



## PLANNING REPORT

# Planning and Zoning Commission

Thursday, October 6, 2022

## Mount Carmel Health System Dublin Campus – Amended Final Development Plan 22-134AFDP

[www.dublinohiousa.gov/pzc/22-134](http://www.dublinohiousa.gov/pzc/22-134)

### Case Summary

Address	4105 Emerald Parkway
Proposal	Development of a 150,000-square-foot, 30-bed, inpatient hospital on a 35-acre.
Request	Request for review and approval of an Amended Final Development Plan under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.
Zoning	PUD: Mount Carmel Hospital Northwest
Planning Recommendation	<u>Approval of Amended Final Development Plan</u> Planning recommends approval with conditions.
Next Steps	Upon approval of the Amended Final Development Plan, the applicant may file for building permits through Building Standards.
Applicant	Timothy Scanley, HGA
Case Manager	Christopher Will, AICP, Planner (614) 410-4498 <a href="mailto:cwill@dublin.oh.us">cwill@dublin.oh.us</a>

Site Location Map

22-134AFDP | Mount Carmel



- Site Features**
- 1 Tree Stand
  - 2 Sawmill Road frontage
  - 3 Overhead electric lines



## 1. Background

### Site Summary

The 35.0-acre site, located at 4105 Emerald Parkway, is 750 feet southeast of the intersection of Bright Road and Emerald Parkway. The site has approximately 700 feet of frontage on Emerald Parkway, 250 feet of frontage on Bright Road, 450 feet of frontage on Sawmill Road, and 1,500 feet of frontage along I-270. Presently, the site is undeveloped although the northern portion of the site is heavily wooded. The site is accessible via an informal driveway along Bright Road and shared drive with Perry Township administrative offices along Sawmill Road. There are no existing curb cuts along Emerald Parkway although there is an existing median break.

### Development History

Final Development Plan – Planning and Zoning Commission

On August 4, 2022, the Planning and Zoning Commission (PZC) approved the Final Development Plan for Mount Carmel Health Systems Dublin Campus with 44 conditions and 4 minor text revisions.

Rezoning – City Council

On April, 25, 2022, City Council (CC) approval a rezoning of the site from R-1, Restricted Suburban Residential District to a PUD, Planned Unit Development District – Mount Carmel Hospital Northwest. CC previously provided similar feedback to the PZC regarding excess parking, retention basins, and the importance of open space.

Preliminary Development Plan/Rezoning – Planning and Zoning Commission

On March 3, 2022, the Planning and Zoning Commission (PZC) recommended approval to CC for the Rezoning with a Preliminary Development Plan. The Commission expressed concern at the number of proposed parking spaces on the site, which is greater than the minimum required by Code. The applicant stated that they will be including a Parking Plan with their FDP application. There was also discussion regarding the proposed open space and the possibility for public art to be included on the site.

Concept Plan – Planning and Zoning Commission

On December 8, 2021, PZC reviewed and provided non-binding feedback on a revised Concept Plan. The Commission expressed support of the revisions. Specifically the Commission appreciated the creation a wellness and health campus organized around a greenway. The Commission noted the Community Plan, which recommends elevated architectural character and that successful implementation of the Community Plan may include curvilinear lines, use of light/reflectivity, and playful design. Additionally, the Commission emphasized the project relies on successful execution of high-quality design details including landscape design and architectural character.

Concept Plan – Planning and Zoning Commission

On November 4, 2021, PZC reviewed and provided initial non-binding feedback on a Concept Plan. The Commission expressed support for the proposed hospital and medical office. The Commission encouraged the applicant to explore a wellness campus concept with integrated green spaces and physical connections to the site surroundings.

**Process**

Approval for the development of a PUD is a three-step process, which includes:

- 1) Concept Plan (CP)
- 2) Preliminary Development Plan (PDP)/Rezoning
- 3) Final Development Plan (FDP)/Amended Final Development Plan (AFDP)

The FDP is the final review step for development of a PUD where the PZC makes a determination based on conformance with the PDP and the approved development text. The FDP provides final design details including building, landscape and sign design. An Amended Final Development Plan (AFDP) is an application that proposes an amendment to a previously approved FDP. The applicant requires review and approval by PZC to make amendments.

