proposed for the addition; this will also require a Waiver. New stucco to match the existing stucco is proposed in Downing Sand, SW2822. A manufactured stone sill is proposed below the stucco in Dutch Quality Stone, Brown Chiseled, to match the existing sills on the house. A manufactured stone watertable is proposed in Stonecraft Heritage, Bucktown Limestone, with grout being Holcim-N (grey) to match the existing. Finally, on this elevation, two Jeld-Wen sliding vinyl basement windows are shown that match windows already existing on this elevation and are included in the Waiver analysis for the vinyl windows.

Staff, our consultant, and the applicant discussed an opportunity to use different body materials to better meet Guideline Section 4.12A and F (clearly subordinate, materials complementary to the district and original building); but agreed that matching the existing house is the best approach to keep the structure cohesive in its design.

*South Elevation – Right Side Yard*

The south elevation is much the same as described for the north, with the addition of an internally-facing French door and staircase. The door is a Weather Shield Signature aluminum-clad wood door with integral grids, painted Extra White. Guideline Section 4.8E states that window muntins should avoid sandwiched grids; however, these windows will match the existing ones on the house, so staff is satisfied.

Other elevation materials indicate that the trim for the French door is Azek, painted Extra White, included in the Waiver request for that material. The porch decking is concrete; and the stairs are proposed to be Timbertech Composite, a composite wood and recycled plastic material, in Kona Brown. Timbertech also requires a Waiver, included herein, and similar materials have been approved in the district. The railings for the deck are proposed with square spindles, powder coated black, from Timbertech, between Azek-wrapped columns painted Extra White. The porch is cantilevered, with the watertable visible underneath.

*East Elevation – Mill Lane*

This elevation clearly shows that the proposed roof is below the existing roof line of the original structure and inset from the existing structure. The previously-described materials are the same with the following details. A Fypon gable vent is proposed to match other gable vents on the

building, requiring a Waiver. This vent will be painted Extra White. The Timbertech stair treads are proposed to sit on pressure-treated wood stringers.

**Lighting**

While neither Staff nor the Board has the authority to approve/dis-approve single-family residential lighting levels, Guidelines Section 6.7 speaks to lighting style. Sub-sections A and B recommend fixtures that are scaled appropriately to the use and character of the surrounding properties, with simple designs, avoiding large ornate fixtures. Staff recommends the addition of any new lighting be approved by staff with the building permit.

**Tree Preservation**

Tree Preservation Plans are not required for single family residential properties; however, Code Section 153.173(H)(8)(a)(2) states that where practicable, site design, architectural layout, and utilities shall preserve existing trees, including those on adjacent parcels. Staff encourages Best Management Practices to ensure that the district’s tree canopy, and resulting character, is maintained. Staff had no concerns with the proposal.

**Utilities and Stormwater**

Staff had no concerns with the proposal. Any potential outstanding, or new, issues may be dealt with at building permit.

**4. Plan Review**

**Waiver**

**Code Section 153.174(J)(1)(a and b):** Permitted materials are stone, manufactured stone, full depth brick, etc. and other high-quality synthetic materials may be approved by the Board if high-quality and climatically appropriate.

**Request:** Use of Azek for trim and fascia

Criteria	Review
1. The need for the Waiver is caused by unique site conditions, the use of or conditions on the property or surrounding properties, or other circumstance outside the control of the owner/lessee, including easements and rights-of-way.	<b>Criteria Not Met:</b> The request for this material is to match existing material on the structure. The Board has approved Azek in locations where a trim board touches the ground to aid in maintenance and reduce rot; yet this material would allow the addition to match the rest of the house.
2. The Waiver, if approved, will not negatively impact the historic context of the immediately surrounding area or the district as a whole.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The use of this material on this particular project allows consistency based on previous approvals under a different set of Codes and Guidelines. Any other new project would be required to abide by the current regulations.

Criteria	Review
<p>3. The Waiver, if approved, will generally meet the spirit and intent of the Community Plan, <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i>, other adopted City plans and policies, and all applicable requirements in §§153.170 through 153.178.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> The use of non-traditional materials at the back of the structure will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The spirit of the Guidelines and other plans will be maintained.</p>
<p>4. The Waiver is not being requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> The applicant’s justification for use of this material is consistency with the rest of the construction and durability.</p>
<p>5. The Waiver, if approved, will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality with respect to design, material, and other similar development features than without the Waiver.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Not Met:</b> This request allows use of previously-approved materials on this structure.</p>
<p>6. The requested Waiver is better addressed through the Waiver rather than an amendment to the requirements of this Chapter.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> The new Code specifically addresses the use of traditional materials to be in compliance with Secretary of the Interior Standards. Changing the Code would not be appropriate.</p>
<p>7. The Waiver does not have the effect of authorizing any use that is not otherwise permitted in the applicable zoning district.</p>	<p><b>Not Applicable:</b> The use of the property will not change.</p>
<p>8. In the event of Waivers from numeric or dimensional standards, the Waiver does not exceed 20%.</p>	<p><b>Not Applicable:</b> No numeric Waiver is sought.</p>

Criteria	Review
9. In the event of Waivers from determinations of contributing or noncontributing status, the provisions in Section 153.175(J)(2)(c) shall also apply.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> This request has not been made, and the form of the house remains an important part of the fabric of Franklin Street.

