Minutes of \_\_\_\_\_ Dublin City Council \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Meeting

BARRETT BROTHERS - DAYTON, OHIO \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Form 6101

Held\_\_\_\_\_February 25, 2019

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

Mayor Peterson called the Monday, February 25, 2019 Regular Meeting of Dublin City Council to order at 6:00 p.m. in Council Chambers at Dublin City Hall.

#### ROLL CALL

Present were Mayor Peterson, Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, Ms. Alutto, Ms. De Rosa, Ms. Fox, Mr. Keenan and Mr. Reiner.

Staff members present were McDaniel, Ms. Crandall, Ms. Readler, Ms. Mumma, Ms. Goss and Ms. Ray.

#### ADJOURNMENT TO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mayor Peterson moved to adjourn to executive session to consider confidential information related to a request for economic development assistance that involves public infrastructure improvements that are directly related to an economic development project, and which executive session is necessary to protect the possible investment or expenditure of public funds to be made in connection with the economic development project.

Ms. Alutto seconded the motion.

<u>Vote on the motion:</u> Ms. Fox, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Mr. Reiner, Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. De Rosa, yes.

(Note: Ms. Alutto recused herself from a portion of the executive session due to a conflict of interest regarding one of the discussion items.)

#### **RECONVENE**

The meeting was reconvened at 7:05 p.m.

Additional staff members present were Ms. O'Callaghan, Mr. Rogers, Mr. Earman, Chief von Eckartsberg, Deputy Chief Paez, Mr. Stiffler, Mr. Gracia, Mr. Hammersmith, Ms. LeRoy, Ms. Richison, Ms. Burness and Mr. Plouck.

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Ms. De Rosa led the Pledge of Allegiance.

## SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS

 OSU Airport Master Plan - Dr. John Horack, Senior Associate Dean OSU College of Engineering

Ms. Goss introduced Dr. Horack, the Neil Armstrong Chair in Aerospace Policy at The Ohio State University. Dr. Horack holds a joint appointment between the Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering in the College of Engineering and the John Glenn College of Public Affairs. In addition to his faculty appointment in the College of Engineering, Dr. Horack also serves as the Senior Associate Dean for the College. He will provide an update to Council tonight regarding recent activities at The Ohio State University Airport at Don Scott Field.

Dr. Horack thanked Council for this opportunity. He encouraged Council members to contact him at any time with questions about the University Airport or the Aviation and Aerospace Education campus. They are very excited about the work that goes on there in education, research and experiential learning for a wide range of students – not just those in aviation and aerospace.

- The OSU Airport is truly a unique asset and supports over 800 jobs as well as \$150 million of aggregate economic benefit to the surrounding communities of which Dublin is one.
- As Council is aware, OSU is investing in the aerospace and aviation activities
  across the board to address certain challenges faced by the U.S., including pilot
  shortage; issues of maintenance, repair and overhaul for the industry; and
  addressing the strong environmental component to sustain aviation activities.
- Most recently, they received a \$10 million gift from The Austin E. Knowlton Foundation, which allowed them to develop a new terminal at OSU airport. Many

Held\_

of the golfers who come to Dublin for the Memorial Tournament will use that facility to enter and exit the Columbus region.

Page 2 of 15

February 25, 2019

- The airport is a world-class teaching and private aviation facility that integrates the opportunity for student pilots and others learning about aviation to interact directly with professionals who fly airplanes.
- The Aviation Research Center, also located on Case Road will perform about \$5.5 million of research expenditures this year. Research includes how to make airplanes quieter, how to lower the noise from engines, how to develop all electric airplanes for shorter commuter routes and for private airplanes. They hope that in the future airplanes can be made as quiet as electric cars. Other research involves how turbine blade life in an airplane can be extended; how to know before they fail that maintenance is needed to extend the life.
- He invited Council members and citizens of Dublin and stakeholders to upcoming
  events. On Tuesday, March 12 from 6-8 p.m. at the OSU airport, a public meeting
  is scheduled to discuss some of the plans for the future growth and investment
  they are making in this aviation and aerospace education campus as well as Don
  Scott Field. The public will have opportunity for comment and to share their input.
  In partnership with COSI, on Thursday, May 2, OSU airport will be participating
  with COSI in other open house activities for STEM oriented educational activity for
  K-90 plus.
- He encouraged everyone to stop at the airport to learn about aviation, watch airplanes, and learn about the vibrant history of Don Scott Field.
- He offered to respond to any questions.

Mayor Peterson noted that the \$10 million grant is very good news for the OSU airport. Dr. Horack responded that they are very fortunate to receive The Knowlton Foundation gift. The NetJets organization, through their relationship with OSU, has arranged to provide seven brand new training aircraft — Cessna 172 aircraft, that retail for \$300,000 each. This allows training in state of the art equipment, with the most up-to-date avionics, most up-to-date systems and features needed to fly safely and productively. Mayor Peterson noted that Dublin Schools Emerald Campus is one of the stops on the STEM tour, which is very exciting.

Dr. Horack invited Council members to the facilities for a tour, which could be scheduled individually or as a group. He added that in 1942, this facility was set up to train pilots to fly for WWII – it is named for Don Scott, a scholar athlete who was killed in action. Now, the airport is where they interact with automated vehicles, drones and learning how to fly those safely and how they interface with the national airspace system. They also serve as the anchor of the transportation corridor along US33, between the Transportation Research Center and Don Scott Field. Dublin is at an anchor point on the future of how we will navigate – sending people and packages through – on the air and on the ground.

Mr. Reiner asked if the diner is still open at Don Scott.

Dr. Horack responded affirmatively – the "Barnstormer" is open for early breakfast through late lunch. He highly recommends this, noting that the walls are completely adorned with all of the history of Ohio aviation, including what is on the back of the quarter coin. Aviation is very important to Ohio!