**2. Zoning Code**

At the time of rezoning to a PUD a development text is established which sets forth the minimum zoning requirements. The AFDP is required to comply with the established standards except in cases where minor modifications to the development are approved by the Commission due to further design development.

**3. Project**

**Project Summary**

The applicant is proposing to develop a health and wellness campus in multiple phases with full build out to include an inpatient hospital, ambulatory care facility, and medical office building (MOB) in a single Primary Building and a single detached MOB. This AFDP is for Phase I, which includes only the inpatient hospital and associated site improvements. The applicant will be required to return to Commission for review and approval of future phases of the development plan.

The general site layout remains consistent with the approved FDP; however, the proposed phasing of the site development has shifted substantially. In the approved FDP, 230,000 SF of development, including the hospital and attached MOB along with 728 parking spaces were planned for Phase I with Phase II adding an additional 84,500 SF and 270 parking spaces, totaling 314,500-square-feet and 946 parking spaces.

Below is summary of the proposed amended phasing of development.

<b>Phase I (Total development - 150,000-SF)</b>	
Primary Building	4-story (exclusive of a penthouse), 30-bed, 153,400-SF hospital (excluding 25,000-SF shell space on 4th floor) 424 parking spaces
<b>Future Phasing (Total development – 302,900-SF)</b>	
Primary Building	Finishing the hospital’s 4th floor (cumulatively 25,000-SF) with 30 additional beds 35,000 SF hospital addition resulting in a total finished hospital area of 210,400 SF 2-story, 51,500-SF medical office building
Detached MOB	Up to 40,000-SF
Parking	891 total (467 new)

**Amended Final Development Site Plan**



**Development Standards**

The PDP established numeric development standards in conjunction with the preliminary site layout. Compliance with all numeric standards was confirmed with the FDP and has been reviewed again for this AFDP. Development standards provided include setbacks, building coverage, lot coverage, and building height. All development standards are required to be met prior to submitting for Building Permits. Development standards are provided in the development text and are met as follows:

<b>Setbacks</b>						
	<b>Emerald Parkway</b>	<b>Sawmill Road</b>	<b>I-270</b>	<b>Bright Road</b>	<b>Side/Rear Property Lines</b>	<b>Interior Lot Lines</b>
<b>Building (feet)</b>	100 (met)	100 (met)	50 (met)	50 (met)	50 (met)	0
<b>Pavement (feet)</b>	50 (met)	50 (met)	50 (met)	25 (met)	15* (met)	0
<b>Lot Coverage/Building Coverage/Building Height</b>						
<b>Lot Coverage</b>	75% (met: 54.3%)					
<b>Building Coverage</b>	25% (met: 7.8%)					
<b>Building Height</b>	65' and 4 stories in height, excludes penthouses and mechanicals (met: 62'-4")					

\*Shared use path west of the Bright Road access drive - min. setback is 10'

## **Architecture**

The proposed architecture builds on the concept presented at the PDP and is consistent with the previously approved architecture at the FDP. The hospital wing is the most prominent architectural element, and includes a brick base with wood panel accents (first floor) and glazing (floors 3-4) with floating frame accent clad in metal panel. The south end of the building facing I-270 incorporates a vertical stone element highlighting the emergency department and providing visual relief to metal panel and glazing. The rear of the hospital wing, adjacent to the service yard, is clad in brick to minimize the appearance. Service yard screen walls have been updated to include brick to be architecturally integrated with the building.

As part of the approved FDP, there were a series of conditions of approval regarding architecture, which have been addressed with the AFDP submittal. The architecture of the hospital ground floor along the west elevation and the second story of the east elevation is proposed to be updated with a brick parapet that terminates the roofline. Additionally, the architecture for the hospital connector was revised with glass and a stone base to reduce the overall mass of the hospital and break up the building materials. The applicant provided details that the louvered vent inserts on the east and west elevations maintain a consistent appearance across the entire fifth floor, whether inactive (ornamental) or for active ventilation.

The attached MOB which is now proposed in a future phase. The applicant has provided an updated architectural elevation of the temporary condition where the hospital connector and attached MOB meet. The updated elevation details a brick wall with a decorative brick detailing above a primarily glass and stone ground floor. This design is similar to the north elevation of the previously approved attached MOB.

