

Bolyard Residence

Jeffrey P. & Brooke N. Bolyard
60 Franklin Street
Dublin, OH 43017

Project: Proposed front porch expansion and master bathroom/basement addition.

Project Location: 60 Franklin Street, Dublin, OH 43017

Project History, Narrative, & Design Review:

The subject property at 60 Franklin Street in Historic Dublin is located in the “HD-HR: Historic District - Historic Residential District” and is an example of a 1950’s ranch home. Most of the ranch homes on Franklin Street have hipped roofs with wider eaves, however the subject property is gabled on all 4 sides with standard eaves. The home has seen a number of modifications to its exterior, including in 2007 when the ARB approved a proposal to replace the original wood siding with stucco as the primary exterior material, as well as adding manufactured stone base, wood cedar shingles in the gable ends, and white double-hung vinyl windows with faux muntins. The existing home is a blend of historic forms with more contemporary aesthetics. In 2020, the ARB approved a proposal to add a family room addition over the garage, matching all existing materials, and providing a seamless addition to the property.

The current proposal for an expanded front porch relates to the Dublin Community plan and the Franklin Street improvement projects. The city of Dublin has decided to make Franklin Street more pedestrian-oriented in accordance with 153.173(A) by adding sidewalks to both sides of the street. The proposed expanded front porch serves two purposes; 1) it provides a space for the homeowner to sit and enjoy the front yard, interact with the community, and contribute to the walkable nature of the district (153.173(E)(2)(a), and 2) it provides additional separation and privacy with less visibility into the home’s large front picture window from sidewalk pedestrians, who will now be walking closer to the home. The proposed front porch addition follows the Dublin Historic Zoning Code by creating an “open porch” per 153.174(C)(2) that is a “simple design” per Dublin Historic Guideline 4.9(D) with materials that are complementary to the district.

The current proposal for the bathroom addition is not intended to be a large-scale building addition requiring a break and a separate subordinate structure. It is subordinate in size and scale, but the small single room addition is intended to be a seamless extension of the current home with materials consistent with those identified in 4.1.C of the guidelines and complementary to the district. Per Dublin Historic Guideline 4.12 Building Additions, Section F, the materials for additions do not need to match those of the original structure, however the homeowners prefer that they do match. The addition follows the Dublin Historic Guidelines by being located at the rear of the home, it is inset from the existing northeast corner of the house per the Guidelines and to comply with side setback requirements, the roofline has zero impact to the front elevation, and the height of the addition is below the original building.

Nature of the Project(s):

1) Porch Expansion:

We propose to widen and extend the existing covered front porch. The intent is to create a larger covered area for “front porch sitting”, as well as to enhance the architectural elements of the front elevation by creating depth with a gabled entry that is set off from the existing face of the home to interrupt the mass of the wall. It also provides a level of privacy for the home due to the proximity of the new Franklin Street sidewalks bringing pedestrians closer to the home’s existing picture window on the front façade.

The existing approximately 6’-0” wide x 5’-0” deep covered front porch construction consists of a concrete block foundation with a concrete slab that has a single post at the corner supporting the existing roof line.

The proposed covered front porch is located at the front of the home with East exposure facing Franklin St. It will be built on a new concrete block foundation wrapped with manufactured stone (matching existing) with a new concrete porch slab at the same elevation as the existing porch, standard concrete color and broom finish. It will be approximately 28’-0” wide x 8’-0” deep, with five simple post columns and a standing seam metal roof with gutter. The vertical surface of the new front gable will have cedar shingles matching the home’s existing façade. These materials were approved in 2007 and in 2020 and all materials are still available today. The existing roof was replaced in 2016 and the same Certainteed Landmark Driftwood dimensional shingle will be used for the small gable extension of the existing roofline, but the primary material for the majority of the new front porch roof will be a standing seam metal roof in “Dark Bronze” color. The proposed clean, smooth, rivet-less, standing seam roof in Dark Bronze color is the same product used on our adjacent neighbor’s homes to the north and south of our property (see photo summary).

