



DRAFT

**Dublin Tax Incentive Review Council
Tuesday, May 12, 2020 – 4 p.m.
(Virtual meeting conducted via Zoom due to COVID-19)**

Minutes of Meeting

Call to Order

Chair Stinziano called the Dublin Tax Incentive Review Council (TIRC) meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

Members present:

Michael Stinziano, Franklin County Auditor
Kelan Craig, Franklin County Board of Commissioners Representative
Michael Kinninger, Franklin County Board of Commissioners Representative (arrived at 4:15)
Carlie Boos, Franklin County Board of Commissioners Representative
Christina Alutto, Chair of Finance Committee of Dublin City Council
John Reiner, Chair of Community Development Committee of Dublin City Council
Denise King, Chair, Washington Township Board of Trustees
Eric Richter, Administrator, Washington Township
Brian Kern, Dublin City Schools representative, CFO/Treasurer
Tammy Woods, Tolles Career & Technical Center representative, Treasurer/CFO
Brian Wilson, Hilliard City Schools Representative, Treasurer School/CFO

Members Absent:

Gary Chapman, Jonathan Alder Schools

Others Present:

Kelly Washington, TIRC Administrator, Franklin County Auditor's Office
Matthew Stiffler, City of Dublin, Finance Director
Colleen Gilger, City of Dublin, Director of Economic Development
Clarence Bishop III, City of Dublin, Financial Analyst

Chair Stinziano thanked everyone for attending today. He noted the meeting will be conducted via Zoom and livestreamed on Dublin's website in accordance with the Open Meetings Act and the emergency provisions provided in House Bill 197.

Election of Vice Chairperson

Chair Stinziano stated that ORC Section 5709.85(B) provides that the Council shall select a Vice-Chairperson. He proposes that Michael Kinninger be selected as Vice-Chairperson for the TIRC 2020 TIRC meetings – except for the City of Columbus TIRC and the Blendon Township TIRC. He is seeking consent from the Tax Incentive Review Council.

There were no questions.

Mr. Reiner moved to select Michael Kinninger as Vice-Chairperson as requested.

Mr. Craig seconded the motion.

Vote on the motion: Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Boos, yes; Mr. Craig, yes; Mr. Kinninger, yes; Mr. Richter, yes; Ms. King, yes; Mr. Kern, yes; Ms. Woods, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Stinziano, yes.

There was no one opposed to the motion.

Approval of Minutes of Meeting of May 7, 2019

Chair Stinziano inquired if there were any additions or corrections to the May 7, 2019 TIRC minutes and report as submitted.

Hearing none, Mr. Reiner moved for approval of the minutes.

Mr. Craig seconded the motion.

Vote on the motion: Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Boos, abstain; Mr. Craig, yes; Mr. Kinninger, yes; Ms. King, abstain; Mr. Richter, yes; Mr. Kern, yes; Ms. Woods, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Stinziano, yes.

There was no one opposed to the motion.

The Chair stated that the minutes of the May 7, 2019 meeting have been approved.

Review of 2019 Bridge Street District Community Reinvestment Area Status

Ms. Gilger, Director of Economic Development and Housing Officer for the City of Dublin noted that in 2019, the City received one tax exemption application within the Bridge Street CRA, the City's only CRA -- for the H block owner-occupied town homes. Last year, the original parcel was split into 23 separate parcels as outlined in the packet materials. These 23 townhomes were completed in 2019 and cleared for occupancy between April and June. Each property has been reviewed and deemed in compliance with the development agreement between the City of Dublin and Crawford Hoying Partners. All have been reviewed for a 15-year, 100 percent tax abatement from 2019 to 2033. The remainder of the original parcel remains unimproved, although there are plans for two additional phases of the H block townhomes. As a reminder, the CRA development agreement with Crawford Hoying specifies that there are seven parking garages, an events center, and owner-occupied for sale condominiums that will be included for abatement eligibility as they are constructed. This development agreement excludes abatement eligibility for any rental apartments, hotels, office buildings and retail projects. In return, Crawford Hoying has agreed to create 1,700 jobs before the end of 2021. In the last three years, they have created 796 new jobs or 47 percent of their total job commitment. They have three years remaining to reach the full 1,700 job commitment. In 2018, there were three applications for two garages and the event center. In 2017, there were three applications for two garages and the owner-occupied condominium building in Historic Dublin. Crawford Hoying has been an excellent development partner, bringing a summer-long Farmers Market to the area, a street party and outdoor concert during the Memorial Tournament, and hosting the City's State of the Community at its event center each year. All seven abated projects are in excellent condition and she recommends that the seven exemptions be continued.

There were no questions or comments.

Chair Stinziano requested a motion to accept the TIRC report and find it in compliance.

Mr. Kinninger moved to accept the Dublin TIRC report and to find it in compliance.

Mr. Reiner seconded the motion.

