



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (In Person) Thursday, August 30, 2022

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee to the meeting.

Committee members present: W. Dwayne Maynard (Chair), Ajmeri Hoque (Vice Chair), Emmet Apolinario, Gaurav Goel, Isao Shoji, Zhen Xing, Rama Billakenty, Chief Justin Páez, Deputy Chief Greg Lattanzi, Deputy Chief Nick Tabernik, Corporal Devin Howard, Officer Cody Woodard, PIO Rebecca Myers; Guests: Kirby Dearth, CIAC Member Peggy Kilty, Dee Marks of Dublin City Schools
Minutes by: Rebecca Metcalf

Committee Business

Chair W. Dwayne Maynard and Vice Chair Ajmeri Hoque

Chair Maynard welcomed all and thanked all for making the meeting. He appreciates all coming out and shared his thanks to Chief Páez and Vice Chair Hoque in keeping the committee focused and consistent. He reflected globally on the War in Ukraine, which has gone on for another month since last meeting; he applauds the leadership and citizens for their resilience and resolve. He also conveyed thoughts and prayers to those in Pakistan impacted by the devastating flooding. Nationally, his thoughts are with the citizens of Jackson, Mississippi who are enduring a water system failure as well as excessive rainfall and flooding; they will be without running water for the foreseeable future. Recent gun violence in Oregon, Michigan, Texas, and other states took multiple persons lives. Locally, he commented that it is good that all are back in school and that the Columbus teacher strike was short and resolved quickly. Record car thefts and break-ins have occurred throughout Columbus, and there have been two officer-involved shootings in past four days; gun violence signals a need everywhere. He also gave a shout-out to Serena Williams who is potentially participating in her last US Open. Billy Jean King applauded her for promoting diversity, equity and inclusion in women's tennis. He commented that the CACs task is not as broad reaching as Serena Williams in the world of tennis, but he hopes they make a lasting impact on our communities and those surrounding, as well as across the state and region, on police and community relations and that they can be significant and long lasting. Asked that all on the CAC serve with purpose and intentionality. He then deferred to Chief Páez to call roll.

- **Attendance**

Chief Páez called roll for the meeting:

Chair Dwayne Maynard - present

Vice Chair Ajmeri Hoque – present

Mr. Emmet Apolinario - present

Mr. Gaurav Goel –present

Mr. Isao Shoji – present

Ms. Zhen Xing –present

Ms. Rama Billakenty – present

Ms. Yanling Yin – not present

Ms. Susan Ortega – not present

Ms. Stella Villalba – not present

Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes

Chair Maynard asked if all had an opportunity to review the minutes from the July 28, 2022 meeting and if they had any changes or additions. The committee members had no changes or additions. Chair Maynard had one name correction to the minutes and suggested referring to him and Ajmeri Hoque as Chair Maynard and Vice Chair Hoque moving forward.

Chair Maynard entertained a motion to accept the minutes as amended and Vice Chair Hoque moved to accept the July 28, 2022 minutes as amended. Isao Shoji seconded the motion. Chair Maynard asked that all in favor of accepting the minutes as amended acknowledge by stating "I" and any opposed by stating "Nay". All stated "I" and there were no nays. The minutes from July 28, 2022, as amended, were adopted.

Old Business

Chair Maynard asked if there was any old business. Neither the committee nor Rebecca Myers had any old business.

Chair Maynard asked about the successes of the Irish Festival. DC Tabernik advised that the festival went off without a hitch from the standpoint of the police department. They had a suspension of operations due to weather; patrons used designated temporary shelters until the lightening cleared. There was one arrest made and many opportunities for officer engagement. DC Tabernik then opened the floor to answer any questions from the group. CIAC Member Peggy Kilty asked what the attendance numbers were. DC Tabernik did not have final numbers but advised that Saturday was well attended. Chair Maynard commented that it seemed there was more space for the festival. DC Tabernik agreed; there was some extra space around the stage area. Chief Páez offered, as there was previous conversation about firearms at the festival, that they will revisit and take a look at federal and state ordinances on how to address those types of concerns. There was one incident of open carry that was reported. Officers had a conversation with the

person involved; they advised that they had not fully thought it through and then left without incident. Isao Shoji asked if they were asked to leave the festival or to store the firearm elsewhere. Chief Páez advised that this particular instance was a unique incident, if there had been different circumstances; they may have had a different conversation with this person.

