



## PLANNING REPORT

# Administrative Review Team

Thursday, March 9, 2017

### Case Summary

Agenda Items	1
Title	CML Library
Case Number	17-002ARB-BPR
Proposal	A 45,560-square-foot library building with associated site improvements.
Request	Basic Plan Review under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.
Site Location	75 N. High Street West of N. High Street, North of the intersection with North Street.
Applicant	Columbus Metropolitan Library Board of Trustees; represented by Tracy Perry
Case Managers	Jennifer M. Rauch, Planning Manager   (614) 410-4690   jrauch@dublin.oh.us
Planning Recommendation	Recommendation of approval to City Council with the following actions:

#### *Waivers*

- 1) Block Length and Perimeter
- 2) Block Access and Vehicular Access (2)
- 3) Loading Facility Location
- 4) Building Stories
- 5) Ground Story Height
- 6) Building Setbacks
- 7) Building Entrances

#### *Administrative Departures*

- 1) Corner Side Setback
- 2) Lot Coverage

#### *Conditions*

- 1) The applicant file a demolition request prior to the approval of the Site Plan.

- 2) The applicant investigate the use of stone in lieu of brick on the lower portions of the building.
- 3) The applicant continue to refine the architectural details and Building Type requirements, as part of the Site Plan.
- 4) The applicant update the required parking information and submit a parking plan with the Site Plan.
- 5) The open space, gateway and terminal vista details be addressed with the Site Plan.
- 6) Final details regarding landscaping, lighting, utilities and stormwater will be required with the Site Plan.

Facts	
Site Area	1.15 acres (library site)
Zoning	BSD-P, Public District
Surrounding Zoning	North and West: BSD-P, Public District (Dublin City Schools and Grounds of Remembrance) East: BSD-HTN, Historic Transition Neighborhood District (Mixed use development and public plaza) South: BSD-HC, Historic Core District (Commercial uses)
Site Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Significant grade change across the site, with the largest change from west to east along the northern boundary.</li> <li>• Existing library building located in the northeastern portion of the site.</li> <li>• Off-street parking located to the south and west of the existing building.</li> </ul>
Future Improvements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Creation of two new parcels for the library and garage, respectively.</li> <li>• Street network improvements: Future Rock Cress along the north, Future Franklin Street extension along the west, and modifications to existing North Street to the south and North High Street to the east.</li> </ul>
Case Background	<p><b>City Council</b>          December 5, 2016          City Council approved the development agreement with Dublin City School District to facilitate the development of the library, parking garage and adjacent streets.</p> <p>January 10, 2017          A project preview for the CML Dublin Branch Library and the public parking garage were provided to City Council at the January 10, 2017 meeting. A majority of City Council expressed support for the proposed library and the contemporary design of the building. Council members confirmed the proposal meets and exceeds the vision and expectations they previously identified for this area. They were also supportive of the parking garage, as it fulfills a long-term goal of Council to address parking in the Historic District. Council</p>

## Facts

members stressed the importance of the design for the garage as it is further refined. Members stated they were interested in hearing the input from the public and ARB regarding the library and the garage as it moves through the process.

February 27, 2017

City Council approved the development agreement with Columbus Metropolitan Library (CML) to facilitate the development of the library, parking garage and adjacent streets.

March 6, 2017

City Council held a work session to review and discussion the proposed library, parking garage and ground of remembrance sites.

### **Architectural Review Board**

January 25, 2017

The Board informally reviewed the Basic Plan applications for the proposed library and parking garage. Some members expressed concerns that the proposed contemporary design of the buildings did not fit the character of the District and requested modifications be made to the proposal to be more sensitive to the character of the District in design, scale, and materials. Another member stated the proposal provided contrast to the District in its design and use of materials, which appropriately set the proposal apart from the historic structures. The Board discussed the reduction in the size and scale of the garage, as well as improvements to the north and west elevations to address the school and the Grounds of Remembrance. The Board encouraged an increased connection, physically and visually, to the Grounds of Remembrance. The members supported the plaza and open spaces as an opportunity for community engagement in the District.

## Review Process

Code requires Basic Plan approval by City Council for applications involving a development agreement. The applicant has submitted a Basic Plan for review by City Council on January 13, 2017. The review of the Basic Plan is scheduled for City Council on March 20, 2017.

The following outlines the review and approval procedures and the sequence of required applications following the Informal Review:

1. Basic Plan Review: Reviewed by ART with recommendations forwarded to City Council for determinations within 28 days.
2. Rezoning: Reviewed with a recommendation from the Planning and Zoning Commission to City Council.
3. Demolition: Review and approval by the Architectural Review Board.
4. Development Plan/Site Plan Application: Reviewed by the ART with a recommendation forwarded to the final determining body as designated by

## Facts

- City Council for a determination within 42 days.
5. Conditional Use: Review and approval by Planning and Zoning Commission
  6. Preliminary Plat/Final Plat: Reviewed with a recommendation from the Planning and Zoning Commission to City Council.
  7. Building Permits through Building Standards.

