



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (In Person)

Thursday, March 24, 2022

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee to the meeting. Thanked all for their flexibility and adaptability with getting together to meet.

Committee members present: W. Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque (via WebEx), Susan Ortega, Yanling Yin, Isao Shoji, Rama Billakenty, Gaurav Goel, Emmet Apolinario, Zhen Xing, Chief Justin Páez, Deputy Chief Nick Tabernik, Officer Amber McCloskey, PIO Rebecca Myers

Minutes by: Rebecca Metcalf

Committee Business

Chair W. Dwayne Maynard and Vice Chair Ajmeri Hoque

Dwayne Maynard wished all a good evening and welcomed all to the first meeting of the second iteration of the Chief's Advisory Committee. He spoke about how the committee came to be; welcomed new members and thanked the outgoing members of the first iteration of the CAC for their work and commitment: Imran Malik, Sri Gaddam, Cameron Justice, and Courtney Ingram. He spoke about current events the first being on the international scene. The invasion of Ukraine which occurred a month ago and is still ongoing extending his thoughts and prayers to the persons in Ukraine. On a national level, the historic confirmation hearings going on, hopefully for our first Black Female Supreme Court Justice, Ketanji Brown Jackson. On the local level, Congressional maps are being redrawn again hoping this time it will pass Ohio Supreme Court scrutiny. Additionally, he spoke of issues that in his opinion are important, related to issues of policing and community relations. The lifting of restrictions on gun laws and guns registration. His hope is that the committee can have discussions and get a better understanding of law enforcement's perspective on that issue and how it affects policing. Finally, he extended thoughts and prayers to Director Somerville as he continues his recovery. He stated that he considers all in the committee his community partners, and that as community partners, they must have open and honest dialogue with the department and each other to better understand the issues that they think are important to those persons they are representing.

He then deferred to Chief Páez to call roll.

- **Attendance**

Chief Páez called roll for the meeting:

Judge Dwayne Maynard - present

Ms. Ajmeri Hoque – present

Ms. Yanling Yin – present

Ms. Susan Ortega – present
Mr. Isao Shoji – present
Ms. Rama Billakenty – present
Mr. Gaurav Goel – present
Mr. Emmet Apolinario
Ms. Zhen Xing
Ms. Stella Villalba – not present

- **Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes**

Dwayne Maynard asked if everyone had an opportunity to review the minutes from February 22, 2022; all affirmed. He asked if there were any corrections or additions. The only corrections noted were to have the name Dwayne Maynard corrected to Dwayne Maynard where it appears as such in the notes. Chief Páez advised that those corrections would be made. No others had any corrections or amendments. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to accept and adopt the minutes. Isao Shoji motioned and Yanling Yin seconded that motion to accept and adopt the minutes as amended. Dwayne Maynard asked that all in favor state "I"; all signified in favor. Dwayne Maynard stated that the February 22, 2022 minutes are accepted and adopted with amendments.

- **Old Business**

Dwayne Maynard asked if there was any old business that needed to be addressed. Rebecca Myers did not have any old business.

Chief's Update to Committee

Chief of Police Justin Páez asked that Vice Chair Ajmeri Hoque, who was attending for a short time via WebEx, to introduce herself to the new members of the committee. She stated that she has been on the committee since 2020 and is looking forward to working with the new members, hearing their ideas, and seeing what they can accomplish together in the upcoming year.

Chief welcomed all to the meeting. He reiterated Dwayne Maynard's comments and added that the committee has been on an incredible journey together. He conveyed his gratitude to those who are moving on to other things and to those as well who will continue to serve on the committee. He offered, to the new members for clarity, that this is a space to be honest with each other, to lean into conversations, an opportunity for the police department to listen to perspectives, to understand expectations, to share some perspective from the department's experience, and the intentional engagement efforts of the police department. He emphasized the connection and connectivity that the committee has built with community members. He hopes through their involvement, discussions on policy, mission, intention, and focus of our organization that they become comfortable and can assist in finding the right ways to engage with and build relationships with our the community in Dublin and those surrounding communities that are impacted by our work here in Dublin.