Chief's Update

Chief Páez deferred to Isao Shoji to provide an update on the CIAC. Isao Shoji focused first on recent events that took place in the City of Dublin; Pakistan and India Independence Day Celebrations; between those two events was the JASCO Oban Festival; all events went off very well and were well attended by people of all backgrounds. The India Independence celebration had the largest attendance. The CIAC then had a lengthy conversation about the City's policy and what it ought to be regarding permitting or supporting these types of celebrations. Some recent requests were very of short notice and members of the CIAC and City of Dublin come from a background that they can make it happen. After the fact, he advised that questions came from the group about handling the requests in this manner or if there should be a more formal request process moving forward; there was no conclusion on what to do but the CIAC will look further to formulate potential policy. He hopes to have more information back by the next CAC meeting.

CIAC Member Peggy Kilty advised that initially she thinks more with her head and not so much with her heart but after listening to other members and the City Manager speak, it became clear that there is a need to improve upon the current process so there is advance notice (agenda, speakers, format of event, etc...) beyond lighting the bridge and gathering; there definitely needs to be a reassessment.

Vice Chair Hoque commented that she attended the India Independence celebration and agrees with and supports the need for more advanced planning.

Kirby Dearth commented that moving forward, it should be determined how much city involvement there will be; there are so many potential events and it is not likely there are staff to commit to all. He suggests evaluating moving forward what are the holidays that the city needs to be involved with, what is the city supporting, community lighting bridge events; they have a retreat scheduled on September 27 of which half of the time is set aside to discuss those topics. He commented that when it comes this evaluation, there are arguments in all different ways; should events be held to specific holidays or do we celebrate everything; need to find that sweet spot in between or meet in the middle.

Vice Chair Hoque asked if any of those conversations include any of those groups.

Kirby Dearth stated that is the difficult question. The city would have to be non-discriminate or consider establishing procedures that protect us from that. These are all

topics we still need to navigate. He suggests perhaps the CIAC should move forward and have the City step back so they can have those discussions.

Chief Páez shared that in the course of four days there was the Pakistan Independence Day Celebration, Rainbow Dublin's Coming Out Party, JASCO Annual Oban Festival, and then the India Independence Day Celebration. The Link Bridge has become an icon of unifying people and showing support. He further stated that it is easy to say yes, but there will be groups for consideration that may not meet with the City's views of diversity, equity, and inclusion.

Kirby Dearth provided more information about their plans for the next month of the CIAC. He also mentioned that he recently accepted a role on the Economic Development team, moving from the City Manager's Office to the Development Building. He will continue his work with the CIAC for a while but there will be another individual attending with him to whom he will pass along that role. He anticipates continuing his work with the CIAC until the end of the year.

Chief Páez thanked Rama Billakenty and Gaurav Goel for the invitation to the India Festival celebration and for recognizing our department.

DEI Framework: Public Safety

Chair Maynard reviewed the DEI Framework that was established in July 2021. He stated that it is important to go over the four topic areas and indicators of success to identify their progress, where they want to go, and to provide, as a group, areas either topics or indicators of success that we would like to emphasize during this year's iteration of the CAC.

Chief Páez advised that they would go through all one at a time and pause after each for discussion, realizing that these are never really finished.

Promoting Public Safety and a Sense of Security

Dublin Police ensures public safety, a sense of security, and community engagement while acknowledging and respecting the various cultures and perspectives of diverse residents.

Indicators of Success

- The Dublin Police Department cultivates a culturally responsive public safety staff.
- The City produces policies and continues training sessions that reduce the potential for implicit biases that may affect decision-making.
- City officials promote policies and programs that contribute to a community environment in which minority and immigrant communities are welcomed and included.
- Dublin Police employ procedural justice in policy and interactions with the public with a focus on young and vulnerable communities.
- City officials promote policies that ensure the safety of all individuals during arrest processing, searches and placement in custody.
- The City provides education and training opportunities for Dublin Police staff, encouraging collaboration and a better understanding of diverse perspectives, experiences and expectations.