## Details and Analysis

### Informal

Proposal	This is a request for review and approval of a 45,560-square-foot library building. The proposed site has frontage along four rights-of-way: future Rock Cress, N. High Street, North Street, and future Franklin Street extension.
Use	The Bridge Street District – Public District permits institutional use, such as libraries, schools, and parks. A future application to rezone the property from BSD-P, Public to BSD-HT, Historic Transition will be pursued following approval of the Basic Plan.
Layout	The proposed site layout includes the library building located at northeast corner of the intersection of future Rock Cress and N. High Street. The proposed building extends south along N. High Street and is bound on the south by a large plaza at the southeast corner of the intersection of North Street and N. High Street. The proposed plaza area runs along the southern edge of the library. An additional open space area is proposed between the parking garage and the library, oriented north and south on the site. Mechanicals and service area for the library are shown at the northwest corner of the building along Rock Cress. The proposal includes two entrances for the library. The first is located along the N. High Street elevation and the second at the southwest corner of the proposed building, adjacent to the parking garage pedestrian entrance and the plaza space to the south.
Lots and Blocks	The library has frontage on three rights-of-way: Rock Cress Parkway (corner side), N. High Street (front), and North Street. No additional street connections are provided between the library and garage buildings, which require waivers to the block length and perimeter requirements. Vehicular access to the site is only provided at the proposed garage entrances on North Street and Franklin Street (future). The proposed service area for the library is provided along the northwestern corner of the library with vehicular access on Rock Cress Parkway, which requires waivers.
Building Setbacks and Lot Coverage	<p>Code requires a front and corner side setback of 15 feet, which is required along N. High Street and Rock Cress Parkway, respectively. The northwest corner of the proposed building is setback 5 feet, requiring a waiver. The northern elevation is setback 14 feet, requiring an administrative departure.</p> <p>Code permits a maximum lot coverage of 65% for a Civic Building. The proposal includes 67% lot coverage, requiring an administrative departure.</p>

Details and Analysis	Informal
Building Stories and Story Heights	<p>The proposal incorporates a Civic Building Type for the library building. Code permits the building height for a Civic Building at a maximum of 5 stories; 3 stories within the Historic Core District. The Historic Transition Neighborhood District, which the site is located permits a maximum building height of 2.5 stories when adjacent to Historic Core properties. The proposed library building is three stories at the intersection with N. High Street and future Rock Cress, but is two stories along the other elevations. A Waiver is required to permit the three-story portion of the building adjacent to Historic Core.</p> <p>The proposal requires a waiver for the ground story height at N. High Street and Rock Cress. Code permits 24 feet and the proposal indicates 28.5 feet. The proposal meets story height requirements on the remaining elevations.</p>
Architectural Details	<p>Staff will continue to work with the applicant on the blank wall requirements, transparency and façade articulations and façade transparency. Additional information is required with the Site Plan to determine if the requirements are met and the extent waivers or administrative departures are needed.</p> <p>Code requires a series of street entrances: Rock Cress: 2, 1 provided; North High Street: 3, 1 provided; and North Street: 2, 1 provided. A waiver is needed to reduce the number of building entrances.</p>
Building Materials	<p>For Civic Buildings, Code permits stone, brick, and glass as primary building materials. Permitted secondary materials include glass, reinforced gypsum, wood siding, fiber cement siding, metal, and architectural metal panels and cladding. The proposed library utilizes brick, glass and metal panels for the primary materials. Additional information is required with the Site Plan to determine if the requirements are met and the extent waivers or administrative departures are needed. Additionally, City Council directed the applicant to use stone in lieu of the proposed brick at the base of the building to reflect the materials within the existing Historic District.</p>
Parking	<p>Parking is provided in the proposed parking garage located west of the library building. The proposed parking garage indicates 549 parking spaces. Code requires 151 parking spaces for the library. However, as part of the development agreement the library will be allocated 200 spaces. The remaining spaces will be public parking. An approved parking plan will be required with subsequent applications.</p>
Open Space	<p>No dedication of open space is required with the proposal. However, the library includes a 0.48 acre plaza area on the south side of the building and open space area between the building and the garage. The details and activities will be more clearly defined as the project moves forward.</p>
Roads, Utilities & Stormwater Management	<p>As noted, addition to the street network will occur in conjunction with the proposed library and parking garage applications. Utilities and stormwater management will to be addressed as the proposal moves forward.</p>