Ms. Fox stated that it is fascinating to hear about autonomous flight. Perhaps there would be an opportunity to present to the 33 Corridor group about air travel on the autonomous route.

Mr. McDaniel added that Dublin has joined a Council of Governments (COG) and they are looking at an agreement with ODOT as a testing corridor for drone technology. This is just beginning to happen.

Dr. Horack cited two examples of drone use: one would be pre-positioning drones along the corridor to provide information to EMS responders via camera; secondly, there are conversations taking place with DriveOhio and FlyOhio about the opioid epidemic. Many people are reluctant to call when there is an opioid emergency, but they might punch a button on a phone to deploy a remote vehicle to drop Narcan or another substance to provide immediate aid. This would make a small but meaningful impact in the opioid crisis. Testing would take place before these could be deployed.

Ms. Fox stated that many do not understand how the autonomous technology could be helpful to communities versus just providing data.

Held\_\_\_\_\_ February 25, 2019 Page 3 of 15

Dr. Horack stated that the opioid response initiative is entirely student-drive and is named "Air St. Bernard" as the rescue vehicle that would respond in this situation.

Mayor Peterson thanked Dr. Horack for presenting to Council tonight.

Bridge Park Multi-use Sports Facility – Bob Hoying

Bob Hoying, Principal, Crawford Hoying stated they will present the Bridge Park Fieldhouse, which is a project they have been working on as a potential future phase to Bridge Park. Tonight, they will present the following: What is It, Why Build It, Potential Users, Operations, Financial Background, Impacts/Return on Investment, and Next Steps. He noted that a year ago, they submitted for a \$1 million grant from the State of Ohio, and this grant was awarded. Originally, the Fieldhouse was planned for F Block of Bridge Park; however, after working on the project, they decided to move it up the hill and further to the east to J Block. During that time, they have worked closely with Wendy's International and have executed a long-term parking agreement to share their surface parking spaces of approximately 800 that go unused at night and on weekends. In terms of Bridge Park development overall, they are 100 percent leased on office space. They have recently initiated D Block to the north, which will deliver most of those office spaces in the next year. That is where the public market will be located. In F Block, they will begin the next hotel – Springhill Suites, which is a 145-key hotel. In H Block, they have sold 14 of 22 townhomes to date, and closings will take place shortly. [He shared a short video introducing the project, featuring various community supporters of this proposed future facility.]

Mr. Hoying stated the video does a great job of showing the potential fieldhouse.

#### What is It?

It is a 150,000 square foot multi-purpose athletic and event center. Approximately 10,000 square feet of that is on the ground floor with some mezzanine and support space. Up to eight basketball courts – potentially 10 basketball courts that could convert to 16 volleyball courts, providing flexibility to host a variety of sporting events and other trade shows.

In the main part of the gym, there is the ability to host events for up to 5,000 people. Weekdays, this facility will serve the local residents with youth and adult athletic league programming and other recreational programming and trade shows; on the weekends, it is designed to host regional and national athletic tournaments and trade shows. There will be close to 3,000 structured parking spaces already built in and around Bridge Park. This does not include the 800 spaces available at Wendy's.

He shared the layout of J Block. Moving this facility to the east has created extra space for additional office. Conceivably, up to 300,000 extra square feet of office could be available as part of F, G and J Blocks that did not exist previously. The fieldhouse shares a parking garage with either a residential liner or an office liner. To the east is Wendy's International and the parking field available to them.

He shared renderings of the exterior. The front part of the fieldhouse is the main part of the gym and the auxiliary to the rear. It is about 32 feet clear height in both parts of the facility.

He shared a concept plan of the layout of the fieldhouse. There is office space for management on site. There are up to four locker rooms that facilitate hosting multiple events throughout the day. The portion highlighted in red is programmed for Hall of Fame space. The concept plan was presented to the Ohio Basketball Hall of Fame a year ago, and they are very interested in locating their statewide museum in the entrances at both ends (east and west). This will give this facility a sense of place upon entrance. He pointed out the loading docks located to the south to accommodate tractor trailers, which would be used for hosting small concerts.

The facility can also host graduations and other shows.

The grey coloring indicates support space/storage at the north.

The mezzanine level plan and concourse level plan show how these lay out.

Other slides show how the space can be configured for various purposes – convention, exhibits or concert. The concert configuration or graduation set-up accommodates about 1,200 seats on the floor/court, and hosts up to 5,000 people. There is the ability to have multiple events occurring at the same time.

Dan Haines is the architect for this project. He has designed multiple projects like this

Held\_\_\_\_\_\_ February 25, 2019 Page 4 of 15

across the country and he has done a great job with the layout.

#### Why Build It?

Local residents have expressed the need for additional recreation space for more athletic programming. There is a lack of recreation space due to population growth. There have been changes at OHSAA in regard to what high school coaches can do in terms of training in the off season, prompting the need for more gym space. This could alleviate some of these issues.

It will drive regional and national tours to the City of Dublin, especially on weekends when regional and national tournaments are hosted.

There is no other venue in the marketplace that can host 5,000 person events. Downtown Columbus event facilities turn away these smaller events and those could come to Dublin.

It will leverage Dublin assets to attract larger events and tournaments. With three high school gyms in Dublin, this fieldhouse will augment those and accommodate larger basketball/volleyball tournaments.

They are in close proximity to over 3,000 parking spaces that are within walking distance to this facility.

There is continued population growth in Dublin and the region. By 2050, the estimates for regional population growth are one million.

#### **Potential Users**

Based on many meetings with potential users, these are identified as the Dublin CVB; Dublin Parks and Recreation; Dublin City Schools; The Memorial Tournament; Ohio Basketball Hall of Fame; OSHAA competitions; academies for The Cleveland Cavaliers; OCC Conference; AAU Basketball; Club Volleyball; and Futsal.

