

20-191ARB-INF – 72-84 N. HIGH STREET

Summary

Request for feedback on a proposal to demolish existing commercial buildings (20 North Street, 72-84 N. High Street) and construct a new two-and-a-half to five-and-a-half story, mixed-use building including 68 residential units, a 6,000-square-foot event center, a 2,400-square-foot restaurant, a 1,800-square-foot retail space, 80 parking spaces, and associated open space on a series of parcels located in Historic Dublin.

Site Location

North side of North Street between N. High Street and N. Riverview Street.

Zoning

BSD-HC: Bridge Street District – Historic Core District

Property Owner

72 Dublin, LLC.

Applicant/Representative

Dwight McCabe, The McCabe Companies
Jonathan Grubb, Architectural Alliance

Applicable Land Use Regulations

Zoning Code Section 153.066, 153.070 and *Historic Dublin Design Guidelines*.

Case Manager

Chase J. Ridge, AICP Candidate, Planner I
(614) 410-4656
cridge@dublin.oh.us

Next Steps

Upon feedback from the Architectural Review Board (ARB), the applicant may apply for a Concept Plan. Additionally, the applicant must continue to work with the City should future applications include improvements on City owned parcels.

Zoning Map



1. Context Map



20-191INF
Informal Review
72-84 N. High Street

0 75 150
Feet

2. Overview

Background

This site contains three buildings built at varying points in the 20th century. The building located at 84 N. High Street, built in 1930, is the oldest of the three buildings. 72-84 N. High Street underwent significant modification in the 1980s, ultimately giving the structures the combination of Post Modern and Queen Anne architecture style that existing today. According to the City's Historic and Cultural Assessment from 2016, the structures are not recommended contributing due to the number of extensive modifications and additions that have occurred over the years.

Presently, the three buildings are site along N. High Street with a surface parking lot to the rear. Vehicular access to the parking lot is provided via North Street. Today, the buildings are occupied by a variety of commercial uses: retail, restaurant, and office.

Site Characteristics

Natural Features

The site contains a significant negative change of grade from west to east. The site is developed and contains no other significant natural features.

Historic and Cultural Facilities

The existing structure on N. High Street was constructed in the 1930 and is considered non-contributing due to the extensive modifications and additions that have occurred over time. The North Street building was constructed in 1960 and is also considered non-contributing to the local district.

Surrounding Land Use and Development Character

North: BSD-HTN: Historic Transition (Commercial)
East: BSD-HTN: Historic Transition (Undeveloped)
South: BSD-HC: Historic Core (Commercial)
West: BSD-HTN: Historic Transition (Institutional – CML)

Road, Pedestrian and Bike Network

The site has frontage on N. High Street, North Street, and N. Riverview Street. A public sidewalk is located along the N. High Street frontage, but no pedestrian access is provided along North Street or N. Riverview Street.

Utilities

The site is currently served by public utilities, including sanitary and water. Electrical and gas are also provided on site.

Proposal

The applicant is proposing to demolish the three existing buildings fronting N. High Street and North Street. The proposal includes the construction of a new two-and-a-half to five-and-a-half story, mixed-use building to replace the existing structures. The new building is proposed to include 68 residential units, a 6,000-square-foot event center, a 2,400-square-foot restaurant space, a 1,800-square-foot retail space, 80 parking spaces, and associated open space. A

formal demolition request will be required to come before the Board prior to any buildings being razed. As part of the future demolition request the applicant will be required to demonstrate economic hardship or unusual and compelling circumstance exists, or that two of the four Code criteria are met.

New Construction

The proposal before the Board provides an opportunity for feedback based on the conceptual site layout, building massing, and architectural design. In considering new construction within a historic district, it is prudent to ensure the scale, character and location are in keeping with the district, and do not detract from the historic value of adjacent properties or buildings.

As part of this review, an architectural consultant performed an analysis of this proposal to supplement Staff review. Their report is provided, and details from the analysis are provided throughout this Staff report.

Site Layout

The proposal calls for the construction a U-shaped building, with the east face of the building open to allow views of the Scioto River. The structure consists of two main wings, connected by a two-story connector. The northern portion of the proposal stretches from N. High Street to N. Riverview Street, a distance of approximately 240 feet, immediately south of building Z2. Moving west to east from N. High Street to N. Riverview Street, this portion of the building is proposed to include a residential lobby and a restaurant space with outdoor seating along N. High Street. Residential units and the proposed event space are located primarily to the east, closer to N. Riverview Street.