Discussion

Chair Maynard asked if there were any questions or if anyone needed clarification.

Vice Chair Hoque asked about bullet two, she doesn't recall how often they talk about it.

Chief Páez reviewed training the department has completed. A new instructor delivered training last year to all sworn personnel and she will be back again this year for additional training. The same instructor presented a portion of her training at an advisory committee meeting last year.

Vice Chair Hoque asked about intersectionality; has there been any conversation yet about that and ensuring awareness and cultural sensitivity; there is also colorism, which affects all. She further stated that with intersectionality, individuals can come from the same place but differ in how they view themselves; sexual identity, gender identity, non-binary not male or female, may present one way or another but don't see themselves that way. Colorism is people with deeper skin tones within their community that can be discriminated against.

Kirby Dearth added that with intersectionality, age, economic status and ability, may change the stereotypical projection of what they appear to be and how they all come together.

Chief Páez commented that, and this is not an indictment of where we are as an agency, but this brings awareness to our officers and department. These conversations are occurring throughout the city, state, and further.

DC Lattanzi provided information about the training curriculum, which is submitted to the state for approval. Upcoming training will focus on scenarios about DEI and how they deal with those situations. The training will occur in October and the instructor will once again come and meet with the CAC as well.

Vice Chair Hoque highly recommends attendance by the group when she comes to present.

DC Lattanzi advised that Dr. Burrs trained last year and the officers felt a connection with her and the training, which is why we are bringing her back again this year.

Officer Woodard introduced himself and spoke about Dr. Burrs, his experience with her training, and how she views things through the officers' perspective.

Chief Páez advised that Dr. Burrs has been working with DC Lattanzi to prepare and present scenarios that would be beneficial to personnel.

Chair Maynard asked about bullet two and bullet six; if those two are running in line with one another or is there a different focus for bullet six.

Chief Páez advised that they could be; it has been a while since they produced the document. He feels bullet six leans more toward implicit bias and brings a diverse perspective.

CIAC Member Peggy Kilty commented that this reminds her of the conversation they had about traffic stops, seems to go along with that.

Cpl. Howard views them as follows: bullet two talks about to you as a person and mandatory training; bullet six has the word "opportunities" the department provides to have additional training but also some external opportunity for outside organizations.

Chair Maynard asked if the committee is meeting this or are still building on it.

Vice Chair Hoque commented that she would say we are building on it.

Kirby Dearth commented that in the CIAC, they are building upon exploring what they have done and what they plan to do to accomplish this.

Gaurav Goel asked if there was a conversation about how to measure success?

Chief Páez advised that some of the bullets lend themselves to a metric indicator, output and outcome over time, to continue to track and reinforce progress.

Kirby Dearth commented that there are likely some metrics that can be used to show what progress is made.

Chair Maynard asked how the progress that is made is catalogued; that is what the CAC gets to help with by offering their input.

Vice Chair Hoque commented that there is no end point to this work; you keep building on what you have; she would not put an end date on this.

Chief Páez shared that he took feedback from the group and employed that feedback to help drive the progression of our policy; here is the success we have had moving toward best practices not past practices. He hopes this helps everyone and be on the same page.

Isao Shoji commented that this is a living document; there are some things over time that could be particularly checked off.

Gaurav Goel asked how are we doing on all or is there one that equates to success.

Dee Marks commented that how the community feels and how they feel about the interaction is a gauge of success.

Chair Maynard asked to review bullet four and consider that there is maybe more to it than we originally thought. "Dublin Police employ procedural justice in policy and interactions with the public with a focus on young and vulnerable communities." He suggests the group to consider what that means to you and asked Chief Páez what that looks like from the department viewpoint.