The building is required to have a contemporary design with natural building materials including approximately 35 percent glazing, 10-20 percent wood/stone accents, 45-55 percent brick and metal panel. The proposed building is 37 percent glazing, 11 percent wood/stone accents, and 47 percent brick and metal panel. The material specification are as follows: 1) brick – dark iron spot brick (smooth finish), 2) stone – natural limestone (full bed dimensional coursing in ashlar pattern), 3) metal panel – white flat panel with dry joints, 4) wood – Prodema phenolic wood veneer (Onix color), and 5) windows – PPG Night Sky color. The applicant provided installation examples of projects which used the Prodema panels and clarified the exposed fasteners are to be stainless steel and not galvanized. The installation methods provide a lasting high quality appearance.

## **Temporary Structure**

The applicant is proposing a temporary structure for staging of construction materials, which is consistent to the information approved with the initial FDP. The development text provides the Commission the opportunity to review the details including size and location as part of the AFDP. The industrialized structure is proposed to be located immediately west of the future hospital tower and is 16,400 square feet in size and 25 feet in height.

## **Signs**

A variety of signs are proposed to ensure visibility and wayfinding for the campus. The development text preserves the right to have adequate emergency signs to ensure safe and efficient arrival at the emergency department. The Commission has purview over all final sign designs and locations, which have been revised based on the proposed phasing. There are

inconsistency with the proposed sign types and quantities proposed with the updated Phase 1, including that there should be no WL-03 signs as this is a sign type associated with the attached MOB which is now in Phase II. The applicant should update the Sign Quantities/Parameters table to accurately reflect sign area and quantities in the updated Phase 1. Additionally, the applicant should specify all letters and logos be individually mounted for all building mounted signs.

### **Access and Circulation**

Three access points are being constructed in Phase I: the primary drive from Emerald Parkway, the service drive on Emerald Parkway, and the secondary entrance drive on Bright Road. Emerald Parkway and the main site entrance will be controlled by a roundabout. The design and construction is being led by the City and coordinated with the applicant team. Detailed design is underway for the project. The site proposal includes modifications to the existing Emerald Parkway median to accommodate the Emerald Parkway service drive. The Bright Road access drive has been realigned to provide separation from the shared property line with the Village at Inverness. The proposal includes the additional of a shared-use path along the west side of the Bright Road access.

The background infrastructure improvements associated with the project include a second northbound left turn lane on Sawmill Road, and westbound receiving lane on Bright Road and preliminary engineering is underway for these improvements. Additionally, a dedicated eastbound right turn lane for Bright Road traffic turning onto Sawmill Road is recommended, which detailed design is also underway. A potential future bridge over I-270, connecting Tuller Road and Emerald Parkway, as recommended by the 2019 Sawmill Road Corridor Study, is recommended to distribute traffic across the roadway network and provide additional bicycle and pedestrian connections in the area.

The applicant has submitted an addendum to the previously accepted Traffic Impact Study. It demonstrates that the proposed Phase 1 generates about 75% of the daily trips estimated from the original final development plan, and shows the distribution of trips across the three access points included in Phase 1. Since the full build assumptions have not changed for the proposal, the long-term improvement recommendations remain consistent with the original final development plan.

The applicant will need to continue to coordinate proposed site and off-site improvements with the Emerald Parkway Roundabout project to the satisfaction of the City Engineer, as well as the Sawmill Road and Bright Road Intersection improvements, which includes the widening of Bright Road, to the satisfaction of the City Engineer and the City of Columbus' designee. The applicant will also need to execute their obligations set forth in the Infrastructure Agreement accepted by City Council per Ordinance 15-22, including the dedication of R/W and easements to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.

The applicant has updated the development plan with heavy duty pavement for a number of drives. The applicant should further update plans to provide heavy duty pavement for all fire apparatus access drives and fire lanes to the satisfaction of Washington Township Fire Department.