Analysis	Basic Plan Review
Site Plan Waiver Review	
Review Criteria	<p>The designated reviewing body is required to review the proposed Waivers based on the following review criteria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) The need for the Waiver is caused by unique site conditions, the use of or conditions on the property or surrounding properties, or other circumstances outside the control of the owner/lessee, including easements and rights-of-way;</li> <li>(b) The Waiver, if approved, will generally meet the spirit and intent of the Bridge Street District Plan and supports the commonly accepted principles of walkable urbanism;</li> <li>(c) The Waiver is not being requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience;</li> <li>(d) The Waiver, if approved, will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality with respect to design, materials and other similar development features than without the Waiver;</li> <li>(e) The requested Waiver would better be addressed through the Waiver rather than an amendment to the requirements of this Chapter;</li> <li>(f) For Development Plans, the other Development Plan elements not affected by the Waiver will be generally consistent with Code Section 153.060(A) and Code Section 153.061(A); and</li> <li>(g) For Site Plan Reviews and Minor Project Reviews, the Waiver does not have the effect of authorizing any use or open space type that is not otherwise permitted in that BSD zoning district.</li> </ul>
Block Length and Perimeter	<p>Maximum Block Size – Section 153.060(C)(2)(a) - Permitted Maximum Block Length: 300 feet. North Street: 379 feet provided; Permitted Maximum Block Perimeter: 1,000 feet. Proposal: 1,308 feet provided.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> Due to the comprehensive design of the site for the library and garage, a strong pedestrian area and public plaza were identified between the library and garage in lieu of an additional vehicular connection.</p>
Block Access and Vehicular Access (2)	<p>Block Access Limitations and Vehicular Access – Sections 153.060(C)(5)(a) and 153.061(D)(2): No vehicular access permitted on Principal Frontage Street (Rock Cross Parkway). Proposal: Vehicular access provided at northwest corner for service area.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> The lack of additional vehicular connection between the proposed structures limits the location of the service area to the north side of the building.</p>
Loading Facility Location	<p>Loading Facility – Sections 153.062(O)(11)(a): Loading facilities are to be located to the rear of a principal structure. Proposal: Loading area is provided at the corner side façade along a Principal Frontage Street.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> The lack of additional vehicular connection between the proposed structures limits the location of the service area to the north side of</p>

Analysis		Basic Plan Review
	the building.	
Building Height	Building Height – Sections 153.063(D)(4)(b): Building Height Limited to 2.5 stories adjacent to Historic Core. Proposal: 3 stories is provided at the northeast corner of the building. <i>Criteria Met.</i> The increased height at the northeast corner of the building is due to the significant change in grade across the site. The increase is limited to this corner of the building.	
Ground Story Height	Story Height – Sections 153.062(O)(11)(b): Ground Story maximum is 24 feet. Proposal: 28.5 feet at the northeast corner of the building. <i>Criteria Met.</i> The increased height at the northeast corner of the building is due to the significant change in grade across the site. The increase is limited to this corner of the building.	
Building Setbacks	Front Setback – Sections 153.062(O)(11)(a): 15 feet required along N. High Street. Proposal: 5 feet is shown at the northwest corner of the building. <i>Criteria Met.</i> The decreased setback occurs at the northwest corner of the building due to design aesthetic of the building. The setback increases as the building moves south along N. High Street.	
Building Entrances	Building Type–Section 153.062(O)(11)(d) – Street Facades: Number of Entrances Required – 1 per 75 feet of façade for buildings. Rock Cress: 2, 1 provided; North High Street: 3, 1 provided; and North Street: 2, 1 provided. <i>Criteria Met.</i> The interior layout and the proposed use do not accommodate additional door locations. The proposed entrances are prominently located and easily identifiable.	

Recommendation		Basic Plan Review
Waiver Summary	Recommendation of approval of eight Waivers to City Council.	
Waiver Requests	1) Block Length and Perimeter 2) Block Access and Vehicular Access (2) 3) Loading Facility Location 4) Building Stories 5) Ground Story Height 6) Building Setback 7) Building Entrances	
Administrative Departures	Approval of two Administrative Departures.	
Administrative Departure Request	1) Corner Side Setback 2) Lot Coverage	
Basic Plan Review	Recommendation of approval of the Basic Plan Review to City Council with	

Recommendation	Basic Plan Review
	the following conditions:
<i>Conditions</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) The applicant file a demolition request prior to the approval of the Site Plan.</li> <li>2) The applicant investigate the use of stone in lieu of brick on the lower portions of the building.</li> <li>3) The applicant continue to refine the architectural details and Building Type requirements, as part of the Site Plan.</li> <li>4) The applicant update the required parking information and submit a parking plan with the Site Plan.</li> <li>5) The open space, gateway and terminal vista details be addressed with the Site Plan.</li> <li>6) Final details regarding landscaping, lighting, utilities and stormwater will be required with the Site Plan.</li> </ol>
Required Reviewing Body	City Council is required to designate a required reviewing body for future applications including Development Plan, Site Plan and Master Sign Plan (if applicable).