



CITY OF DUBLIN RECORDS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Date of Meeting: February 7, 2019

Present: Lisa Schoning, Director of Court Services; Stephen Smith, Assistant Law Director; Laura Colwell, Resident Representative; Jerry O'Brien, Chief Accountant

Absent:

Date of Next Meeting: August 8, 2019 at 9 a.m. in Council Chambers

Roll Call

Ms. Schoning called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

City Council Audio Recordings Discussion – Doug McCollough, Chief Information Officer

Mr. McCollough appeared before the Records Commission to speak about a security incident with the City's database. He handed out a memo and explained that his appearance before the Records Commission was to disclose a problem the Department of IT experienced with some records, how they have worked out the problem and how IT has created a record of what has taken place.

Mr. McCollough explained the City had a folder that contained audio recordings of City Council and Board/Commission meetings which experienced a security incident, most likely ransomware. The way this works is not all files are affected but the ones that are affected are encrypted in place, unread, not destroyed or moved. A ransom is then charged in bitcoin to get the files back. The known method of dealing with this is to figure out how they got in, shut the door to prevent it from happening again and restore the files.

After the IT Department found out this had taken place, they proceeded to restore the affected files and it was discovered that they didn't have all the backup files they needed. For a certain period of time, these files were not being backed up according to how they should have been backed up. IT took an inventory on how many files had been lost. A mitigation plan was put into place and Ms. Barney started working with the Clerk of Council's Office to figure out what could be done. It turned out that a number of these recordings had been saved by other methods; for example,

Communications and Public Information who video tapes many of these meetings, had video backups which no one was aware of. There were also a number of CD's which these files had been backed up to as well.

Ms. Barney tried to identify to the best extent possible, every single file in the time period they were looking at and figure out if they had all been restored in one way or another. The goal being if someone should request the file or record of that time period, IT was in a position to give it to them. As of February 6, IT believes all of the files have been restored.

Mr. McCollough's current objective is to disclose this security activity to the Records Commission and mention if someone should request a file from 2013 that is unable to be produced, IT can say the file cannot be produced because of a security incident and that it was disclosed to the Records Commission. Mr. McCollough added he felt that this was unlikely to happen as the beginning of the security activity happened more than ten years ago so each year that goes by, a lot of these files go off their retention period. We are not talking about a full ten years' worth of records.

Mr. McCollough stated a couple of the immediate items that needed to be dealt with were: fix the problem of a backup situation that was not IT's best practice. That problem has been resolved. All files now are being backed up and can be restored. The second problem was to prevent anyone from getting in and holding the City at ransom. IT has made significant and major upgrades to the City's security posture across the entire City. The good news is IT doesn't think they lost any files, the bad news is that this happened at all. Mr. McCollough feels this security activity must be disclosed, questions need to be answered and they must be prepared in case some anomaly happens. There should be a record that this occurred in a set period of time so if someone asks for 2019 files and we don't have them, we don't get to take this memo and say we lost them.

Ms. Wilson asked if someone requested an audio recording from 2013, would IT be able to provide it. McCollough answered IT would be able to provide the audio recording in one form or another according to what we are accountable for.

Ms. Colwell asked if there was a small segment of recordings from March 1st through December 31st, 2013 (according to the memo IT provided) that we were not able to be recover. Mr. McCollough stated all files have been restored and are available according to our responsibility. Ms. Barney answered that the videographer for the Council meetings was able to provide video recordings of that time segment. Mr. McCollough stated that these recordings were then posted on YouTube.

Mr. Smith asked what guarantees exist that the videos will always be on YouTube. Mr. McCollough stated the City has placed files on YouTube before and he believes that the company is so large and ubiquitous, that if they did go out of business, there would be sufficient time to retrieve those files. Mr. McCollough used Flickr as an example. This was a service that the City used until Yahoo discontinued it. They gave plenty of disclosure and time to grab your photos and put them somewhere else.