**Parking**

The development text establishes standards for number of parking spaces required based on a ratio determined by use. The applicant is proposing 424 spaces for Phase I and 467 spaces in Phase II for a total of 891 spaces. The proposed parking is consistent with the development text. A condition of approval for the previously approved FDP stated the parking plan be updated to maintain the reduction of 52 parking spaces in Phase II for a total of 946 parking spaces when 998 spaces were previously proposed. The new proposed parking figure is 55 fewer spaces than the approved FDP parking. Additionally, the applicant updated the design of parking lots to provide landscaped parking islands and pedestrian circulation from the parking lots to the greenway and proposed building to meet the condition of approval from the FDP.

<b>Proposed Parking Plan</b>		
<b>Phase I</b>		
	Parking Calculation	Parking Required
Hospital Patient (150,400 SF)	1.5 Spaces per 1,000 SF	226
Hospital Staff (152)	Staff x 1.3 for Shift Change	198
<i>Phase I Required</i>		424 (Provided: 424)
<b>Phase II</b>		
Hospital Shell Addition Patient (25,000SF)	1.5 Spaces per 1,000 SF	38
Hospital Shell Addition Staff (7)	Staff x 1.3 for Shift Change	10
Hospital Addition Staff (41)	Staff x 1.3 for Shift Change	53
Detached MOB (40,000 SF)	4 Spaces per 1,000 SF	160
Attached MOB (51,500 SF)	4 Spaces per 1,000 SF	206
<i>Phase I Required</i>		424
<i>Phase II Required</i>		467
<i>Total Required</i>		891 (Provided 891)

**Utilities**

Sanitary

The site is served by the 12-inch public sanitary sewer along the west side of Emerald Parkway.

Water

The site is served by the 12-inch public water main line along the east side of Emerald Parkway and the 12-inch public water main line along the south side of Bright Road. The applicant is proposing a connection to both water main lines for the purposes of providing water redundancy for uninterrupted service.

Stormwater Management

Stormwater management for the site consists of a network of storm sewer and drainage structures that drains into a series of retention and extended dry detention basins across the site. Phase I stormwater outlets from the site are proposed at two separate locations to maintain existing drainage conveyance patterns; Emerald Parkway to the west and Bright Road to the north.

A guardrail is proposed on the east side of Emerald Parkway where the required 50-foot retention basin setback from the right-of-way is not achieved. The applicant will need to coordinate the proposed ground sign location along Emerald Parkway with the proposed guardrail as part of the Emerald Parkway Roundabout project to the satisfaction of the City Engineer. The applicant will also need to work with the City of Dublin to establish ownership

and maintenance responsibilities for the proposed guardrail along Emerald Parkway, including the dedication of easements if necessary, to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.

### **Open Space**

Two open spaces totaling approximately 3 acres are proposed for Phase I. The final design details are subject to the Commission's approval with the AFDP. The development text provides guidance for open space sizes and character. The applicant is proposing to delay some open spaces approved in Phase I of the FDP to Phase II of the AFDP as well as modify elements of previously approved open spaces.

#### West Greenway/ Community Wellness Garden

The west greenway (community wellness garden) contains the main boulevard entrance, wet basins, chapel garden, shared use paths, and site furnishings. The design of the west greenway approved during the FDP provided a looped pathway which allowed patients and visitors to enjoy the greenspace from the north and south side of the space. The applicant has proposed to revise the west greenway to remove the loop element and provide reduced respite and landscaping. The applicant should refine the entry wellness green in the Phase I design to include a path loop, additional respite areas along the path, and additional landscaping.

#### East Greenway/ Staff Green

The east greenway includes the staff green and plaza along with landscaping and site furnishings though the proposed AFDP Phase I. The staff green is significantly smaller with less landscaping than the previously approved FDP. The proposed Phase I includes a temporary fire lane and the previously approved dry basin to the east of the staff green. Neither of these elements provide landscaping from the staff seating area. The AFDP proposed staff green does not reflect the high quality space approved with the FDP. The applicant should refine the staff green Phase I design to provide additional staff seating, landscape the dry basin to the northeast of the staff green, and provide landscape between the respite areas and the temporary fire lane.

