



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (Virtual) Thursday, February 24, 2022

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee to the meeting. Thanked all for their flexibility and adaptability with getting together to meet.

Committee members present: Chief Justin Páez, Lt. Nick Tabernik, PIO Rebecca Myers, Officer Amber McCloskey, Corporal Devin Howard, W. Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque, Susan Ortega, Yanling Yin

Minutes by: Rebecca Metcalf

Committee Business

Chair W. Dwayne Maynard and Vice Chair Ajmeri Hoque

Dwayne Maynard wished all a good evening and shared recent events, noting the invasion of Ukraine that occurred today, thoughts and prayers to them. He also conveyed his thoughts and prayers to Jay Somerville and Isao Shoji due to illness. He then read an excerpt from the CAC Memo to City Council dated May 4 2021:

"On Aug. 10, 2020, Dublin City Council unanimously approved Resolution 41-20, which identified appointees to the Community Task Force and Chief's Advisory Committee (CAC). City Council developed the newly enacted committees to assist and advise City of Dublin staff on efforts to combat and prohibit social injustice, inequity, intolerance, negative stereotyping and discrimination in our community. The Chief's Advisory Committee, specifically, provides an opportunity for proactive community engagement and critical dialogue concerning the City of Dublin's protection, service and public safety needs. This report serves to satisfy the requirement of the Chief's Advisory Committee to update Council as to the progress and direction of the committee's discussions and review after one year of service."

Dwayne Maynard continued thoughts about recent events. In February 2022, recent court decisions relating to George Floyd's death and incidents where policing practices in other states have been challenged because of officer involvement, where it was alleged there was biased policing; the incident with two young males at a mall, one white, one black; convictions of police officers who stood by and did not act, when it was appropriate for them to, when George Floyd's death occurred; an off-duty officer who today was able to talk a woman off of an overpass where she was going to jump down onto train tracks; within five minutes of him getting her off the overpass a train came through. Additionally, he spoke about recent dangers to law enforcement in the media. He reiterated that the committee needs to continue to be aware of all of those things that affect policing and continue the dialogue and discussions leading to better police relations with all of the diverse communities in Dublin. He then deferred to Chief Páez to call roll.

- **Attendance**

Chief called roll for the meeting:
Judge Dwayne Maynard - present
Ms. Ajmeri Hoque – present
Yanling Yin – present
Susan Ortega – present
Imran Malik – not present
Isao Shoji – not present
Stella Villalba – not present

- **Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes**

Dwayne Maynard asked if everyone had an opportunity to review the minutes from September 7, 2021; all affirmed. One correction was made. Dwayne Maynard motioned for adoption of the September 7, 2021 minutes as amended; Ajmeri Hoque moved to accept and adopt the September 7, 2021 minutes as amended. Susan Ortega seconded. Dwayne Maynard asked all in favor to state "I"; all signified in favor and there were no objections.

Dwayne Maynard asked if everyone had an opportunity to review the minutes from October 26, 2021; all affirmed. Ajmeri Hoque did not see any necessary corrections. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to accept and adopt the minutes. Ajmeri Hoque moved to accept and adopt the minutes from October 26, 2021; Yanling Yin seconded. Dwayne Maynard asked all in favor to state "I"; all signified in favor and there were no objections.

Dwayne Maynard asked if everyone had an opportunity to review the minutes from December 2, 2021; all affirmed. No corrections were noted. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to accept and adopt the minutes. Ajmeri Hoque motioned to accept and adopt the minutes; Susan Ortega seconded. Dwayne Maynard asked all in favor to state "I"; all signified in favor. Dwayne Maynard stated that the December 2, 2021 minutes are accepted and adopted without correction or objection.

- **Old Business**

Dwayne Maynard asked if there was any old business that needed to be addressed. Rebecca Myers did not have any old business. Dwayne Maynard asked the committee if there was any old business to address and there were none noted from the group.