#### Operations

Matt Starr, Director of Development, Crawford Hoying stated they have worked closely with The Ohio State University; talked with SMG, who manages the Columbus Convention Center; and met with another group out of New York to gain perspectives on how to operate facilities like this. OSU is building a very similar facility just north of the track — the Covelli Center — for volleyball and wrestling. This is of similar size and seating capacity to what is envisioned in Bridge Park. This has helped inform the budgets and the operational pro forma. They have developed a daily calendar and are working on maintenance and staffing plans to operate this facility.

#### Budget

The development budget is just over \$35 million and they are working with Garmann Miller, architects and engineers who have an office in Dublin. They are based near Dayton, Ohio. They have also talked to various people who are interested in their name being associated with this facility – whether on the building or through sponsorships. They received a \$1 million grant from the State of Ohio capital fund last year.

The budget is approximately \$36 million; netting the land out brings it to \$32 million. For comparison purposes, Covelli Center is currently being built for \$40 million and is very sports specific with video capabilities, sports locker rooms for various programs, resulting in additional costs built-in to that facility.

From the total budget, they have deducted what will be available to them from other sources, including sponsorships. Based on discussions, they believe they can generate up to \$4 million in sponsorship funds. Crawford Hoying as the developer would contribute \$2 million and the State of Ohio has contributed \$1 million in grant funding. This nets about \$29.6 million to be funded. The bond amount must be somewhat larger, due to reserves. The annual debt service is about \$2.4 million, based on a six percent interest rate. He shared an annual cash flow summary and profit and loss statement. Work remains to be done on this. Overall, working with OSU on this, Crawford Hoying feels good about the gross numbers, the revenues, and the operating expense piece. The net operating income is estimated at \$1.5 million. Included in the operating expenses are a minimum service payment of \$500,000 that would be redirected back toward the bonds. They plan on utilizing the NCA hotel charge for the new hotel. The gap to be funded is \$840,000 in this model. He noted there are many levers that can be pulled on this – likely on the

Held Page 5 of 15

capital budget with design-related issues. He believes the revenue and operating expense piece is somewhat more solid and there are not as many dollars to maneuver. This is laid out so that any of the excess goes to Reserves. Perhaps this could be approached differently, i.e. fund a Reserve through the bond issuance.

## Impacts/Return on Investment

Mr. Hoying stated that they reached out to University of Cincinnati for an original market economic impact study. That is being updated and will be made available to Council and staff. They have projected direct fiscal impacts of \$271,328 on an annual basis; over 20 years, it would be \$5.6 million.

For hotel room nights, annually, it would be 23,870. These room nights can come at a time when hotels are experiencing vacancies – weekend nights.

The sports tourism economic impacts – spending – is estimated at \$9.5 million annually. There is more about this study that will be made available soon. They have done case studies on four or five other similar properties, and that information will be available as well

The return on investment impact is expanding the offerings for local residents during the week and drive local spending and tourism on the weekends.

#### **Next Steps**

They have been working on this proposal for a long time and are excited to share this information with Council. Their questions to Council are if Council is generally supportive of this concept; how as a group can we make this a better project for the community; in terms of the gap, if Council and staff are ready to engage, Crawford Hoying will begin working on financial models that they believe are viable; at some point, those would be brought forward for review; they will continue to work diligently with their consultants on this project.

They are very excited and believe this project can be a game changer for Dublin and for Central Ohio. He offered to respond to questions and invited feedback.

#### **Council Comments**

Mr. Reiner asked about the size of exhibition booths in the calculations – are these 10 or 8-foot booths.

Mr. Hoying responded these are 10x10 booths.

Mr. Reiner asked for the current location of the Ohio Basketball Hall of Fame.

Mr. Hoying responded it does not have a home; they have been looking for a location for a number of years. He has worked with Bill Hosket, Jr. who serves on their Board and presented this project to them a year ago.

Ms. De Rosa thanked Mr. Hoying and Mr. Starr for being here tonight and presenting this very interesting concept. One of the questions they have likely heard already relates to traffic. Have they done any studies or can they offer any information in response? Mr. Hoying responded that studies have not been done. Only conversations have taken place about traffic. For any major event, they would have a comprehensive traffic plan prepared by engineers, presented and vetted to everyone. They do not want traffic bogged down in and around Bridge Park. They intend to bring this forward as part of due diligence. For them, looking at most events that will occur, they will take place periodically throughout a weekend. There will be a handful of events such as graduations with large numbers of people arriving and departing all at the same times. ForeFest was fairly successful last year in terms of getting people in and out of Bridge Park. They will continue to work on the traffic planning.

<u>Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes</u> commented that Crawford Hoying has done an excellent job of identifying users, given the list of 12. It speaks to the nature of the flexibility of the space, and the design and flexibility will be paramount to its success. She agrees there are many potential groups who will seek use of such a facility. She looks forward to hearing more in the future. As a community, it is important to help identify sources to fill the funding gap. She does not believe the City has particular interest in funding that gap, but could help identify what those funders could be from in and around the community. She believes this project will be a critical point for the success of Bridge Park in terms of drawing people to the area. She likes the concept and recognizes the amount of work

 Minutes of
 Dublin City Council
 Meeting

 BARRETT BROTHERS - DAYTON, OHIO
 Form 6101

Held \_\_\_\_\_ February 25, 2019

that has been done to date. She believes that the City would like to see Crawford Hoying succeed in that space.

Page 6 of 15

<u>Mayor Peterson</u> stated he is generally supportive of the concept as well. They have identified a need in the community for athletic resources and space. This will support a lot of needs of the Schools. This would be a great venue for all three high school graduations in our community. In terms of return on investment for Bridge Street specifically and Dublin in general, the ROI is off the charts. There are many citizens in this community who would be drawn to this new facility for things it can provide that cannot be accommodated now. He agrees that solutions for the funding gap can be found by all working together in creative ways. This will be a huge resource for the community, much like the pedestrian bridge.