Chief Páez highlighted events of the past month. He thanked Dwayne Maynard and Emmett Apolinario for attending the annual police awards program. This is an opportunity to bring members together and recognize awards that have been presented throughout the year and also

share larger awards we present once per year; Officer of the Year, Civilian Employee of the Year, Leadership Award, and Volunteer of the Year. The recipients of those awards are: Detective Jason Murphy, Officer of the Year; Communications Technician Brett Goldstein, Civilian Employee of the Year Brett Goldstein; Sergeant Thomas Gallagher, Leadership Award; and Debbie Giddings, Volunteer of the Year (2nd time award recipient). Chief Páez also acknowledged the awards committee for their work throughout the year. Chief Páez extended an invitation to all members to attend next year. Additionally, Officer Scott Brown's daughter was recognized for assisting an elderly neighbor who had fallen outside her home. The neighbor reached out to Chief Páez and expressed her appreciation as several people had passed her by. He commented that as public servants we take care of the public and serve the public and through that service we hope to inspire others to do as well. Chief Páez is certain that Officer Brown's work as a police officer inspired his daughter and gave her the courage to step forward and help. The department was proud to recognize her as part of the awards ceremony.

Chief Páez shared some upcoming events: Bike Drive April 2, 2022 11AM to 1PM at the Justice Center in partnership with Starfish Assignment. Career Recruitment Event for public safety in partnership with NRECC and other police agencies and fire departments we serve. Location is Coffman High School on April 23; more information forthcoming. All members are invited to attend and be part of that event. Departments include: Dublin Police, Upper Arlington Police and Fire, Washington Township Fire, Hilliard Police, Worthington Police and Fire, and Columbus Police. NRECC provides service to all of those departments both police and fire (except Columbus).

Chief Páez also shared that there is a link to the CAC Team's site. The site includes all past presentations and information so that all members old and new have access and can review at their convenience. The site can also be used to share information with each other.

Deputy Chief Tabernik spoke about the bike drive partnership with Starfish Assignment accepting new bikes or used bikes (which will be repaired if necessary). Bikes are then donated to under-represented populations throughout Central Ohio. Dublin's event last year took in 220 of the overall 400 bikes that were collected last year. The outpouring of support from our community was great and it was a tremendous event. Helmet donations are accepted as well. DC Tabernik invited all to donate or just stop by for this great cause.

Lastly, Chief Páez thanked all from the committee that came out for the State of the City and a special thanks to Rebecca Myers for putting together an overview of the CAC's accomplishments for 2021.

Dwayne Maynard opened the floor to any questions from the committee. There were no other questions.

New Business

Dwayne Maynard invited the current and new members of the CAC to introduce themselves.

Yanling Yin: She has been on the committee since 2020. She attended the Dublin Citizen's Police Academy which provided the opportunity to look behind the scenes at things the community may not know. This allowed her to pass along the information to the community and assist in building

bridges. Personally, she wants to work on diversity and review policy and processes for hiring especially relating to hiring female officers.

Gaurav Goel: He grew up in India and moved to US and Central Ohio about three years ago; residing in Dublin for the past two years. He attended the Dublin Citizen Police Academy as well stating it was an amazing experience. He shared his experience growing up; when he would see police or a uniform, he would turn around and go the other way. The CPA completely changed his perspective. He wants to be more involved in the community and bridge the gap; Dublin is doing great things but it is not one way. The community has to help bridge the gap and he looks forward to the partnership.

Ajmeri Hoque: She has been part of the group since 2020; she did not have anything additional to share since she already introduced herself earlier.

Rama Billakanty: She has been in Dublin for twelve years coming here from Michigan. She was part of Dublin Task Force and more interested in the Chief's Advisory Committee. She shared that perspective that when you see a cop, you turn around and go; and that perspective is in the community as well. She would like to be the liaison or bridge for the community, the city and the police department. Diversity has always been an issue and she wants to talk about it, bridge the gap, and she see more diverse people in the city.

Isao Shoji: He is a five or six-year resident of Dublin and worked in Dublin before that. He has been involved with the CAC and CTF since 2020 at the same time, serving as liaison between the two entities. He is also part of the CIAC as well and will continue to be the liaison between the two committees. As a resident he wants to do what he can to get involved. He expressed that the conversations had in both committees are not issues that get solved tomorrow. They are long term issues but the conversations need to start now to impact the future.

Additional Commentary: Yanling Yin shared that what happened across the country sometimes led to uncomfortable conversations but it allowed her to have more objective conversations with her own kids and she appreciates this experience. Rama Billakanty stated that she learned so much from her involvement with the kids that participated on the CTF helped her in talking with her own kids on diversity. Dwayne Maynard was hopeful we would get youth advocates as part of the CAC. He suggests in the future making being a part of this committee attractive to younger people so we can hear their voices as part of these committees as well. Yanling Yin feels that having kids involved, conversations may be different.