Chief's Update to Committee

Chief of Police Justin Páez

Resolution 41-20 started the CAC as a 10-member committee; five members committed to one-year terms, five members committed to two-year terms. The five one-year term members are Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque, Yanling Yin, Cameron Justice and Sri Gaddam. Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque and Yanling Yin wish to continue on the committee. Sri Gaddam, due to work conflicts, is unable to continue on the committee and Cameron Justice as well is unable to continue on the committee as he has just started law school. This leaves the CAC with two

vacancies. Additionally, Cortney Ingram, who was selected to a two-year term, is unable to continue her commitment, leaving the committee with three vacancies to fill. Applications and selection processes for both the CIAC and CAC commenced. Twenty-five applications were received for the CIAC and 15 applications received for the CAC. Dwayne Maynard and Ajmeri Hoque assisted in the review of the CAC applications initially and Chief Páez conducted the final interview. Imran Malik interviewed, as an applicant for the CIAC and upon approval will join that committee leaving the CAC with a fourth vacancy to fill. Isao Shoji will continue to be the liaison for both the CIAC and CAC committees. Four new committee members were selected and will be presented in a resolution to City Council: Zhen Xing, Emmet Apolinario, Rama Billakanty, and Gaurev Goel. Additionally, Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque and Yanling Yin will all be approved for a two-year term. This will bring the CAC to its full 10-member committee. Chief Páez then opened the floor to any questions and advised that the new members will be welcomed at the next meeting to be scheduled in March. Dwayne Maynard thanked Chief Páez for working through the process with him, Ajmeri Hoque, City Council and the City Manager to get to this point, and that all CAC members are looking forward to getting to work and getting to know new community partners. He also thanked the City Manager for being involved and engaged in those interviews as well expressing thanks to Kirby Dirth for navigating through the process and to Kat Crowder who did a lot of the work in the background.

Dwayne Maynard asked the other partners if they have any familiarity with the new partners who will be joining the CAC. Yanling Yin is not familiar. Susan Ortega is not familiar but is excited to meet them. She also asked if Imran Malik would be available to attend one last meeting so they could thank him for his service to the committee.

Chief Páez advised that he does wish for the opportunity to recognize all members who will be leaving to thank them for their contribution and if they are able to attend the next meeting, he wants to publicly thank them.

Dwayne Maynard suggests extending some sort of invitation to them specifically asking them to attend so they can be recognized thinking that would be a more appropriate way to do that. He feels it is good for new community partners to have the opportunity to meet them as well and have a dialogue with them as participants one more time. Susan Ortega agreed stating that makes it more purposeful and acknowledges their partnership. Chief Páez agrees that that is a wonderful idea and hopes to identify a date for next the meeting this evening.

Dwayne Maynard asked when Dublin City Schools has Spring Break. Ajmeri Hoque advised it is the last full week of March. The committee discussed possible meeting dates for March. Dwayne Maynard suggested the first, second or third full week but not 3/25; Susan suggested sticking with Thursdays potentially. Dwayne Maynard would be available anytime the week of 3/21-3/24; or any other day the week before excluding the 17th. Rebecca Myers advised that the 10th and 11th are not good on city side; 10th is the State of the City and the 11th the bridge dedication ceremony. Dwayne Maynard will check with Cameron Justice to find out the dates of OSU's Spring Break. Lt. Tabernik checked and advised that OSU spring break is the week of the 14th. Dwayne Maynard asked the partners what their schedules looked like for the month of March. Ajmeri Hoque is out of town the week of 21st. Dwayne Maynard will check with Cam on week of the 14th to see if he is in town then. Susan Ortega is available Monday 3/14 and 3/15, Ajmeri Hoque is available; Yanling Yin is not available. Ajmeri Hoque suggested sending out the When

to Meet survey. Susan Ortega asked if there are regulations against having a WebEx for the next meeting. Chief Páez advised that we possibly can but public meetings should be in person and hopes that by March meetings can again be in person. Dwayne Maynard asked if the next meeting has to be March. Chief Páez emphasized the importance of attendance and that the next resolution will contain language regarding attendance. He also stated that the next meeting does not have to be next month but that the longer we go there is a loss on that continued momentum.

Dwayne Maynard asked if the next meeting is in person and not WebEx, could he call in if out of town. Chief Páez advised that we could try to work thru that. Susan Ortega suggested that if scheduling is too complicated including the schedules of departing members to possibly push that meeting to a later date and schedule the meeting with new members in March.

Chief Páez sent out an invitation to all for the State of the City; suggests that possibly this would be a good opportunity to publicly acknowledge those members; if they are available to attend the State of the City that would be a good venue; it is scheduled for Thursday 3/10 6:00PM at The Exchange at Bridge Park, 6520 Riverside Drive, Dublin OH. Rebecca Myers is excited to have all members and new members of CAC, CTF and CIAC be welcomed at the end of the presentation. Additionally, Chief Páez advised that March 14 is not a day that works with the police department; we will be hosting our Annual Awards Program.