Ms. Barney stated those files also exist in Communications and Public Information so if something were to happen to YouTube, we can get those files. Mr. Smith just wanted to make sure that we have the ability to retrieve them in some manner, in some way, if requested.

Mr. Smith added that when it comes to Council minutes, the actual recording is valuable until the minutes are prepared and approved, which then serve as the official record. As soon as the minutes are passed by council, audio recordings no longer have administrative value. Mr. McCollough agreed and struggles with that as well. He said the Records Commission gets to define that, and IT has had very few instances in which someone has requested the original audio recording. The interactions between IT and the Clerk of Council's office has matured as a result of this. The process of taking a recording, making minutes out of it, storing and backing up that recording and putting on a much better retention period regime has improved. IT feels they must save these audio recordings until such time that someone says you don't need the audio anymore.

Ms. Schoning asked Ms. Delgado if once the minutes are created and approved, does the staff from the Clerk of Council's office reference the audio recordings very often or at all. Ms. Delgado responded that the recordings are sometimes requested. The way this was discovered was out of a council member request. He recalled a conversation and presentation that was given at a council meeting and wanted to hear it again. It may not be a public records request but council members sometimes do request to hear their own words about a particular topic. Ms. Delgado also stated that topics have a tendency in the City to cycle. When that happens, council members want to hear what was said previously and the minutes just aren't good enough, even though they are the official record.

Ms. Colwell asked if there is anything in place in the City that brings record retention to the fore front so employees are aware of the significance of records management. Mr. Smith replied that he and Ms. Schoning presented a comprehensive training two years ago for all the record officers in each department. The training was to educate the staff to pay attention to records management, the things we are looking for and the importance of records retention. Mr. McCollough added that records retention is

a very dynamic process across the City and every business function has external standards that they follow. Each department is different and the commonality of IT is to back up everything according to the retention schedule as they understand it. It is now an entirely digital back up process rather than a manual one.

Mr. McCollough said he would like to submit an official memo for the record, different from the one he passed out today, that states that some records were lost as part of a security incident and all of those records have been restored. However, if a record is unable to be located, it is a result of this security incident. The memo will provide some coverage to the City in that it has been disclosed as public information. The matter will then be closed and going forward IT will continue to diligently restore anything not there. Mr. McCollough ask the Records Commission if they will accept this and Ms. Colwell answered they absolutely will, she appreciates him bringing this matter forward and he can't account for human error.

Mr. Smith motioned to bring this disclosure into the record as part of today's Record Commission meeting. Ms. Schoning seconded motion. Motion Carried.

Review/Approval of Meeting Minutes from August 8, 2018

Ms. Schoning motioned to approve the minutes from the last meeting. Mr. Smith seconded the motion. Motion carried.

Facilities Management (330)

Add "Custodial Work Plans"

Description – Guidelines, policies and procedures related to custodial staff

Retention – Until no longer of administrative value

Media type – Paper and/or digital

Add "Custodial Inspection Reports"

Description – Internal quality control documents

Retention – 3 years

Media type – Paper and/or digital

Ms. Schoning stated she met with Brian Ashford, Director of Facilities, prior to today's meeting regarding these additions. These are both fairly new record series and Mr. Ashford wanted to assign a retention period to them. There is not a significant amount of records to be stored. Mr. Smith motioned to amend the retention schedule to add "Custodial Work Plans" and "Custodial Inspection Reports". Ms. Colwell seconded the motion. Motion carried.

Court Services (520)

520-92-021 Change series title from "Bank Statements" to "Bank Statements, Cancelled Checks and Reconciliations"

Change retention period from "3 years provided audited" to "7 years provided audited"

Ms. Schoning stated the reason for this change is to mirror Finance and the retention period they are requesting for this record series on their portion of the schedule. Mr. Smith motioned to amend the schedule to reflect the retention period change from "3 years provided audited" to "7 years provided audited". Ms. Colwell seconded the motion. Motion Carried.