Zhen Xing: She moved from China to the US in 1997 living in New York, Boston, East Coast area. They moved to Ohio in 2006; she was concerned at the time if there were any Chinese living in Ohio and she did not want to move here. However, moving to Dublin, she noticed that there is a very concentrated population of Chinese because of our school district. Over the past two years, there have been heated conversations about race, diversity, but ultimately she believes we are all human, we share the same emotions, we love our family. All of her experiences in Dublin have been very pleasant. She wants to be on the Chief's Advisory Committee to see all get along, she is not only interested in Chinese culture but is interested in a lot of things. She believes everybody can make America home.

Susan Ortega: She is with Syntero and a licensed social work clinician. A lot of parts converged for her to become a part of the Chief's Advisory Committee. She has family members who are police officers across the county, working in the mental health field they do a lot of work with the schools and also have a lot of interaction with law enforcement. These interactions are usually in very heated situations; some jurisdictions have room for growth but when working with Dublin she realized there is something going on here that is right. She feels confident that if she has to reach out for assistance, she is not worried. She wanted to be a part of this team to see what is going on, what is going right, and how she can offer her support to the department and the community. She also has been with the team since August of 2020.

Emmet Apolinario: He grew up in the Philippines coming to the United States in 1980. He is a product of the Simpson Mazzoli Bill, which was the first immigration amnesty that the United States had offering 2 million a path to citizenship. He grew up in Alexandria, Virginia, which is a very diverse community, then moved to Long Island, NY where he met his wife, who is from the Tiffin, Ohio area. They have four children and have been married 32 years with all four kids still living at home. His brother is in law enforcement for Fairfax County, VA and his son, who has separated from the Air Force, was in the security forces. His family moved to Dublin in 1991, moved to Powell for a few years, but his family really liked Dublin so they moved back in 1998. He appreciates the opportunity to be a part of this group.

Dwayne Maynard: He introduced himself, his name is William Maynard, but Dwayne is his middle name but people call him "Judge" in this group. He is an Ohio State Law School graduate where he met his wife who is an educator, working with kids with special needs at Coffman. They have two kids, both of whom are in education. He served on the Franklin County Municipal Court Bench for 18 years, and has been away from the bench for 10 years. He finished his professional career in the Attorney General's Office. He participated in the CPA in 2017 and enjoyed it but did not feel like the questions and issues he wanted to raise with law enforcement were addressed in that setting. When the opportunity arose to be a part of the CAC, he lobbied to be a part of it because of the issues around policing involving Black and Brown people that were occurring in the Spring and Summer of 2020. He felt it was important to help raise awareness or address issues with local law enforcement. He found the Chief to be a very amenable partner to taking this to a visionary point where Dublin would aspire to be a progressive law enforcement agency on these issues. He has been pleasantly surprised of the support from his command staff team and realizes they may face challenges internally to address issues raised by the CAC. He looks forward to what comes next based on the DEI report which contains a section on public safety; the CAC team wrote that portion of the plan. In year two, it is the CACs turn to take those things from just a vision and put them into action. He looks forward to continuing the work with folks who remain on the team and working with the new members of the team.

Deputy Chief Nick Tabernik: He has been a part of the committee since 2020 as well. He has been very impressed with the partnerships they have created. He grew up on the East side of Cleveland and attended the University of Dayton earning his Criminal Justice Degree. He was hired shortly thereafter by the City of Dublin Police Department. He has had several different assignments throughout his career but currently oversees our Support Services Bureau. The department is broken down into three different bureaus: Operations Bureau, Support Services Bureau, and Technical Services Bureau. The Support Services Bureau is made up of investigative

components and our Community Education Unit. His most important role is as a husband and father to an eight-year-old son.

Officer Amber McCloskey: She is a second shift patrol officer, which is her primary function at the police department. She is also part of our surveillance unit, bicycle unit, drone operator, community liaison officer and serves on the CAC. Additionally, she is the LGBTQIA+ liaison between the police department and the city. She advised that being a part of this committee has been very rewarding and interesting over the past year, getting ideas from community members that we may not have had the opportunity to get otherwise. She is happy to be a part of the committee and looks forward to making connections as well with the new members.

Rebecca Myers: She has been with the city for almost two years. Prior to that she was a journalism student at Ohio University and she is from southeast Ohio. She reported on the statehouse for a news organization downtown and also worked with the State of Ohio Department of Developmental Disabilities as a public information officer prior to joining the City of Dublin as a PIO. She primarily works with the police department and NRECC and has primarily taken on most of the diversity, equity and inclusion initiatives for the city. She will also be a part of the CIAC as a support staff member. She is happy to be a partner with all.