Vice Chair Hoque stated that she thinks about hate crime, reporting hate crime and making sure it is not just the police department investigating. Can we involve the CAC in that considering how does this affect the community; how does this come about; how can you look at it as a community and make it a community conversation for both young and old.

Chair Maynard considers the vulnerable community is very broad.

Chief Páez considers it any community that feels vulnerable in our city; it can be populations united by commonality perspective; the language was intentional so it could be comprehensive but also intentional.

Vice Chair Hoque spoke about an incident in UA and their procedure on reporting a hate crime; if you don't have experience you can't just dismiss it; there is a balance of emotional weight and how much they want to share when reporting a hate crime.

Chief Páez advised that the supervisory staff just had conversation about interaction with juveniles and our policy. The Deputy Chiefs worked on the policy with our policy manager and Chief Páez has had the opportunity to work at the state level on the Ohio Collaborative; they have worked to bring the policy under one lens; our policy is intentional on what we expect as an agency.

DC Tabernik shared that they worked to bring several policies together so officers can go to one place for guidance. The policy itself is an eleven-page document of which he shared the policy statement with the group. It covers overall considerations when interacting with juveniles in general; then proceeds to procedural considerations. This is still a draft document but they received good feedback from supervisory staff; they are taking all into account to ensure our department has proper interaction with juveniles.

Cpl. Howard commented that 90% of what was in the policy, our officers are already doing. The policy is almost a statement of what we are doing, why we are doing it, all different times of the day; 2nd shift hours generally deal with juveniles more frequently; they have positive and negative interactions; having that framework or statement of how we do that is very important.

Zhen Xing sees on social media kids hanging out on library parking lots, riding scooters down on Bridge Park.

Cpl. Howard advised that yes, they do deal with that a lot on their shift and the higher elevation of a parking garage is a natural collection point. They have directed officers to patrol that area; they are also other complaints about noise and reckless driving; they have seen a reduction in that activity recently but he is not sure if it is our increased patrol or that the kids are back in school.

Vice Chair Hoque commented about an educational seminar on when to call 911 and when not to call 911. Chief Páez shared that our communication center staff does offer that information as often as possible.

CULTIVATING COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND PUBLIC TRUST

Dublin Police develops and executes a comprehensive community engagement strategy that effectively connects police with Dublin residents, businesses and community stakeholders.

Indicators of Success

- City officials establish an ongoing Chief's Advisory Committee.
- The Dublin Police Department develops various diversity, equity and inclusion engagement events that promote collaboration, communication and partnership among Dublin Police and diverse constituents.
- Leadership engages with people with disabilities and disability advocacy associations in an effort to increase awareness for Dublin Police staff and enhance services for the community.
- The Dublin Police Department researches and develops future partnerships in public safety related mental health resources.
- The Dublin Police Department improve communication strategies to better inform and solicit feedback from the community as a whole, including diverse communities and stakeholders, during public meetings and engagement opportunities.

Vice Chair Hoque commented that we talk about engagement in that second bullet and we talk about a town hall; is that something we want to do once a year.

Chief Páez advised they are working on a suicide prevention town hall for this year but he is not sure we can do a town hall every year. We can determine what we can capture from our upcoming town hall to send out to continue that ongoing conversation. We want to do it the first time and figure out what pieces will be replicated moving forward.

Vice Chair Hoque asked if there is a timeline on when that will occur.

Chief Páez stated that he hopes for Fall; it is just a matter of logistics, etc...there are some other pieces that we have offered in the past: until help arrives, response to mental health crisis and traffic stops.

Rebecca Myers shared that Yanling Ying participated in a video piece regarding traffic stops and traffic stop etiquette that can be shared. This type of information can also be shared at DEI engagement events.

Rama Billakenty asked if just the police department is doing the town hall meetings or do you reach out to others.

Chief Páez asks that the CAC and CIAC bring people together for this upcoming town hall.

Kirby Dearth suggested a focus on a public safety town hall.

CIAC Member Peggy Kilty suggests the topic of responding to a behavioral health crisis; how do different cultures perceive behavioral health, reducing the stigma, it is different depending on where you come from.