Ms. Alutto echoed the comments of her colleagues. She appreciates that they have moved the building to a better location within Bridge Park. This provides opportunities regarding the direction of traffic so that it does not all go to the roundabout. That will be a critical piece of this project. She is impressed with the thoughtfulness put into this proposal and how many different uses have been identified. The fact that they have procured a \$1 million grant prior to bringing this forward is very impressive. Council would be supportive in working with staff to help identify funding for the gap. She is of the same mind as Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes that the City would not want to be the entity to fund that gap, but that the City would be happy to work together on this. This will be a key component to bringing the Bridge Park area together and achieving its fullest potential.

Ms. Fox stated that she supports the concept as well. Once the community views this, she believes they will receive great support and the funding gap may be closed based on the excitement for the project. The DCVB has been looking for a facility of this size to bring in the type of events and activities desired. Most importantly, for her, she likes the fact that it will provide the venue for lots of things the community desires – sports, events, etc. She supports the concept and would support the staff helping them to find the resources to fund the gap.

Mayor Peterson thanked Mr. Hoying and Mr. Starr for bringing this information to Council.

#### **CITIZEN COMMENTS**

Cornell Robertson, Franklin County Engineer introduced himself to Council, noting he is attending City Council meetings in various municipalities in Franklin County to gain an understanding of their current activities. He appreciates this opportunity to address Council briefly. He believes that Franklin County Engineer's office has enjoyed a very strong, coordinated relationship with Dublin for many years. He wants to reaffirm that and strengthen that more. Dublin has an excellent engineering staff and he has known them for a long time. He looks forward to continuing to work with them. Recognizing there is not general knowledge of the Franklin County Engineer's office, they are similar to ODOT, but on a much smaller scale. They do road projects, bridge projects, drainage projects and snow and ice removal. Recently, they completed the Darree Fields drainage improvement, working with the City of Dublin. They have some resurfacing projects scheduled in the area – Houchard Road south of 161; Rings Road west of Houchard; and Hayden Run Road west of Cosgray. He offered to respond to questions, and thanked Council for this opportunity.

Mayor Peterson stated that the City appreciates his service and looks forward to working with his office in the future.

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

- Approval of Minutes of February 11, 2019
- Notice to Legislative Authority re. New D2 Liquor Permit for B2AM Dublin LLC, 52
   S. High Street, Dublin, OH 43017

Mayor Peterson moved to approve the actions for items on the Consent Agenda. Mr. Reiner seconded the motion.

<u>Vote on the motion:</u> Ms. Fox, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes.

Minutes of \_\_\_\_\_\_ Dublin City Council \_\_\_\_\_\_ Meeting

BARRETT BROTHERS - DAYTON, OHIO \_\_\_\_\_\_ Form 6101

Held \_\_\_\_\_ February 25, 2019

Mayor Peterson stated that Resolution 14-19 will be heard at this time due to residents in attendance for this item.

Page 7 of 15

# **RESOLUTIONS – INTRODUCTION/PUBLIC HEARING Resolution 14-19**

Authorizing the City Manager to Enter into a Cooperative Agreement with Concord Township for the Construction of a Shared-Use Path Along Concord Road Between Deeside Drive and the Existing Path North of Palmer Court. (The Concord Township History and Community Trail Project)

Ms. Alutto introduced the Resolution.

Ms. O'Callaghan stated that staff has been working with Concord Township and the Delaware County Engineer's office to provide a safe shared-use path connection along Concord Road from Deeside Drive in the City of Dublin north to the existing path which connects to Eli Pinney Elementary School in Concord Township (referred to as "Project"). In 2017, Dublin constructed the first phase of the path from the tunnel at Glick Road north to St. Boswell Court. The township was awarded a \$100,000 state grant for this project last year, and the township will be using this to fund the portion of the project that lies within the township. Pursuant to the agreement presented to Council tonight, the City of Dublin would agree to pay the cost of constructing the portion of the project that is within the City of Dublin corporation limits. That cost is currently estimated at \$57,000. The township would also be responsible for competitively bidding the construction project, as well as administering the project. The township anticipates opening bids in mid-March, and pursuant to the agreement would use their best efforts to complete the path and have it operational by the end of July 2019. Staff recommends approval of the Resolution.

Ms. Alutto stated that she understands Concord Township has already approved this agreement. She thanked Trustee Bart Johnson and the Township, as well as the residents present tonight who pursued this project. Thanks also to Ms. O'Callaghan for her role in shepherding this project and offering assistance to the township. It is a great partnership and an example of how local activism can make a difference. Kudos to everyone! Mr. Reiner suggested the residents present have opportunity to comment. This has been a lengthy effort to have this path connection made.

<u>Becca Wleklinski, Muirfield resident</u>, noted this effort began when her child was in kindergarten and wanted to ride his bike to school at Eli Pinney. There was not a safe way to ride a bicycle from their home to Eli Pinney. He is now a junior in high school, so it took some time to have this project finally moving forward. Thanks to all involved!

<u>Michele Brenner, 6593 Raynor Court, Concord Township</u> stated that for her, it is a good lesson that multiple jurisdictions involved in a project can complicate the process. They are thrilled that this project will finally be completed, and children will have a shared use path to travel between Muirfield, Tartan Fields and Eli Pinney.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes acknowledged the efforts of Laura Sale in working to secure this project.

Mr. Reiner stated that the Muirfield Association has been very supportive of this effort and he thanked them for doing so.

<u>Vote on the Resolution:</u> Ms. De Rosa, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Ms. Fox, yes.

Mayor Peterson moved to waive the Council Rules of Order to address Ordinance Nos. 03, 04 and 05-19 together.

Ms. Alutto seconded the motion.

<u>Vote on the motion:</u> Ms. De Rosa, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes; Ms. Fox, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes. [The Clerk read the titles into the record.]