DC Tabernik provided more information about the awards ceremony; 3/14/2022 is the tentative date; we are able to be back in person to recognize the efforts of our officers, communications technicians, and civilian support staff over the past year. We recognize the Officer of the Year, Civilian Employee of the Year, Volunteer of the Year, and present the award for Leadership. We also recognize other awards that have been presented to employees throughout the year. This is a great venue and opportunity for CAC members to join us and celebrate the successes of our members.

Dwayne Maynard suggested what scheduling the next meeting for a date that works best for all; if we can work out some way to have members call in or WebEx in to the meeting if they are unable to come in person, let's go with that for March. He does not want the new group to get started without him or Ajmeri being there.

Chief Páez shared some information with committee members of an English Language Learning Event hosted by Northwest Presbyterian Church on March 17. They are currently in planning stages for that event, but have asked police and other departments within the City to share information about their departments and other city services. If there is any interest in supporting or attending the event, he wanted to offer that opportunity to members. Rebecca Myers will share the information of where and when with all members.

New Business

Review CTF Diversity Equity & Inclusion (DEI) Framework

Chief Páez wanted to revisit the document. The document was presented to council in August of last year and the CAC was involved in the public safety portion (priority area 4) of the framework; he wanted to review one again CAC goals are established in 2022.

Dwayne Maynard reviewed the four areas within priority 4 that were highlighted in the plan and asked members to share their thoughts:

- Promoting Public Safety and a Sense of Security
- Cultivating Community Engagement and Public Trust
- Ensuring Transparency and Accountability
- Diversifying Police Personnel

Yanling Yin recalled a goal to focus on female representation in the police department (diversifying police personnel, specifically female representation). Dwayne Maynard referred to the third bullet in that particular section:

- Dublin Police focuses on equitable hiring practices and require all hiring committee members and recruiting representatives to successfully complete diversity, equity and inclusion training prior to participation in the selection process.

He asked Chief Páez what that looks like from a department vantage point. Chief Páez agrees that we want to focus on and lean into this goal. If any members want to be part of the recruiting environment and team, please let him know. He also welcomed them to review the EEO Recruitment Plan and Focus for the department. He provided a description of the recruitment process; first, we take into consideration a start date based on upcoming opening in an academy, consider how many openings we have and then work our way back from there to the start of the process. The process includes advertisement, testing, interviews, backgrounds, final interview, and then a conditional offer prior to attending the academy. As we move forward, the process is guided by a City of Dublin Administrative Order (AO). We do have the opportunity to amend and adjust that process, which allows for more flexibility. Currently, all agencies are experiencing the need to add and replace officers, to what has become a dwindling pool of applicants.

Chief Páez further explained that moving forward part of that recruiting focus would be on DEI. We will examine the instruments and procedures we use and decide if they are right for us. We are exploring new programs (i.e., College to Law Enforcement Pathway) and attended an event at Cedarville University in January where we met with new potential candidates. Corporal Keiffer, which is a perfect example of leaning in to our goal, is attending some training to help broaden our perspective in recruiting (Women in Law Enforcement Summit).

Deputy Chief Tabernik shared that Corporal Keiffer and Corporal Kovacs went to Cedarville University on 2/23 to promote our organization and recruit potential candidates. In regards to the upcoming Women in Law Enforcement Summit, this provides Corporal Keiffer a good opportunity to get more insight on best practices to recruit, retain, and promote women in law enforcement. The summit is scheduled for 3/19/2022 thru 3/22/2022 in Nashville, TN.

Dwayne Maynard asked that when we talk about diversifying personnel, that is not only officers, but all staff in general. Yanling Yin agreed that is a fair assumption. She appreciates that Corporal Keiffer will be attending this conference, and suggests having persons representing those groups present when recruiting. Chief Páez agreed with these great points and advised that we are still working through various opportunities available and ways we can improve connectivity in recruiting as well. Chief Páez asked Officer McCloskey to give her perspective on the interview process as she participated on the most recent interview panel and recruiting.