The two-story connector at the west end of the site provides a passageway between the northern and southern portions of the building, and allows public access to the centrally located courtyard from N. High Street. The courtyard consists of a series of staircases, which lead to a landing adjacent to the event space.

The southern portion of the building stretches from N. High Street to N. Riverview Street along North Street, a distance of approximately 200 feet, immediately north of CoHatch. Retail space and a public plaza are envisioned along N. High Street, while residential units would front North Street.

The proposed parking is located on the first floor of the structure, and is primarily underground due to the change of grade on the site. Parking is proposed to be accessed from N. Riverview Street. Sidewalks are proposed along North Street and N. Riverview Street, which aligns with the City's goal for increased pedestrian facilities in the area.

Uses

The proposal includes a combination of uses for the site. There are 68 residential units proposed in the building. Additionally, there is 1,800 square feet of retail space, 2,400 square feet of restaurant, and 6,000 square feet of event center space. The development would be supported by an 80-space parking structure located on the first floor of the building and primarily visible from N. Riverview Street. The proposal includes a new courtyard, centrally located between the northern and southern portions of the new structure.

The BSD Code permits multi-family residential units in the BSD-HC: Historic Core District although limits dwellings to upper floors. Commercial retail and restaurant uses are permitted uses in this zoning district, and are encouraged along Principal Frontage Streets such as N. High Street to promote a continuous, pedestrian oriented street and a vibrant pedestrian experience. Conference and event centers are not permitted uses in the current Code, conditionally or outright. The Historic District Code amendments recently recommended by the Board allow conference centers up to 3,000 square feet. Parks and open space are permitted uses. The applicant would be required to provide a still to-be-determined amount of open space with any redevelopment of the site. The Code does not allow Waivers to modify use standards, meaning the applicant will need to modify the proposal to meet the uses outlined in the Code.

Development Standards

BSD-HC, Historic Core District, permits defined building types for commercial development, which specify the required development standards including buildable area, building height, building materials, lot coverage and façade requirements. The applicant is not required to provide a level of detail with an Informal Review that will confirm compliance with Code requirements. However, while a full Building Type analysis has not occurred at this stage of review, the proposal does not appear to meet the requirements of either of the two allowable Building Types permitted in this Zoning District: Historic Cottage Commercial and Historic Mixed-Use buildings. This proposal has been evaluated against the most applicable Building Type, which is the Historic Mixed-Use Building. Depending on the feedback from the Board, the applicant would need to revise the proposal to comply with the Building Type standards or seek Waivers from the requirements, should this move forward as proposed.

Building Frontage/Setbacks

The front Required Build Zone (RBZ) for a Historic Mixed Use Building Type is 0-20 feet, with an 80% required Front Property Line Coverage. The Corner Side RBZ is 0-10 feet with an 80% coverage required. The maximum permitted lot coverage is 90 percent (impervious and semi-pervious combined). The proposal does not indicate enough information to determine whether these requirements are met, but these will be reviewed with subsequent applications should the proposal proceed. The Building Type requires a mid-building pedestrian way if the building exceeding 150 feet in length, which would be required in this case, and is conceptually provided along N. High Street. The proposal indicates that the building exceeds this length along North Street, meaning this requirement will need to be met should the applicant proceed.

Building Height/Stories

Within the Historic Core Zoning District, the Historic Mixed-Use Building Type limits the building height to 1.5-2.5 stories in height to complement, not overwhelm, the existing building stock and historic character. This proposal includes buildings, which, at a minimum, present as a 2.5-story building and, at a maximum, present as a 5.5-story building. Staff has identified the proposed massing and scale of this structure exceeds that of the recently approved CoHatch building, located on the south side of North Street, which was approved at three stories in height along Blacksmith Lane. The architectural consultant indicates that, while portions of the N. High Street elevation are appropriate or near appropriate in height, scale, and massing, portions of the building on this elevation clearly exceeds the permitted 2.5 stories. They identified the existing historic buildings on nearby blocks range from 1-2.5 stories in height, and to the north, where recent redevelopment has occurred, new construction has been limited to 2.5 stories along N. High Street. The proposal will need to be revised to meet the maximum number of stories, or a Waiver to the requirement would be required.