 Minutes of
 Dublin City Council
 Meeting

 BARRETT BROTHERS - DAYTON, OHIO
 Form 6101

Held\_\_\_\_\_\_ February 25, 2019 Page 8 of 15

## SECOND READING/PUBLIC HEARING - ORDINANCES

#### Ordinance 03-19

Determining to Proceed with the Acquisition, Construction, and Improvement of Certain Public Improvements in the City of Dublin, Ohio in Cooperation with the Columbus Regional Energy Special Improvement District. (Bridge Park D Block Project)

## Ordinance 04-19

Levying Special Assessments for the Purpose of Acquiring, Constructing, and Improving Certain Public Improvements in the City of Dublin, Ohio in Cooperation with the Columbus Regional Energy Special Improvement District. (Bridge Park D Block Project)

#### Ordinance 05-19

Authorizing and Approving an Energy Project Cooperative Agreement by and between the City of Dublin, Ohio, the Columbus Regional Energy Special Improvement District, Bridge Park D Block Commercial Investments, LLC, and Orix Public Finance, LLC; A Special Assessment Agreement by and between the City of Dublin, Ohio, the County Treasurer of Franklin County, Ohio, the Columbus Regional Energy Special Improvement District, Inc., Bridge Park D Block Commercial Investments, LLC, and Orix Public Finance, LLC, and Related Agreements, All of Which Provide for the Financing of Special Energy Improvements Projects. (Bridge Park D Block Project)

Mr. Gracia stated that some redlined documents were provided by the attorneys that highlighted some minor changes to the cooperative agreement and special assessment documents. He offered to respond to questions.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes noted that on the 35<sup>th</sup> page of the redlined version of the agreement, it appears the rates for 2019-2026 are at 6.75 and 2026-2029 are escalated to 8.75. Are these the same interest rates for all of the PACE legislation the City has approved?

Mr. Gracia stated they are not the same.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes added that she recalls significantly lower interest rates in previous PACE legislation. Can he provide any further clarification?

Mr. Gracia responded he cannot – it appears that this is what Orix and Crawford Hoying have worked out in the terms of their financing.

Ms. Fox noticed that the ESID collects a fee for the transfer of the assessment. The City then pays the assessment directly to the investor. Is there a transaction fee provided to the City?

Ms. Mumma responded that for all of these, the City has imposed a \$1,000 upfront fee to offset the administrative costs to the City, which includes the legal costs of reviewing the documents pertaining to this as well as when the special assessment is passed on by the City to the trustee.

Ms. Fox noted that PACE can be used for residential as well. If a large residential area would like to utilize PACE funding for homeowner improvements related to energy efficiency, etc., how does this process work?

Mr. Gracia responded he is more familiar with the commercial side of the PACE financing. It is available for residential, but there are some nuances.

Mr. Keenan added that he aware that this program is used heavily in California, which is where the main program began. They use this for solar energy projects and for neighborhoods that have financial need for such improvements to be financed over a longer period of time.

Ms. Fox stated that she is aware PACE projects are typically in the \$200,000 plus range, so it seems a neighborhood district would need to be created for eligibility for the program.

Mr. Keenan stated that people at the Ohio Air Quality Board are working on this program now, and Columbus-Franklin County Finance Authority is involved as well. It is a nice

Minutes of \_\_\_\_\_\_ Dublin City Council \_\_\_\_\_\_ Meeting

BARRETT BROTHERS - DAYTON, OHIO \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Form 6101

Held\_\_\_\_\_\_February 25, 2019

program that they are trying to push statewide to help areas that need such assistance. It enables energy improvements to be made and financed over a longer period of time. Ms. Fox stated this would be a great program for Ohio.

Page 9 of 15

Mr. McDaniel noted that staff will seek information from the Columbus-Franklin County Finance Authority about eligibility requirements for residential improvements and how that process works. They will report back to Council on this.

<u>Vote on Ordinance Nos. 03-19, 04-19 and 05-19:</u> Mr. Keenan, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes; Ms. Fox, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes.

# INTRODUCTION/PUBLIC HEARING - RESOLUTIONS

**Resolution 10-19** 

Adopting the Franklin County Natural Hazards Mitigation Plan Update. Mayor Peterson introduced the Resolution.

Deputy Chief Paez stated that this legislation will adopt the updated Franklin County Natural Hazards Mitigation Plan. The Plan was updated in 2018; the Plan has been approved by the Ohio and the Federal Emergency Management Agency. Final completion of the update requires adoption by all cities and villages in Franklin County. Council's adoption of the updated plan assures the City's eligibility to receive federal mitigation funds.

Ms. De Rosa noted that each of the municipalities had an opportunity to add or update items. Did the City of Dublin make any changes as it relates to Dublin? Deputy Chief Paez responded that Dublin had the opportunity to participate in some work sessions and did have some updates recommended as part of this Plan. In 2018, the mitigation efforts that were recommended for the City of Dublin were to bury all electrical utility lines and poles; install safe room and wind shelters in public parks and existing buildings; replace wood poles with concrete ones; stormwater retention pond mucking, cleaning and sediment removal. These were the inclusions for the update for the City of Dublin in the Plan.

<u>Vote on the Resolution:</u> Mayor Peterson, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Ms. Fox, yes.

#### Resolution 11-19

Authorizing the City Manager to Execute a Contract with the Franklin County Public Defender Commission for the Defense of Indigent Defendants.

Mayor Peterson introduced the Resolution.

Ms. Readler stated that the City is required by law to provide access to court-appointed attorneys for indigent defendants. Historically, the City has contracted with the Franklin County Public Defender's office, and a new contract is proposed with them for 2019. The contract provides for a cost per case of \$81.90; \$3,600 has been budgeted for 2019 for this purpose. In 2018, there were 42 defendants who qualified for this program. Staff recommends approval of Resolution 11-19.

<u>Vote on the Resolution:</u> Mr. Keenan, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes; Ms. Fox, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes.