**Waiver**

**Code Section 153.174(J)(1)(a and b):** Permitted materials are stone, manufactured stone, full depth brick, etc. and other high-quality synthetic materials may be approved by the Board if high-quality and climatically appropriate.

**Request:** Use of Fypon for gable vents

Criteria	Review
1. The need for the Waiver is caused by unique site conditions, the use of or conditions on the property or surrounding properties, or other circumstance outside the control of the owner/lessee, including easements and rights-of-way.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The request for this material is to minimize maintenance in a difficult-to-reach location. Similar gable vents have been recently approved at 94 Franklin Street. The applicant notes that this vent will match the other five vents on the property.
2. The Waiver, if approved, will not negatively impact the historic context of the immediately surrounding area or the district as a whole.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The location of this material is such that the viewer cannot perceive that it is not wood.
3. The Waiver, if approved, will generally meet the spirit and intent of the Community Plan, <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> , other adopted City plans and policies, and all applicable requirements in §§153.170 through 153.178.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The use of this material ensures good maintenance in the future, thus meeting Guidelines and policies.



Criteria	Review
4. The Waiver is not being requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The applicant's justification for use of this material is for consistency and maintenance reasons. This request ensures that the vent matches the other five Fypon vents on the home.
5. The Waiver, if approved, will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality with respect to design, material, and other similar development features than without the Waiver.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> This result of this request will not be discernable from the public rights-of-way and does ensure better maintenance in the future.
6. The requested Waiver is better addressed through the Waiver rather than an amendment to the requirements of this Chapter.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The new Code allows the option of requesting alternative materials; changing the Code would not be appropriate.
7. The Waiver does not have the effect of authorizing any use that is not otherwise permitted in the applicable zoning district.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> The use of the property will not change.
8. In the event of Waivers from numeric or dimensional standards, the Waiver does not exceed 20%.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> No numeric Waiver is sought.
9. In the event of Waivers from determinations of contributing or noncontributing status, the provisions in Section 153.175(J)(2)(c) shall also apply.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> This request has not been made, and the form of the house remains an important part of the fabric of Franklin Street.

**Waiver**

**Code Section 153.174(D)(1):** Windows shall be wood, metal-clad wood, or vinyl-clad wood; other synthetic materials may be approved by the Board that are high-quality and climatically appropriate.

**Request:** Use of vinyl windows for body and foundation of house

Criteria	Review
1. The need for the Waiver is caused by unique site conditions, the use of or conditions on the property or surrounding properties, or other circumstance outside the control of the owner/lessee, including easements and rights-of-way.	<b>Criteria Not Met:</b> The request for this material is to match existing material on the structure. The Board has never previously approved vinyl windows under the new Code; however, staff recommends that matching the existing windows would be more aesthetically pleasing than using different windows on this small addition.
2. The Waiver, if approved, will not negatively impact the historic context of the immediately surrounding area or the district as a whole.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> This project has unique circumstances of having approvals granted under the previous Code and Guidelines. Any new project would be required to use the current regulations.
3. The Waiver, if approved, will generally meet the spirit and intent of the Community Plan, <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> , other adopted City plans and policies, and all applicable requirements in §§153.170 through 153.178.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> These windows will maintain a consistent appearance on this structure; vinyl windows were previously approved, and these will match.
4. The Waiver is not being requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The applicant's justification for use of this material is for consistency with the remainder of the house.
5. The Waiver, if approved, will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality with respect to	<b>Criteria Not Met:</b> These windows are not of a design or material that is equal or greater to anticipated quality.

Criteria	Review
design, material, and other similar development features than without the Waiver.	
6. The requested Waiver is better addressed through the Waiver rather than an amendment to the requirements of this Chapter.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The new Code specifically addresses the use of traditional materials to be in compliance with Secretary of the Interior Standards, and applicants are permitted to request Waivers.
7. The Waiver does not have the effect of authorizing any use that is not otherwise permitted in the applicable zoning district.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> The use of the property will not change.
8. In the event of Waivers from numeric or dimensional standards, the Waiver does not exceed 20%.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> No numeric Waiver is sought.
9. In the event of Waivers from determinations of contributing or noncontributing status, the provisions in Section 153.175(J)(2)(c) shall also apply.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> This request has not been made, and the form of the house remains an important part of the fabric of Franklin Street.