Officer McCloskey was on the most recent police officer interview panel. They interviewed 60 candidates over a two-week period. She appreciated the opportunity, commenting that it was motivating to talk to people who want to do this job, and people from other departments that want to come to Dublin. Half to three quarters mentioned this committee in their interview. They saw that Dublin is proactively taking steps to connect with our community, attracting and bringing a certain quality of candidate that is aligned with same values of this committee. This committee has not gone unnoticed. The interview panel does its absolute best to ensure the perfect candidate for the job, this department, and what we stand for as an agency. They hit on key factors of empathy and implicit bias, which goes into their overall score. They ask hard-hitting questions, which are necessary. They selected 12 candidates that align with us as best as possible. The background process is long and arduous and a candidate can feel left out, they can lose motivation, interest, and hope because they don't hear from the agency. For this process, the agency is taking a different approach. A contact from the department has reached out to each candidate to meet with them on a one-on-one basis; commended them on their interview, invited them back to tour the department, ride along, sort of an open book policy. Emphasizing that while we need them to be a good fit for us, we need to be a good fit for them and their family. In essence, opening up the doors a bit in our hiring process with those we want to move down the line; this is who we are, what we stand for, and want them to be confident in us. As time goes on, we will continue to recruit very high quality candidates, word spreads when candidates have a good experience.

Yanling Yin thanked Officer McCloskey, liked the way the department opened up to the candidates; trust built will be paid back in the long run.

Susan Ortega was excited to see the excitement Officer McCloskey shared when describing the new process; stating, that this brings it back to what we are talking about in this framework, these are things that are hard to put into words; building progress toward diversifying your personnel, part of the team, part of the family. When considering concrete goals moving forward for the four areas, how do we capture these great things in words and make them measurable to demonstrate our progress. She shared some other thoughts; when invited to community events, if appropriate, start spreading the word about recruitment because you are speaking to a more diverse population in Dublin at those events.

Chief Páez advised that part of our Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Plan highlights where we advertise. He will send the EEO Plan out to the group to review. He commented that he is excited about upcoming interviews and using these ideas with tangible outcomes and progress. Is it appropriate to recruit at these events, every contact is an opportunity. He deferred to Corporal Howard to offer his perspective.

Corporal Howard stated that he views our position out in patrol as unique, we engage with community on a day-to-day basis. This engagement also affords a recruiting opportunity, can talk to younger kids, goes beyond just going to colleges and schools, it is what we do on a day-to-day basis.

Ajmeri Hoque spoke about the particular bullet points of this document stating that when Officer McCloskey was talking, she was touching on all of them. All are interconnected; while you are doing one part of your job, you are actually doing everything.

Officer McCloskey commented that by opening up those doors while doing our hiring process that will bring the DEI inclusionary aspect into the process. The more open we are as a police department, and the more connections made with community to convey that we are good people here, we have a certain set of values, and we treat all with respect and integrity. The department really wants to showcase this to everybody and hopes that will start to draw in other demographics that have not considered this profession.

Ajmeri Hoque commented that this department does not shy away from DEI; this group has done a good job of bringing back the issues and bringing back to the people we are trying to connect.

Dwayne Maynard was appreciative for the discussion from this vantage point; we talk about bridge building and intentionality. In the recruitment arena, when we talk about doing things and being transparent and personable with recruits, it shows that we are trying to put our best foot forward and inviting them in to try to make their own determination; that goes a long way with people trusting the department in general. He further commented that with transparency and attempts at community engagement it is a broader reach, and he can see it potentially being very attractive on different levels. He asked all to continue to be intentional, considering what else can be done in showing Dublin Police Department's progressive nature.

Chief Páez shared information on the training of the department's recruitment team. At the department level in 2020, Dr. Marvin Whitfield conducted Implicit Bias training. Dr. Burrs, who presented a sample of her training to the CAC at the October 26, 2021 meeting, offered bias training to sworn and civilian members; this avails all members to be part of that recruiting committee and recruiting effort. This includes members of NRECC as well. The department will continue this foundational training and offer more specific training for those who avail themselves to the recruiting team.

Dwayne Maynard commented that he will continue to ask the hard questions and challenge the department. He asked if all members had ample opportunity to express their focus and goals for the CAC related to the four areas within priority 4 that were highlighted in the plan. All advised that they had nothing more to add.

Onboarding of community partners

Chief Páez asked members of the committee their recommendations and thoughts related to onboarding the four new community partners.

Ajmeri Hoque stated that it would be a good idea to send new members the DEI Framework Document, as well as copies of minutes, to give them a general idea of what has already been discussed.

Yanling Yin agreed.