### **Tree Preservation/Tree Replacement**

According to the tree preservation and replacement plan, 917-inches of protected trees will be removed and replaced on an inch-for-inch basis with 231, 3-inch and 64, 3.5-inch caliper trees. The tree survey and preservation plan show inconsistencies with some trees represented as to be removed on the plan and others as preserved in the table. The conflicts need to be corrected prior to the submittal for Building Permits. Additionally, the applicant needs to update the tree replacement plan to show the Bright Road utility area trees as utility screening trees not replacement trees and update the tree replacement plan accordingly

### **Landscaping**

The development text provides standards for various elements of the landscape plan, including frontage treatment/street trees, perimeter buffering/screening, parking lot trees, internal driveway trees, and foundation plantings. Site landscape emphasize a naturalized appearance and blend with the design of public rights-of-way, while delineating areas of more formal design where people will gather and use space. The applicant should update the plans to provide quantities and sizes for all plants in the plant list, confirm plants are properly identified, and tags do not overlap.

### Frontage/Perimeter Buffer

The development text requires each frontage to have a unique character. Buffering consists of tall earth mounds, and a mixtures of evergreen and deciduous trees. The Emerald Parkway frontage will include manicured turf, wet basins, and replacement trees. Along Sawmill Road and I-270 mounds are required to screen service areas and parking lots. A combination of mown turf and no-mow turf is proposed around and atop the sculpted mounding. Due to FAA regulations the perimeter buffer along I-270 is interrupt to accommodate the Helistop sited south of the hospital. The applicant should work with Staff to identify a species with a mature height compliant with all FAA regulations to provide in the Highway Buffer Landscape. The applicant should also provide all 54 required highway property perimeter trees in Phase I and provide a planting plan for a more thorough coverage of trees in the Highway Buffer Landscape. The Bright Road frontage will maintain a natural character.

### Parking Lot

There are approximately 93 trees shown in the parking lot islands and peninsulas to help shade and visually break-up the large expanses of asphalt, which meets the development text. Connector paths are shown within the landscape islands to direct pedestrians to greenways and the main entrance.

### Internal Driveways/Parking Perimeter

Trees are required on both sides of internal drives at a rate of one every 30 feet. The revisions to the previous plans increase the number of trees along the internal drives in conformance with the development text.

### Foundation Plantings

One hedge every three feet and one tree every 25 feet is required to be provided along the foundation. Service yards are not subject to the requirement. Foundation landscaping is proposed around the hospital, mostly planted with evergreen boxwood shrubs and ornamental grasses. Serviceberry trees are also proposed around the building in compliance with the approved text.

### **Screening**

Evergreen trees are proposed to screen the above-ground utilities shown on the plans. A 12-foot tall, corrugated metal panel wall is proposed to screen the service yard/loading dock. The service yard screen walls have been updated to be constructed of brick to be architecturally integrated with the building. The corrugated metal panel rain screen is also used to screen rooftop mechanicals. Any new ground mounted or rooftop mechanicals not shown on the plans are required to be screened per Dublin City Code

### **Lighting**

The development text contains minimum lighting standards to ensure even distribution of light across the site that does not trespass onto adjacent properties. LED lights are permitted at up to 30 feet in height to minimize the total number of poles. Light levels may not exceed an average ratio of 4:1 at 1-3 footcandles in a warm color. The applicant should update the footcandle levels along the main entry drive be reduced to fall within the average range of one to three footcandles. Light poles were previously placed within the parking areas, they have been moved to be placed in landscaped islands. Lighting plans are reviewed at Building Permitting stage to ensure compliance with the Code regarding lighting requirements.

## 4. Plan Review

### Amended Final Development Plan

Criteria	Review
1. The plan conforms in all pertinent aspects to the approved preliminary development plan.	<b>Criteria Met with Conditions:</b> The proposed AFDP complies with the qualitative and quantitative standards set forth in the development text, PDP, and PZC with the conditions of approval 1 and 2. All plans submitted to Building Standards should reflect compliance with the development text.
2. Adequate provision is made for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulations within the site and to the adjacent property.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> Multiple vehicular and pedestrian connections provide adequate provisions for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulation to-and-from and within the site.
3. The development has adequate public services and open spaces.	<b>Criteria Met with Conditions:</b> 3 acres of open space are provided in Phase I, including a wellness green and staff green. The applicant should refine the design of the entry wellness green and staff green to provide more usable open spaces. The applicant should also update plans to provide heavy duty pavement material for all fire apparatus access drives and fire lanes to the satisfaction of Washington Township Fire Department to provide adequate public service. Public services are provided.
4. The development preserves and is sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site in a manner that complies with the applicable regulations set forth in the Code.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The site plan is designed to preserve existing stands of trees. Additional landscaped parking islands were added to reduce large areas of paved surfaces.
5. The development provides adequate lighting for safe and convenient use of the streets, walkways, driveways, and parking areas without unnecessarily spilling or emitting light onto adjacent properties or the general vicinity.	<b>Criteria Met with Conditions:</b> Lighting specification are provided with the FDP/AFDP. To ensure conformance with all requirements of the development text and prevent excessive lighting, the applicant should reduce the footcandle levels along the main entry drive be fall within the average range of one to three.