Chief Justin Páez: He has been with the City of Dublin for a little over 18 years, 21 years in law enforcement. Chief of Police since June of 2019. He resides in Dublin with his wife Abby and his five children. He is grateful for the timing of the arrival of the Chief's Advisory Committee in our community and this profession. The anxiety and uncertainty about police is something that we all feel. There is a certain level of anxiety and apprehension that is baked into the idea that there is an entity that enforces the law out in the community and nobody wants to be outside of the expectations. He tries remind himself that he grew up around policing. His dad was a police officer for 37 years, retiring as the Chief of Police in Perrysburg, Ohio; he grew up around it so it felt comfortable and it is the same for his kids but not everybody has had that experience. He is grateful to have conversations about policing at this level because much of the support you receive from a police department as well as city government goes unnoticed because it blends in to the background until you need it and in its absolute importance to you at that moment. To have the venue where people get to ask questions and we get to share what we do and why we do it and who we are is so important but also critical at this point in our society that we wrestle with the tough questions as well. He reiterated that there are no questions that you can ask that are going to offend or affront us because we know it is coming from the spirit of making this community safer and making this environment more welcoming.

Dwayne Maynard opened the floor to anyone questions the new members may have for the committee. Zhen Xing spoke about a story that has been circulating in the Chinese community about a case that occurred in San Diego. The case was very recent and involved a Chinese lady who was highly educated, she was killed and shot by police when serving an eviction paper to her. She was diagnosed with bi-polar and since pandemic the situation got worse and wasn't paying HOA fees. During the interaction she was holding a knife and she ended up being killed. She asked if the police department ever researches those types of situations that occur in other places. Her concern was that although she may have been highly educated, sometimes for a non-native English speaker they may have a good grasp of vocabulary in a very specific area but not necessarily in some more common sense ways as does a native speaker, so they may not

fully understand. Also due to the past few years during the pandemic, many are experiencing mental illness. Officer McCloskey was familiar with the case. She advised that as a shift they reviewed the body camera footage during roll call. They went over from beginning to end, pointed out what was right, what was wrong or what could possibly have been done better. Yanling Yin suggested that perhaps when the case is completed the committee could possibly have a discussion with the Chinese community at that time. She commented about conversations the committee has previously about dealing with people experiencing mental health issues and recognizing those signs. Additionally, she is personally involved as part of the community panel for Dublin Police Officer's in training sharing how the Chinese or Asian community interact with police differently. The language and gestures they use can sometimes be interpreted like they are hiding something. Different cultures and how they deal with police departments vary and this is an opportunity to discuss those differences. Rama B commented that she would like to have more dialogue between the department and communities. There is always a thick wall between the community and the police department, the perspective of the people is completely different. There is fear, or thought that I did something wrong and I have to defend myself. You don't do things right when you have that feeling. More communication between the community and the police department is needed.

Chief Páez commented that there is always something that has happened globally or nationally that feels like it has happened here. When someone from our community sees something that occurred somewhere else and they don't have that familiarity or awareness of how we do things in Dublin their worry is, I don't know why that happened or have all the details, but I don't want that to happen in our community, happen to me, or happen to someone I love. The benefit of having this committee, and leaning into those conversations is that it didn't happen here, but it doesn't mean we can't learn from it. The department tries to take those situations that we have observed, that have gone right or wrong, and fold them into our training so our officers aren't experiencing it for the first time in real time when the stakes are so high. The more we can have officers be part of conversations with the community in larger numbers, the more familiarity and comfort and understanding of expectation and safety we can have for all of our community members. Projecting the CACs conversations outward into venues is what is so important for the department moving forward to ensure there is trust and confidence in your police department and the safety of this community by having those conversations.

Goel shared an experience he recalls from a few years ago of a police interaction involving an Indian older gentleman somewhere in Ohio. It ended up with the older gentleman being hurt and hospitalized. After that occurred, he was scared for his parents who live here, he explained the things that they would need to do if they would get pulled over. There is an educational opportunity for the community on how to handle these types of situations.

Zhen Xing agreed, commenting that someone who has grown up in this country knows to sit still or what to do in those situations, but it might not be a given for someone who did not grow up in the car culture, many immigrants learned to drive here.

Yanling Yin commented about the situation that occurred involving the use of force against Ma'Khia Bryant last year, the committee talked about that, she suggests the need to revisit and talk through that use of force again.

Dwayne Maynard agrees that use of force should be revisited every time we have new members to the Chief's Advisory Committee. That type of interaction with law enforcement or any group of people is probably the scariest. He has talked to groups about what you should do if you are stopped by law enforcement but he hopes those messages get through to people but a lot of times in the moment they don't remember or don't act appropriately.

Yanling Yin commented, as Officer McCloskey said, when things like that happen it is in the heat of the moment you also want to make sure police officers are safe too.