Finance (600)

Add "Tax Incentive Review Council (TIRC) Reports"

Description – Meeting documentation and report filed with the State of Ohio

Retention – Permanent

Media type – Paper and/or digital

Add "Community Reinvestment Area (CRA) Reports"

Description – Meeting documentation and report filed with the State of Ohio

Retention – Permanent

Media Type – Paper and/or digital

Ms. Schoning stated Ms. Angel Mumma, Director of Finance, requested these be added. Mr. Smith asked that the descriptions be shortened to read "Meeting documentation and reports." He stated that these reports are often sent to the county as well as the state. Ms. Schoning motioned to approve adding "Tax Incentive Review Council (TIRC) Reports" and "Community Reinvestment Area (CRA) Reports" to the retention schedule. Mr. Smith seconded the motion. Motion carried.

600-03-003 "Accounting Journals"

600-01-365 "Accounts Receivable – Non-Collectable Files"

600-92-060 "Annual Financial Report Working Papers"

600-92-019 "Bank Records"

600-92-087 "Expense Reimbursement Files"

600-92-118 "Investment Activity"

600-05-165 "Purchase Orders"

600-92-246 "Receipts "(City Wide)"

600-92-174 "Request for Taxpayer Information"

Change retention period from "3 years provided audited" to "7 years provided audited"

600-92-020 Change series title from "Bank Statements and Cancelled Checks" to "Bank Statements, Cancelled Checks and Reconciliations"

Change retention period from "3 years provided audited" to "7 years provided audited"

600-17-431 "Local and State Government Finance Survey Documentation"

Change retention period from "3 years" to "7 years"

Mr. O'Brien stated he requested the changes to align the retention periods with the State Auditor's Office. Mr. Smith motioned to change the retention period on the above. Ms. Colwell seconded the motion. Motion carried.

600-11-136 "Payroll Computer Reports"

Change description from "Detail bi-weekly payroll reports and monthly reports/Kronos Time Post/Kronos Change Form/Leave request/Adjustments/W-4's" to "Detail bi-weekly payroll reports and monthly reports, time change form, leave requests, adjustments and W-4's"

Add "Detailed Timekeeping Payroll Records"

Description – Records for which wage computations are based; digital time cards and work/time schedules
Retention – 3 years provided audited
Media type – Paper and/or digital

Ms. Schoning stated Matt Stiffler, Deputy Director of Finance, wanted to separate detailed timekeeping payroll records from payroll computer reports and change the description to more closely reflect the language used by the Fair Labor Standards Act. The retention period is one year longer than the Fair Labor Standards Act requires. Mr. Smith motioned to approve changes to "Payroll Computer Reports" and add "Detailed Timekeeping Payroll Records". Ms. Colwell seconded the motion. Motion carried.

600-14-064 "Contracts/Agreements"

Move to 800 series

Description – Change from "Construction contract documents and professional service documents" to "Construction contracts and professional/technical service agreements"

This is a change Ms. Schoning is requesting. After speaking with Ms. Mumma, Finance doesn't hold all the original contracts as they once did. It makes more sense to put this under the 800 series because original contracts can be found in any department/division. Mr. Smith motioned to approve moving "Contracts/Agreements" to the 800 series and changing the description. Ms. Schoning seconded the motion. Motion carried.

City-Wide (800)

800-92-223 "Contracts/Agreements (copies)"

Change description from "Originals maintained by Finance" to "Copies of construction contracts and professional/technical service agreements"

Mr. Smith had issues with the word 'copies'. After a brief discussion, the commission decided to move forward with the request and have a discussion about 'copies' at the next meeting. Mr. Smith motioned to approve "Contracts/Agreements (copies)". Ms. Schoning seconded the motion. Motion Carried.

Roundtable

No items were added.

The next meeting will be Thursday, August 8, 2019 at 9 am at City Hall.

Ms. Schoning motioned to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Smith seconded the motion. Motion carried. Meeting adjourned at 9:48 am.

Sharon Hague
Recording Secretary