The proposed front porch expansion project provides additional exterior livable space along with increased community connectivity, utilizing materials consistent with the existing materials on the home and those used on other homes in the historic district. Front porches are prevalent in many existing and new homes in the historic district on Franklin Street, High Street, and South Riverview as well as on 50’s ranch homes located on Marion Street, Longview Drive, and Grandview Drive. The proposed project is designed in a similar fashion at an appropriate size and scale, albeit as an addition to the home instead of being incorporated into the original roofline like some ranch homes from the 1950’s.

2) Master Bathroom/Basement Addition:

We propose to add on to the rear of the home by creating a master bathroom on the main level with additional basement space below for multipurpose use, seamlessly integrating the exterior façade into the current home. The rear elevation will be enhanced architecturally with the addition of a 2nd gabled element matching the roof pitch of the 2020 family room addition project located above the garage.

The existing single-story ranch home consists of concrete block basement walls with stick frame wood main structure wrapped in a combination of stucco, manufactured stone, and cedar shingles. The existing master bedroom on-suite

bathroom will eventually be converted into a master closet. The new master bathroom suite addition will be a wood frame structure and wood trusses built on a new concrete block basement foundation. The outside dimensions are proposed to be 18'-8" long and 15'-4" wide, adding 286 sq.ft. to the existing home. The proposed expansion is located at the rear of the home with North, East, and South exposures with the primary East façade facing Mill Lane.

The existing master bedroom's North facing double-hung vinyl window will remain while the East facing double-hung vinyl window will be removed. The addition will receive new double-hung vinyl windows matching those used throughout the rest of the home and a new aluminum clad wood door for direct access to the patio. The existing combination of stucco, manufactured stone, and cedar shingles on the main body of the current home will be extended to the new portion of the home, matching the existing manufacturers and colors. These materials were approved by the ARB in 2007 and 2020 and all materials are still available today. The existing roof was replaced in 2016 and also used on our 2020 addition. The same CertainTeed Landmark Driftwood dimensional shingle will be used for the addition.

The exterior materials renovation approved and completed in 2007 gave the existing 1950's ranch home the character that was desired, similar to the renovation and new construction projects taking place in the Dublin historic district. The 2020 family room addition project provided the desired interior livable space. The proposed master bathroom project creates a true master suite and is an extension of those same materials. The proposed addition to the single-story ranch home is designed at a size and scale appropriate for the neighborhood.

Variance Request: Windows

Historic district code section 153.174(D)(1) states that windows shall be wood, metal-clad wood, or vinyl-clad wood. The proposed addition project has only (2) windows on the main floor and (3) basement sliders. The proposed Jeld-Wen double hung, insulated, Low-E, Energy Star white vinyl windows are an identical match to the existing 23 windows on the main floor and 7 basement windows already used on the home and approved by the Dublin ARB in 2007 and 2020. The request is to have the new windows match the existing windows.

Variance Request: Roof Pitch

Front Porch: Per historic district code section 153.174(B)(4)(c)(3), porch roofs shall be pitched greater than 3:12, unless determined to be appropriate to the style of the building. The gable extension portion of the front porch does match the existing 5:12 roof pitch and is compliant with the code, however due to the nature of the existing structure's 5:12 roof pitch, a 3:12 pitch is inappropriate for the remainder of the porch as it is too steep and would extend much too far up the roof line. It is our request to have the standing seam metal portion of the front porch roof to pitch to be at an appropriate slope of 2:12.

Rear Addition: Historic district code section 153.174(B)(4)(c)(1) requires roof slopes to be not less than 6:12 pitch. We are in compliance with that code requirement and are proposing a 7:12 pitch to match the existing rear gable family room. The ARB may determine what pitch is architecturally appropriate since the property is a ranch home

with a roof pitch less than the required minimum. It is the homeowners request to have the addition on the rear of the home match the 2020 addition to the rear of the home with a 7:12 roof pitch. Anything other than a matching 7:12 roof pitch would be architecturally inappropriate.

Variance Request: Material

Historic district code section 153.174(B)(7) requires an architecturally appropriate element on street facing gable ends. The proposed addition is in compliance with that code requirement by proposing a gable vent. This request is for approval of a synthetic façade material, being the Fypon polyurethane vent product. This is the same product proposed for use on the property and approved by the Dublin ARB in 2007 and 2020 for previous renovation projects and used in 5 locations on all four directional exposures of the home. The request is to have a matching gable vent product.