Susan Ortega commented about the new law regarding not having to have training, or a permit to carry a concealed weapon but that it also includes not having to announce to the officer that have a weapon in your vehicle. That made her consider, what that must be like for an officer in a really tense situation already. She is curious how the department will be handling that.

Chief Páez advised that the law goes into effect in 90 days. The department has had conversation as a supervisory staff, and will also reach out to legal to see what that looks like; but he is sure officers have had conversations at the shift level or individually about how does this change my interaction. All officers know there are some inherent dangers out there in the world and that our job is to prepare for them. He shared his own reflection and balance was that he always has an awareness that something might be out there but that he can't act in fear. He can be afraid in situations, and as an officer that is okay and healthy and necessary to be able to take in all of the information in a dynamic situation, and to pay attention to that sense of something is not right here. But to go out with fear driving you every day cannot be healthy for anyone. That becomes harder when the rules change over time but, you presume that there are situations out there where somebody is going to be armed but that doesn't always mean they are trying to harm you. Open carry has always been the case in the State of Ohio. You could carry a firearm legally and have it displayed as you do so in public, that doesn't mean everyone is trying to harm you. Firearms invoke a certain level of anxiety that other elements may not. There are dangers and threats that are not implements and weapons that are of equal concern for officers. So, when the rules change you have to take it in and consider what does this mean to me now and fold it in and consider who do I present the professional image and the intention of service and safety and protection while taking care of everyone that is involved in the situation and that includes those dynamic encounters where we would desperately want someone to behave differently than they are in that moment. There are going to be more people carrying firearms because now they feel license and empowerment to do so. He shared an incident that occurred in Dublin the same evening that the legislation passed and how professionally the officers involved in the incident handled the call.

Officer McCloskey recalled something a lieutenant told them in the academy about graduation, that she has folded into her philosophy on policing and her career. He said, "The bravest thing you will ever do is take your oath on graduation day, everything after that moment is just your duty. It's not brave. It's not courageous. It's what you signed up to do". That is how she feels about policing, that was the bravest moment she has ever had, everything that has happened after that, is just her job but, that is not to say, that she doesn't get scared. The committee has had conversations about encounters where citizens are scared of police, and part of the work of this committee is determining what we can do to make those interactions more comfortable, make people feel safer, and improve communication with the community. There is also the

component of you getting to know who she is when the uniform comes off; she is just Amber at the end of the day; she is just a human being. Officers are people too, they get scared and stressed, and legislation like that makes her scared and stressed.

Chief Páez thanked Susan for the question and shared that if there is any change needed for our policy or if it requires new training we will ensure it gets delivered to our officers or if it requires awareness we will ensure it is projected to the public.

Susan shared for the new members that the police department distributes lock boxes for firearms. This creates another blanket layer of safety for the community.

Yanling Yin asked collectively how do we get that knowledge out to our community on how to respond in certain situations. Immigrants' interaction with police is very different. How can we do better collectively to share the proper way to interacting with police during a traffic stop.

Chief Páez offered that they have done some training and informational sessions with individual groups on what to expect and to share information from the police department. If it is desired by members of the committee to put on another town hall forum, where we could invite members from all of Dublin or specific invitations you would like to encourage to attend, we would be glad to do that.

Zhen Xing commented that the resources sound like they are all there but maybe are not reaching the audience in some circumstances.

Chief Páez commented that in having those types of presentations at the town hall forum setting provides the opportunity to find out what questions people have, what concerns people have so that we can tailor those informational videos with the information requested by the community.

Yanling Yin suggested on the bigger scope for any immigrant what are the avenues other than attending a town hall, if you are being stopped for a traffic stop, if you have a driver's license you know the rules.

Chief Páez advised that he has an appointment to the Ohio Collaborative, a group which helps set standards for the State of Ohio. The Department of Public Safety is affected by that and he can definitely pass that suggestion along. Having a product to provide to them or suggest that they provide something to create an awareness for drivers and be included as part of their education. This not only affects Dublin, but it is about safety and a comfort level for all.

Dwayne Maynard segued to the end of the meeting. He asked that the presentation for this evening be carried over to the next meeting.

Chief Páez advised that we will bring back that and other presentations for the next meeting to share with the committee.

Public Commentary

Dwayne Maynard asked if there was any public commentary. Rebecca Myers advised that nothing had come in for this meeting.

Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Emmet Apolinario motioned to adjourn and Yanling Yin seconded the motion. Dwayne Maynard asked that all in favor of adjourning the meeting signify by stating "I". All were in favor and the meeting was officially adjourned at 7:35 PM.

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information

614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez
jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville
jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi
glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard
dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik
ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey
amccloskey@dublin.oh.us