#### Resolution 12-19

Authorizing the City Manager to Enter into a Contract with Franklin County General Health District (DBA Franklin County Public Health) and Clarke Environmental Mosquito Management, Inc. for Integrated Mosquito Management Services.

Mayor Peterson introduced the Resolution.

Ms. O'Callaghan stated that Dublin, along with many communities in the region partners with Franklin County Public Health to provide mosquito management services for the area. The most recent contract expired at the end of 2018, and a request for proposals was issued for future integrated mosquito management services. Those services are comprehensive and are geared primarily toward preventing disease. Two proposals were received and evaluated. The lowest and best proposal was determined to be Clarke

Held \_\_\_\_\_ February 25, 2019

Environmental Mosquito Management, Inc. The cost to Dublin for these services in 2018 was just over \$40,000. The cost for each of the next three years will be at the same rate. Those are budgeted within the amount established for 2019. Staff recommends Council approval of Resolution 12-19.

Page 10 of 15

Ms. Fox pointed out that Clarke uses the EarthRight program, which utilizes products listed with the Organic Materials Review Institute. Some residents have indicated concern with mosquito spraying. She asked if the EarthRight program includes neighborhood spraying.

Ms. O'Callaghan responded that she did highlight that aspect of the Scope of Services for that very reason. As outlined in the memo, Clarke Mosquito Services offers the EarthRight program and that will be part of the region's mosquito management effort. This program utilizes products listed with Organic Materials Review Institute (OMRI). What that means is both the larvacide – the treatment used to prevent eggs from becoming adult mosquitos – and adultacide - the treatment of spraying or fogging use materials recognized as being safe to use in and around organic crops and gardens. They are made from naturally derived active ingredients, along with other inert ingredients that are registered by the US EPA. The programs the City has had to date have all been approved by the EPA and used chemicals and materials approved by the EPA. This is one addition for this year's program, which staff believes is a positive.

Ms. Fox commended staff for this consideration of the residents' health and welfare.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes asked about the service request for residents who do not want spraying. Are these requests carried over year to year, or do additional requests need to be made for the 2019 season?

Ms. O'Callaghan responded that staff does carry those requests over from year to year. Those are part of the Franklin County Public Health website.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes asked if there is a link on the City's website to this. Ms. O'Callaghan responded there is a link on the City website. Communications staff worked closely with Franklin County Public Health staff on this matter.

Ms. De Rosa echoed Ms. Fox's comments, and agrees that sharing this information with the public would be great. Also, the City now has a nuisance mosquito spraying in addition to the general services for areas such as around ponds. What would be the process for residents to request that and how will it be sequenced and managed in terms of costs? This is a good addition, and she asked for more details.

Ms. O'Callaghan responded there was significant discussion about this, as the program is primarily geared toward disease prevention. The working group consisting of representatives of jurisdictions in the region had a lot of discussion about that. A couple of years ago, there was an abnormally wet season prompting a very high population of adult mosquitoes in the region. Dublin staff received a lot of requests from Dublin residents. The process in the past has been that Dublin residents and Dublin staff report those requests and concerns to Franklin County Public Health staff who fields those inquiries. Residents can either call Dublin staff or call Franklin County Public Health directly with information found on the City website. She believes the criteria established was a threshold would be determined of 50 mosquitoes in a trap for consideration of this treatment. Once that threshold is reached, staff will gauge the interest heard from residents and will work with Franklin County to determine the next steps.

Ms. De Rosa stated that as part of the process, perhaps that information can be shared, given this is a new element. This news will be well received.

Mayor Peterson recalled that the mosquito management policy was the result of work done by the Community Services Advisory Commission. Thanks to CSAC for their work on this matter.

<u>Vote on the Resolution:</u> Ms. Alutto, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Fox, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes.

Minutes of \_\_\_\_\_\_ Dublin City Council \_\_\_\_\_\_ Meeting

BARRETT BROTHERS - DAYTON, OHIO \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Form 6101

Held February 25, 2019 Page 11 of 15

#### Resolution 13-19

Authorizing the City Manager to Enter into an Agreement with the Dublin City School District Board of Education for Fleet Shared Services for Compressed Natural Gas School Buses.

Ms. Alutto introduced the Resolution.

Ms. O'Callaghan stated that the City of Dublin and Dublin City School District Board of Education have an ongoing shared services agreement with regard to the gasoline and diesel fuel service area and providing those fuels. The District recently purchased five compressed natural gas (CNG) school buses. City and School District staff have reviewed operations within their respective organizations and have determined fueling and preventive maintenance/repairs for the District's new CNG school buses would best be provided by the City of Dublin. It would result in improved efficiencies and benefit both organizations. The City's Fleet building is equipped with the required ventilation to perform maintenance on CNG vehicles indoors, and the City's technicians have the specialized training required to maintain CNG fleets. All services would be provided on a time and material basis. CNG fuel would be charged at the base price of fuel plus a surcharge that is established as part of the cost of services ordinance each year. The City of Dublin would invoice the School District monthly. Staff recommends Council approval of Resolution 13-19. The School Board approved this resolution at their last Board meeting.

<u>Vote on the Resolution:</u> Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Ms. Fox, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes.

#### **OTHER**

Basic Plan

— The Residences at Tuller Heights

Mayor Peterson moved to table the Basic Plan, as requested by the applicant. Mr. Reiner seconded the motion.

<u>Vote on the motion:</u> Mr. Keenan, yes; Ms. Fox, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes.

Independence Day Price Changes

Ms. LeRoy stated that the memo in the packet outlines the changes proposed for the 2019 event.