Vice Chair Hoque likes the short videos that go out highlighting what is going on in the city; suggests taking clips of the town hall topic and making a short 90 second video clip; that is easier to digest.

Chief Páez stated that was our hope of what we highlight after the town hall; those points of emphasis we take away from the town hall.

Zhen Xing asked if there would be an opportunity for online participation for a town hall. She feels that would be helpful.

Chief Páez thinks that is a good consideration but would require some logistical navigation. He also envisions that personal dialogue in the town hall environment.

Dee Marks commented that in person attendance is dramatically lower now; she likes the idea of a hybrid type of event or even an offering on zoom where you could have breakouts sessions.

CIAC Member Peggy Kilty suggests that maybe if all goes well in person, the town hall could be replicated in a virtual format.

Dee Marks suggests a possibly a recorded event but offering an online live chat format to answer questions.

Vice Chair Hoque likes the idea of the online virtual offering and offering it on several occasions, which may increase awareness by repeating in the information.

Chief Páez suggests replicating the living peace perhaps on our website. Our intention is to be able to share the information.

Chair Maynard asked how the recent "coffee with a cop" event turned out and if the department does this on a routine basis.

Chief Páez shared that the event was lightly attended but we hope to provide other opportunities if the business continues to extend the invitation.

Kirby Dearth asked if this was something we did prior to the pandemic and how was attendance then.

Chief Páez advised that previously they would maybe get 20 attendees; but for those 20 people that showed up, he hoped they walked out with a better feeling of connectivity with the police department; if the engagement is meaningful for a community member, we will show up.

Vice Chair Hoque asked about bullet point three, three that speaks to engagement with people with disabilities. She asked if Chief Páez could speak on that.

Chief Páez advised that we have not had ample opportunity to work on that particular point but will continue working on that piece.

CIAC Member Peggy Kilty asked one of the officers, about a year ago, if the department has a registry of persons with disabilities and whether or not they want to participate in something like that. She thinks about people with cognitive memory issues, Alzheimer's, dementia, autism, etc...is there a registry for law enforcement.

Dee Marks advised that there is a registry.

Chief Páez looked at what resources are out there, there is a county system (Franklin) so we decided not to implement a separate system so we did not compete with the county system.

DC Lattanzi has had some conversation as well internally about building something of that nature. The discussion is ongoing with consideration of having a separate system for Dublin since we service portions of Delaware and Union Counties in addition to Franklin County.

Cpl. Howard shared that we do have in our CAD dispatching system space where we can add alerts to specific addresses or known persons; it is not a searchable database but we do have another product that may have some of those capabilities.

Dee Marks feels it would be beneficial for Dublin and those suburbs that surround the community. WTFD has a database for families with disabilities.

Chair Maynard suggested wrapping up for the evening. They touched on two of the topics in the DEI Framework. He suggests that the community partners make it a point to review the document so there can be a more focused discussion at the next meeting. He revisited the issue about what or how they as a committee can communicate with one another while not in session, due to the public records request concern. He suggested if they could have an email thread for this iteration of the chief's advisory committee, they can maybe share dialogue with one another as a group during the course of the month prior to upcoming meetings.

Chief Páez advised that a thread could work but the public meeting requirement of keeping track of all those ideas in between meetings can be labor intensive on our end.

CIAC Member Peggy Kilty advised that if she has something she would like the group to discuss, she sends an email to their Chair.

Vice Chair Hoque asked to put the topic on the agenda so they can discuss if that is something they want pursue.

Chief Páez commented that one-way conversation would probably be fine; it is the substantial conversation where there may be issue.

Kirby Dearth shared an instance where one conversation piece snowballed into a full-blown dialogue; you can have limited thread and limited dialogue.

Chair Maynard then asked if anyone had anything else to add, as it was getting late into the evening, and if not he asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Ajmeri Hoque motioned to adjourn the meeting and Zhen Xing seconded the motion.

The meeting was officially adjourned at 7:40 PM.

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information
614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez
jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville
jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi
glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard
dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik
ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey
amccloskey@dublin.oh.us