Architecture/Materials

The Building Type outlines a series of architectural details, including building transparency, façade divisions, entrances, which will need to be met should the proposal move forward. Permitted materials for the Historic Mixed Use Building include stone, brick and wood. The proposal includes the use of stone and wood siding. Further understanding and refinement of the materials will be conducted with the subsequent reviews should the proposal proceed. Code permits a pitched roof type for the Historic Mixed Use Building, with allowance for ARB to approve an alternative design. The proposal includes pitched and flat roof types.

West/N. High Street Elevation

The proposed elevation consists of a series of side and front gables, as well as architectural recesses, which are intended to break up the long elevation. The south corner of the west elevation is bookended by a front gable, along with the second front gable at three stories in height. A series of shed dormers are proposed along this elevation. The applicant is proposing to utilize stone cladding material on the first floor of the elevation, with vertical siding used on the second and third stories. A variety of window sizes are proposed, although the architectural consultant has indicated that the proposed window size and placement are appropriate. There is a break in the west elevation which serves as a passageway for public access into the proposed courtyard. The applicant is proposing outdoor seating for the restaurant use and a public plaza along the west elevation, as well.



South/North Street Elevation

The south elevation along North Street takes advantage of the change in grade, ultimately increasing in height from three stories to four stories as it moves to the west. The parking level is not visible on this elevation. Like the N. High Street elevation, this elevation consists of a series of front gables and architectural indents, which are intended to break up the long elevation. A series of shed dormers are proposed on this elevation, much like the west elevation. The applicant is also proposing balconies on this elevation on some of the residential units. The façade is clad in what appears to be stone on the first floor, and a combination of vertical and horizontal siding, as well as brick on the upper floors. Given the change in grade, the applicant is proposing to utilize a stone retaining wall along what appear to be ground level residential units.

Given the close proximity of this elevation to nearby residential units across the street, the architectural consultant indicates a number of changes could improve this elevation. The consultant indicates that a



reduced height on this elevation would better respond to the shorter single-family homes nearby. A reduced height would also allow more natural light into the proposed courtyard throughout the day. Additionally, the consultant recommends breaking up this elevation by providing a public access point into the courtyard from North Street. This should align with the courtyard provided between the 54 N. High Street and CoHatch buildings. Finally, the consultant recommends the rooflines on this elevation complement those of the buildings to the south, across North Street.

East/N. Riverview Street Elevation

The west elevation along N. Riverview Street rises to a full five-story height, and includes rooftop access in the northeast corner of the building. The parking garage is visible on this elevation, as is the utility and trash bay. This elevation consists of two main forms, a northern form and a southern form. The design of the southern form closely aligns with what is shown on the south elevation, along North Street. The south structure is formed by three levels of residential units atop one level of parking. This portion is clad in what appears to be stone on the garage and first floor, then vertical siding on the upper floors. Between the northern and southern portions of the building is the two-story passageway along N. High Street, which is also visible from the east.

The northern form consists of a more contemporary design than the southern form. This portion consists of four levels atop the garage level. The first floor is proposed to include the event space, while the upper three floors contain residential units.



The applicant is proposing to clad this portion in what appears to be stone on the garage level, brick on the first floor, and an undetermined third material on floors 3-5. The consultant indicates that the layer-cake approach to cladding on this portion exacerbates the taller height, and does not help it blend with the surrounding context. The residential floors on this portion are proposed to have balconies and some architectural accents on the corner facing the interior courtyard. The consultant has indicated that this portion of this elevation could be simplified.

The courtyard on this elevation consists of a series of staircases, leading from the higher elevation along N. High Street to the lower elevation at the rear of the building along N. Riverview Street. The staircases are clad in the same stone used elsewhere on the building, and lead pedestrians to a landscaped landing abutting the event center space. The applicant is proposing a mix of seating options in this area.



Parking and Access

With any future application, further review of parking will be necessary to determine whether the location of parking and amount provided meets Code. Additionally, further review and research is required to determine whether the proposed parking should be classified as podium parking, which is conditional use, or parking within a building, which is not permitted in this zoning district. While the consultant indicates that parking and utility access is appropriately placed on the east elevation, the applicant will need to continue to work with Planning and Engineering Staff should this proposal move forward.