- Price of tables increase from \$125 to \$150. Tables seat 10 people.
   The table price was last increased in 2014. The tables sell out on the day the table sales begin. Comparing prices with other jurisdictions who sponsor such events found that the City's prices are much lower.
- Wristbands. Change proposed from no charge on day of event to a charge of \$5 for wristbands on the day of the event. The pre-sale wristbands would also be sold for \$5. This recommendation is partially a result of confusion about wristband sales. Many residents have commented that they pay to purchase wristbands in advance of the event, while the wristbands are free the day of the event. The charge has been imposed in previous years to ensure people purchasing tickets prior to the event do attend the event. The number of wristbands available is based on capacity for safety purposes as determined by the Fire Department. Staff is now recommending that the fee for pre-sale wristbands increases from \$3 to \$5 and that \$5 is charged for wristbands the day of the event.

Ms. De Rosa stated that if the intent of charging for wristbands was not to raise funds, but ensure the residents had priority access to the wristbands, then she does not understand why all will now be charged \$5 for wristbands – pre-sale and at the gate. She does not understand the logic behind this.

Ms. LeRoy stated that pre-sales ensure that people will attend the event, especially in a rain situation. There is a limit to the number of wristbands available, so it is important that wristbands be available at the gate to fill the stadium. Staff recommends continuing the pre-sale of wristbands, which will be available only to Dublin residents/Dublin School District residents. The number of wristbands sold will likely increase dramatically, as the same price will be charged for pre-sale and at the gate.

February 25, 2019

Page 12 of 15

Mr. Keenan recalled that some of these measures were implemented for crowd control purposes at a particular concert a few years ago.

Ms. LeRoy noted that during the 2014 concert, the gates had to be shut down because of capacity issues. Thereafter, the City instituted wristbands at pre-sale to allow residents first opportunity for purchase.

Ms. De Rosa stated she understands that aspect of the pre-sale to residents. But people will not purchase in advance if the charge is \$5 for pre-sale as well as at the event. Mayor Peterson stated that it would be a matter of ensuring they have wristbands. Ms. De Rosa stated that staff has shared that the number of wristbands available is about 12,000, and the highest use was 5,000 in 2018. If the goal is to have pre-sales to ensure people attend, it makes sense to keep it. She is still struggling with the logic of charging at the gate. If the goal were residents being accommodated versus non-residents, and making sure the residents have the first priority, she would understand charging the non-residents. She wants to ensure that the families who are economically challenged can come if they decide to do so on the day of the event.

Ms. Alutto stated that she believes the idea is to incentivize people to purchase the tickets in advance, so it would make sense to charge less for the pre-sale tickets and the full \$5 for the day of tickets. This would reduce the cost for residents who can purchase wristbands in advance. This will be offset with the charge of \$5 for wristbands the day of the event. This would encourage residents to purchase wristbands by charging less for the pre-sale.

Ms. Fox stated that what is really desired is pre-sale and guaranteed wristband sales to the residents. Many residents have out of town family who visit for the July 4<sup>th</sup> events and need wristbands. If residents can purchase the wristbands for \$3 at pre-sale, this would be an incentive for purchase in advance. She suggested \$3 for pre-sale and \$5 at the gate the day of the event.

Ms. De Rosa stated that would make it more affordable for the families who purchase wristbands in advance. This is the City's event for the residents; she does not want to create a barrier in terms of cost/access.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes moved that the wristbands be priced at \$3 pre-sale to residents/Dublin School District residents and \$5 for everyone on the day of the event. Ms. Fox seconded the motion.

Mayor Peterson clarified that the table prices would be increased from \$125 to \$150 as recommended in the staff report.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes and Ms. Fox agreed with this clarification.

<u>Vote on the motion:</u> Ms. Alutto, yes; Ms. Fox, yes; Ms. De Rosa, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Mayor Peterson, yes; Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, yes; Mr. Keenan, yes.

## **STAFF COMMENTS**

## Mr. McDaniel:

Held\_

- Congratulated Ms. Mumma and her team on receipt of the Government Finance Officers Association (GFAO) Award of Excellence in financial reporting for 2017. This is the 29<sup>th</sup> consecutive year the City has received this award.
- 2. Noted that Council requested an update on the Mobility Study, which was included in the packet.
- 3. Reported that he asked staff to prepare an update on events, and this event update will provide information about the number, magnitude, type of events and when they are scheduled.

## **COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS**

#### Administrative Committee:

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes, Chair:

1. Reported that everyone received an e-mail from Mr. McDaniel today regarding a proposed workshop on Monday, March 4 at 5 p.m.

Held\_\_\_\_\_\_ February 25, 2019 Page 13 of 15

Mr. McDaniel responded he has received replies from everyone. Mr. Keenan cannot attend, but the other Council members are available that evening.

Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes noted that the work session will be scheduled on Monday, March 4 at 5 p.m., followed by the Community Development Committee at 6:30 p.m. to review Beautify your Neighborhood Grants and the implementation strategies for the Dublin Corporate Area Plan.

- 2. Thanked Council for their participation in the retreat last week. She was very pleased with the outcome and looks forward to hearing from staff on the implementation strategies for the items discussed.
- 3. Noted that Council will meet on Wednesday, February 27 at 5 p.m. for an executive session regarding the performance reviews.
- Stated that the board and commission candidate interviews are tentatively to be scheduled on Wednesday, March 6 at 5:30 p.m. The application deadline is Friday, March 1.

#### **Community Development Committee:**

Mr. Reiner, Chair confirmed the CDC meeting for Monday, March 4 at 6:30 p.m.

#### COTA:

Ms. De Rosa stated that a wonderful event took place this morning at the intersection of Broad and High in Columbus. The portion of N. High Street in front of the COTA building (between Broad and Gay Streets) has been renamed, "Rosa Parks Way" in recognition of the impact she made. The ceremony highlighted the power of one person and the impact one can make.

#### **Dublin Arts Council:**

Mr. Reiner noted that a new exhibit is scheduled at the DAC beginning March 5 through June 7 – "Opening Doors: Calling Central Ohio Home." He also reminded Council of the annual Dublin Arts Council Garden Party fundraiser, which takes place from 6:30-9:30 p.m. on Friday, May 3 at The Conference Center at OCLC.