Vote on the motion: Ms. Boos, yes; Mr. Craig, yes; Mr. Kinninger, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Kern, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Woods, yes; Ms. King, yes; Mr. Richter, yes; Mr. Stinziano, yes.

There was no one opposed to the motion.

Chair Stinziano stated that the report has been approved.

Review of 2019 Tax Increment Financing (TIF) Status

Mr. Bishop, Dublin Financial Analyst stated that included in the member's packets were copies of the annual reports that were filed with the Ohio Development Services Agency (ODSA), which showed the revenue, expenditures and estimated employment numbers within each TIF District. These reports are required to be filed annually with ODSA by March 31, and were filed by City staff.

Also included in the packet was a recap showing the value of the private investments and public improvements within each active TIF since their inception. The report shows that over \$205.7 million of public improvements have been made benefiting the TIF areas, with service payment revenues that have already been received -- or through the City advancing funds from the General Fund or Capital Improvement Fund -- with the expectation that those advances will be repaid from future service payments received. Those improvements have leveraged over \$879.3 million in private improvements.

From tax year 2018 to 2019, the City realized a 9.6% increase in the valuation of the Franklin County TIF areas, which increased from \$657 million in tax year 2018 to \$720 million in tax year 2019.

Notable increases in valuation included the following:

- The Bridge Street District Block C and Z TIF increased in value \$47.1 million or 2,409.4 percent due to continued development in the Bridge Street District.
- The Bridge Street District Block B TIF increased in value \$12.6 million or 37.1 percent due to continued development in the BSD.
- Tuller 40 TIF increased in value \$11.5 million or 47 percent due to ongoing development of residential apartments in the Bridge Street District.
- Dublin Methodist Hospital TIF increased in value \$7.3 million or 53.4 percent due to a change in the value of the medical campuses surrounding the hospital.
- Ruscilli TIF increased in value \$3.1 million or 7.1 percent due primarily to improvements of one parcel situated within that TIF district.
- The Bridge Park Incentive District TIF increased in value \$1.8 million or 385.1 percent due to continued development in the BSD and the splitting of parcels into new residential units.

- The Penzone TIF increased in value \$1.8 million or 184.9 percent due to building renovations to the Penzone Spa and Salon.

Notable decreases in valuation included the following, all of which were due to Board of Revision decisions:

- The West Innovation TIF decreased in value \$29 million or 36.8 percent;
- The McKitrick TIF decreased in value \$7.2 million or 10.2 percent;
- Perimeter West TIF decreased in value \$1.7 million or 4 percent;
- Irelan Place TIF decreased in value \$.8 million or 74.9 percent.

The City is currently reporting to Ohio Development Services Agency one other TIF. This is a residential TIF in Union County – the Tartan West Incentive District. Given that this TIF is not located within Franklin County, it is not within the purview of this Tax Incentive Review Council. However, for general knowledge, from tax year 2018 to 2019, the valuation increased \$4.6 million or 3%.

In total for 2019, properties located in TIF districts paid the City \$14.7 million in revenue. The school districts – largely Dublin City Schools – are estimated to have received \$13.6 million in revenue.

Finally, the City received a listing of delinquent property owners within the TIF districts from Franklin County and mailed out notification letters instructing the owners to contact Franklin County for payment. Currently, there is one delinquent property located in the Perimeter Center TIF and two located in the Perimeter West TIF. The total amount of these delinquencies is \$71,052.

There were no comments or questions.

Chair Stinziano stated he will request three separate motions for each School district within the City of Dublin.

Dublin City Schools

Chair Stinziano asked for a motion to accept the TIF report and find it in compliance.

Mr. Kern moved to accept the TIF report and find it in compliance.

Ms. Woods seconded the motion.

Vote on the motion: Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Boos, yes; Mr. Kinninger, yes; Mr. Kern, yes; Ms. King, yes; Mr. Richter, yes; Mr. Stinziano, yes.

The Chair noted that the motion has been approved.

Hilliard City Schools

Chair Stinziano asked for a motion to accept the TIF report and find it in compliance.

Ms. Boos moved to accept the TIF report and find it in compliance.

Mr. Kinninger seconded the motion.

Vote on the motion: Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Boos, yes; Mr. Kinninger, yes; Ms. King, yes; Mr. Richter, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Stinziano, yes.

The Chair noted that the motion has been approved.

Jonathan Alder Schools

Chair Stinziano asked for a motion to accept the TIF report and find it in compliance.

Mr. Reiner moved to accept the TIF report and find it in compliance.

Ms. King seconded the motion.

Vote on the motion: Ms. Alutto, yes; Mr. Reiner, yes; Ms. Boos, yes; Mr. Craig, yes; Mr. Kinninger, yes; Ms. King, yes; Mr. Richter, yes; Mr. Stinziano, yes.

The Chair noted that the motion has been approved.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:22 p.m.

Anne C. Clarke
Clerk of Dublin City Council