Criteria	Review
6. The proposed signs are coordinated within the PUD and with adjacent development.	<b>Criteria Met with Conditions:</b> Signs should be updated to address conditions 13 and 14.
7. The landscape plan will adequately enhance the principle building and site; maintain the existing trees to the extent possible; buffer adjacent incompatible uses; break up large expanses of pavement with natural material; and provide appropriate plant materials for the buildings, site, and climate.	<b>Criteria Met with Conditions:</b> Final landscape details are provided with the FDP/AFDP. To ensure conformance with the development text the applicant should update the plans to address conditions 7-11.
8. Adequate provision is made for storm drainage within and through the site which complies with the applicable regulations in the Code and any other design criteria established by the City or any other government entity which may have jurisdiction over such matters.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The majority of stormwater basins are provided in Phase I. The site provides adequate provisions for storm drainage within and through the site.
9. If the project is to be carried out in progressive stages, each stage shall be so planned that the foregoing conditions are complied with at the completion of each stage.	<b>Criteria Met with Condition:</b> The project is proposed to be developed in two phases. This AFDP is for Phase I. The applicant should return to PZC for review and approval of future phases of the development plans.
10. The proposed development is compliant with other laws and regulations.	<b>Criteria Met:</b> The proposed development is compliant with other laws and regulations.

## Recommendation

### **Planning Recommendation:** Amended Final Development Plan Approval with conditions:

- 1) The applicant update all site plans to correctly depict property lines, right-of-way lines, easements, development standards and demonstrate consistency between engineering and landscape plans prior to submitting for Building Permits.
- 2) The applicant update plan drawings to; reflect the number of bicycle parking spaces provided, dimension sign placement, specify steel pipe bollards only be permitted within service yard, and decorative bollards be required in all other installations, and prevent excessive lighting along the main entry drive, prior to submitting for Building Permits.
- 3) The applicant return to PZC for approval of future phases of the development plans.
- 4) The applicant coordinate proposed site and off-site improvements with the Emerald Parkway Roundabout project to the satisfaction of the City Engineer, including the proposed ground sign location along Emerald Parkway with the proposed guardrail, and to establish ownership and maintenance responsibilities for the proposed guardrail with the dedication of easements if necessary.
- 5) The applicant refine the entry wellness green Phase I design to include a path loop, additional respite areas, and additional landscaping, subject to Staff approval.
- 6) The applicant refine the staff green Phase I design to provide additional staff seating, landscape the dry basin to the northeast of the staff green, and provide landscape between seating areas and the temporary fire lane, subject to Staff approval.
- 7) The applicant revise the tree survey and tree preservation plans to ensure consistency with the information in the table.
- 8) The applicant update plans to provide quantities and sizes for all plants in the plant list, confirm plants are properly identified, and tags do not overlap prior to Building Permits.
- 9) The applicant update the tree replacement plan to show the Bright Road utility area trees as utility screening trees not replacement trees and update the tree replacement plan accordingly.
- 10) The applicant work with Staff to identify a species with a mature height compliant with all FAA regulations to provide in the Highway Buffer Landscape.
- 11) The applicant provide all 54 required highway property perimeter trees in Phase I and provide a planting plan for a more thorough coverage of trees in the Highway Buffer Landscape.
- 12) The applicant update the plans to provide heavy duty pavement material for all fire apparatus access drives and fire lanes to the satisfaction of Washington Township Fire Department.
- 13) Raceways be prohibited for all building mount signs, and all letters and logos be individually mounted.
- 14) The applicant update the Sign Quantities/Parameters table to accurately reflect sign area and quantities in the updated Phase 1.