Impact on Neighboring Parcels/Open Space and Pedestrian Connectivity

The site's adjacency to Riverside Crossing Park (West) and the pedestrian bridge should be considered, the City has invested substantially in the improvement of the area. The proposed site plan suggests that this proposal makes improvements on portions of parcels not currently in the applicant's control, including on portions of City-owned parcels. Should this proposal move forward or another proposals which similarly impact City-owned parcels, further discussions with City Staff, as well as with City Council must occur to determine whether or not the City is willing to sell portions of those impacted parcels.

With a future Concept Plan submittal, additional consideration for how this proposal impacts planned pedestrian facility improvements along N. Riverview Street will be necessary. Parks and Recreation Staff have indicated that sidewalk connections are planned for N. Riverview Street, as well as to the terminus of the staircase leading to the public plaza at the west entry of the pedestrian bridge. Engineering Staff have indicated that on-street parking will not be carried south to North Street from the current terminus at Bridge Park West's Building Z1. The applicant should continue to work with Planning, Engineering and Parks and Recreation Staff to determine where and how connections should be made.

3. Discussion Questions

- 1) *Is the Board supportive of the request to demolish the existing structures fronting N. High Street and North Street?*

Requests for demolition of structures within the Historic District are not considered lightly. Code requires the applicant to bear the burden of demonstrating an economic hardship or usual and compelling circumstance, or two of the four criteria for demolition are met. Staff encourages the Board to provide initial feedback on a future demolition request, and to identify what information the Board will require to make an informed decision.

- 2) *Is the Board supportive of the proposed uses?*

The proposal includes a combination of uses for the site, including multi-family, retail, restaurant, event center space, and open space. Code permits commercial retail and restaurant uses in this zoning district. Multi-family residential units are permitted, but limited to upper floors. Conference and event centers are not permitted uses in this zoning district, conditionally or outright. The applicant requests feedback about the proposed mix of uses for the site.

3) *Is the Board supportive of the proposed site layout?*

The proposal calls for the construction a U-shaped building, with the east face of the building open to allow views of the Scioto River. The applicant requests feedback with regard to the general site layout and associated site details mid-building pedestrian ways and parking locations.

4) *Is the Board supportive of the proposed scale, massing, and height of the building? If so, would the Board support future Waivers to the Building Type requirements to allow these deviations? If not, what modifications are recommended to meet the requirements?*

The property is located within Historic Dublin and is zoned BSD-HC, Historic Core. The zoning district permits two commercial building types within this district. While a full Building Type analysis has not occurred, the Historic Mixed Use Building would be the most applicable building type for the proposal given its use, layout, and form. The Board should reference this building type and its requirements, along with the Historic District Design Guidelines when considering the appropriateness of the proposed building.

5) *Are the proposed architectural character and materials compatible with surrounding development?*

The Bridge Street District Code and the *Historic Dublin Design Guidelines* provide guidance about the architectural character, materials and details for new construction. The applicant requests feedback with regard to the general architectural design and styling.

6) *Is the Board supportive of the conceptual open spaces and the proposed public access to the central courtyard?*

The applicant requests feedback with regard to the design of the proposed open spaces and the public access to them.

7) *Other considerations by the Board.*

4. Recommendation

An Informal Review provides the opportunity for feedback at the formative stage of a project. It is intended to allow the Architectural Review Board to provide feedback to an applicant regarding the intended land use and development pattern.

Planning recommends the Board consider this proposal with respect to the demolition, scale, massing, height, architectural details, and associated site improvements. Listed below are suggested questions to guide the Board's discussion:

- 1) Is the Board supportive of the request to demolish the existing structures fronting N. High Street and North Street?
- 2) Is the Board supportive of the proposed uses?
- 3) Is the Board supportive of the proposed site layout?
- 4) Is the Board supportive of the proposed scale, massing, and height of the building? If so, would the Board support future Waivers to the Building Type requirements to allow

these deviations? If not, what modifications are recommended to meet the requirements?

- 5) Are the proposed architectural character and materials compatible with surrounding development?
- 6) Is the Board supportive of the conceptual open spaces and the proposed public access to the central courtyard?
- 7) Other considerations by the Board.