Susan Ortega stated that makes sense and that they may need time to digest the information and get their thoughts together. She added to let them know that they can reach out to any of the community members with questions.

Dwayne Maynard asked if they need to be added to the email thread. Rebecca Myers will make sure they are added once appointed. He also asked members, in addition to meeting minutes, what their thoughts were about sending handouts for policies, documents, items they have dealt with in the past, and any other areas of focus we should revisit. Susan Ortega advised that she thinks that would be good to include that information as well. Dwayne Maynard deferred to Rebecca Myers and Chief Páez to streamline the information and distribute to new members. Rebecca Myers advised that she would get all information out to them.

Dwayne Maynard appreciates the agenda coming out in advance to give the all the opportunity to prepare and revisit the materials prior to the meeting. He asked if moving forward, to get the agenda and minutes a couple of days to a week in advance of the next meeting as that is very helpful.

Public Commentary

Dwayne Maynard asked Rebecca Myers if there was anything that had come in on the chat or other questions that had been received. Rebecca Myers advised that nothing had come in for this meeting.

Dwayne Maynard spoke about black history month, commenting that we were intentional last year, and that he didn't want to miss the opportunity to share some thoughts from his vantage point. He shared that he had been thinking about his heroes, who were part of the Franklin County Municipal Court, two judges who were both very important to him. Both have since passed away but he shared the following information:

Judge James Pearson served from 1969 until January of 1993. Dwayne Maynard practiced in front of him prior to Judge Person's retirement in 1993 and paved the way for him to have the opportunity to ascend to the Municipal Court Bench. When Judge Pearson retired in January 1993, Dwayne Maynard was appointed, by then Governor Voinovich, to take his seat on the bench. Dwayne Maynard had to run for election later that year, but was appointed in late January, took bench in March and won the election in November 1993, serving until the end of December 2011; it has been ten full years since he was a municipal court judge.

Judge Robert Duncan, if you look up his bio information, he is known as a jurist of many firsts for black or African American judges in Franklin County. Judge Duncan was elected in 1966, the first African American elected to judicial office in the Franklin County Municipal Court, and later appointed by then Gov. James Rhodes, to succeed Supreme Court Justice Paul Brown. Subsequently, Judge Duncan was the first African American to win a statewide election in 1970. He served there until President Nixon appointment him to the US Court of Military Appeals, a three-justice bench created by Congress in 1950 as highest court for military personnel. Judge Duncan remained on that court until President Nixon appointed him to the US District Court for southern Ohio in 1974. He served for 11 years and decided several significant cases. One of the most meaningful being the Columbus Schools desegregation cases. He ended his career in 1985 when he stepped down from the federal bench, that does not often happen, as it is usually a

lifetime appointment. He joined the private firm of Jones, Day, Reavis and Pogue in Columbus as an administrative partner. Judge Duncan was considered a judges' judge, a moderate in his decisions, many federal judges thought that even though he no longer served on the bench that he might be the African American judge nominated to replace Thurgood Marshall when President George HW Bush had the opportunity to appoint a new justice. Unfortunately, Judge Duncan was not the judge nominated as Clarence Thomas was selected. Judge Duncan received his undergraduate degree from the OSU in 1948, law degree in 1952, and served the university in several capacities.

Dwayne Maynard commented that those two persons are very important to him, Judge Pearson passed at the age of 72, Duncan at the age of 85; he appreciates them and what they meant and did for him. He stated that they are very important to the person serving on this committee at this time. He hopes that next year, the committee can be more intentional about celebrating or remembering black history month in the month of February.

Dwayne Maynard entertained a motion to adjourn unless there was other business and recognized trying to get the March meeting date together. Becky Metcalf will send out some dates; the CAC does intend to meet in March.

Ajmeri Hoque wanted to point out that Ramadan is coming up in a couple of weeks. She hopes that the department and city can participate; there is a celebration happening at the Dublin Recreation Center. Ajmeri Hoque then moved to adjourn the meeting.

Yanling Yin seconded the motion.

Chief Páez thanked all again for coming together tonight and thanked Dwayne Maynard for sharing the information.

Dwayne Maynard asked that all in favor of adjourning the meeting signify by stating "I". All were in favor and the meeting was officially adjourned at 7:28 PM.

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information

614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez
jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville
jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi
glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard
dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik
ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey
amccloskey@dublin.oh.us