### Waiver

**Code Section 153.174(J)(1)(a and b):** Permitted materials are stone, manufactured stone, full depth brick, etc. and other high-quality synthetic materials may be approved by the Board if high-quality and climatically appropriate.

**Request:** Use of Timbertech Composite for deck stairs

Criteria	Review
1. The need for the Waiver is caused by unique site conditions, the use of or conditions on the property or surrounding	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The request for this material has been previously approved for rear and side decks in the district. It aids in maintenance is not discernable from the public right-of-way.

Criteria	Review
<p>properties, or other circumstance outside the control of the owner/lessee, including easements and rights-of-way.</p>	
<p>2. The Waiver, if approved, will not negatively impact the historic context of the immediately surrounding area or the district as a whole.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> The use of this material has been previously acceptable in rear and side locations. Visibility of the material is minimal: from head-on the viewer would see only an end profile, not the face of the material.</p>
<p>3. The Waiver, if approved, will generally meet the spirit and intent of the Community Plan, <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i>, other adopted City plans and policies, and all applicable requirements in §§153.170 through 153.178.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> The use of this particular material is appropriate in this location, meeting the spirit of the Guidelines and City policies.</p>
<p>4. The Waiver is not being requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> The applicant’s justification for use of this material is durability. The Board has approved this material in low-visibility locations previously.</p>
<p>5. The Waiver, if approved, will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality with respect to design, material, and other similar development features than without the Waiver.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> This request ensures low maintenance for the rear deck’s stairs, where wooden boards typically cup and bow and are difficult to keep painted or stained.</p>
<p>6. The requested Waiver is better addressed through the Waiver rather than an amendment to the requirements of this Chapter.</p>	<p><b>Criteria Met:</b> The new Code allows the option of requesting alternative materials; changing the Code would not be appropriate.</p>

Criteria	Review
7. The Waiver does not have the effect of authorizing any use that is not otherwise permitted in the applicable zoning district.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> The use of the property will not change.
8. In the event of Waivers from numeric or dimensional standards, the Waiver does not exceed 20%.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> No numeric Waiver is sought.
9. In the event of Waivers from determinations of contributing or noncontributing status, the provisions in Section 153.175(J)(2)(c) shall also apply.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> This request has not been made, and the form of the house remains an important part of the fabric of Franklin Street.

Minor Project Review Criteria	
Criteria	Review
1. The MP shall be consistent with the Community Plan, applicable Zoning Code requirements, <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> , and adopted plans, policies, and regulations.	<b>Criteria Met with Waivers/Condition:</b> This addition is in general conformance with the Guidelines, located to the rear of the structure, and provides consistency with previous approvals.
2. In cases where a MP is proposed within or as part of an approved PDP or FDP, the MP shall be consistent with such approved PDP or FDP.	<b>Not Applicable:</b> There is no PDP or FDP for this site.
3. The MP shall be consistent with the record established by the required reviewing body, the associated staff report, and the Director’s recommendation.	<b>Criteria Met with Waivers/Condition:</b> The requested Waivers are appropriate to ensure that the addition matches the existing structure. The recommended condition ensures that any lighting will be appropriate.
4. The proposed land uses meet all applicable requirements and use specific standards of Section 153.172 Uses.	<b>Not Applicable.</b> The land uses will not change with this request.

Criteria	Review
5. The proposed development is consistent with the <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> .	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The proposal balances meeting the Guidelines and matching the existing architecture to recommend approval.
6. The proposed MP is consistent with surrounding historic context, character, and scale of immediately surrounding area and the district as a whole.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The addition is located at the rear of the building, which is the most important criterion to address relative to context, in this case.
7. The proposed buildings are appropriately sited and conform to the requirements of Section 153.173 Site Development Standards and the <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> .	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The addition meets setbacks and lot coverage, and its location at the rear of the structure is the most appropriate criterion, in this case.
8. The proposed site improvements, landscaping, screening, signs, and buffering shall meet all applicable requirements of the Code and respond to the standards of the <i>Historic Design Guidelines</i> .	<b>Not Applicable:</b> Site improvements are not part of this residential project.

### Recommendation

Staff recommends **approval** of the following Waiver requests:

- 1) Azek material
- 2) Fypon gable vent
- 3) Vinyl windows
- 4) Timbertech stairs

Staff recommends **approval** of the Minor Project with condition:

- 1) Any additional lighting shall be reviewed and approved by Planning staff with building permit.