## **Dublin Bridges**

Ms. Fox commented that the group was discussing an idea for the new pedestrian bridge opening – incorporating some of the non-profits into the events. She is simply passing along this interest to staff.

#### **COUNCIL ROUNDTABLE**

#### Ms. Fox:

- Thanked Ms. Crandall, Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes and everyone who worked on the Council retreat. It was productive and stimulating; the conversations and flow of ideas among Council and staff were fun. Good consensus was established and good direction given moving forward. She looks forward to working on the strategic items identified.
- 2. Suggested the possibility of a post-construction tour of Bridge Park for the Planning and Zoning Commission members and interested Council members. Now that Bridge Park is nearly built out and more development is coming forward, it might be nice to walk around to see what has been developed. She asked that staff plan such a tour in the near future.
- 3. Noted that at the retreat, Council learned that the Bridge Street corridor rezoning discussed back in May is under study by Planning. She encouraged Council to review a timeline, as residents anticipate seeing some progress. Once clarity about the guidelines and the zoning is created, their comfort level will assure the preservation and maintenance of the area. She would like an update and timeline regarding when this work will be completed.

## Ms. De Rosa:

- Echoed her thanks to staff and Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes for the work on the retreat. Council tackled some complex issues and she is excited to see how all of the action items will now move forward.
- 2. Thanked Ms. Mumma for the financial update provided. The General Fund balance is indicated at \$56.7 million. Is the City still awaiting bond proceeds?

Held\_\_\_\_\_February 25, 2019

Page 14 of 15

Ms. Mumma responded the City is not awaiting bond proceeds. At the end of 2018, the City purchased two parcels – the property located near Emerald 8 and the property along Shier-Rings that will be utilized for economic development purposes. Those purchases drew down the General Fund balance, specifically in December. The bond proceeds were repaid in early December 2018.

Ms. De Rosa stated that the General Fund balance is therefore at 72-75 percent of expenditures, correct?

Ms. Mumma responded the balance is 76.2 percent at the end of January, based on the 2019 budgeted expenditures.

Ms. De Rosa stated that this will be a topic for Finance Committee, as the balance is running at a lower number than in the last year or so, when it has been in the \$70-80 million range.

Ms. De Rosa asked Ms. Mumma to share the rate of return on the investment funds. It is not listed on the report, and perhaps it can be added in future reports.

Ms. Mumma responded she will bring that information back for the next meeting. Ms. De Rosa stated that what the City is earning and how that is trending should be added to the reports.

#### Mr. Reiner:

Reported that he attended the "Fight for Air Climb" at the Rhodes Tower, which
raised funds for the American Lung Association. Firefighter Vince Davis of Dublin's
fire and EMS provider, Washington Township, came in second in fundraising for
the group, and he was proud to see him participate. However, Mr. Reiner's
nephew from Whitehall raised more funds than our firefighter; next year, Dublin
needs to do even better!

## Mr. Keenan:

- 1. Noted that the firefighters are also carrying 75 pounds of equipment while climbing, so that is impressive. Kudos to them!
- 2. Thanked Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes for the goal setting coordination. She did an excellent job!

Ms. Alutto: thanked Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes and staff for their hard work in managing the retreat preparation and facilitation. It was well done, and she is looking forward to working on the Council committees on some of those assignments, as well as the Council work sessions. She anticipates many meetings will be required to complete all of this work.

#### Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes:

Thanked staff for the new report for permitted events in the City, listing Tier 1, 2 and 3 events. In the months of April and May, there are many events scheduled. If staff believes that capacity is being reached or exceeded, she would like to understand who the event benefits. A column should be added to the report with this information – whether the event benefits the City, a non-profit, a private enterprise, etc. When difficult decisions are needed in the future, this information will be very critical.

Ms. LeRoy stated that staff is proposing that no new Tier 3 events be scheduled between mid-May and mid-August, given the current event schedule.

Mr. McDaniel responded that this issue was brought up at the retreat and more discussion will occur with Council. Mr. Earman will be bringing that proposal forward. Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes noted that she would like to see that information included on the report to aid in future consideration when capacity is reached.

2. Noted that the financial reports were very interesting, given the withholding tax revenue was down 3.24 percent, the net profit revenues were down 4.12, yet the individual tax revenues were up 12.37 percent. When a 12 percent increase is observed, it does trigger questions.

Ms. Mumma added that, through today, the February receipts in total are up 16 percent or nearly \$1 million. The top 50 are up nearly \$500,000 over last year. There are other triggers that can impact, such as a three pay period month. Staff reviews this deeper on a quarterly basis, but while January was down, February has more than made up for it.

	ne.	CORD OF PROCEEDINGS	
Minutes of Dublin City Council			Meeting
	BARRETT BROTHERS - DAYTON, OHIO		Form 6101
	Held	February 25, 2019	Page 15 of 15
	Vice Mayor Amorose Groomes emphasized that her point about indiv revenue change caused her to hypothesize, i.e. are more individuals are there more 1099 employees than previously, etc. She agrees that necessarily provide a detailed picture.  Mr. McDaniel stated this is a good observation. Staff, too, is monitorial assess this. Staff will report back on their findings.		
	Council retreat retreat planning 2. Reminded ever March 19 at 1 p attend. Chief Ju	cDaniel, Ms. Crandall and Ms. Mumma for . He thanked Vice Mayor Amorose Groom g and facilitation. yone of the Naturalization ceremonies scho.m. at Dublin Scioto High School and encudge Sargus is excited to have these ceremonies the Schools will provide support.	es for her work on the eduled on Tuesday, ouraged everyone to
	ADJOURNMENT		
	The meeting was adjo	urned at 8:40 p.m.	
		cer	
	Clerk of Council		